MORMONS AT THE MISSOURI:
A HISTORY OF THE LATTER-DAY SAINTS
AT WINTER QUARTERS AND AT KANESVILLE,
1846-52 - A STUDY IN
AMERICAN OVERLAND TRAIL MIGRATION

Volume I

By

Richard Edmond Bennett

A DISSERTATION
Submitted to the Graduate School
of Wayne State University,
Detroit, Michigan
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
1984

MAJOR: HISTORY

APPROVED BY:

Philip P. Haen (Advisor) March 26, 1984 (Date)

Stanley D. Ludwig (Member) March 26, 1984 (Date)

Marc W. Kruman (Member) March 26, 1984 (Date)

C. Dale Vinyard (Member) March 26, 1984 (Date)
© RICHARD EDMOND BENNETT 1984
All Rights Reserved
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work would not have been possible without the assistance of very supportive and encouraging men and women. To Professors Philip P. Mason of Wayne State University and Leonard J. Arrington of Brigham Young University, I owe a special debt. Dr. Mason, my committee chairman, shepherded my doctoral work, encouraged me to tackle a demanding subject in the history of the development of the American west, and kindly consented to the proposed topic. He has also been extremely patient and helpful in arranging seasonal registrations in my absence. Dr. Arrington, the outstanding scholar of Mormon history, through the years has provided me with several research opportunities and provoked my dream of writing on Winter Quarters into reality. He kindly agreed to serve as the outside examiner and guest expert reader of this dissertation.

I wish also to pay special thanks to the staff of the Historical Department of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints in Salt Lake City for their valuable, unending assistance and cooperation in making available every published and unpublished source required to do justice to the topic. In particular, I wish to thank search room supervisor James L. Kimball, Jr., for his assistance and kindness. His scholarly insights and archival sense have helped me immeasurably and his friendship is prized. I also thank the staff in the Archives and Library of the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints in Independence, Missouri,
for their valuable assistance. My sister-in-law, Colinda Dyer Elieson, deserves commendation for her expertise in typing from the beginning drafts through the finished product.

I owe a special debt of gratitude to my present employer, the University of Manitoba, for providing me with the necessary paid study leave, and to my colleagues in the Elizabeth Dafoe Library of said university who were kind enough to accommodate my leave. Furthermore, Wayne State University saw fit to grant me a Professional Scholarship this past year which paid all tuition fees thereby making this effort financially possible.

Finally, and above all, I thank my loyal wife, Patricia, for her joyous companionship, undeviating support and encouragement, and for her own recurring sacrifice of time and talents in my behalf. I freely dedicate this work to her and to our five children, the last of which was born while this work was in labor during our own 'winter quarters' in Salt Lake City.

While so many have assisted me, I nevertheless am solely responsible for the contents and the interpretations that characterize this work. I trust it will be a lasting credit to them all.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ii

LIST OF FIGURES v

LIST OF MAPS AND DIAGRAMS vi

INTRODUCTION vii

CHAPTER ONE - "IT IS NO PLACE FOR THE SAINTS" - THE MORMONS BEGIN LEAVING NAUVOO 1

CHAPTER TWO - FROM THE MISSISSIPPI TO THE MISSOURI - THE MORMON TREK ACROSS IOWA 34

CHAPTER THREE - "THE ADVANTAGES ARE MORE THAN THE DISADVANTAGES" - EVENTS IN WASHINGTON AND IN THE WILDERNESS THAT RESULTED IN THE DECISION TO WINTER AT THE MISSOURI 87

CHAPTER FOUR - SETTLING IN AT WINTER QUARTERS AND ENVIRONS SEPTEMBER - DECEMBER 1846 139

CHAPTER FIVE - MORMONS, INDIANS, AND INDIAN AGENTS 189

CHAPTER SIX - "IN ONE COMMON CAUSE FOR A SEASON" - THEIR ECONOMIC ORDER 232

VOLUME II

CHAPTER SEVEN - "AND SHOULD WE DIE" - SICKNESS AND DEATH AT WINTER QUARTERS 272

CHAPTER EIGHT - FROM WEST TO EAST - LOCATING A NEW ZION, ABANDONING WINTER QUARTERS, AND RETREATING TO IOWA 309

CHAPTER NINE - ERRAND IN THE WILDERNESS - THEIR SOCIAL AND RELIGIOUS LIFE - PART I 352

CHAPTER TEN - ERRAND IN THE WILDERNESS - THEIR SOCIAL AND RELIGIOUS LIFE - PART II 388

CHAPTER ELEVEN - "I AM GOING TO GO IT, THE LORD BEING MY HELP" - THE REORGANIZATION OF THE FIRST PRESIDENCY 416

CHAPTER TWELVE - "LET YOUR HEARTS BE TOWARDS THE SETTING SUN" - KANESVILLE, IOWA, 1848-52 451

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY 489

ABSTRACT 515

AUTOBIOGRAPHICAL STATEMENT 517
LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE 4.1
Mormon Population Study - 31 December 1846 176

FIGURE 6.1
Nauvoo/Winter Quarters Retail Price Comparisons 260

FIGURE 6.2
Kirtland/Winter Quarters Retail Price Comparisons 261

FIGURE 6.3
Wholesale/Retail Price Comparisons - Winter Quarters Store 1846-47 - Sample Order 262

FIGURE 7.1
Cause of Death 281

FIGURE 7.2
Seasonal Graphic Representation of Listed/Named Deaths on West Bank of Missouri River 283

FIGURE 7.3
Estimated Number of Deaths Among Mormon Settlements 1846-1848 289

FIGURE 7.4
Death Breakdown by Age 290

FIGURE 9.1
Sermon Topics and Frequency 363

FIGURE 12.1
List of Mormon Branches/Communities in Western Iowa as of 31 December 1848 458-59

FIGURE 12.2
1848 - 1852 Emigrations West from Kanesville 478
LIST OF MAPS AND DIAGRAMS

THE IOWA TREK 50-51
THE REGION OF COUNCIL BLUFFS 1846-50 89-90
WINTER QUARTERS, WINTER, 1846-47 147-48
WILLARD RICHARDS' OCTAGON 155
KANESVILLE LOG TABERNACLE 439
INTRODUCTION

Joseph Smith Jr., the Mormon prophet, and his brother, Hyrum, had been dead scarcely a year before the Latter-day Saints concluded to leave their beloved city of Nauvoo, Illinois, and risk their future in the isolation of the Rocky Mountain west. Joseph Smith's image and impact upon the now prophet-less Church loomed as large in death as it had in life. As one disciple, William W. Phelps, proclaimed, the prophet's murder would preserve the Church at America's expense. God will "vex this nation, and all nations, that have rejected and slain his prophets and apostles: Then comes the day of calamity: then passes this bitter cup: then, brethren and sisters, we can laugh at distress and their trouble."

Brigham Young, who assumed leadership over the Church as the highest-ranking ecclesiastical figure, reinforced Phelps' tone of urgency and anticipation.

It is the mind of the Spirit to the Saints scattered abroad throughout this Continent to gather Westward, to the place appointed, for a hiding place to Jacob, yea a home to Israel, while the desolation and wickedness maketh desolate the lands and cities where the voice of prophets have been heard unheeded.

Even if pressure from opponents had never reached intolerable levels, the Mormons would have eventually left Nauvoo. Like mariners fleeing the vortex of a sinking ship, they felt the need to come out of "Babylon" and to put a safe distance between them and God's imminent scourge of America.

vii
They only sought time for an orderly departure and to find a hiding place where the Church in isolation could catch its collective breath and become what everywhere else had prevented it from being.

It was this spirit of immediacy and escape, born of repeated persecution and opposition, this belief in divine retribution and premillennial expectations that largely colored the tenor of their time and faith. The story of the Latter-day Saints at the Missouri takes place against an ever-changing backdrop of scenery and attitudes in a period of unmatched agitation and disruption. Everything was in transition. Their society, economy, leadership councils, even their doctrines, patterns of worship, and religious practices were uprooted and distended, transported and re-evaluated. And in the process, they left a permanent impression upon the history of Mormonism and of America.

What had brought them to this impasse? The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, organized in Fayette, New York, 6 April 1830, sprang into being from the proclaimed visions, revelations, and teachings of Joseph Smith, Jr. Based on such religious tenets as Christian primitivism and premillennialism, the belief in a centuries' long apostasy and the subsequent restoration of divine truths and priesthoods, in the Book of Mormon as an ancient American book of scripture, and in modern revelation to a living prophet, the Church attracted a coterie of enthusiastic followers and flourished for much of the 1830's in Kirtland, Ohio, near present Cleveland. An ever-expanding missionary force proselyted along
the eastern seaboard, north into Upper Canada, and before the end of the decade to the British Isles with encouraging success. While at Kirtland, they built a temple, refined their organization, added to their canon of scripture, and developed their doctrine and theology.

At the same time, they made repeated unsuccessful efforts to establish the "New Jerusalem" in the "center stake of Zion" proclaimed as Independence, Missouri, which at that time was but a fledgling outfitting town on the Missouri River. Their attempts to headquarter at Independence aborted in a climate of overzealousness, misunderstanding, suspicion, and eventual cruel persecution. Missouri would not accept Mormonism and the animosity reached a peak in 1838 when Governor Lilburn W. Boggs issued his executive order "to exterminate" the Mormons (as they were then pejoratively called) and to drive them from the state.

Forced out of Missouri quite literally at gunpoint, they eventually found a friendly refuge in western Illinois on the banks of the Mississippi River north of Quincy. Joseph Smith soon called the settlement Nauvoo, "the city beautiful". Founded in 1839, Nauvoo rapidly became the Mormon capital, home to thousands of converts, and by 1845 was the largest city in the state. Here another temple, larger and more impressive than the one at Kirtland, was constructed to accommodate the constantly developing patterns of worship and religious ordinances.
By the time of Joseph Smith's death in June 1844, the religious practice of plural marriage had established itself amidst a hand-picked quorum of believers. This, in conjunction with the economic and political jealousies of surrounding Illinois communities, the ongoing bitterness between the Missourians and the Mormons, the Mormon habit of block voting, their clannishness, and religious fervor, all contributed to the creation of an atmosphere of tension and instability. Eventually it was determined that the Mormons must be dislodged whatever the cost. Many expected, somewhat naively, that the elimination of Joseph and Hyrum Smith would ruin the young Church. On the contrary, their death seemed to fire the flames of faith. Nevertheless, the "martyrdom" was an unmistakeable signal to Mormon leaders that either they get out voluntarily or face an inevitable civil war.

At this juncture in time this study begins and then follows the Church westward. Much has been written about the Mormon trek to the Salt Lake Valley of the Great Basin, the route followed, and the leading personalities involved, but surprisingly little has been written on the central issues at hand. These include such matters as the development of plans, economics, theological and ecclesiastical adaptations and implementations, dealings with the federal government, the Indians, and a host of other bread and butter issues. Specific to the present study, the history of Winter Quarters, the interim headquarters of the Mormons from 1846 to 1848 while in transit from Illinois to the mountains, has been sadly neglected. Far more attention, for instance, has been devoted
to the march of the 500-man Mormon Battalion from the Missouri River to California than to the 10,000 plus people they left behind at Winter Quarters and nearby settlements.

What accounts for this omission? Is it because Winter Quarters was, after all, only temporary, a dreary, death-ridden layover on the way to a far more glorious climax "far away in the West"? Or is it because it was an interregnum period occurring as it did after the death of Joseph Smith and before Brigham Young's ordination as President? The fact that no temple was ever built at Winter Quarters or that few, if any, physical landmarks other than a cemetery now remain may have deterred some inquirers.

Whatever the reasons, scholars are guilty of an incredible disinterest in and an appalling ignorance of the history of the Mormons at Winter Quarters, (now Florence, Nebraska) and the events in Iowa leading up to its establishment. Palmyra, New York, cradle of Mormonism, is revered in song and pageant; Kirtland, Ohio, is ever remembered; Nauvoo is now a restorationist's delight. But Winter Quarters, and its successor Kanesville (Council Bluffs), Iowa, headquarters of the Church for over two years, and home to thousands for as long as Nauvoo ever was, have been inexcusably slighted. Far too much happened in the Missouri Valley to be ignored any longer. Here revelations were proclaimed, apostolic supremacy and succession pronounced and made firm, and a Battalion raised midst formidable obstacles and opposing attitudes. At Winter Quarters women exercised the Priesthood, new patterns of worship were implemented, and plans for the great trek west
solidified. Polygamy and the law of adoption and other new and barely tested doctrines were practised in the open. And here faith deepened while apostasy flourished. Whatever the causes for this unfortunate oversight, this dissertation is written to fill that void.

The first two chapters of the twelve constituting this study lay the necessary groundwork and provide the reasons behind the existence of Winter Quarters. Special emphasis is placed on the twisted plans involved in leaving Nauvoo, the trouble-filled crossing of Iowa, the constant revisions and frustrating delays. Among the chapters that follow, much new research ground is broken and new interpretations proffered on life at Winter Quarters. These include such diverse topics as the following: Mormon-Indian relations; sickness and death and the impact these hardships had on their deliberations; the economics of a frontier community with special reference made to the problems and complaints of Mormon Battalion families; social norms and living conditions and hardships for both men and women; developments in ecclesiastical governments on all levels with particular studies on apostolic supremacy and succession; Mormon theology and temple work in "the wilderness"; and finally, an historical overview of life from 1848 to 1852 in Kanesville, Iowa, which Mormon community temporarily flourished after the abandoning of Winter Quarters.

While the Mormons were intent on leaving the territorial boundaries of the United States as then constituted, their exodus must been seen and understood against the rapidly
changing backdrop of American history out of which they came and from which they would never really escape.

The Latter-day Saints were not alone in looking west for solutions to their problems. If it was divinely manifested to them, the rest of the country was stirring to the strains of another similar impulse which one New York City editor first phrased in 1845 as "manifest destiny." It was time again for Americans to expand westward, to flee the east for the wilds and opportunities of Oregon, California, and Texas, time to prevent any further intrusions on what surely was American soil on the west coast, and time to establish greater trade with the Far East. Florida had just entered the Union as the 27th state in March 1845 and Texas, the "lone star republic" had done the same shortly afterwards. James K. Polk had been elected President in 1844 over Henry Clay in large measure because of his commitments to territorial expansion in the west. By 1845, 5,000 were already settled in Oregon. Consciously or unconsciously, and for whatever other reasons, Brigham Young and his band of followers were participating in part of a much larger and relentless American westward movement.

By 1846 America's population, doubling every decade, stood at 20,794,000. That same year, foreign immigration reached a new all-time high with 154,000 new arrivals, mostly from Great Britain, a foreshadowing of the millions to come. The United States was then experiencing a mild recovery in its economy from the depression of 1838-43 and would not experience another "boom" until the discovery of gold in California in 1848. New advances were being made in science, industry, and agriculture.
with the recent invention of the McCormick reaper just coming into use to replace the cast-iron plow, with the beginning of large-scale adoption of steam power in the east and the rapid expansion of the nation's railroads, with the advent of the telegraph in 1844, and the imminent invention of the sewing machine.

But if its industrial and mechanical developments and territorial expansions were manifest, it was not at all clear and in fact was ever a point of debate whether or not that "peculiar institution" of slavery should be permitted to expand west with the rest of the country. It was the time of abolitionists and slavery defenders, the Federal Fugitive Slave law and the Underground Railroad, that tenuous interim between the 1820 Missouri Compromise and the Dred Scott case of 1857 which denied Negroes citizenship even in the North and ruled Clay's compromises unconstitutional. Significantly, the same year the Mormons were fleeing Nauvoo for freedom in the West, Congress tried to pass the "Wilmot Proviso" forbidding slavery in any new territories acquired from Mexico during the upcoming campaign against that nation. The slavery issue would eventually fester into civil war just fifteen years later. Whether for rejecting Joseph or slavery, the nation would indeed suffer the "calamity" and "distress" that William Phelps and scores of astute statesmen and politicians across the land had been predicting. In 1846, the mood of the country was expansionist, the times unsettling, and the future uncertain.
Having provided this short review, let me add this very personal note with respect to my outlook and interpretation. The late U.S. senator, Hubert H. Humphrey, once said, "I don't know what I'm thinking until I see what I say." Having purposely waited till the end to introduce what I've written and how I've elected to present it, I am more surprised at the bulk of the data rather than the tone or interpretation. It's a long thesis, but necessarily so in order to present the total picture. As to interpretation, I have tried to tell a true story without consciously making an argument, presenting a case, or establishing a faith. Though a Latter-day Saint and an avid student of Mormon manuscripts and history, I have tried hard not to be a slave to prejudice or to prate a certain religious interpretation; rather, I have endeavored to be fair. Yet I cannot see how one can write about the Mormons, or any other religious community for that matter, without dealing with their faith and theology. It would be like analyzing the American Revolution without understanding the root causes. The discussions on faith and doctrines are necessary, I feel, to give background, understanding and context.

Since almost every writer of Mormon history has had a difficult time remaining neutral, myself included, I have relied very heavily on the primary documentation, the unpublished manuscript, and have followed those sources to wherever they have taken me. These sources are admittedly primarily mormon-oriented since the historical experience herein described is overwhelmingly a mormon one; consequently my perspective in part reflects that conscious reliance.
Whether the reader is sympathetic to Mormonism or otherwise, perhaps he or she owes it this single consideration — that these people, like so many other sincere religious devotees before and since, surely believed in what they were doing. In this regard, I am reminded of Robert Bolt's memorable drama, "A Man For All Seasons" in which Sir Thomas More, English Lord Chancellor to King Henry VIII, was tried, convicted, and executed for his impedimental faith in the apostolic succession of the pope and in the supremacy of the Roman Catholic Church. Said More, "Why, it's a theory yes; you can't see it; can't touch it; it's a theory. But what matters to me is not whether it's true or not but that I believe it to be true, or rather not that I believe it, but that I believe it."*

So too in this case. These people believed in their creed, in who they were, and in what they were doing. That made all the difference then; that is what really only matters now.

CHAPTER ONE

"IT IS NO PLACE FOR THE SAINTS"

THE MORMONS BEGIN LEAVING NAUVOO

I feel as though Nauvoo will be filled with all manner of abominations. It is no place for the Saints; and the Spirit whispers to me that the brethren had better get away as fast as they can. . . . I hope the brethren will not have trouble there, but the dark clouds of sorrow are gathering fast over that place.

So confided Brigham Young, the Mormon leader just three weeks after he and his closest advisors had secretly abandoned the Mormon capital on the Mississippi River. "Nauvoo the Beautiful," the "City of Joseph," the "center stake of Zion," and one-time haven for the Latter-day Saints, by the fall of 1845 had become a "prison" to Church authorities, a nest of apostasy, persecution, and physical dangers no longer suitable for whatever future designs Brigham had in mind for saving the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints.

This beginning chapter will explain why the Latter-day Saints left Nauvoo, the timetable they followed, what influence temple building and temple work had on their departure plans, and finally, what economic, political, and religious considerations contributed to Brigham Young's urgency to locate a new headquarters somewhere "over the mountains." These questions demand exploration for the
history of the Mormons at the Missouri begins in Nauvoo, Illinois.

Reading The Handwriting On The Wall

As early as April 1845, Illinois Governor Thomas Ford advised Brigham, for safety sake, to leave the state. 2 "I think it would be good policy for your people to move to some far distant country," he counselled. "Your religion is new and it surprises the people as any great novelty in religion generally does. They cannot rise above the prejudice excited." Not excusing such prejudice but claiming to understand its intensity, Ford confessed, "I do not foresee the time when you will be permitted to enjoy quiet," and said that he had been "informed by General [Joseph] Smith last summer that he contemplated a removal west." 3 Ford was advising the painfully obvious: either leave or be destroyed.

The summer of 1845 was fairly harmless, but serious troubles began in September with enemies to the Church setting fires in small settlements outside Nauvoo - a sign of impending depredations. In early October 1845 these "anti-Mormons," as they were called, held a series of meetings in Carthage and Quincy, Illinois, and adopted the "Quincy Convention" which demanded the removal of the Mormons by May 1846. 4 Later that same month, Governor Ford, fearful of an all out civil war in Hancock County, ordered a peace-keeping army to the Nauvoo area to postpone what he
foresaw as inevitable widespread violence, death, and destruction.

Similarly, Brigham Young, the 44 year-old interim head of the Church by right of his position as senior member of the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles, feared an impending catastrophe and concluded early on that the Church must seek a new refuge in total isolation. In an October 1845 letter written to Apostle Wilford Woodruff, then in England, Brigham confided that "they have told us plainly that the prejudice of the people are [sic] such that the state cannot posably [sic] protect us and that it is therefore advisable for us to remove as the only conditions of peace." He then concluded, "We have determined to do so in the Spring." 5

Irene Hascall, a young woman living in Nauvoo reported on the deteriorating situation, the Quincy treaty, and plans to leave the following spring. "The twelve have issued a proclamation that if they will let them alone this winter . . . and do what they can to prepare us for journeying, all that follow the twelve will go where they will not trouble [the] United States with Mormon religion. . . ." She concluded, "I think probably they will cross the Rocky Mountains to a healthier climate." 6

A spring exodus had been mentioned as early as 28 August 1845 when Church leaders decided "that 3,000 able-bodied men should be selected to prepare themselves to start in the spring to Upper California, taking their families with them." 7 By 9 September, the number had been reduced to 1500. 8 At the October conference of the Church
which convened in the completed portions of the Nauvoo Temple, some 5000 of the faithful listened to detailed plans and timetables for the spring evacuation. William Huntington, a member of the Nauvoo High Council, recorded that on 6 October 1845 "the Church resolved to leave Nauvoo and seek a resting place westward wherever God would lead them." During the conference many heads of families entered into a covenant to consecrate their properties and other possessions to the Church to assist in every way the exodus of the thousands of widowed, infirm, and destitute. This "Nauvoo Covenant" was prerequisite to the successful completion of their departure plans and Brigham would hold them to it.

Further proof of their determination to leave was the formation of four companies of one hundred families each, the first being "the Twelve's company" to consist of the twelve apostles, other lower level Church leaders, and their families. Soon afterwards, twenty-one more companies were established with captains assigned the responsibilities of organizing, outfitting, and supervising all departure preparations for his particular company. Huntington was chosen as one such captain. Simple arithmetic indicates that if each family averaged even five people, this October scheme would have accommodated some 12,500 souls - a very high percentage of Nauvoo's estimated population of 17,000.
Throughout the fall, Nauvoo was alive with preparation efforts. As one put it, "nearly every man was some kind of a mechanic to build wagons, and the whole mind of the people was engaged in the great work of emigrating west in the Spring." By the end of the year 3,500 families had been organized and 2,000 wagons either completed or being constructed. Their efforts culminated in a January circular of the Nauvoo High Council which stated clearly that Church leaders would begin to leave "some time in March", a pronouncement most likely made to convince their enemies of their intentions.

Their Destination

While the vanguard company of Church leaders prepared for its March departure date, most others in Nauvoo anticipated leaving shortly after the completion of the temple scheduled for April or May thereby meeting the Quincy Committee deadline. But if their timetable was clear, much less so was their intended place of refuge. The destination was discussed at length, but apparently no firm decision was ever made in Nauvoo. The matter was addressed in such vague, ambivalent, even contradictory terms that a firm conclusion is virtually impossible. Evidence suggests that Joseph Smith had anticipated the impending persecutions and had predicted a migration of the Church westward. Anson Call, as early as 1842, reported that Joseph Smith supposedly said "the Saints would continue to suffer much affliction and would be driven to the Rocky Mountains" and
that some then in Nauvoo would "go and assist in making settlements and build cities and see the saints become a mighty people in the midst of the Rocky Mountains." Orson Pratt and Heber C. Kimball, when halfway across Iowa, referred to an 1838 statement, purportedly of Joseph Smith's, in which "the Prophet had this mission in contemplation, viz., to find a location west of the Rocky Mountains." Commented Pratt, "Whenever Joseph spoke on that subject, he proposed to send a company of young men as pioneers to seek a location."  

In February 1844 Joseph had instructed the apostles "to send out a delegation and investigate the location of California and Oregon, and hunt out a good location, where we can remove to after the temple is completed and where we can build a city in a day, and have a government of our own, [and] get up into the mountains, where the devil cannot dig us out." Although many men volunteered for the expedition, the plan was throttled by Nauvoo's worsening social and political climate.

James Allen Scott, in Nauvoo in April 1846, reported on a discourse by apostle William Smith, younger brother to Joseph who had turned sour on Brigham Young's leadership.

"...He prophesied that in six months the saints would rue going west [and] said that Joseph never said anything about moving to California; after he quit a man in [the] crowd asked leave to speak being granted. He mounted the stand and told the people that he was with Joseph for two or three days previous to his death - gave him the pistol in jail. Received his blessing and last instructions which were sent by him both verbal and
written to the Church which were to go to go [sic] west to Oregon or California as the Lord should direct and affirmed that he knew that this was the council of Joseph and Hyrum. After he was done, William got up and denied it. 22

As indicated, Governor Ford also thought Joseph had projected a move west. 23 But if Joseph Smith had anticipated a general exodus, he referred to it only in vague and obscure generalities and never specified a particular place of settlement or timetable. Reliable evidence simply does not exist to prove otherwise.

Yet regardless of where "Zion" eventually would be located and whether or not Brigham's plan owed anything to Joseph, Brigham and other Church leaders were determined to leave Nauvoo as quickly as possible. Then they would find a new home "in some good valley in the neighborhood of the Rocky Mountains" where they could worship without persecution, where they would "infringe upon no one, and not be likely to be infringed upon." 24

A recent article by Lewis Clark Christian argues that "Mormon leaders were formulating plans to colonize the Pacific Coast, Oregon, Vancouver Island, and other proposed sites for 'stakes of Zion' but that the center would probably be somewhere near the Great Salt Lake." 25 However, Brigham spoke out of both sides of his mouth on this issue, in the vaguest and sometimes most misleading of terms, perhaps deliberately to confuse and bewilder his enemies. For several months, Mormon leaders had been studying Colonel John C. Fremont's trans-Missouri maps and expeditionary
reports of 1842 and 1843 as well as other works on the Rocky Mountain region. Such studies may have led them to seriously consider the Great Salt Lake Valley but not necessarily to decide on it as the ultimate destination. In letters to Wilford Woodruff, Brigham indicated they would head west of the Rocky Mountains to the area of the "Bay of St. Francisquó" and of Vancouver Island, or, in other words, somewhere in the vast area of "Upper California" covering almost all of the west coast. In a later letter to another apostle, Orson Hyde, Brigham could only say, "it will be over the Mountains, but to define the spot we cannot at present." Only as the "Saints" moved further westward and gleaned more solid, on-site information from fur traders, mountain men, and Jesuit fathers, did the answer crystallize. And even after later conferences with these knowledgeable men, the most specific Brigham could be was "to go to the Bear River Valley, Great Basin, or Salt Lake." Determining a suitable location seemed less a matter of divine decree and more of deliberate planning and interminable discussion.

Unfinished Nauvoo Business

During the few short months before the March deadline, Brigham intended to use the time not only to build wagons, purchase supplies, and make other preparations, but also to begin "temple work" and "endowments" for the people. The Mormon people had labored almost five years constructing the majestic Nauvoo Temple on the crown of the
hill overlooking the Mississippi. Made of white limestone and erected at a cost of several hundred thousand dollars, its exterior dimensions measured 128' east and west, 80' north and south, and 60' high with the tower and spire rising an additional 98 1/2'. At the time of its completion in May 1846, although many of the interior rooms were never completely finished, it was the largest structure north of St. Louis and west of Chicago. Ironically, they were now about to leave it just as it neared completion. But before doing so, many longed to participate in what they believed to be sacred saving ordinances both for themselves and their kindred dead that could be performed only in the "House of the Lord", the term used by the faithful to describe the temple.

Temple work was and is at the very heart of Mormon doctrine. Specifically, the "blessings of the Temple" included various ordinances, rites, key words, performances and dramatizations, and above all, covenants and promises that Mormons believed had been divinely restored and were essential for salvation. This package of temple rites, called the 'endowment', was both a symbol and conditional promise of salvation. Temple ceremonies, based on the doctrine of the eternity of the soul, included celestial or eternal marriages for the living and the dead, baptisms for the dead, and the sealing of living or deceased children to earthly families in an eternal family unit.32

Temple ordinances began in Nauvoo 10 December 1845 and continued night and day until late January so that as many
as possible could participate. Many volunteers worked in
the temple in one capacity or another from early in the
morning until past ten at night since Brigham intended that
"every worthy man" and woman should receive his endowment.

But temple work was squeezed into the remaining time
Church authorities had in Nauvoo and, for want of it, they
would have defied the odds and been on their way even
earlier. "The main and only cause of our tarrying so long,"
admitted Brigham, "was to give the brethren those blessings
in the Temple, for which they had labored so diligently and
faithfully to build, and as soon as it was prepared, we
labored incessantly almost night and day to wait on them
until a few days prior to our departure." During these few
short weeks, 8,000 received their endowments. 33

The endowment was, to the believing and worthy
Latter-day Saints, a spiritual climax, a reward for their
labors, and a prerequisite spiritual preparation for the
impending struggles ahead. Had the temple been completed
earlier, the exodus would have begun that much earlier. In
that case, the entire history of the Mormon trek would have
changed and very possibly, the Mormon stay at the Missouri,
the theme of this study, would largely have been obviated.

A Premature Departure

While temple work certainly complicated and delayed the
advanced exodus of Church leaders, a lengthy postponement
was out of the question. Several reasons account for this,
including fears for the personal safety of members of the
Twelve, the possibility of arrests, and threatened assassination attempts. The activities of various counterfeiters who had based their operations in and around Nauvoo and who had endeavored to blame Church leaders for their own illegal operations had caused a number of indictments in December 1845 at the U.S. District Court in Springfield against Brigham Young and eight of his fellow apostles.34 One second level leader, Theodore Turley, was arrested down river at Alton allegedly for counterfeiting or "bogus-making."35 Turley's arrest tended to agitate emotions still further and as Brigham complained, "smeared the Mormons all around the country."36 Church leaders were sought after on one charge or another almost continually from October until December. On 20 October 1845 William Huntington referred to a subtle change of the opposition's tactics from that of September's crop burnings of the farms in Morley and other outlying Mormon settlements near Nauvoo, to troubling and harassing "by writs, [and] lawsuits, trying to pick the brethren away one or a few at a time secretly and by imprisoning. . . . Strong guards were kept to prevent parties of the mob from taking off the brethren with their vexatious suits."37 Most of the writs concerned efforts to arrest Brigham and other accomplices to Joseph Smith regarding the destruction of the Nauvoo Expositor newspaper press just prior to Smith's death.

At a secret meeting held in the attic of the Temple 10 January 1846, members of the Council of Fifty, an advisory body established by Joseph Smith to give counsel on
political and civic affairs, discussed "the subject of leaving this place [Nauvoo] . . . the time, when, etc. Trouble was near at hand, was the decided opinion of the Council."\textsuperscript{38} Joseph L. Heywood, a trusted confidant, advised Brigham "that if you should tarry . . . however agreeable it might be to your Brethren here to have your society, . . . your safety would be greatly endangered." He advised a speedy departure "with a cavalcade of one thousand armed men" to discourage obstructions for "the enemy knows the only way in which they can get up a row, and that is by attempting arrest."\textsuperscript{39}

While the threat of arrest was annoying, rumored assassination attempts were taken more seriously. One Mormon, Edmund Durphy, had already been murdered within the preceding month.\textsuperscript{40} Assassinations might come from either anti-Mormons or, just as likely, from disaffected members and apostates. Confided Brigham in a note dated 18 January 1846,

A meeting of the Captains of emigrating companies was held in the attic story of the Temple, to ascertain the number ready and willing to start should necessity compel our instant removal, being aware that evil is intended towards us, and that our safety alone will depend upon our departure from this place, before our enemies shall intercept and prevent our going.\textsuperscript{41}

Hosea Stout, active in Nauvoo police activities, on 23 January reported to Brigham Young, Heber C. Kimball, and Amasa Lyman that he had heard of negotiations among the
anti-Mormons "to hire some daring person to secretly assassinate some of the Twelve."42 Besides concerns over their personal safety and freedom, Brigham and other leaders believed that their early departure would prove their genuine intent and possibly free the rest of the Saints from harassment, pillaging, crop burnings, and other injustices.43 By easing tensions, the temple could be finished, properties sold at better prices, and travel preparations completed.44 Brigham felt compelled to buy time and forbearance for he must have known that many of the poor and those then arriving in Nauvoo from distant branches of the Church could not possibly be prepared and out of the city by the final May departure deadline as stipulated by the Quincy Committee.

A third explanation for the leadership's premature departure was a widespread rumor that the United States government was about to dispatch troops to interfere with the intended exodus. Certainly many migrants then moving west or shortly about to do so suspected the Mormon cause.45 Between 1843 and 1846 traffic over the Oregon and California trails mushroomed from an estimated 1,100 travelers in 1843 to over 8,000 in 1846. 15,000 were preparing to leave in 1847, and 1848 would see another 19,000 on the trail.46 More of these immigrants were from Missouri and Illinois than any other state or region in the country and were generally antagonistic towards the Mormon cause. No one more perfectly personified that hostility than former Missouri Governor, Lilburn W. Boggs, who himself would be on
the trail to California in April 1846. The Mormons despised and condemned Boggs for his 1838 "extermination order" to expel them from Missouri, while in return Boggs blamed the Mormons for an unsuccessful assassination attempt on his life in 1842.47

As early as the spring of 1846, some Oregon trains were avoiding travel on the north side of the Platte River because of rumors that 5,000 heavily-armed Mormons were marching westward intent on murdering emigrants and confiscating property.48 And for various reasons, not the least of which were prior discussions between Mormons and disgruntled Indians,49 rumor had it that the Mormons would incite Indian provocation against the migrating parties.50

Francis Parkman, who in 1846 was on the plains to describe first-hand Indian life styles and traditions, wrote of the Mormons, "No one could predict what would be the result when large armed bodies of these fanatics should encounter the most impetuous and reckless of their old enemies on the prairie."51 Such animosities would harden as the Mormons made their way west, but by February 1846 there were already enough complaints against them that the War Department and Office of Indian Affairs were genuinely concerned.

To further complicate matters, the Oregon question was not yet settled with Britain, nor would it be until June of 1846 when negotiations finally guaranteed modern Oregon for the United States with Vancouver Island and everything north of the 49th parallel assigned to Great Britain. In early
1846, President James K. Polk and his cabinet were heavily involved in the Oregon question when war with Britain seemed possible. Similarly, California, New Mexico, and most of the continent west and south of the Missouri River were under Mexican control. A war with Mexico was also impending, and in fact would be declared in May with the U.S. intent on acquiring New Mexico and California.

Finally, Brigham's unclear intentions regarding his destination were unsettling to Washington observers. As already seen, he seemed ambivalent, at least in public, on this issue. In one letter it was Vancouver Island, in another San Francisco, and in another the Great Basin. It was public knowledge that Samuel Brannan, acting under Brigham's instructions, had departed New York with a shipload of 235 Mormons bound for Yerba Buena (San Francisco). Whether Brigham was being deliberately evasive to keep his critics off guard is not clear, but he did succeed in causing official concern.

Nonetheless, Brigham and his advisors wanted to allay any such suspicions and fears. Government intervention must not be encouraged. Consequently he dispatched his personal emissary, Jesse C. Little, in late January 1846 to court Polk's favor and to attract lucrative government contracts by offering Washington the services of the Mormons, from constructing forts and bridges to serving in the army against either Britain or Mexico. Little's instructions were that "if our government shall offer any facilities for
emigrating to the Western coast, embrace those facilities, if possible." 55

But until Brigham was satisfied that Polk would sympathize with his offer, he could not be entirely confident that his enemies were not outmaneuvering him and planning some sort of disturbance or impediment. Late in December 1845, Governor Ford had expressed his opinion that "it is very likely that the Government at Washington will interfere to prevent the Mormons from going west of the Rocky Mountains." He continued, "Many intelligent persons sincerely believe that they [the Mormons] will join the British if they go there, and be more trouble than ever, and I think that this consideration is likely to influence the Government." 56 Whether or not Ford possessed accurate inside information of Washington's plans is doubtful, but certainly he was not the only one communicating such possibilities. Two weeks later, Samuel Brannan, then about to sail for California from New York City, hurriedly dispatched the following warning:

I have received positive information that it is the intention of the Government, to disarm you, after you have taken up your line of march in the spring, on the ground of the law of nations, or the treaty existing between the United States and Mexico, 'that an armed force of men shall not be allowed to invade the territory of a foreign nation.' 57

"Whatever his source or purpose (Brannan later became involved in a fraudulent land scheme of Amos Kendall's and others in Washington to defraud the Mormons of half their-
settled lands in the West), he at this time genuinely suspected government intervention."

Just how much Brannan's informants really knew and what measure of credence Brigham put in Brannan's warning may never be known. Nevertheless, on 26 January 1846 Mr. Little was dispatched to Washington and upon receiving Brannan's communication three days later, Brigham said, "We ask God our Heavenly Father to exert his power in our deliverance that we may be preserved to establish truth upon all the face of the earth."  

Faced then with the prospects of continuing efforts at their arrest, assassination attempts, rumors of possible federal intervention, and hopeful that their leaving might lessen tensions on all sides, the "Company of the Twelve" made final preparations to terminate temple work and to depart quietly and quickly weeks before their March departure date. On 26 January 1846, three days after Hosea Stout's assassination warning, another council was held and the captains of companies "were ordered to warn all who had volunteered [sic] to stand as minute-men to be in readiness." The next day all temple work ceased and by Friday "all was in suspense expecting every moment to have a start, that is the authorities of the Church." 

On Sunday, 2 February 1846, the Twelve Apostles, the recently appointed trustees (John S. Fullmer, Joseph L. Heywood, and Almon W. Babbitt) charged with the responsibility of remaining in Nauvoo to sell off all Church and some private properties, and a few select others met in
conference to consider these important items of information. At that meeting a decision was made to be ready to depart within four hours notice and "let everything for the journey be in readiness" for, as Brigham confided, "if we are here many days our way will be hedged up."62

Two days later, the first of the advance company began quietly crossing the frozen Mississippi for the West, settling temporarily at Sugar Creek, Iowa territory, some nine miles away.

"For the Salvation Of The Church"

Brigham knew, as did the other apostles, that until and unless a new headquarters was speedily established, the Church itself was in a vulnerable position. Instability and uncertainty would breed insecurity among members, especially new converts. Missionary work invariably must be postponed. It was for "the salvation of the Church" somewhere in the West where a standard could be raised, another temple reared, and a firm, conspicuous gathering place organized that motivated their plans. Until these goals were accomplished, the Church was in a weak, exposed, and precarious position. And the tragic spectacle of groping in the wilderness would prove good ammunition for opposing sects and contenders for the leadership of the Church.63

Clearly the Church was in a crisis and had been so since the death of Joseph Smith. The problems from without in the form of persecution and prejudice have already been discussed. But the problems from within were potentially
more divisive and destructive. Since Joseph Smith's death, the question of succession to the presidency had lain unresolved. While most of the membership accepted the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles as the interim leadership of the Church with Brigham Young as head of the quorum, which one man should eventually obtain the presidency was to many unclear. 

Several men claimed Joseph's mantle. Sidney Rigdon, long time first counselor in the First Presidency from 1833 to 1844, returned to Nauvoo in August 1844 and presented his credentials to be "guardian" of the Church, but in the process deflected the attention and allegiance of a mere handful of followers. One William Parker was using peepstones and impersonating religious leaders to induce a belief in his claims. Several, including apostle Lyman Wight who in March of 1845 had led a company of some 150 souls to southern Texas on a mission he felt had been commissioned by Joseph Smith, maintained that the rightful heir to the presidency of the Church was Joseph Smith III, oldest son of the Prophet, who in 1845 was only 13 years of age.

But in February 1846, at the time of the exodus, these claims were minor threats compared to that of James J. Strang and his advocates. Strang, baptized personally by Joseph Smith just a few months before his death, had persuaded many that he was Joseph's legitimate successor, and to prove it, publicly proclaimed a vision in which Joseph supposedly ordained him to establish the Church in
Wisconsin. Strang would soon publish revelations, claim the discovery of another book of ancient scripture (The Book of the Law of the Lord), establish a church in Voree, Wisconsin, and later flee to Beaver Island in northern Lake Michigan.68

Strang's excesses eventually led to his murder in 1856 and the subsequent loss of most of his followers, but in 1846 Strangism was a strong contender and a very real threat to Brigham's efforts to move the Church west. Several outstanding Mormon leaders and personalities were going with Strang including William Marks, former president of the Nauvoo stake, John E. Page, an apostle until his excommunication on 9 February 1846, William Smith, another excommunicated apostle and younger brother to Joseph, Lucy Mack Smith, Joseph's elderly mother, Judge George J. Adams, William McLellen, Rufus Beach, and many more.

The attraction of Strangism may be attributed to the following: its formal establishment as a bona fide church (since early 1845) and not merely an unorganized, theoretical opposition (it claimed the official name of Joseph's Church); Strang's charismatic personality that reminded many of Joseph and contrasted dramatically with Brigham's pragmatism and deliberateness; its allegiance to the Book of Mormon and several other doctrines proclaimed by Joseph; and its zealous, far-reaching missionary efforts directly aimed at Mormon branches in America and England.69 But contributing even more to its initial popularity than all these other factors combined was its ability to
capitalize on the anti-polygamy sentiment many dissidents shared. Polygamy, though practised on a small scale by many high in the Church hierarchy since 1843, had been publicly denied by Church leaders mainly for fear of increasing public hostility. Brigham waited until the Church was re-established in an isolated wilderness before publicly announcing the practice.

Of those who joined Strang over polygamy, many, like James Blakeslee and John E. Page, were fundamentally opposed to the practice on doctrinal and theological grounds. Others, like Gilbert Watson, were unable to reconcile private performance with public denial. He observed that polygamy "was taught confidentially to strangers by brethren and sisters who had remained long enough in the city to become indoctrinated therein. Yet this system was publicly proclaimed against on the stand by the authorities." Lastly, there were some, like the former mayor of Nauvoo and counselor in the First Presidency, John C. Bennett, who were still smarting from public rebuke, chastisement, and excommunication on the grounds of immorality and other alleged moral infractions who may have joined Strang to get back at the Twelve. Until Strang himself was found secretly practising and condoning polygamy some years later, his antipolygamist disciples formed the backbone of his society, although Bennett's appointment proved as unpopular with the Strangites as it had with the Mormons.

Strangite missionaries unquestionably were enjoying considerable success at Brigham's expense. Writing in
January 1846, Isaac Paden, president of a small Mormon congregation in Knoxville, Illinois, northeast of Nauvoo, told of how "the principle part" of his branch had recently become disaffected. "Many of them are filled with the notion that J. Strang is the man to lead the Church. . . . I am convinced that Strang under the present situation of the Church will cause the greatest split that ever has been made." Soon afterwards, Paden himself became disillusioned and left the Church.

On 8 February 1846, William Huntington recorded the last pleadings and instructions of the apostles to the members left behind describing it as "a solemn, solemn time, a time long to be remembered, yes ever to be remembered. Many were backing out, leaving the Church and following a false prophet by the name of Strang." Apostle Wilford Woodruff upon returning from his mission to England, arrived in Nauvoo in April 1846 and was appalled at the success Strangism was having in the area.

The plight of the Church struggling in the wilderness was a tempting target for Strang's reporters. Appearing in the Voree [Wisconsin] Herald, (Strang's official publication) in March 1846 was the following caustic editorial:

Going to Oregon or going to California we look upon as much the same thing. . . . I hope this may settle the question who is carrying out Joseph's measures and who are apostates. . . .

But did not Joseph contrive the California scheme a little before his death? No nor at any
other time. He contrived a scheme for 25 men without families to take a mission among the Indians and take measures for establishing a stake among them. . . . Quite another thing from taking out thousands of women and children to perish by famine, flood and Indian war.

So it must have seemed to hundreds of wavering Mormons who were as unprepared for a trek across the prairies as they were unsure of Brigham's rightful claim to Church leadership.

Charles R. Thompson, an on-again-off-again disciple, described Strangite missionary tactics in a letter to Brigham.

Soon after your departure Strangism began to be propagated with great zeal by some individuals in the city. I at first paid but little attention to it but out of idle curiosity went to hear them lecture. I considered all their arguments futile and of no weight but disliking the manner in which their arguments were treated by some out of sympathy (sic) and to gratify the idle curiosity of some friends. . . . I went to hear [John E.] Page lecture one after noon. . . . I became convinced that Strang was the Prophet to lead the Church and the twelve were usurpers. 78

In light of the conflict, apostle Orson Hyde, charged with overseeing the Church in Nauvoo in Brigham's absence admitted, "It is no very desirable job to stay where hell boils over every breeze that blows." 79

To encourage Hyde, Brigham, writing from a point some fifty-five miles west of Nauvoo, told him that Strang's charges of a mutiny and insurrection were false "notwithstanding all the lyings, slanders and malicious
reports that have been got up at Nauvoo by Strangites, apostates and mobcrats." Brigham concluded with this warning: "let Strangism alone it is not worth the skin of a flea."80

Nevertheless, Strangism was on its way to converting some three or four thousand people before it was through and Brigham could not overlook the threat. In fact, some of his own leaders in camp and most effective trail blazers, would soon cast their lot with Strang. As long as the Church had no resting place, it was in an exposed and dangerous situation, a transient flock in search of higher ground. Hence, Brigham's acute sense of urgency to flee Nauvoo and organize a company of pioneers to go in advance of the first division, reach the mountains, and establish a gathering place and focal point for the Church.

For some, choosing between Brigham Young and James J. Strang was hardly a solution to their dilemma. Despondent, frustrated, and profoundly disillusioned, they asked difficult questions. How could God have permitted the murder of Joseph Smith, His supposed prophet? Why the present split and acrimony among the ranks over the succession? Who was this upstart Strang anyway? And surely Brigham wasn't serious about leaving their homes which they had worked so hard to build, the temple, and the city itself which, not long before, apostle Willard Richards had called "a cornerstake of Zion forever."81

One such confused follower was Nelson Bates, an 1838 convert from upstate New York who had served four
proselyting missions for the Church to Upper Canada and who, in October 1844, had been assigned to preside over the several branches of members in New Hampshire. Bates and his wife had even received their endowments in December 1845. But caught in the social and theological crosscurrents of Nauvoo in early 1846, Bates wavered. "In the winter of 1846," he recalled, "Mr. Strang laid his claims before the people fully sustaining himself from what had been written and acknowledged as the faith of the church. Many of the most prominent members abandon[ed] the idea of going into the wilderness. . . ." Though invited to become one of Strang's apostles, Bates declined and, holding no allegiance with either camps finally left Nauvoo and the Church. With no other place to go, he returned to New York where he resumed his former work as a school teacher. His story was probably typical of hundreds of others. 82

This, then, approximated the confused state of things in February 1846 as Mormon leaders stood poised ready to move, if necessary, with all requisite haste to escape whatever its enemies might send against it. Uppermost in Brigham's mind was a quick thrust to the mountains. What he and those around him underestimated were the trials of the ensuing march and the compelling desire of the Saints not to be left behind but to go west with the Twelve, escape the inevitable persecutions and disaffections and assist in securing a new home. Brigham may have been able to flee from his enemies, but he would never get away from his followers.
FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER ONE

1 Brigham Young to Joseph Young, 9 March 1846, Brigham Young Papers, Church Archives, Historical Department of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City, Utah, hereafter cited as LDS Church Archives.

2 Because of the frequent references in this dissertation to the name "Brigham Young," the author's inclination to stress the personal as well as the official aspects of the following history, and out of no disrespect whatsoever for the man and his office, I've chosen to use the name "Brigham" most of the time.


4 B.H. Roberts, A Comprehensive History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Century 1, 6 vols. (Salt Lake City: The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1930), 2:505.

5 Brigham Young to Wilford Woodruff, 16 October 1845, Brigham Young Papers.

6 Irene Hascall to Ursula B. Hascall, 26 September 1845, Hascall Family Letters 1845-54, Library and Archives, Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, The Auditorium, Independence, Missouri, hereafter referred to as the RLDS Library and Archives.

7 Brigham Young, Manuscript History of Brigham Young, comp. Elden J. Watson, (Salt Lake City: Elden J. Watson, 1971), 28 August 1845, p.16.

8 Ibid, 9 September 1845.


10 The "Nauvoo Covenant" reflected Brigham's style of leadership and his commitment to assist the poor and destitute. In 1839, while Joseph Smith was incarcerated at Liberty Jail in Liberty, Missouri, it was Brigham Young who drew up the "Missouri Covenant" to assist the Church membership leave Missouri for a new home in Illinois. Proposing that they "never desert the poor who are worthy", he persuaded over 200 men to sign a covenant "to stand by and assist each other to the utmost of our abilities" to find a new home in a friendlier environment. History of the Church 3:250-54.

Irene Hascall to Ashbee G. Hascall, 8 November 1845, Hascall Family Letters.

A study of over forty families at the Missouri River in 1848 revealed an average of 5.6 members per family. Mill Branch Record Book, 1848, LDS Church Archives.

Arriving at a firm population count for Nauvoo is difficult. The 17,000 figure, considerably in excess of the 12,000 given in the 1843 census, probably includes many Mormons flocking into Nauvoo at the end of 1845 both to escape persecutions in outlying areas and to participate in wagon building. Nelson Bates, whose journal gives fairly accurate accounts of populations in Buffalo, Cleveland, Erie, and Chicago, estimates Nauvoo's January 1846 population at 17,000. Nelson Bates Journal, Nelson Bates Papers, RLDS Library and Archives. A few hundred other Mormons lived near Nauvoo in surrounding towns and villages and may have been included in Bates' estimate.

Letter of Irene Hascall, 29 October 1845, Hascall Family Letters.

Brigham Young to David S. Hollister, 1 January 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 20 January 1846.

Brigham Young to David S. Fullmer, Joseph L. Heywood, and Almon W. Babbitt, Nauvoo Trustees, 11 March 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

History of the Church, 5:85.

Journal History of the Church, 26 April 1846, Church Archives. The Journal History is a massive chronological collection of newspaper and other items relating to the history of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints compiled under the direction of the late Andrew Jenson. Hereafter cited as Journal History.

History of the Church, 6:222.

James Allen Scott Journal, 19 April 1846, James Allen Scott Papers, LDS Church Archives.

See footnote #3.

History of Brigham Young, 20 January 1846.


27 Brigham Young to Wilford Woodruff, 17 December 1845, Brigham Young Papers.

28 Brigham Young to Orson Hyde, 2 April 1846, Brigham Young papers.

29 To minimize usage of the lengthier term "Latter-day Saints," to provide an alternative to the word "Mormons," and to reflect the historical usage of a term these people deliberately used to describe themselves, the word "Saints" will be used frequently throughout. This does not imply that these people, like others, were without sinners nor is it meant to convey the author's prejudice.

30 Brigham Young to William Huntington, 22 June 1846, "A History of William Huntington."


32 The Doctrine and Covenants of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (Salt Lake City, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1967), Section 132. For more on temple work see Chapter Ten.

33 Brigham Young to James Emmett, 26 March 1846, Brigham Young Papers.


35 Brigham Young letter, 17 December 1845, Brigham Young Papers.

36 Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 24 January 1846.

37 "A History of William Huntington," 20 October 1845. In late December 1845 several men from Carthage, Illinois, the county seat, stormed the temple and seized a man they mistook for Brigham Young. George Miller had disguised himself as the Mormon leader.

38 Journal of John D. Lee, 10 January 1846, John D. Lee Papers, LDS Church Archives. For more on the Council of Fifty see Chapter Two.

39 Joseph L. Heywood to Brigham Young, circa. 15 January 1846, Brigham Young Papers.
Brigham Young letter, 17 December 1845, Brigham Young Papers.

Manuscript History of Brigham Young, unpublished version, 18 January 1846, LDS Church Archives.

Journal of Hosea Stout, 23 January 1846, Hosea Stout Papers, LDS Church Archives.

Joseph L. Heywood to Brigham Young, circa. 15 January 1846, Brigham Young Papers.


History of the Church, 3:175 and 5:67.


As early as July 1843 and on several occasions thereafter, delegations of Pottawattamie Indians had met with Joseph Smith seeking counsel and direction. Joseph sympathized with them and taught them his religion, but did not preach insurrection or rebellion. History of the Church, 5:480, 542-49.

Unruh, The Plains Across, p.332. Unruh quotes Theodore Edgar Potter as saying, "For honesty, purity, truthfulness, trustworthiness, and honor, between the Indian and Mormon, give us the Indian at all odds."

As quoted in De Voto, The Year of Decision, p.146.


Polk, The Diary of James K. Polk, 1:443.

Brannan's ship, Brooklyn, arrived in San Francisco 19 July 1846.

Brigham Young and the Council of the Twelve to Jesse C. Little, 6 July 1846, Brigham Young Papers.
56 Governor Thomas Ford to Sheriff William B. Backenstos, 29 December 1845, Manuscript History of Brigham Young. B.H. Roberts maintains that Ford wrote the letter to hasten the Mormon removal, that he knew nothing of the War Department's intent, and thus soundly condemns Ford for his trickery and subterfuge. See B.H. Roberts, Comprehensive History, 2:532-35.

Ford himself admits that he wrote the letter with a scarcity of hard facts. However, it must be emphasized that Ford did not say for a certainty an army would come. Rather, his words were that Polk "might order up a regiment or two of the regular army, and perhaps call on me for the militia." [Italics mine]. After all, he did admit it was all "such guess work" and should not be too hastily criticized for taking any and all possible measures to prevent what he perceived as unavoidable bloodshed if the Mormons delayed. Roberts' criticism of Ford is itself evidence that he believed Brigham put some stock in the possibility of federal intervention.

57 Samuel Brannan to Brigham Young, 12 January 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

58 President Polk, significantly, did not believe that he was authorized, constitutionally, to interfere with the Mormons. He confided in his diary that "I told him [Gov. Ford] I could not interfere with them on the grounds of their religious faith, however absurd it might be considered to be; that if I interfere with the Mormons, I could with the Baptists, or any other religious sects." Diary of James K. Polk, 1:205-206.

59 Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 29 January 1846.

The argument that the vanguard company of Mormons may have left Nauvoo out of fear of government interference and not because of widespread local persecution is further confirmed in a letter from Brigham to James Emmett.

"When we left Nauvoo the feelings of the people around were somewhat more favorable than they had been for sometime previous especially in the counties some distance from us, but inasmuch as the time had fully come for this church to be transplanted into a far distant country... we left all our houses and property to be disposed of to assist the poor to follow after us to our departed home in the west."

Brigham Young to James Emmett, 26 January 1846, Brigham Young Papers.


61 Ibid., 27-29 January 1846. It is significant that the first band of refugees was to be Church leaders and not the rank and file membership. Specifically, on 1 February
orders were received "for the Twelve, High Council, Trustees-in-Trust, the old Police and Presidents of Seventies with many others to be in immediate readiness." They would become the core of the first Mormon division to cross Iowa.

62 Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 2 February 1846.

63 See especially Chapter Seven.

64 Certain it is that most of the apostles believed that they had been authorized "to bear off the kingdom" in Joseph's absence. See Leonard J. Arrington and Ronald K. Esplin "The Role of the Council of Twelve During Brigham Young's Presidency of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints," Task Paper in LDS History, No. 31 (Salt Lake City: Historical Department of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1979), p.11. For a more thorough review of the succession issue see Chapter Eleven.

65 History of the Church, 7:223-24. One possible reason for Rigdon's failure was that Joseph had earlier tried unsuccessfully to remove Rigdon from the First Presidency. History of the Church, 6:47-50.


67 Lyman Wight, a convert since 1830 and an apostle since 1841, was not out to establish a new church but to organize a Texas settlement of the Church. His purpose was to teach Indians, attract southern shareholders to the Mormon cause, raise money, and in other ways hasten and facilitate the return of the Church to the believed staging site of Christ's millenial return in Independence, Missouri. Wight was not disfellowshipped until 1849. He died in 1856 at which time remnants of his family and followers allied themselves either with the "Utah Mormons" or eventually with the RLDS Church. See Davis Bicton, "Mormons in Texas- The Ill-fated Wight Colony 1844-1858," Arizona and the West 2 (Spring 1969): 5-26.

68 For a good review of Strang, his life, and teachings, see Milo Quaife The Kingdom of Saint James: A Narrative of the Mormons (Newham: Yale University Press, 1930). A more recent work is William D. Russell "King James Strang: Joseph Smith's Successor" pp.231-56 in The Restoration Movement: Essays in Mormon History (Lawrence, Kansas: Coronado Press, 1973) ed. by F. Mark McKiernan, Alma R. Blair, and Paul M. Edwards.

69 William Alexander Linn, The Story of the Mormons from the Date of Their Origin to the Year 1901. (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1923), p.325. See also Jesse C. Little to Brigham Young, 6 October 1846, Brigham Young Papers.


Issac Paden to Brigham Young, 26 January 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Issac Paden to James M. Adams, 27 February 1853, RLDS Library and Archives.


Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 14-18 April 1846, Wilford Woodruff Papers, LDS Church Archives. Woodruff's own parents had to be 'reclaimed' from Strangite influence.


Charles R. Thompson to Brigham Young, 25 December 1846, Brigham Young Papers. Thompson's reference to John E. Page is significant. Page, a former apostle, had been converted to Mormonism in August 1833. During a preaching mission to Upper Canada (Ontario) from 1835 to 1837, he enjoyed outstanding success baptizing over one thousand people. Called "Son of Thunder" because of his preaching capabilities, he seemed to have the capacity to discuss both sides of any question. He broke with Joseph Smith primarily because of polygamy. His influence with the Church, particularly the hundreds in and about Nauvoo who owed to him their membership, his continued allegiance to several fundamental doctrines including the Book of Mormon, and his compelling oratory and preaching abilities all made of Page a significant weapon in Strang's arsenal. For a description of Page's missionary success see the author's work, "A Study of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints in Upper Canada, 1830-1850" (Master's thesis, Brigham Young University, 1975) pp.45-53.

Journal History, 27 March 1846.

See Brigham Young to Orson Hyde, 16 March 1846, Brigham Young Papers; and Journal History, 16 March 1846.

History of the Church, 6:406. Continued Richards, "here are the house and ordinances, extend where else we may."
Nelson Bates Journal, 1846, Nelson Bates Papers, RLDS Library and Archives. Bates was reconverted by his brother several years afterwards.
CHAPTER TWO

FROM THE MISSISSIPPI TO THE MISSOURI
THE MORMON TREK ACROSS IOWA

"History is never innocent, least of all when it offers a simple narrative or a single analysis as unadorned truth."¹ The Mormon exodus from Nauvoo westward across Iowa Territory defies such a simple analysis, despite the plethora of family reminiscences, county histories, and trail guides that tend to shroud this hegira in sentimental nostalgia and folklore — a sterling example of pioneer devotion and perseverance. Rather, it is a complex chapter in American history that speaks of man against man, his conflict with nature in the raw, of his struggle with an emerging frontier and a trackless wilderness, of indecision amidst determination, of dissension within authority, and of overcoming seemingly endless obstacles and discouragements.²

The decision to establish Winter Quarters when they did and where is directly traceable to the relatively disorganized, incompletely planned, surprisingly difficult, and frustratingly slow trek across Iowa. When the Saints left Nauvoo, wintering at Council Bluffs on the Missouri River was not anticipated, but by the time they reached Missouri, it had become virtually inevitable.
The purpose of this chapter, then, is to focus on two matters of special concern: one, the unexpectedly long length of time required to complete the journey necessitating a winter in the wilderness; and two, the route taken, the changes made in their line of march, and the eventual decision to cross the Missouri at Council Bluffs. These delays, disagreements, and detours take on special significance when contrasted with Brigham Young's commitment to reach an acceptable destination west of the Rocky Mountains later that summer of 1846.

Languishing at Sugar Creek

The desperate situation the Mormons now faced cannot be underestimated. There was absolutely no turning back at this point. Rather die in the wilderness than be killed in the streets of Nauvoo. But the unanswered questions taxed the faith and imagination of most everyone. Precisely where were they going? What route would they take to get there? How would they move so large a population within such time constraints over vast distances and in unfavorable winter weather?

As soon as the advanced company could assemble on the Iowa side of the Mississippi, President Young intended to divide it "so that a part of it might cross the mountains to the Great Basin soon enough to plant in the spring." An 'express' of some 300 able-bodied men would be selected to "go forward from the camp, leaving their families somewhere on the road, so as to travel with all speed." Once a new
home was established and crops planted, teams would return to bring on the families left in the wilderness while those in Nauvoo could set out directly for their new home late in the spring.

The plan was as desperate as their circumstances and not at all certain to succeed. Locating a new haven as quickly as possible was paramount in Brigham's mind for several reasons. First, to prevent possible mass starvation and suffering in the wilderness, crops had to be planted and accommodations established. Second, in the event a federal army or anti-Mormon posses did try to forestall and intercept their progress, a speedy departure was essential. Third, the Mormons did not want to be pre-empted in their choice of a suitable location by the swelling tide of Oregon and California immigrants staking out new homes in the West. Finally, as pointed out in the previous chapter, until the Church was relocated, it stood to lose ground against its detractors.

One might almost conclude that it was the bitterly cold, sub-zero winter temperatures that froze the members of the advance company in their tracks for four weeks in Sugar Creek, almost in sight of their warm Nauvoo homes. Eliza Maria Lyman painted a vivid picture of the icy environment when she arose and "found the ground covered with snow." It snowed all day with the wind blowing in every direction. "Our fire is out in the storm so that we cannot get warm by
it. I am almost frozen so shall go into the wagon and make my bed and get into it as that is the only way I can get warm."5

Shivering at Sugar Creek throughout February 1846 was not entirely anticipated. Despite their avowed rush to put distance between them and possible pursuers, and very likely because of it, Church leaders were confronted with a battery of problems and circumstances that delayed them, problems that only magnified themselves later. First of all, it proved much more difficult to leave Nauvoo than anyone had anticipated. The task of assembling 1,800 people in some 400 wagons in the dead of winter was no easy one.6 Invariably there were postponements, arguments in scores of families regarding who should go in this first company, indecisions, things that had to be retrieved, broken equipment, sicknesses, last minute unattended details. and a seemingly never-ending string of unsolved problems and concerns. Some were in camp by 4 February; others could not possibly make it for another three weeks. Brigham, constantly entreated by individuals to deal with problems, became ensnared in details. The press of private and Church business prevented his departure until 15 February and required him to return to Nauvoo at least once within the month. William Huntington, writing 17 February, said the camp was "waiting here for some brethren to come from Nauvoo - brother [Newel K.] Whitney and [William] Clayton not over."7 Brigham Young, elaborating on the matters, said they stopped on Sugar Creek three weeks "to get teams to
drag out Whitney and Clayton with the public property [sic] they had in charge, such as mill irons, saws, guns, etc."\textsuperscript{8} Deciding to leave ahead of time caught many off guard.

Secondly, the weather proved undependable. Earlier in the month, the Mississippi River had completely frozen over providing quick and easy crossing for heavily-loaded wagons, cattle, sheep, and other animals.\textsuperscript{9} Many took advantage of the circumstances, interpreting it as a Divine favor. But by the end of the month, moderating temperatures had caused the river ice to break up and flow in large, dangerous chunks where before a solid sheet had formed a highway. Apostle Amasa Lyman departed Nauvoo 23 February and "Found the ice running the river s[+] it was impossible to cross that night except in a skiff which [he] succeeded in doing with great difficulty."\textsuperscript{10} Orson Pratt records that many were detained on the Illinois side because of the ice flows on the Mississippi.\textsuperscript{11} To transport large numbers of wagons, provisions, livestock, and other necessaries by ferry across the Mississippi under the best of conditions was both time consuming and dangerous; to do so amidst jagged, fast-moving ice-flows, proved a formidable challenge.

Many of the early arrivals took advantage of the wait to return to Nauvoo to augment their provisions, spend more time with their families, confer with the trustees on details and prospects of property sales, and attend to previously unfinished business. And the longer the camp remained at Sugar Creek, the larger it grew as more and more
husbands arranged to bring out their families with them, fearful of leaving them behind.

A third cause of their extended stay were the lengthy deliberations regarding which route to follow across Iowa territory and beyond to the Missouri River. With one eye on Nauvoo and another on the far West, authorities had found it difficult to focus attention on the question. While their eventual destination remained somewhere in the Rocky Mountains, the immediate course to pursue remained anything but clear. Evidence suggests they had only the fuzziest idea of where to cross the Missouri, and how to cross Iowa seemed open to debate and revision.  

Ezra T. Benson, later ordained an apostle in Iowa observed, "We crossed the Mississippi River leaving our beautiful city and Temple, not knowing where we should go." Others echoed Benson's remarks. Clara Decker Young said that theirs was an "uncertain pilgrimage" and that they "didn't know where they were going, only that it was across the plains."  

Brigham Young later admitted that at the time of crossing the Mississippi, he did not know "whither they were going."  

The last week to ten days at Sugar Creek were largely dominated by discussion over travel plans. Several men in camp possessed considerable knowledge of Iowa. Bishop George Miller, in company with John A. Mikesell, had scouted ninety miles up the Des Moines River in the summer of 1840 on assignment from Joseph Smith to find a suitable place "for establishing and building up a stake or branch of the church."  

In July and August of 1843, Jonathan Dunham had
travelled all across Iowa as far west as the Missouri River preaching to various Indian tribes all along the way. And in 1845, Henry G. Sherwood, former Nauvoo city marshall, in company with Joseph L. Heywood, had travelled horseback northwesterly across Iowa to visit James Emmett's settlement, camped in the Vermillion River country.

All three men, Miller, Dunham, and Sherwood, were at Sugar Creek and at least two, Miller and Sherwood, actively participated in travel plans. Several councils were convened, apparently without agreement. Bishop Miller grew frustrated with the delays and changes in plans and found himself increasingly critical of Brigham's style of leadership and personality. "While we were camped on Sugar Creek" he recorded, "there was hardly a night without a council, and quite as many changes of plans as councils. . . . We had repeated delays, from causes that I could not understand."

But understanding Iowa was precisely the difficulty since the Iowa of 1846 posed a formidable challenge to any would-be overlander. Ever since the Black Hawk Indian War of 1830-32, eastern Iowa had been open to settlement. In 1838 it separated from Wisconsin and became a relatively small territory. From 1838 to 1846, its population tripled from 30,000 to 96,000 most of whom were clustered in the eastern counties along the Mississippi and Des Moines rivers. Although the lines of settlement were advancing inexorably westward onto newly-acquired parcels of land purchased by the federal government from retreating Indians,
population remained sparse. Even the border with Missouri was in question.

Roads leading westward across Iowa in 1846 were few and of poor quality. In 1839, a federal highway or "agency road" opened from the Mississippi northwestward to the Sac and Fox Indian agency near Ottumwa on the Des Moines River. Along this route sprang a number of river communities the Mormons would pass through. But beyond these frontier settlements, in south-east and south-central Iowa as far as the Knoxville meridian or Red Rock line in central Iowa, farms and fledgling, intermittent settlements were connected by the poorest of roads, more aptly described as mere surveyed trails. Travel was best either in the coldest parts of the winter by sled or in the dry summer after the spring rains. Beyond Appanoose and Wayne counties in south-central Iowa and sprawling west to the Missouri River was a vast, unsurveyed, trackless wilderness.

Research has not yet determined what maps the Mormons used in charting their course across Iowa. Certainly they had studied John C. Fremont's maps of the trans-Missouri regions but Fremont was sparse in his descriptions of Iowa. Most likely they used the writings and maps of Fremont's mentor, J. N. Nicollet, who in January 1845 had presented to Congress a highly detailed report on the upper Mississippi Basin with much information on Iowa's topography, biology, geology, and other physical features.
Thus the Iowa of 1846, except for its eastern counties, was practically unknown and uncharted. Understandably, then, the Mormons deliberated at length on the matter. Finally on 23 February 1846, Brigham, in council with the Twelve Apostles and captains of hundreds, tentatively agreed "to pass up the divide between the waters of the Des Moines and Missouri rivers,"\(^{24}\) Specifically, this initial plan called for moving northwest along the so-called "Farmington road" and cross the Des Moines River at Bonaparte "before the ice brakes up".\(^{25}\) They intended to stay fairly close to settled communities and farm lands which, as John D. Lee recorded, "would afford us opportunity of purchasing feed for both ourselves and teams."\(^{26}\) At the same time some, like Stephen Markham and Bishop George Miller, were appointed scouts and pioneers "to go ahead and learn the best routes" and in this way, mile by mile, and by trial and error, they would follow the river road through Farmington, Bonaparte, Bentonsport, and Keosauqua before striking more due westerly.\(^{27}\)

Precisely where the camp would eventually cross the Missouri River was also important to those left behind. Many in Nauvoo were exploring the feasibility of chartering a steamboat for Council Bluffs or some other crossing point. Apostle Orson Hyde believed that many would do better by water transportation than by overland conveyance. Hyde told the Nauvoo faithful to wait until April conference "when we shall probably hear something more definite" in regards to the matter. Near the end of March, Hyde, anxious for
clarification, asked Brigham, "Tell me where the first settlement will be made, if you can, and at what place property and people shall land on the Missouri River." Clearly, then, authorities had not arrived at a firm decision while in Sugar Creek regarding a Missouri River crossing point and the precise overland route to get there.

Finally, in addition to the weather, the logistical difficulties of getting out of the city, and their extensive travel plans, the Sugar Creek encampment needed organization. Much of the October 1845 plan of starting twenty-five companies each with 100 families was now in shatters. Scores of company captains were opting to go with the advanced company swelling it far beyond original expectations. The originally conceived "Company of the Twelve" was now a disorganized, overgrown amalgam of winter refugees. New appointments and a redistribution of manpower were required. An immediate census had to be made to accurately determine who was all there, the availability of provisions, and the number and nature of livestock in camp. This was no easy task since the camp's make-up changed almost daily with some parties returning and others arriving from Nauvoo.

Brigham, by now sustained as "President of the Camp of Israel," assembled the camp together on 17 February and organized it along military lines with captains over companies of tens, fifties, and hundreds. "It will not do to start off helter-skelter without order and decorum," he said while calling for patience, obedience, and
cooperation. 32 Each company of one hundred was to have a clerk, an historian, and two commissaries. The latter were assigned to contact settlers and negotiate for food and provender and to distribute provisions fairly among the company. Families assigned to one company were expected to remain in and report to that subdivision. At least four companies, each approximating one hundred families, were organized: Brigham Young's, Heber C. Kimball's, George A. Smith's, and Amasa Lyman's.

Besides these travelling companies, a "pioneer company" under Col. Stephen Markham was to scout ahead the best routes, find trading settlements, build bridges, and make other preparations. 33 It would appear, however, that Markham deferred or at least shared this responsibility with George Miller. Some, such as Hosea Stout, were assigned other responsibilities. He and a group of about 100 men were armed with rifles and commissioned to act as police for the encampment. 34

But attempts at organization were undermined not only by the constantly changing make-up of the camp, but by both petty and serious jealousies, disagreements, and personality conflicts. Hosea Stout, not content to work under too many bosses, was constantly observing, perhaps exaggerating, cases of disobedience and friction. He recorded that George Miller and John Scott "found it difficult to give prompt and unquestioning obedience to the commands of Brigham Young especially when they were issued by Albert P. Rockwood." Stout noted that "both Miller and Scott had been appointed
to the Council of Fifty by Joseph Smith, so considered
themselves equal in rank and authority to Brigham Young and
higher than Albert P. Rockwood."\(^{35}\)

Some have argued that the Council of Fifty played a key
role in both the preparations for and the progression of the
Mormon journey westward.\(^{36}\) Most evidences for this claim,
such as Benjamin F. Johnson's *My Life’s Review* and other of
his writings are retrospective and sketchy. But if the
Council of Fifty did exercise leadership and provide
temporal direction commensurate to the quorum of the Twelve
Apostles and more especially those three or four apostles
closest to Brigham who acted as an executive council, it is
not clearly evident.\(^{37}\) It is significant that men like
Miller, who was a council member, always felt rebuffed and
slighted.\(^{38}\) Brigham was centralizing command, not
dispersing it. As the camp travelled west, communication
between companies deteriorated and collective leadership
became impossible. The Council of Fifty's influence
deprecated in inverse proportion to Brigham's increasing
control over Church and camp leadership.

So it was that the Mormon pioneers, numbering over
2,000 by the end of February, waited in the snows of Sugar
Creek.\(^{39}\) On the eve of their departure, Brigham wrote James
Clark, territorial governor of Iowa, announcing their
intentions and seeking his sympathetic understanding of
their desperate plight. Brigham was particularly anxious to
be allowed to make temporary farms in Iowa, if necessary,
"in the settled or unsettled parts" in order to facilitate the exile. 40

On 1 March 1846, 3 1/2 weeks after the first crossing of the Mississippi, the "Camp of Israel" began moving west.

Across the Mud Flats of Iowa

Their immediate plan was to reach the Missouri by mid-April, plant small acreages along the way for those coming behind, establish a portion of the camp somewhere west of the Missouri as a farm or way station for future travelers, and "dispatch a swift company across the mountains with seeds for a spring crop." 41 But the impending travel difficulties forced major revisions of their expectations and timetables.

Their fundamental problem was the lack of preparation, namely, inadequate or faulty supply of provisions, foodstuffs, and materials. While Brigham in his letter to the governor blamed their plight on their persecutors, toward the Saints themselves he was far less complimentary, more caustic, and increasingly critical.

Everyone in this advanced company was expected to come prepared with a year's provisions and all the necessities for extended travel. The well prepared came with a solidly built wagon, a harness, a good dependable team of horses or oxen, some cows, 1,000 pounds of flour, 100 pounds of sugar, farming and mechanical tools, cooking utensils, seeds, clothing, a musket, and other necessities. A full stock of supplies weighed at least 1,900 pounds and cost anywhere
from $700 to $1,500 depending on the quantity and quality of materials. But Brigham later lamented that "eight hundred men had reported themselves without a fortnight's provisions" and because of it were feeding off the supplies of the Twelve and others in the camp. Consequently, they were constantly seeking work in eastern Iowa towns to pay for food and provisions.

In their defense, many were victims of circumstances beyond their control. Some had been requested to leave before sufficiently ready; others were property rich but provision poor, having been unsuccessful in selling their Nauvoo holdings. For many the only way open lay in consigning their lands to the Church - specifically the Trustees left behind - and on such credit borrow a "Church team" until their properties were sold. An estimated half of the 400 teams in camp were public property, i.e., Church-owned.

In contrast, some found themselves overly prepared and far too heavily loaded, a not uncommon experience with emigrants unfamiliar with the hardships of wagon travel in the west. Wrote Willard Richards from Richardson's Point, 9 March 1846, "Do not take a 1,000 useless things when you start, to overload your teams. 1,000-1,200 [lb] is a good load for one team on a long journey. I gave away 4 or 500 lbs of flour to lighten my loads."

While some were either over or under prepared, others were incorrectly provisioned. Flour, in its unprocessed state, was not as durable a food as parched corn, biscuits,
crackers, and other breadstuffs and was too susceptible to rapid spoilage and loss, especially in wet weather. Ironically, by the end of March, Church leaders were counselling those coming behind to bring more cash, household wares, and less bulky provisions. "Crockery, iron ware, light chairs, light stands, clocks, not forgetting all such kind of light valuable articles . . . about their houses" were recommended for bartering purposes. As Willard Richards said, "a few hundred pounds may be exchanged for many hundred pounds of corn, corn meal, flour, oats, pork, etc. and thus accommodate the inhabitants on the route."46

But because they needed food for their families and feed for their livestock, men repeatedly hired themselves out for temporary jobs wherever available. These included husking corn, splitting rails and fencing fields, grading stretches of road, constructing bridges, digging wells, building houses, cleaning farms, "and whatever else offered itself."47

Noted Iowa historian, Edgar Harlan, observed that the Mormons "drove resistless bargains for their skill and labor with the Iowa settlers." As a result, "the spring of 1846 in the Des Moines Valley above Farmington saw more frontier cabin shanties replaced by two story dwellings than has occurred, perhaps, in any life time and area in any western state."48 Nor was all work manual labor. William Clayton frequently refers to playing in William Pitts' brass band and presenting formal concerts in various Iowa Communities.49 Though time-consuming, without such means of
labor and support, mass starvation would have been inevitable.50

But with men on the job instead of in the wagons, progress was painfully slow and largely explains why most of the camp tarried almost three weeks at Richardson's Point (near present day Bloomfield) only fifty-six miles from Nauvoo. While many opted to stay behind, the camp, in intermittent spurts, inched ahead along the north bank of the Fox River before veering southwesterly stopping temporarily at the Chariton River, Shoal, and Locust Creeks in disputed border lands between Iowa and Missouri. (See map on following page)

As the Mormons advanced beyond the more settled areas, detours for food and labor became more difficult and time-consuming. Several commissaries and traders travelled incognito far into northern Missouri to seek provisions among anti-Mormon farmers and settlers some of whom had participated in driving the Latter-day Saints from the state eight years before. Not surprisingly, the cost of provisions increased the further west they travelled. Corn that had sold for 12-15c/bushel along the Des Moines doubled in cost beyond the Chariton River.51

Their lack of preparations and continuing need for supplementary employment deeply worried camp leaders. Helen Mar Kimball Whitney, daughter of Apostle Heber C. Kimball, noted that "In that first exodus" there was such a great desire among the people and such a determination to migrate with the first company that "hundreds started without the
The following map is based on J.N. Nicollet's Report Intended to Illustrate a Map of the Hydrographical Basin of the Upper Mississippi River, Document #52, 28th Congress, 2d Session, House of Representatives (Washington: Blair and Rives, Printers, 1845).

The route markings superimposed, both actual and proposed, are derived from original manuscript sources.

1" = @ 40 miles.
necessary outfit. They could neither procure sufficient
teams nor provisions, which retarded our progress, and was
the cause of a greater amount of suffering than there would
otherwise have been. And my father," she recalled, "in
speaking of it said, under the circumstances it would take
years to reach the mountains."\(^52\)

Another retardant was the almost constant shuttling of
men back and forth from Nauvoo. "I was continually teased,"
said Brigham, "by men saying, 'May I go back to Nauvoo for my
family?' I counselled the brethren to let their families
remain where they were, and go and make farms and raise
something for them to eat when they do come." He admitted
that he "almost felt to curse the man that would not hearken
to counsel but would tease and beg continually to be
permitted to go back."\(^53\)

However, he never denied anyone who was determined to
return and bring out his family, for he viewed Nauvoo as an
increasingly dangerous place for the Saints. Nine days
after the break-up of the Sugar Creek encampment, Brigham
confided to his brother that Nauvoo "is not the place for me
any more... Do not think, Brother Joseph I hate to
leave my house and home. No, far from that. I am so free
from bondage at this time that Nauvoo looks like a prison to
me. It looks pleasant ahead, but dark to look back."\(^54\)

Brigham was as concerned with the allegiance and
faithfulness of the membership as he was with their physical
safety. He left instructions with Apostle Orson Hyde to
speedily complete the temple and then assist in bringing on
as many as possible. As discussed in the preceding chapter, there was a growing fear that those trapped in Nauvoo might ally themselves with Strangite and other factions. Hyde took his assignment so seriously and so genuinely feared and despised Strang that he proclaimed a revelation cursing the Wisconsin prophet and his followers "for they have perverted my law and deceived my servants. Evil men, ambitious of power, must needs arise among you, and they shall be led by their own self-will and not by me," said Hyde. He concluded by calling for harmony and obedience.

This purported revelation proved as embarrassing to Brigham, who as chief apostle had not yet obtained any revelations, as it did opportune to Strang who immediately pounced on the paradox and played it for all its worth. The editor of the Herald countered directly:

We learn by the Book of Doctrine and Covenants that no one shall be appointed to the gift of revelation except it be through Joseph. . . . Hyde was not appointed to this gift by Joseph, and he does not pretend to have been so appointed, and has declared before a congregation of thousands in Nauvoo that no one was, and never would be.

The Strangite press diligently followed the Mormon exodus and offered its own reasons for exclaiming the tardiness of the Camp of Israel claiming that Brigham halted to send missionaries back to Nauvoo to reclaim the wavering and the unsure.

Meanwhile a further delaying factor was the problem of coordinating the camp's forward progress. The task of
controlling so many people in such unfavorable circumstances was almost overwhelming. On leaving Sugar Creek, Brigham indicated that when he intended to call together the entire camp he would raise a white flag; when only the captains of companies, a blue one. But blue and white flags notwithstanding, by the fourth week of March it had become painfully obvious that camp organization and manner of travel were too loose and unmanageable and were impeding rather than contributing to their progress. Instead of rolling out in single file and staying in close proximity one to another, wagons often scattered fan-like for miles across the Iowa landscape, particularly west of the Des Moines River. Some were off exploring with Miller and the Pratt brothers while others were busy in some settlement or farm. Men on horseback were kept busy merely carrying dispatches between the leaders among the separated companies. The entire camp never once reassembled as a total unit for combined Sabbath worship for over eight weeks.

Driven to exasperation by these events and by the adventurous, independent, and competitive spirit of Bishop Miller and others like him, Brigham decided to exercise much firmer control by demanding stricter obedience and cooperation. His frustration and determination are clear in this dispatch written 26 March from the Chariton River to Bishop Miller, Parley P. Pratt, and Orson Pratt:

We have found to our entire satisfaction that the course taken by Brother Miller from the commencement
of this campaign, and the course you
are now pursuing has already . . .
cost us sorrow and trouble. . . . You
must know that this large body of people
cannot be transplanted in a distant
country without order in our travels. . . .
It will not do for the camp to divide off
in parties and each take their own
course. . . . We have labored diligently
to overtake your division of the camp so
as to organize, but just so sure as we
come within a few miles of you we find
you off again seemingly determined to
keep out of our reach. . . . Now this
confused state of things cannot be borne
any longer. 60

Brigham threatened that unless their attitudes changed, they
would be severed from the councils of the Church. 61

Consequently the following day at an encampment between
the Chariton River and Shoal Creek in southern Appanoose
County, the camp was thoroughly reorganized. New captains
and leaders were chosen where necessary, much stricter laws
adopted requiring the companies to stay closer together, and
several other changes made to expedite their travelling, or
as the humbled Orson Pratt said, "for the convenience of
journeying and to preserve good order." 62 Brigham was
unanimously re-elected president of the whole camp. This
move apparently had been designed to counter any lingering
opinions that some were equal to him in authority by right
of membership in the Council of Fifty. The pioneer
companies were instructed to maintain much closer
communication with headquarters. Sherwood, Miller, and a
few select others were dispatched to go ahead and learn the
best route and to go on to the Platte country in western
Iowa and arrange for more work projects. 63
Route changes also slowed them down. With all the captains re-assembled, Brigham announced a course alteration decided upon some ten days before at Richardson's point. Because of the lateness of the spring, rather than proceed in the original northwest direction, they now decided to bear southwest and keep closer to the border settlements of Missouri for trading purposes. The inevitable result of this decision, recommended by Henry G. Sherwood, called for the camp to travel through the north-west corner of Missouri among more settled areas and to cross the Missouri River at Banks Ferry just north of St. Joseph, Missouri. 65 Once across, "a fleet division" would be selected to cross over the mountains in time for a late planting while the rest would "pass on more leisurely perhaps one or two hundred miles and open a field." 66 Brigham was yet clinging tenaciously to his scheme of getting as much of the camp as far west as possible in 1846, perhaps to Fort Laramie or beyond. 67

But as much as inadequate provisions, unworkable organizations, and route changes impeded their movements, their most persistent problem was the inclemently cold and incessantly wet weather. Spring was so late that prairie pasture did not appear until mid-April, much later than anticipated. "We were traveling in the season significantly termed 'between hay and grass'" , wrote Eliza R. Snow, "and the teams feeding mostly on browse, wasted in flesh and had but little strength; and it was painful at times, to see the poor creatures straining every joint and ligature, doing
their utmost, and looking the very picture of discouragement."68

One cannot exaggerate the havoc wrought upon the struggling pioneers as they suffered and slid across what Brigham called "a great mud hole" from Nauvoo to Grand River. The almost constant rain, sudden melting snows, swollen creeks, and mud were their constant companions. As bad as things were in March, they deteriorated in April.

Camp writings abound in vivid descriptions of weather-caused difficulties. Said one:

We were strung along clear across Iowa, and such roads, from one rod to a mile in width on those bottomless prairies. When the turf would hold the wagons up, it was ok, but there might be a dozen or more all sunk in the mud at once, a short distance apart. 69

Benjamin F. Johnson described the open prairie as a watered mud flat where "our mules feet like pegs, could find no bottom, and could go no further. So in the open treeless prairies we were compelled to stay."70

Between mid-March and mid-April, the rains fell almost continually and with such intensity that progress was restricted to less than 1/2 mile's journey per day. 71 Eliza Lyman made this dismal description. "Roads very bad indeed ... we had to sleep [in the wagons] as best we could, which was anything but comfortable - some lying on boxes, some on chairs, others in wet beds ... wet about a quarter of a yard deep around my ankles."72

Such agonizing delays, the sufferings of the travellers, the dangerously weakened condition of the draft
animals due to the depleted food supply, the unaffordably high prices for feed grain (up to 37 1/2 cents per bushel of corn), wagons and equipment in constant disrepair, rapidly depleting food supplies, and no prospects for better weather in the near future — all demanded a reevaluation of their course and conduct. The dream of reaching the Rockies later that season was drowning in the mud flats of Iowa and Brigham was growing increasingly worried, impatient, and annoyed. Something had to be done to save the cattle, save the lives of his followers, and save his great enterprise.

A Revision of Plans

The revised plan desperately, prayerfully forged on the muddy banks of swollen Locust Creek in Wayne county, had to solve several pressing problems. The camp itself, both man and beast, needed immediate rest and refreshment. Crops needed planting and a way station immediately established for the large emigrant trains about to depart Nauvoo. Money somehow had to be raised in any way possible to finance their protracted journey. Finally, the proposed express company had to be supplied and dispatched immediately over the mountains in time to plant late crops.

The scheme agreed upon was, consequently, multi-faceted. A large relief farm or way station would be located east rather than west of the Missouri River at or near "the head" or source of Grand River some 60-70 miles northwest of their present position, another at the Missouri, and possibly one or more further west. By
exercising pre-emption rights on land recently vacated by the Indians, the Mormons would be among the first white settlers in western Iowa, where they could live without interference and persecution.

To take advantage of such open lands, their route would need redirecting once again, essentially reverting to their original plan of moving northwest along Indian trails to Council Bluffs, thereby avoiding the Missouri settlements and Banks ferry altogether. Economic considerations also contributed to the change in directions. "We consider it wisdom to avoid the settlements as much as possible," said Brigham, "for their [sic] seems to be only one disposition which is universal amongst the inhabitants in this region, and that is to speculate out of us as much as possible, and we mean to defeat them." Willard Richards referred to the exhorbitant prices Missourians were charging Mormon traders - from $60 to $80 for a yoke of oxen that in eastern Iowa had sold for $25 and corn as dear as 37 1/2¢/bu.

The change in plans also owed much to the advice of settlers in that area. Commissary Sherwood had visited a Judge Miller who owned a mill on Weldon's Fork of the Grand River where, it was said, "the prospect for trade is good," work projects available, and corn 25¢/bu. Miller advised they travel northwest where corn prices would be cheaper.

Although some in camp had argued against traveling among Missourians for fear of a fresh outbreak of old animosities, this concern does not seem to have been the
determining factor for changing directions. For the most part, Missourians were disinclined to bother a fleeing people.

Specifically the plan called for sending fifty men ahead to the source of Grand River to "build some huts [and] plant some grain and garden seeds." After that, the main body was to travel northwest to the head of Grand River, on to Council Bluffs on the Missouri River, and then over the mountains leaving behind at their new settlement, as Brigham put it, "those that have not the means to prosecute the journey - thereby furnishing a sojourning place for those that may here after come from the States..." Others were to retrace their steps and pilot oncoming caravans along a better, more direct route avoiding creeks, bad roads, and high prices.

But instead of one farm, as originally planned, the Mormons actually built two. While waiting near Locust Creek at a site named "Pleasant Grove", the main camp received word that those trailblazers ahead had taken on a job "of building a jail and storehouse worth $250" for some settlers on the east Fork of Grand River [Weldon Creek] only 30 miles ahead.

By 25 April Brigham caught up with the forward party who were busy at work. A decision was then made to establish a farm and "lay out a town plat" there at Weldon Creek partly because of employment opportunities and the need for immediate rest. Furthermore, they did not want to get too far away from the more southerly Missouri
settlements where they could exchange unneeded articles for extensive provisions to outfit the mountain company.

Work began on the farmsite 27 April 1846 with one hundred men splitting rails, another forty-eight building log houses, others digging wells, and virtually everyone totally involved. 83 Jedediah M. Grant, David Yearsley, John Davenport, and Francis Whitney were dispatched almost immediately some forty or fifty miles down the Grand River to Missouri to barter not only for cows but also for badly needed bacon, flour, meal, and corn. Said one, "We have had no meat of any kind... for a number of weeks, but have subsisted principally on sea biscuit, and milk porridge."84

Most of the camp remained at the site, eventually named Garden Grove, for over three weeks and while awaiting the return of the four traders improved the time by building several log houses, cultivating the land, and establishing an ecclesiastical government consisting of a High Council with Samuel Bent Presiding Elder. Some 200 people, by their own choice or by assignment, would remain to oversee and improve this first way station.

But Garden Grove had its problems. For one, it was too small to accommodate the oncoming companies now on their way from Nauvoo. Indeed, it had not been intended to fulfill that assignment. Nor was it as well timbered or watered as they had hoped. 85 Finally, the place was infested with rattlesnakes. Many men killed eight or more per day despite
Brigham's instructions to destroy them only if they threatened human life.\(^\text{86}\)

Consequently scouts were soon exploring the head waters region of the main branch of Grand River, twenty-seven miles west, to stake out a bigger, healthier farm closer to the direct line of march many were then following from Nauvoo and more in consonance with their earlier plans. Parley P. Pratt apparently was responsible for locating and naming the site.\(^\text{87}\)

At Mt. Pisgah the scenes of Garden Grove were reenacted and "a farm of several thousand acres was enclosed and planted, and the place became a permanent settlement."\(^\text{88}\) Mt. Pisgah soon eclipsed the "lower farm" in size and activity. As at Garden Grove, the land was divided into five, ten, and twenty acre plots distributed, by lot, among individual families. Though the land was privately farmed, the effort was clearly a co-operative enterprise.\(^\text{89}\) On 18 Many 1846, Brigham and the Twelve arrived at Mt. Pisgah where four days later they organized another High Council to regulate both Church and civic matters. William Huntington was elected president with Ezra T. Benson and Charles C. Rich his counsellors.\(^\text{90}\)

Brigham praised the new farm in a letter to Samuel Bent back at Garden Grove.

Good water and healthy. Some good timber but not as abundant as at your place . . . yet there is good farming land plenty. Reptiles scarce only one rattle snake and one green snake have been seen within 8 miles. The council decided this day that if there were brethren at
Garden Grove who choose to come on to this place they were at liberty to do so. Should a general feeling to remove prevail we think it would be well for a few families to tarry so as to keep possession of our improvements for they are valuable and ought to bring something sometimes.

Most who stayed at Mt. Pisgah, however briefly, found it beautiful and inviting and a welcome respite from the dreariness of the immediate past. Ezra T. Benson declared, "This was the first place where I felt willing in my heart to stay at, since I left Nauvoo."  \(^{92}\)

But the Locust Creek plan, it should be remembered, had called for more than merely establishing a farm or two. The challenge of raising money was no less formidable. The solution lay in selling property back in Nauvoo, but since sales were not going well, some drastic measures were required. \(^{93}\) It was decided at Garden Grove to instruct the trustees to enter into confidential negotiations to sell the recently completed Nauvoo Temple scheduled for dedication in just two weeks' time. At the same time they agreed to try and sell the Kirtland Temple in Ohio and all other church properties in that area. Apostle Orson Pratt, who participated in these deliberations, explained their rationale. "Inasmuch as we were driven from our inheritances and homes and from the Temple," all future property sales "were but forced sales done for the purpose of keeping a poor people from perishing and that we would be justified by our Heavenly Father in so doing."  \(^{94}\)

These decisions were kept confidential for several months so as not to shock and injure the religious and
spiritual sensitivities of many followers. But Brigham, faced with a worsening economic situation and endeavoring once and for all to sever all ties with Nauvoo in order to risk everything in a western wilderness, convinced his colleagues that they really had no other choice. Besides, it was far better to sell these structures to the 'Gentiles', a term frequently used to describe the non-Mormons, than to have them fall into the hands of the Strangites or other factions who were simultaneously maneuvering for their possession and ownership. The Council of the Twelve unanimously sustained Brigham's decision on 29 April.

The initial asking price was set at $200,000, compared to a construction cost of from $600,000 to $750,000. Word was sent back to the Trustees and Orson Hyde to make every effort to consummate the transactions. Brigham was definitely counting on a sale of the Nauvoo temple as several potential buyers were reported interested, including Mr. W. Brunson who desired to use the temple as a literary institution, and later, a more serious applicant, M. Paulding of New Orleans. Apparently Brigham was expecting a quick sale since he left specific instructions for the Trustees to bring $25,000 of the total to the Mt. Pisgah settlement.

In light of his decision to sell, Brigham's determination all along to complete the temple may have owed more to economics than to prophecy. A completed structure would be most attractive to educational societies
or other churches and would consequently demand a much higher price. Whether or not the rank and file temple builders or general Church membership had deciphered this possibility beforehand is uncertain, but few, if any, objected once the intention was publicly announced at Winter Quarters. 102 In the absence of government work contracts, temple sales were essential. Though the two temples never sold, these efforts to sell underline their desperate straits. 103

As the weeks passed their difficulties intensified. Without an immediate infusion of funds the final element of the Locust Creek plan — sending an advance party to the mountains — was jeopardized. Yet regardless of what happened in Nauvoo, Brigham was resolute. While the bulk of the camp stayed behind to build way stations, a larger party would head westward to establish more sites leaving one contingent here and another there while the Twelve would reach the mountains in the summer, put in crops the following spring, and return the ensuing year to bring on those left behind. "The calculation is that some of those who are not prepared had better stay nowhere in the neighborhood of Grand River where," said Brigham," while others would move on to the Missouri River and beyond. 104

At a conference of all the assembled camp at Garden Grove, Brigham referred to his plan of encamping most in western Iowa territory "while we go a little farther and
lengthen out the cords and build a few more stakes, and so continue until we can gather all the saints . . . in the tops of the mountains."\textsuperscript{105}

Four days later, in a confidential letter to Hyde and Woodruff, he said that "after feeding and nourishing and nursing them [saints] as a mother does her infant till the last breast is sucked dry, we will give them a good farm, send their teams back to Nauvoo, bless them, and leave them."\textsuperscript{106}

But as the weeks dragged on without the express company, Brigham grew increasingly critical of what he perceived to be an unwillingness on the part of those who had covenanted to bring out the poor and save the Church. He thought too many were unwilling to give up their Church teams to the advance company or to use them to go back and bring out the destitute in Nauvoo, but were desperately holding onto them to retain their families. Rather, they were clutching to the Twelve and unwittingly, by weight of sheer numbers, preventing further progress.

Said Brigham in conference,

\textbf{The Saints have crowded on us all the while, and have completely tied our hands by importuning and saying: Do not leave us behind. Wherever you go, we want to go, be with you, and thus our hands and feet have been bound which has caused our delay to the present time, and now hundreds at Nauvoo are continually praying . . . that they may overtake us and be with us. . . . They are afraid to let us go on and leave them behind, forgetting that they had covenanted to help the poor away at the sacrifice of all their property.}\textsuperscript{107}
To prevent anyone from further delaying the Twelve and the mountain company of 100 men, those having church teams were counselled either to surrender immediately their teams to the advance company and stay and build the farms, or return to Nauvoo and fetch their families. Many in camp, if they did not openly object, quietly retired to their wagons disillusioned and discouraged. To give up their only means of travel, to sacrifice what scant materials they still had after giving all to the Church in Nauvoo in return for a wagon or some other conveyance, and now to be left in the wilds of Iowa was asking almost too much. Reflecting the frustration and discouragement many felt at this, the latest call for sacrifice, William Huntington said:

There I had one of the most severe trials I ever had - expecting that on Monday morning my goods and family to be left on the ground and by the charity of others to be helped up to the farm, [Garden Grove], as I had no team of my own, having in Nauvoo, according to council given my house and lot into the hands of the Trustees in Trust by Deed, according to covenant of the whole Church at October [1845] conference that we would, all we could to help the Church away.\textsuperscript{109}

The following Monday, 20 April, wagons and provisions were pooled together. But in discovering the degree of scarcity of food and other necessaries, leaders decided to send traders once again southward into the Missouri settlements along the Grand River to exchange watches, horses, feather-beds, and other prized personal possessions for oxen, cows, and foodstuffs.\textsuperscript{110} Until they returned in mid-May, the Camp was stalled.
Huntington eventually received permission to accompany the Twelve if he could supply himself with the necessary provisions, but his destitute plight mirrored that of many others. "I had no team of my own wherewith to go on - no meat, no flour, no corn meal, except a few quarts of parched corn meal - had no milk and only a few crackers and how I should be provided for the Lord only knew. I did not. My soul was troubled."\(^{111}\)

The scheme could have worked only if daily rations had been reduced to a scant 1/2 pound or less of bread stuff per person in the mountain company. At outdoor meetings lasting most of Sunday, 19 April, many speakers endorsed Brigham's plan including Bishop Miller who boasted he could "outrun anyone" (precisely one of Brigham's concerns) and survive on only 1/4 pound of flour daily!

But it was all too much for some. Lorenzo Young, Brigham's older brother, arose and called for calm reconsideration and common sense. "I speak not because I am asposed [sic] to the instruction that has been given but I do it merely to impress upon the minds of this camp the reality of being reduced to this scanty allowance." He then advised, "don't let the bump of ideality get so high and be carried away in anticipation to that extent that you will venture to take a journey of 12 months upon the scanty allowance of four ounces per day."\(^{112}\)

Nonetheless Brigham was not dissuaded and urged the same get-away plan recommended at Mt. Pisgah and later, with even greater intensity, at the Noddaway River on the trail
to Council Bluff. Seldom willing to admit publicly to any errors of judgment or to assume much responsibility for the Iowa delays, Brigham continued to place most of the blame for their troubles on the intransigence of the Saints. But Apostles Heber C. Kimball and Willard Richards, Brigham's closest advisors, began to differ publicly with him by urging a less demanding course, to accept the inevitability of their situation, and forget once and for all what was becoming madness - to send or lead a large company over the mountains in 1846. Instead, they suggested the Twelve remain at Mt. Pisgah or one of their new settlements, send ahead a small advance party westward as far as possible, and winter the main camps in the area of western Iowa.113

Brigham still resisted. If the Twelve were not going ahead, no one else could either. He again proposed that "the Twelve and such others as they might select should go."114 He had little confidence that others, like Bishop Miller, could be entrusted to find a suitable place and do the work he viewed as the responsibility of the Twelve. He seemed determined not to let anyone get too far ahead of him.

Brigham's final harangue on the topic was perhaps the most biting, reflecting his genuine frustration and serious apprehensions.

... We will not cross the Mountains as soon as we anticipated but I will not find fault I will let God do that... I can tell the brethren what they are doing... they have hedged up their own way by praying continually saying I am poor I have done all I could for the
church . . . and all the devils between this and the Nethermost part of Hell are acting in concert with your prayers.

He predicted they would not cross the Mountains that season which "is just what the Brethren want[,] they would rather go to Hell then to be left behind." And his conclusion reflected his fears: "I do not seek to save [my] life but the good [sic] and lives of this People to save them from following after Strang [,] Sidney Rigdon or going to St. Lewis [sic] and getting drunk and profane the Name of the Lord."\textsuperscript{115}

On 2 June 1846, the camp, now numbering over 500 wagons despite leaving several hundred souls behind at Garden Grove and Mt. Pisgah, rolled out in the direction of Council Bluffs and beyond. Four days later they found the Indian trail to the Bluffs and pursued their journey westward crossing the middle Noddaway River in the south-west corner of present Adair county, the Nishnabotna River in western Cass county, and finally the west Nishnabotna and Keg Creek in Pottawattamie county before arriving at Indian and Mosquito Creeks on 13 June.\textsuperscript{116} It required only fourteen days to cover the last remaining one hundred miles to the Missouri River during which the travellers enjoyed the unfamiliar luxury of traveling over dry, dusty trails. On their way they also passed by various Pottawattamie Indian villages. Finally, on 14 June 1846, two months behind schedule, the main camp reached the Missouri, characteristically a day or two after Bishop Miller. The vanguard, with Brigham at the head, "saw the Missouri
sprawled like a silver serpent in the sun of a mid-June morning."117

After 130 days and 327 miles, the trek across Iowa at last was over. While no one had anticipated an easy journey, few if any had foreseen the extreme difficulties which they had endured, nor the interminable delays. While gazing on the Missouri River, contemplation must have momentarily returned from that summery scene to those of less comfortable times – of the frozen Mississippi, the snows of Sugar Creek, the mud-filled prairies, the endless councils, of Garden Grove and Mt. Pisgah, of trials, sickness, and death along the way, of failure and of success. The crucible of Iowa had taught the Mormons lessons that would serve them well in times to come.
FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER TWO


Available unpublished journals for this epic include those of Orson Pratt, Horace Whitney, John D. Lee, and Eliza R. Snow.

3 Journal History, 8 March 1846.

4 Ibid.

5 Eliza Maria (Partridge) Lyman Journal, 19 February 1846, Eliza Maria Lyman Papers, typescript, BYU Library.

6 Brigham Young to James Emmett and Company, 26 March 1846, Brigham Young Papers. Andrew Jenson, Church Chronology - A Record of Important Events, (Salt Lake City: Deseret News, 1914), 28 February 1846, p. 29.

7 Journal of William Huntington, 17 February 1846, William Huntington Papers, BYU Library.

8 Journal History, 5 May 1846.

9 Eliza R. Snow recalled that from February 13th to the 18th, "we had several snows and very freezing weather which bridged the Mississippi sufficiently for crossing heavily loaded wagons on the ice." Edward W. Tullidge, The Women of Mormondom (New York, 1877: Lithograph Reprint, Salt Lake City, 1957), p. 309. See also D. E. Miller, "Westward Migration of the Mormons With Special Emphasis on the History of Nauvoo," unpublished manuscript, 1963, in the possession of the Nauvoo Restoration, Inc., Salt Lake City,
Like most studies of Nauvoo, Miller's work pays scant attention to the exodus.

10 Eliza Maria Lyman Journal, 23 February 1846.

11 Orson Pratt Journal, 18 February 1846, Orson Pratt Papers, LDS Church Archives. Pratt's meteorological, topographical, and geographical observations are a reliable source of information.

12 Some have argued that not only did Joseph Smith give details about a final destination in the Rocky Mountains but that he also left instructions on the particulars of the Iowa trek. To support their claims, reference is made to the retrospective writings of Mosiah Lyman Hancock who reported an alleged visit by Joseph Smith just prior to his death. Wrote Hancock:

"The Prophet came to our home stopped in our carpenter shop and stood by the turning table. I went and got my map for him. 'Now,' said he, 'I will show you the travels of this people.' He then showed our travels thru Iowa, and said, 'Here you will make a place for the winter, and here you will travel west until you come to the valley of the Great Salt Lake.'"


If Joseph ever made such specific statements, they are recorded nowhere else. Certainly Brigham Young indicated no knowledge of them nor did any of his advisors. In light of the many changes in travel plans made during the Iowa journey, one cannot put credence in much of what young Hancock remembered.

However, their plans to travel between the rivers (Des Moines and Missouri) and presumably head toward Council Bluffs may have owed something to Joseph Smith's attempted memorial to Congress in the spring of 1844 in which he and Orson Hyde had proposed sending a Mormon army of 100,000 westward to police the territories of Oregon and California and prevent their falling into British or Mexican control. Though the plan was considered outlandish and extreme and not even considered by Congress, the proposed route of departure may have played on Brigham's mind.

"In case of a removal to that country, Nauvoo is the place of general rendezvous. Our course from thence would be westward through Iowa bearing a little north until we came to the Missouri River, leaving the state of Missouri on the left, thence onward until we come to the Platte, thence
up the north fork of the Platte to the mouth of the Sweetwater . . . to the South Pass. . . ."

History of the Church, 6:374.

13 Journal History, 16 July 1846.


15 Discourse of Brigham Young, 14 February 1853, Journal of Discourses (Liverpool: Published by F.D. and S.W. Richards, 1854), p. 279.

16 Almon W. Babbitt, John S. Fullmer, and Joseph L. Heywood, Nauvoo Trustees, to Brigham Young, 27 March 1846, Brigham Young Papers.


18 History of the Church, 5:542-49.

19 James Emmett, a member of the Council of Fifty, had attended a meeting in February 1844 during which Joseph had asked for volunteers to explore areas west of the Missouri River "to hunt out a good location where we can remove to after the temple is completed . . . where the devil cannot dig us out." Nothing came of the meeting because of the Prophet's candidacy for the Presidency and because of the climate of hostility then developing in Nauvoo. But three months later, Emmett, feeling little allegiance to Brigham Young, set out with 150 followers across Iowa stopping first near the 'Big Woods' area (Marshall town) on the Des Moines River. Brigham dispatched several couriers, including Amasa Lyman, to dissuade Emmett from his enterprise and be "regrafted into Zion." Because of his cruelties, insensitivities, and thieving propensities many left Emmett in the winter of 1844-45 and straggled back to Nauvoo. Others, wishing to leave, were intimidated into staying for fear of their lives. Hunted by local authorities for alleged thievery, Emmett left the Des Moines River and travelled in a north-west direction finally arriving at the Vermillion River in present-day South Dakota, some 700 miles from Nauvoo, in June 1845.

Emmett returned to Nauvoo for a reconciliation with Brigham since his priesthood had been renounced earlier. Brigham, not willing to see Emmett lead his followers out of the Church or become an enemy, and anxious to use Emmett's considerable skills as a woodsman, explorer, and Indian interpreter, forgave Emmett and instructed him to remain at the Vermillion and wait for instructions regarding a rendezvous with the main body of the Church in the
wilderness. Eventually Brigham sent word to have Emmett send most of his camp to the Council Bluffs region.

Emmett, as colorful a character as he was, has received very little scholarly notice. A recent but blindly sympathetic treatment is Gerald E. Jones "Some Forgotten Pioneers: The Emmett Company of 1844 in "Eighth Annual Sidney B. Sperry Symposium" (Provo: Brigham Young University, 1980) pp.193-209. The best manuscript sources on Emmett are "The Autobiography of Allen Russell," "A Short History of the Life of John L. Butler," and "Memorandum Recounting Experiences with James Emmett Co." by James and Rebecca Nelson, all at the LDS Church Archives.


In 1844, Van Buren county could boast a population of only 9,019. Davis county was only beginning to welcome settlers while Appanoose county to the west had just been organized. J.B. Newhall, A Glimpse of Iowa in 1846, or the Emigrant's Guide and State Directory with a Description of the New Purchase (Burlington, Iowa: W.D. Skillman, Publisher, 1846).

21 Missouri surveyors in 1838 had established a northern boundary on parallel 40° 40' 06", nearly ten miles north of the present state border. Although the Governor of Missouri officially recognized this boundary in 1839, eleven years later the United States Supreme Court declared that this ten mile wide belt of land legally belonged to Iowa. Edgar Ruby Harlan, A Narrative History of The People of Iowa (Chicago: The American Historical Society, Inc., 1931), p.219.

The southern border with Missouri was still unclear and a bone of contention between the fledgling territory and its more established neighbor state to the south. Before the Mormons reached the Missouri, the Pottawattamie Indians would sell their five million acres of land in south-western Iowa preparatory to the organization and Congressional acceptance of Iowa in December 1846 as the 29th state of the union with its present bounds. Ansel Briggs became Iowa's first state governor replacing James Clark, the last of three territorial governors.


23 Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 23 February 1846.

24 Eliza Maria Lyman Journal, 3 March 1846.
Journal of Jonathan Dunham, 2 March 1846.

John D. Lee Journal, 23 February 1846.

A.W. Babbitt and Joseph L. Heywood, Nauvoo Trustees to Brigham Young, 11 March 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Journal History, 27 March 1846.

This census has not yet been located.

Some argued that Brigham patterned the 1846 camp organization after that of "Zion's Camp," organized by Joseph Smith in 1834. That travelling army of 130 men marched from Kirtland, Ohio, to western Missouri in a vain attempt to put down Missouri persecutions. Leonard J. Arrington, Great Basin Kingdom – An Economic History of the Latter-day Saints 1830-1900 (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University, 1958), p.428.

John D. Lee has left a vivid account of Brigham's 'organization speech' which he gave to the encircled crowd from atop his wagon.

"Attention! All the Camp of Israel... we have called you together this morning for the purpose of giving you some instructions with regard to the order and organization of the camp... Many of you, I have no doubt are anxious to be traveling but not more so than I am, but we must first get ready. It takes a long time to move so large a body of people as this, [ca. 1800]. It will not do to start off helter-skelter without order and decorum – if we should but few would reach the place of destination... We want to count noses and under each nose I assure you there will be a mouth to feed and when we get all the camp together then we will number Israel and organize them into companies of tens, of fifties and of hundreds and place captains over them... We do not intend to make a great many laws or bye laws to violate but we will have order and will not suffer men to run from one wagon to another."

Journal of John D. Lee, 17 February 1846.

History of the Church, 7:595.
Journal History, 18 February 1846. As with almost any other group of people of comparable size and impoverished circumstances, crime was not unknown. Some passed counterfeit money, others were guilty of stealing. "Some plead suffering from persecution as an excuse and said they were justified in stealing from the enemies of the saints because they had robbed them but such a course tended to destroy the Kingdom of God." See Journal History, 12 April 1846.


Leonard J. Arrington and Ronald K. Esplin argue that from August 1844 to December 1847, Brigham Young, as President of the Quorum of the Twelve, and apostles Heber C. Kimball and Willard Richards acted as an executive council to "manage the general affairs of the Church."


Storge Miller recalls that in reference to the Council of Fifty's political maneuverings to find a haven for the Church in Texas and elsewhere, Brigham "had no faith in it." H.W. Mills, "De Tai Palo Tal Astilla," p.136.

Recent research has proven that the Council of Fifty apparently played a more symbolic than literal role in Church government. It was only infrequently active and when assembled, was merely advisory to the decisions of the Twelve. It "exerted minimal direction on the Mormon Pioneer exodus." Michael D. Quinn, "The Council of Fifty and Its Members, 1844 to 1945," Brigham Young University Studies, 20 (Winter 1980):170.

Journal History, 28 February 1846.

Journal History, 18 February 1846.

See Willard Richards to Levi Richards, 9 March 1846, Levi Richards Papers, LDS Church Archives; and Brigham Young to Orson Hyde, 2 April 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

De Voto, Year of Decision 1846, p.144. Brigham had stipulated precisely what would-be emigrants required in a letter to Luther C. White of Calais, Maine. "You will need to make provision according to the number of your family. The rule adopted by us here is as follows:
Each family of five persons should be provided with one good strong waggon [sic] well covered—the box made light, five or three wood yoke of oxen from 4 to 9 years old—two or more milk cows—some sheep, 1000 lbs flour in stout sacks, one good musket or rifle to each male over 12 years of age, one lb. powder, four of lead, one of tea, five of coffee, 100 lbs sugar, two lbs. pepper, half a pound of mustard, ten pounds rice, cinnamon, cloves, nutmegs, 25 lbs salt, five of saleratus, ten of dried apples, one bushel beans, a few lbs. dried beef, five of dried peaches, 25 lbs seed grain, one gallon of alcohol, 20 lbs of soap, four or five fish hooks and lines, 15 lbs of iron and steel, a few lbs wrought nails, from 25 to 100 lbs farming and mechanical tools, a bake kettle, frying pan, coffee pot, tea kettle, tin cups, tin plates, knives, forks, spoons and pans as few as will do—a good tent for each 2 families, clothing and bedding not to exceed 500 lbs. This list should be full at the moment of leaving this City. . . ."

Brigham Young to Luther C. White, 29 January 1846, Brigham Young Papers. The total weight of all these materials, not counting the wagon or animals came to almost a ton, an amount they soon discovered to be far in excess of what they could possibly transport comfortably or rapidly.

43 Journal History, 21 May 1846. The "800" figure was probably an exaggeration, a technique Brigham used to support his arguments. Earlier, on 28 February, he recorded that one half of the outfits were actually overloaded and that while "a considerable number, regardless of counsel, had started in a destitute condition, and some others with only provisions for a few days", many "were provided with provisions for several months." Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 28 February 1846.

44 Regulating this matter of exchanging proceeds realized from the sale of private property for outfits and equipment was one of the most frustrating economic details confronting camp leaders. Occasionally sales would be made and inaccurate records maintained by the agents resulting in harsh feelings among those who felt they had been shortchanged. Not all were as fortunate as apostle Heber C. Kimball who realized 35 yoked oxen plus other provisions from the sale of some of his Nauvoo property. Many felt the Trustees were not active enough in selling properties, or
favored the Church authorities, or the rich, criticisms which seem largely unjustified.

Brigham, sensing the difficulty, demanded that the Trustees keep meticulous records and offered the following guidelines:

"... Whenever you make sale of the property of any individual which has or may be committed to your charge for that purpose, and receive oxen, horses, mules, cows, beeves [sic], sheep, goods, cash or any other articles in payment to make a perfect entry of those identical articles, and when you shall furnish any individual with an outfit with any of those articles, or from any church funds which are or may be in your possession, that you also make [sic] a full entry with perfect description of the same and forward us a copy [sic] ... this course strictly adhered to [sic] will cut off much occasion of difficulty and hard feeling among the Brethren hereafter. ..."

Brigham Young to A. W. Babbitt, Joseph L. Heywood, and John S. Fullmer, Nauvoo Trustees, 12 March 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

45 Willard Richards to Levi Richards, 9 March 1846, Richards Family Letters, LDS Church Archives.

46 Willard Richards to Levi Richards, 25 March 1846.

47 B. H. Roberts, A Comprehensive History of the Church, 3:42.

48 Edgar R. Harlan, A Narrative History of the People of Iowa, 1:212.


50 These employment opportunities proved an unforeseen benefit. Many men back in crowded Nauvoo, where jobs were scarce, were advised to come out to Richardson's Point for work. The money earned allowed many families to leave Nauvoo later in the spring.


52 See Helen Mar Kimball Whitney, "Our Travels Beyond the Mississippi." Woman's Exponent 12 (1883-84):102, and Journal History, 26 April 1846. Many were also delayed by the need to exchange horses for oxen which were better

53 Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 20 April 1846.

54 Brigham Young to Joseph Young, 9 March 1846, Brigham Young Papers. Nor was he alone in his sentiments. Apostle Willard Richards told his brother, Levi, to get out of Nauvoo as soon as possible. "When I look back upon the city all is darkness," he said. "When I look forward all is light and peace. ... I would like to see Nauvoo clear of all Saints as soon as the way shall open." Willard Richards to Levi Richards, 9 March 1846, Levi Richards Papers.


Hyde's revelation further condemned the adversary. "Behold James J. Strang hath cursed my people by his own spirit and not mine. Never at any time have I appointed that wicked man to lead my people." Marvin Hill, "Life of Orson Hyde," pp.83-84.

57 Voree Herald, April 1846, Vol. 1, #4, pp.4-5.

58 Ibid., p.7.

59 Part of the reasons were the long delays encountered while crossing swollen rivers and streams. To expedite matters, many turned out of line up and down the rivers to find easier places to cross.

60 Brigham Young to Parley P. Pratt, Orson Pratt, George Miller, "and their brethren" 26 March 1846, Brigham Young Papers.


62 Orson Pratt Journal, 27 March 1846. Further to reorganization, Horace Whitney records that Brigham Young, Heber C. Kimball, Parley P. Pratt, John Taylor, Peter Haws, and Bishop Miller, who had formerly been captains of companies were promoted "to the office of president", and their places filled by others. Wrote Whitney:

"In our company the vacancy of the office of captains was filled by Stephen Markham. ... In each company there was appointed two commissaries and a clerk. In our company the leading commissary is David Yearsley. His
business is to go ahead and engage grain, procure jobs for the company, etc. Our distributing commissary is Jedediah M. Grant, whose business it is to distribute corn, oats, etc. when brought into camp. Our clerk is John Pack whose business it is to record all essential matters pertaining to the company." Helen Whitney "Our Travels Beyond the Mississippi," Woman's Exponent 12 (1883-84): 118, 27 March 1846.

The captains were likewise instructed to more faithfully observe sabbath day observances within their companies and to exercise more spiritual direction, assuming, therefore, many of the duties of a bishop.

63 Journal History, 26 and 27 March 1846.

64 Erastus Snow provided this rationale for the course change.

"Finding it impracticable to haul grain for our teams, in the bad condition of the roads and it being far too early to sustain them upon grass we thought it expedient to deviate from the direct course we had intended to travel [between the Fox and Des Moines rivers] and bear further south so as to keep near the border settlements where we could obtain feed for our teams."


65 Banks Ferry, fifty-five miles upriver from St. Joseph, Missouri, at Iowa Point near present day Oregon, Missouri, had been established by William Banks in 1844. It was fast gaining popularity as a favorite crossing point for Oregon-bound emigrants. History of Holt and Atchison Counties, Missouri (1882), p.313.

66 Willard Richards to Levi Richards, 25 March 1846, Richards Family Letters. Had they adopted this plan, the Mormon trail west of the Missouri would have followed the Oregon Trail along the southern banks of the Platte River, at least at the outset.

67 Journal History, 26 March 1846.

It rained at least seventeen days in April. See Journal History for April 1846. William Huntington described their dilemma this way.

"At 12 p.m. it began to rain with 200 teams scattered over the flat prairies — roads soon became impassable — wagons constantly sticking and teams doubling and thrangling — many wagons were left on the prairie overnight with families cold and wet without fire."


The Diary of Eliza Maria Lyman, 9 April 1846.

Brigham cautioned future travellers not to start "with old wagons, old axle trees, old tongues and old any thing and old every thing that will be breaking down every half hour and hindering the whole camp." Brigham Young to A. Babbitt, J.L. Heywood and J.S. Fullmer, Nauvoo Trustees, 9 March 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

See Helen Whitney, "Our Travels Beyond the Mississippi," Woman's Exponent 12:126, 12 April 1846; The Diary of Hosea Stout, 10 April 1846; "A History of William Huntington," 12 April 1846; and Journal History, 10 April 1846.

Their decision to move northwest and set up a farm at the headwaters of the Grand River may have been influenced by Sherwood and John S. Fullmer. Both men, during their travels to the Vermillion the year before, had stumbled upon a site which, as Fullmer said, "we thought a most desirable place for a settlement of the saints, in case a chain of settlements should be made between here [Nauvoo] and the Rocky Mountains." Located some 100 miles west of Raccoon Barracks and a few miles north of the Council Bluff trail, not far from the Pottawattamie villages, the site was reportedly well timbered, watered, and possessing good soil. Concluded Fullmer: "I don't think there is anything to compare with that place."

John S. Fullmer to Brigham Young, 18 March 1846. Brigham Young Papers.

Brigham Young to A.W. Babbitt, John L. Heywood, and J.S. Fullmer, Nauvoo Trustees, 12 April 1846, Brigham Young papers. Corn prices ranged from 20c to 26c/bushel back along the Des Moines River. William Clayton's Journal, 23 March and 8 April 1846.
Willard Richards to Levi Richards, 1 May 1846, Richards Family Letters.

Brigham Young to Heber C. Kimball and "all presidents and captains of the camp of Israel," 5 April 1846, Brigham Young Papers. See also Roy Franklin Lawson, "The Mormons: Their Trek Across Iowa," p.34.


See Brigham Young to A.W. Babbitt, J.L. Heywood, and J.S. Fullmer, Nauvoo Trustees, 12 April 1846, Brigham Young Papers; and Journal History, 10 April 1846.

Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 19 April 1846.

Ibid, 25 April 1846.

Journal of Orson Pratt, 27 April 1846.

Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 7 May 1846.

Journal of John D. Lee, 2 May 1846.

Wrote Helen Whitney: "I remember that day of seeing our men killing snakes in the grass, where our tents were afterwards pitched, and it was enough to give one nervous spasms to see them, and then to think of sleeping in the neighborhood of such dangerous enemies." Helen Whitney, "Our Travels Beyond the Mississippi," Woman's Exponent, 12:127, 16 April 1846.

Parley P. Pratt, Autobiography of Parley P. Pratt (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Co., 1980), p.381. Pratt's autobiography is subject to more than the occasional error and faulty remembrance. For instance, it would appear that both Orson Pratt and Henry G. Sherwood were also instrumental in locating the Mt. Pisgah site. See Journal of Orson Pratt, 15 May 1846.


Brigham Young to Samuel Bent, 20 May 1846, Brigham Young Papers.


A.W. Babbitt and J.L. Heywood, Nauvoo Trustees, to Brigham Young, 11 March 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Journal of Orson Pratt, 28 April 1846. This business of temple sales is an unexplored area in LDS Church history. It appears that Brigham may have first broached the topic even before the exodus from Nauvoo but was rebuffed. Now in much more stringent conditions, his colleagues were less opposed but not warmly supportive of the idea. Wrote Apostle George A. Smith in a letter to Brigham,

"We have felt much anxiety on that subject until we all agreed in council not to sell it last winter. But if you in your wisdom should think it best to sell the same to help the poor in the present emergency we frankly concur, notwithstanding we feel opposed to a Methodist congregation ever listening to a mob Priest in that holy Place, but are willing to sacrifice our feelings at all times for the good of the saints."

George A. Smith to Brigham Young and Council, 26 April 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Strang's arguments were based on his reading of the deeds to both temples which stated such properties belonged to Joseph Smith and to his "successors in the First Presidency." Since Strang had already established his own First Presidency and Brigham Young was months away from that development, this may have proved one of the legal barriers to the sales. Voree Herald, September 1846, vol. 1 #9, p.2. "All we ask of the Binghamites, is that they will not burn the Temple down and lay it to the mob."

Journal of Orson Pratt, 29 April 1846.


James Whiteshead to Brigham Young, 18 August 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Joseph L. Heywood to Brigham Young, 2 October 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

See the Council of the Twelve to Orson Hyde and Wilford Woodruff, 30 April 1846, Brigham Young Papers; and William Clayton's Journal, p.25.

102. In part this may have been due to the fact that workers were still owed $2500 for work performed finishing the temple.

103. Neither temple sold due in large measure to the unstable social climate in Nauvoo, legal barriers imposed by those opposed to Brigham, and at Kirtland, by various Strangite factors.

104. Brigham Young to Orson Hyde, 21 April 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

105. *Journal History*, 26 April 1846.

106. The Council of the Twelve to Orson Hyde and Wilford Woodruff, 30 April 1846, Brigham Young Papers.


108. *Journal History*, 29 April 1846.


113. See *Journal History*, 20 May 1846; and De Voto, *Year of Decision*, p.239.

114. *Journal History*, 20 May 1846.


Roy Lawson in his thesis on the Mormon trek across Iowa agrees with another scholar of early Iowa travelers, Jacob Van der Zee, that the advance Mormon company followed a northern route crossing through the present town of Greenfield, into Cass Co., arriving at an Indian village on the east Nishnabotna River, a few miles north of Griswold. They then traveled southwest into Pottawattamie Co. "through the townships of Wright, Woveland, Macedonia, Keg Creek, Levis and Kane" bringing them to Indian Creek which they followed forming a camp in the form of a hollow square called Miller's Hollow on the Missouri River. Later companies apparently followed a slightly more southerly,

117 Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 8 June 1846.
CHAPTER THREE

"THE ADVANTAGES ARE MORE THAN THE DISADVANTAGES"
EVENTS IN WASHINGTON AND IN THE WILDERNESS THAT RESULTED IN
THE DECISION TO WINTER AT THE MISSOURI

The problems facing Church authorities and their many
followers in the wilderness, estimated by late June 1846 at
between three and six thousand, were serious and complex.
Iowa had delayed and exhausted them beyond all expectation.
Had they reached the Missouri River in April, as planned, or
even in May, chances for bringing on the "Camp of Israel"
over the mountains would have been more promising. But now
the season was too late to embark upon such a hazardous
journey in an unknown wilderness. Just to ferry their
almost 2000 wagons across the river would take weeks.¹ And
even if a small pioneer party could get away to reach
wherever it was they were going - and no one yet seemed
positively sure where that was - finding a suitable winter
location in time to plant crops, cut hay for their vast
herds, and prepare adequate shelter was their most serious
concern.²

Greatly complicating matters was their physically
exhausted and economically depressed condition both of which
demanded immediate care and attention. Danger signs were
already appearing. There were, of course, other serious
concerns. How would the Indians react? What of government
Indian agents and their attitudes? What of provisions? And what of the hated, nearby Missourians?

This chapter will examine efforts to solve those problems, explore their available options, and review the set of events and circumstances that eventuated in the decision to winter at the Bluffs. For little did anyone suspect while pausing at the Missouri River in June of 1846 that their forward progress for that year was virtually at an end.

Early Developments at the Missouri

While bunching in together on the east banks, the Mormons evaluated their alternatives. As mentioned, George Miller had reached the Missouri River a day ahead of the main camp - 13 June 1846 - and had conferred with Peter Sarpy of the American Fur Company at his station at Trader's Point (Pointe-aux-Poules) concerning the Pottawattamie Indians, ferry crossings, overland trails westward, and other topics. The following day as the lead wagons of the camp struggled over the two branches of Mosquito Creek and took up their advanced positions south of the Blockhouse "about a mile above the trading houses" (i.e. near Trader's Point), Miller reported on his briefings from Sarpy and company.

The first order of business was to construct a ferry. To move their hundreds of wagons across the river, even at the rate of fifty per day, would take weeks. Although Sarpy owned and operated a small ferry some nine miles down river
Sources Consulted in Creating the Following Map:


d) Clark, Lawrence D. Scrapbooks. Unpublished. LDS Church Archives.


Scale: 1" = @ 10 miles
connecting Pointe-Aux-Poules on the east bank with the Indian agency at Bellevue on the west, it was Brigham's determination to build one of their own, large enough for their present and future purposes thereby saving the high ferriage costs in moving so large a company. Furthermore, it would allow them to follow their own timetable. He therefore appointed George Miller, Newel K. Whitney, and Albert P. Rockwood a committee to present the matter to Sarpy and his colleagues and to offer them, in return for spikes, pitch, and other building materials, free use of the 'skow' for his own future needs whenever the Mormons would not require it. Sarpy agreed.

Bishop Miller's company was assigned to build the ferry and landings on both sides of the river with Frederick Kesler immediately in charge of construction. This first so-called "Mormon Ferry" was located several miles north of Sarpy's and north of Council Point at a location more convenient to their Mosquito Creek camp. When completed on 29 June, it was one of the largest ferries on the river, big enough to transport three wagons simultaneously. But even a new ferry failed to solve the problem of the steep embankments on the west side which resulted in almost perpendicular inclines for disembarking wagons. Travelling in wet weather was almost impossible. Even with improvements, one observer described it as "one of the steepest hills" he had ever seen, "and at the same time very rough."
But until the ferry was complete, the main camp was forced to retreat to higher ground or "Redemption Hill", as they termed it, up Mosquito Creek some nine miles from Trader's Point to escape from bad water and thieving Omaha Indians who lived on the river's west side. Peter Hansen explained that on 16 June, they "made rety [sic] to go up again on the bluffs for the sake of good water; that which was supposed to be spring water here is nothing but swamp water and is unhealthy." 

As the Mormon encampments sprawled over several square miles of high bluffs and open prairie in sight of the Pottawattamie Indian villages, Brigham forged a policy of establishing good relations with the Indians, of courting the favor and goodwill of government agents, and of developing a positive dialogue with Peter Sarpy and his colleagues. As wanderers in a strange land, they had much to gain from open cooperation and everything to lose without it.

Regarding the Indians, Brigham charged his people to "have nothing to do with the Pottawattamies, no trading or intercourse of any kind." He was determined to avoid dangerous entanglements and the risk of offending the Indians in any way and gave strict orders that no one should trade or barter with them. Whatever trading was required would be done on a collective basis and conducted only by camp leaders.
Actually the Mormons had little to fear from the 2500 Pottawattamie and half-breeds. The two peoples had known each other for some time and communication between Pottawattamie chiefs and Mormon spokesmen had been ongoing for at least five years. 18

The Pottawattamie, though never a war-like people, had some cause for celebration because of a recent treaty with the United States to sell their lands in western Iowa at a high price for a new home in the southwest. 19 This may have contributed to the spirit of cooperation between the two groups. Brigham lost little time in courting their favor by offering presents and staging several feasts and dances. 20

No less important was the need to incur the favor of the all powerful Indian agents who were in a position to report on Mormon plans, attitudes, and movements and had ready access, when required, to Colonel Stephan Kearny and his United States Army of the West stationed only 200 miles south at Fort Leavenworth. 21 If there was any truth to those rumors of Mormon collusion with the Indians, the agents would see it firsthand.

Though Brigham apparently entertained no intentions respecting the Indians other than establishing friendly relations, he was aware of the intense hatred among some in camp toward the United States. But expressing such animosity in hearing range of federal Indian agents would not be in their best interest, and he made sure that everyone so understood. His concerns were not only to prevent oppression in the form of military intervention but
also to court the favor of the agents and to gain their permission for possible winter camps on Indian lands. In a public meeting on 15 June, just a day after reaching the Missouri, he counselled the camp "to be wise and prudent, to hold their tongues and say nothing [against] this government, the war with Texas and Mexico etc. lest you subject ourselves to trouble and difficulties." The policy would be that of official silence - "say nothing about the government or about our organization or church rules; let them find these things out by their learning."\(^{22}\)

Brigham's instructions apparently paid off, at least initially. Agent R.B. Mitchell reported a positive first impression. In a letter to his supervisor, Superintendent T.H. Harvey at St. Louis, Mitchell said he was "gratified to say that since their arrival," he had "seen nothing to which exception can be taken. The principal men seem determined to hold themselves aloof from the Indians." As to their attitude towards the United States, "they complain that they have been badly treated but declare their intentions to bear the American flag, to whatever country they may cast their lot."\(^{23}\) Later, Mitchell described Mormon-Indian relations as "greatly more circumspect and unexceptionable than is usually found to be the case with emigrant bodies passing through this region of country."\(^{24}\) He, nevertheless, stopped short of permitting the Mormons from wintering on the Pottawattamie lands. So long as they were only passing through on their way west, he would pose no objections.\(^{25}\)
Brigham also accomplished his other objective of establishing a positive relationship with the traders. Besides agreeing on the ferry business, the Mormons and Peter Sarpy and company also conversed about "the road, country, and climate to and about the Rocky Mountains"—especially "about the great Bear river valley" discussing such matters as living with the Indians, the feasibility of sending out an advanced party to the mountains, and possible sites for wintering the camp.°

Convinced of their intention to move further west and aware that sizeable shipments of furs from the Indian winter hunts were likely detained up the Platte River among the Fawnees, Sarpy inquired whether the Mormons, while waiting at the Missouri, would be willing to contract out some forty teams, "to bring 20,000 of furs and peltry from the head of Grand Island." The pay would be "$1,000 plus some fifteen or twenty barrels of pork, bread, etc." Seeing "an opening for bigger jobs," Brigham quickly agreed and assigned a more than willing Bishop Miller and James Emmett to take forty wagons to Grand Island and bring on the peltry shipment.°

Emmett had been a persistent problem to everyone concerned. Until the spring of 1846, he and his company had been among the Sioux at the Vermillion River, but upon the orders of Indian agents and Church leaders had moved south.° Early in June, the Emmett party reached the Bluffs intending to merge with the main companies and set up camp approximately thirty-five miles south of Mosquito Creek, on
the east bank near the Missouri state line in order to be close to trading centers. Emmett, meanwhile, had offended his wife, alienated most of his followers, and disturbed Indian agents when it was learned he secretly had taken a squaw as another wife. He had also stolen seven Indian horses. His rash and impolitic actions caused most of his bedraggled followers to abandon him and to seek for the main camp then nearing the Missouri River. 30

Emmett's assignment to go with Miller may have been an attempt on Brigham's part to put distance between Emmett and the main camp and to defuse a potentially explosive issue. Whatever the cause, he instructed Emmett and whoever wanted to go with him to accompany Miller on the fur mission to the Grand Island. The rest of Emmett's original camp was given the choice of going with Miller and Emmett or staying where they were till further notice. 31

Emmett's indiscretions and meddlings into Indian affairs were the cause of yet another rumor - this one reported by Sarpy in late June that an army of United States dragoons was advancing north to intercept the Mormons and to "prevent their uniting with the Indians to fight the United States." 32 Sarpy reported that Mr. Mitchell had written to Colonel Kearny "for troops to take the Mormon leaders and drive off the Indians," who were making "depredations at Pottawattamie town." 33

To dispel these falsehoods Brigham commissioned Orson Hyde and Bishop Newel K. Whitney to meet with Mitchell and thoroughly review with him their purpose and policy
respecting the Indians. After conferring with Mitchell, they learned he had not instigated any such call to the army, but had written a letter some weeks previously "because of his bad impressions of the Emmett Company." Mitchell assured the Mormon delegation he was convinced of the law-abiding nature and good behavior of the Mormons now arriving at the Missouri.

Thus Brigham was glad to dispatch Miller and Emmett, via Sarpy's ferry (as the Mormon Ferry was not yet completed) and the Papillion Creek to the Elkhorn River and up the Platte to rendezvous with the Pawnees. Under strict orders to keep their mission a secret from Indian agents and not in any way to offend the Indians, and to wait for the Twelve to later catch up with them, the Miller - Emmett expedition headed west in late June.

Though false, these rumors, when coupled with Emmett's proven indiscretions and an uneasy awareness that many in Missouri opposed them, created a climate of uneasiness and suspicion resulting in a frenzied revival of the earlier plan to send a pioneer company to the mountains. On the 28 June, Brigham, believing "that all that men and hell could invent to hedge up the way of the camp would be hatched up", demanded an express company to go "to Bear River Valley in the Great Basin, without families, forthwith," as he put it, to prevent the Church from being "blown to the four winds and never gathered again." "A company of some 2-3 or 500 able and effective men" without families were to head for "the Bear River Valley, Great
Basin or Salt Lake, with the least delay possible." Their wives and children would somehow be accommodated somewhere along the way—probably Grand Island. 38 The Twelve Apostles would go with the pioneers "over the mountains to set up the Kingdom of God or its Standard [sic] yet this year." 39

Parly P. Pratt and Solomon Hancock were immediately assigned to rush back to the farms and recruit for the company. Upon meeting any of the saints along the way, they were to explain their threatened situation and call for volunteers "to try and forward the expedition [sic]". Hosea Stout, just east of the Bluffs, said of Pratt's mission, "he instructed us to push on with all possible speed that if we did not get to the Bluffs by the time that he returned [from Garden Grove and Mount Pisgah] it would be needful for us to go on and leave our families such was the necessity to push forward the expedition [sic]." 40

United States officers were indeed in the area not to attack but to recruit. And instead of running away from the U.S. Army, the Mormons were on the verge of becoming part of it.

The Call of the Mormon Battalion

On 26 June 1846, Captain James Allen and three other officers of the United States Army of the West on assignment from Colonel Stephen L. Kearny, arrived at Mt. Pisgah in an attempt to meet with Mormon leaders. 41 A gracious Captain Allen gained the permission of William Huntington to mount
the stand and on behalf of the President of the United States invited the Mormons to enroll 500 men in the army to fight in the recently declared war against Mexico.

Shocked by his audacity to ask the Mormons to assist a government they popularly distrusted, and temporarily blinded to the possible advantages, Huntington records that he "followed him with an address, as the old saying is 'by answering a fool according to his folly.'"42 Nonetheless Huntington provided Allen with a letter of introduction to the authorities at the Bluffs and sent him on his way.

Within hours Parley P. Pratt arrived in camp with orders to recruit up to 500 men for the pioneer company. Pratt apparently passed by Captain Allen unawares and when told of the officer's request, was considerably excited, though undeterred from enlisting pioneers.43

Apostle Woodruff, then passing through Mt. Pisgah, shared Huntington's doubts. "I had some reason to believe them to be spies and that the president had no hand in it."44 He sent Thomas Grover ahead to conceal all cannons and artillery from Allen's view and to reach the Bluffs with the news before Allen's arrival. Grover arrived at headquarters only a few hours ahead of Allen.45 Whether Grover was the first to inform Brigham and the Twelve of the Battalion request or whether they had heard it earlier from Missouri traders is unimportant; what is significant is that even before conferring with Captain Allen, with the information provided, Brigham Young, Heber C. Kimball, and Willard Richards "decided to raise the men wanted."46
Brigham had been hoping for this or some such similar good news ever since sending Jesse C. Little back to Washington the previous January to "embrace" whatever facilities for emigrating to the western coast the government might offer. After leaving Nauvoo, Little had travelled to his native New Hampshire to confer with his personal friend and governor, John H. Steele. Steele wrote him several letters of support and introduction to senior officials in President Polk's cabinet.

On his way to Washington, and on the same day the United States declared war on Mexico - 13 May - Little preached at a special conference of the Church at Philadelphia. In attendance was a young, non-Mormon lawyer destined to play a leading role in Mormon relations with Washington for years to come - Thomas L. Kane. Son of John Kintzing Kane, attorney general of Pennsylvania and a future federal judge and close friend of President Polk, young twenty-four year old Thomas had been following newspaper reports of persecutions against the Mormons with genuine sympathy. Kane introduced himself to Little after the meeting and the two spent the rest of the day in earnest conversation. That evening Kane obtained from Little a letter of introduction to Brigham Young since he had decided to go to the Missouri and travel to California with the Mormons. In exchange, Little obtained from Kane a letter of introduction to the vice president of the United States, George M. Dallas, and to other highly placed officials.
Without Kane's input, savvy, and connections, it is doubtful Little would have gotten very far.

Little's arrival in Washington was superbly well timed and incredibly coincidental. In the latter part of May, Polk and his cabinet were totally absorbed with war-time planning, mobilizing, and political maneuvering. Whether Polk had been angling for the war or not, he and the nation were totally unprepared for it. Recently appointed commander of the armed forces, General Winfield Scott, called for a volunteer army of 50,000 men in addition to the standing army and it was agreed that 20,000 of them would be called up from western and south-western states, including Missouri. Almost every state in the union wanted representation, although the war was much more popular in the south and west than in New England.

Polk, with his cabinet and trusted Democratic senators like Senator Thomas H. Benton of Missouri, formulated a blueprint of action that involved at first a three-pronged attack; 1) General Taylor to cross the Rio Grande with a much enlarged volunteer army to invade northern Mexico and capture Monterrey and other cities; 2) Commodore David Conner to blockade the Mexican ports on the Gulf of Mexico; and 3) Commodore John D. Sloat to seize San Francisco and blockade other California ports. After further discussion and revision in late May, the president decided to involve the Army of the west by sending Colonel Stephen W. Kearny to occupy Santa Fe and if at all possible to reach California, overpower its Mexican garrisons, and secure the region for
the United States.\footnote{53} Kearny, in Polk's words, was "to acquire for the United States, California, New Mexico, and perhaps some others of the Northern Provinces of Mexico" as ransom when negotiating a peace with Mexico.\footnote{54}

Polk's plan called for Kearny to take 1,000 Missouri mounted volunteers west plus "another 1,000 mounted men' to support the colonel's positions and guard supply lines. His most serious doubt, despite Senator Benton's assurances to the contrary, was whether there was time before winter "to collect a force on the Western frontier of Missouri in time to reach the Sacramento River in California."\footnote{55}

Against this backdrop of fast-moving events, Little had arrived in Washington on 21 May. He met the President informally the next day, but in such a social gathering had little chance to discuss his request seriously. The following day he met with Amos Kendall who "thought arrangements could be made" to assist the Mormon emigration "by enlisting 1000 of our men, arming, equipping and establishing them in California to defend the country."\footnote{56} Kendall was likely speaking with inside knowledge of the administration's evolving intentions.\footnote{57}

Little did not get to meet Polk again for another eleven days. Anxious to speed matters along and to re-emphasize the desperate straits of the Latter-day Saints, he sent off a letter to the President on 1 June. Acting under the advice of Thomas Kane, Little threatened that if the Mormons were not successful in getting support from Washington, they might seek for it from another source.
[We] are true hearted Americans ... and have a desire to go under the outstretched wings of the American Eagle. We would disdain to receive assistance from a foreign power, although it should be proffered, unless our government shall turn us to be foreigners. Means for the gathering of poor we must obtain. ... and if I cannot get it in the land of my fathers, I will cross the trackless ocean where I trust I shall find some friends to help.

What Polk and the United States government would have done had the Mormons joined hands with the British is only speculative, but clearly it was a possibility not to be taken lightly.

It is in the Mormon overtures to England that much of Kane's true motivation may be seen. As interested as he may have been in the humanitarian aspects of Mormonism, his first loyalty was clearly to the United States. Contrary to most historical assumptions, long before ever meeting Little, Kane had privately decided to visit the Mormons for he believed they were too susceptible to British overtures and might seriously complicate Oregon Treaty negotiations then in progress. In a very revealing letter dated 29 May 1846 to his brother, Elish, young Kane admitted "that it has weighed upon my mind for months past whether it was not my duty to go with the Mormons." He continued:

"this increased as I began to see signs of something which even to my eyes looked like English tampering with their leaders. I became oppressed the more ... when two days ago I saw a letter which disclosed kind assistance to the emigrant parties from the Hudson's Bay Company, [I] found I could not rest without consulting
somebody whose opinion to me would be of more weight than Papa's ridicule."

On 28 May, Kane had held a private audience with Polk in which he "told him all" he knew of the Mormons and their leaders and what he "knew of H.B. Majesty's interference." As a result of the meeting Polk encouraged Kane to travel to the Bluffs and secure Mormon loyalty considering Kane's offer of "the highest and most praiseworthy patriotism.""60

On 2 June, Cabinet approved of Polk's plan and authorized Kearny "to receive into service as volunteers a few hundred of the Mormons who are now on their way to California." Fully aware of the Mormon exodus then underway across Iowa, but wary of Mormon intentions and attitudes, Polk's invitation was "to conciliate them, attach them to our country, and prevent them from taking part against us."61 Furthermore, the Mormons just happened to be in a most strategic position at the time and, if persuaded, could expedite and facilitate Kearny's march to California in time to participate in that season's campaign.

Yet despite the potential advantages, and Cabinet's approval, Polk proved hesitant and ambivalent. The following day, Polk, in company with Amos Kendall, conferred with Little for three hours who offered the immediate services of the Mormon people. Altering the Cabinet's plan somewhat, Polk inquired whether "500 or more" Mormons would be willing to volunteer to serve in the United States Army but only after they reached California and then only to help defend that territory.62 Little, unimpressed with having to
wait until and unless they reached the coast, tried unsuccessfully to dissuade Polk even at a follow-up meeting the next day. Perhaps unknown to Little were Polk's sensitivities to criticisms likely from key Democratic senators against the possible arrival in California of thousands of Latter-day Saints. To send Mormons to California as part of the Army at public expense might exasperate an already alarmed California citizenry made up of many anti-Mormons. Hence Polk's revised plan to trim the number to 500 and then not to enlist them until Kearny's army had taken possession of California. Despite his concerns, Little penned a letter accepting the President's offer on the evening of 5 June 1846.

Colonel Kane met with Polk and the Secretary of War, W.L. Marcy, on 8 June possibly to review the Mormon Battalion matter, offer to carry dispatches to Colonel Kearny, and in other ways prepare for his journey west. On 9 June, Kane and Little left Washington together traveling as far as St. Louis. From there Little went north to Nauvoo and eventually across Iowa arriving among his people on 6 July while Kane headed toward Fort Leavenworth arriving there in late June.

Since the Mormons enlisted at the Missouri and not, as Polk indicated, at California, why the discrepancy? W. Ray Luce maintains that Marcy's orders of 3 June were written ambiguously and were "misinterpreted" by Kearny. Thus, Luce argues, "a vaguely worded letter rather than a presidential plan led to the march of the Mormon Battalion."
However, there are problems with this argument. It is true that Polk indicated a California enlistment; Kendall believed the same thing. But for reasons not yet entirely known, Marcy's orders, which both he and Polk carefully drafted and redrafted, say nothing about recruiting Mormons in California. Rather, a careful reading, the kind that Kearny must have given it, leaves little doubt that the Polk administration made a last minute flip-flop on the matter and ordered Kearny to call the Mormons immediately. More worried about securing California that season than offending it, Marcy likely persuaded Polk to change his mind. Marcy's official order read as follows:

It is known that a large body of Mormon emigrants are en route to California for the purpose of settling in that country. You are desired to use all proper means to have a good understanding with them, to the end that the U.S. may have their cooperation in taking possession of, and holding that country. It has been suggested here, that many of these Mormons would willingly enter into the service of the United States, and aid us in our expedition against California. You are hereby authorized to muster into service such as can be induced to volunteer; not, however, to a number exceeding one-third of your entire force.

How could the Mormons have assisted in taking "possession" of California if not already enlisted? And how could they participate in the "expedition" unless a part of it?

Marcy further instructed Kearny that upon arriving at California, "you are authorized to organize and receive into the service citizens of "Nueva Helvetica" on the Sacramento river, "such portion of these citizens as you may think useful to aid you to hold the possession of the country."
Had this meant the Mormons, surely Marcy would have said so. He concluded by investing "a large discretionary power" in Kearny with respect to all these matters. 67

Kearny did not misinterpret Marcy's orders. Rather he read between the lines and used common sense. Considering Polk's strong desire to strengthen Kearny's army, get it off to California at all speed, and aware that Missouri might be unable to raise a second company of a thousand infantry, Kearny followed Marcy's orders. 68 On 19 June, well before Kane's arrival, he ordered Captain James Allen to "endeavor to raise from among them [the Mormons at the Missouri] four or five companies of volunteers to join me in my expedition to that country" of California. 69

"Like a Ram in the Thicket" — Recruiting

Meanwhile, at Mosquito Creek on the morning of 1 July 1846, Captain Allen presented his credentials to Brigham Young and other leaders and asked for an immediate twelve month enlistment of 500 healthy volunteers between the ages of eighteen and forty-five. Enlistees in each of the proposed five companies would elect their own officers and march to California in the rear of the First Missouri militia via Santa Fe. They would receive pay and allowances from the moment of joining and when discharged would be allowed to retain their guns and accoutrements furnished them along the way. 70 Allen stressed that if they could not raise 500 men, "they did not want any," 71 and that owing to
the lateness of the season, the organization must be completed in six days.72

But why did Brigham agree to the plan when most in camp opposed it? The answers are multiple. First, the scheme answered their immediate problem of where they could legally winter. Brigham, seeing his opportunity, drove a hard bargain extracting from Allen permission for the Mormons to locate on Indian lands without government interference.73 Without such a pledge, Brigham faced camping illegally on Indian lands.

Second, the Battalion meant badly needed income that could not be obtained from temple sales. Each recruit would be paid $42 in advance for clothing as well as periodic payments along the way. If the men were to forego uniforms and turn their clothing allotments over to the camp, it could mean $21,000. Add to this a sizeable portion of their year's wages, and Church leaders were excitedly thinking in terms of over $50,000.74

A third factor weighing upon Brigham's mind was California, not necessarily the Upper California or the Great Basin area, but lower or southern California along the coast. "Let the Mormons be the first men to set their feet on the soil of California," he said in order to obtain the choicest locations.75 Also, by obtaining and improving lands now, by selling later they could realize handsome profits.76

There were, of course, other reasons. It was an excellent publicity gesture. Public opinion towards the
Latter-day Saints was extremely negative and prejudicial and a Mormon effort to support the war would go far to lessen negative attitudes. Enlistment might also enhance the possibility of obtaining future lucrative government contracts. Cooperation now could mean greater benefits later. And by complying with Allen's request, any possibility of government intervention in their westward march would be obviated. Better a beholden government than a belligerent one.

Finally the Mormon Battalion call provided Brigham with the ideal excuse for not reaching the mountains, as predicted, in 1846. If the government could be blamed for their own frustrating failures and delays crossing Iowa and made the whipping boy for whatever else might occur the coming winter, so much the better. 77

It was a sacrifice, yes, but well enough worth it and one volunteer, reflecting on it later said,

it was like a ram caught in a thicket and that it would be better to sacrifice the ram than to have Isaac die. Reflecting upon the subject, it came to my mind that Isaac, in the figure, represented the Church . . . and for the saving of its life I was willing to go on this expedition. 78

But recruiting the required number of men proved a formidable task. Wilford Woodruff, writing more enthusiastically than accurately — something he was often prone to do — recorded that "when [they] 500 men were called for, they steped [sic] forth instantly at the call of the President . . . and went away with cheerful hearts . . . preparing the way for the building of Zion." 79 In fact, it
just wasn’t so for Brigham and the Twelve had a very
difficult time convincing their people of the rightness of
the decision.

Whereas the Governor of Missouri raised the first
company of 1,000 mounted volunteers in only a few days, it
took Allen almost a month to organize his Mormon Battalion
of only half the size. Some have argued that one reason for
the delay (much longer than Allen had stipulated in order to
meet the President’s time constraints) was because of the
dispersion of Mormon camps between Mosquito Creek and Mt.
Pisgah and Garden Grove. Though distances invariably
complicated recruiting efforts and must be considered a
delaying factor, the problems were less of geography and
more of attitude. While some were obedient almost without
question to Brigham’s request, many others were very much
opposed and, like William Huntington, required converting.

Why the hesitations and objections? First, a large
number genuinely distrusted and despised the American
government and desired to leave the United States
altogether. They regarded any overtures to support it with
anathema and suspicion. Memories remained of the
persecutions they had suffered in Missouri in the 1830’s and
Washington’s refusal to counter Governor Lilburn W. Boggs’
1838 extermination order. Though they continued to revere
the constitution and its protection of religious freedom,
many had lost confidence in all governmental leaders to
guarantee such rights. Evidence seems to exist that some
sort of covenant was made in the Nauvoo temple—perhaps a
sequel to the endowment—"to avenge the blood of the Prophets, Joseph and Hyrum Smith, on the United States and to overthrow her power, beginning first with Illinois and Missouri."82 Whether such a vengeful oath was ever made by the faithful is hard to prove since the above is taken from the pen of a bitter apostate, but it is probable that several renounced their American citizenship. "As our father and mother or the nation that has born us has rejected us and driven us out," declared apostle Wilford Woodruff on the eve of his departure from Nauvoo, "I feel to resign [sic] my citizenship because I cannot enjoy it. I would advise all the Saints that they cast not another vote . . . but resign all offices."83

No better evidence of their critical attitude exists than their response to the outbreak of the Mexican War. "I confess that I was glad to learn of war against the United States," said Pleasant Green Taylor, "and was in hopes that it might never end until [sic] they were entirely destroyed for they had driven us into the wilderness and was now laughing at our calamities."84

Taylor's sentiments were certainly not reflective of a fanatic fringe. Lucius M. Scovil, who came on with the later Nauvoo wagon trains, yearned to get his family "out of this boasted Republic, where they will suffer men to be butchered in cold blood and the guilty go unpunished." Said he, "I disdain this goverment [sic] as I do the gates of hell although my forefathers have fought and bled to obtain
their freedom... I desire to see this government go to the shades of oblivion."85

Hosea Stout, on first hearing Allen's request, was indignant and looked upon it "as a plot laid to bring trouble" on the Mormons. "For in the event that we did not comply with the requisition," said Stout, "we supposed they would now make a protest to denounce us as enemies to our country and if we did comply that they would then have 500 of our men in their power to be destroyed as they had done our leaders at Carthage. I confess that my feeling was uncommonly wrought up against them."86 Stout was convinced that Allen was barely concealing his true purpose - to ascertain the true strength and size of the Mormon encampment.

Many in camp were probably less politically exercised, agitated and anti-American than those quoted above; nevertheless, ill will towards Washington existed among most, a negative attitude that was the single, most powerful obstacle to the call of the Battalion.87 If not everyone agreed with Stout, Scovil, Taylor, and others, it appears that the general intention was to flee to the Rockies and the safety of those western valleys, and escape the "overflowing scourge" which many believed God would pour out upon America for rejecting His prophets.

Another formidable roadblock was concern for the welfare and safety of abandoned families. With so many away, who would be left to guard against Indian and other
Missouri — inspired depredations? Where would their families winter? Who would build shelters and homes? \(^88\)

Little wonder, then, that Brigham offered a multitude of safeguards and comforting proposals. "Every man that enlists," he said during a massive recruiting meeting at Mosquito Creek on 13 July, "will have his name, and the names of his wife and children inserted in a book, and what directions you have to give in relation to them; and if we find that we have more families than we can take forward, we will take them to Grand Island and leave men to take care of them till we go and return to fetch them." Brigham then promised the recruits "if God spares my life, that your families shall be taken care of, and shall fare as ours do." \(^89\) He further proposed appointing ninety bishops from among trusted men in camp to meet the special needs of each Battalion family. \(^90\)

Brigham urged the volunteers to leave most of their expected pay in the hands of the Church to be administered by the bishops who would "keep a correct account of all moneys and other property received by them, and how disposed of at the risk of being brought before the council and reproved." \(^91\) As early as 21 July, Captain Jefferson Hunt, on behalf of the members of Company "A", authorized Church agent and presiding Bishop, Newel K. Whitney, "to receive the payment of the cheques returned by members of said company, and apply them to such uses as may be specified thereon." Similar letters were soon received from the other commandants and officers of the various companies. \(^92\)
But there were other objections. Enlisting as infantry and marching 2,000 miles must not have appealed to a great many any more than it did to the Missourians who, while rallying to serve in a mounted regiment, declined to do so in a marched infantry battalion. Enlisting in an army already largely made up of Missouri volunteers was similarly repulsive. And the women, especially, were so naturally concerned that that Brigham promised the Battalion would never have to fight in open combat.

Yet despite these several objections, the Battalion fell in line in large part due to Brigham's leadership. But it is doubtful he could have succeeded without either Captain Allen or Colonel Kane. Allen's courteous manner and respectful attitude were strong mitigating factors. Said Stout, "He was a plain non assuming man without that proud overbearing strut and self conceited [sic] dignaty [sic] which some call an officer - like appearance." During their short conversation Allen, on Stout's request, told of the progress of the war and many incidentals thereto. "I was much pleased with his manner as a gentleman," he confessed, notwithstanding my prejudice against not only him but also the government which he was sent here to represent." 93

Colonel Kane had arrived in camp on horseback from Fort Leavenworth 11 July. Though slight of build and sickly in nature (Hosea Stout called him "uncommonly small and feminine") he manifested courage, common sense, and genuine sympathy for the Mormons. 94 He brought first-hand
information and, as a confidant of the president, a colonel in the army, and friend, convinced many that Allen was on a bona fide mission acting without ambiguity or deceit. Clearly, Kane's presence and influence proved beneficial. Originally suspicious, Woodruff credited his change of attitude directly to the young officer who, he recorded, "manifested the spirit of a gentleman and much interest in our welfare" and from the information provided, "we were convinced that God had begun to move upon the heart of the President and others in this Nation to begin to act for our interest."95

Nosea Stout, one of the more hardened antagonists to the Battalion plan, proved how much Kane's influence assisted recruiting efforts. Having learned of Kane and Little's work in Washington, of the lengthy negotiations, and of Kane's bringing special dispatches to Colonel Kearny, admitted, "This made the matter plain and I was well satisfied for I found that there was no trick in it."96 With Kane and Allen at Brigham's side, the pace of recruiting accelerated and the effort succeeded.

The first four companies were mustered in by 16 July. Straining hard to complete the final company the following day, Brigham proposed these alternatives: enlist; return to Nauvoo several times and "bring on the poor;" or, the third option, leave their families and go immediately with the volunteers at great personal cost and sacrifice over the mountains. Whichever way, few would be permitted to stay with their families. By sunset of 17 July, Allen had his
full battalion complete with more than enough laundresses and more than expected families and females.\footnote{97}

On Saturday evening, 19 July, at a recently constructed bowery on the banks of the Missouri, and not far from the busy Mormon ferry and near the 'Liberty Pole',\footnote{98} a celebration/farewell ball was convened with William Pitt's band furnishing the music. The scene impressed Colonel Kane. "A more merry dancing soul I have never seen, though the company went without refreshments." Dancing continued until the sun dipped below the Omaha hills at which time, according to Kane,

Silence was called, and a well cultivated mezzo-soprano voice, belonging to a young lady with fair face and dark eyes, gave with quartette accompaniment a little song, . . . touching to all earthly wanderers:

'By the rivers of Babylon we sat down and wept. We wept when we remembered Zion.'

There was danger of some expression of feeling when the song was over, for it had begun to draw tears! but breaking the quiet with his hard voice, an Elder asked the blessing of heaven on all who 'with purity of heart and brotherhood of spirit' had mingled in that society, and then all dispersed, hastening to cover from the falling dews.\footnote{99}

On 21 July 1846, the Mormon Battalion left camp, forty days after the first detachment of dragoons had left Fort Leavenworth, thirty-five after the departure of the first Missouri companies under the command of Colonel Alexander W. Doniphan, and twenty one days behind Kearny.\footnote{100} Whether or not the Battalion proved valuable to the United States Army, it facilitated the Mormon stay at the Bluffs.
Recalled Brigham, "though looked upon by many with astonishment and some with fear, [it] has proved a great blessing to this community. It was indeed the temporal salvation of our camp." 101

The Demise of the Grand Island Scheme

With the Battalion gone, energies were immediately directed toward finding a suitable winter way station. Before Captain Allen departed, Brigham extracted the required permission from the several Pottawattamie chiefs, agent R.B. Mitchell, and Captain Allen in behalf of the President to settle on Pottawattamie lands. 102 Allen also proferred tentative permission [to a yet undecided Brigham] to locate temporarily further west in Indian territory, if necessary. Sensing a hesitancy on Mitchell's part to speak on Indian matters beyond his jurisdiction and realizing that the newly-appointed Council Bluffs agent, John Miller, had not yet assumed his post, Brigham was determined to use the Battalion as bargaining leverage for permission to settle on either side of the river. Had Miller been present, Brigham would have sought his permission too, since he would have held authority over Mitchell and over Indian land west of the Missouri. In the meantime, if it meant positing the authority of United States military officers against the jurisdiction of local Indian agents, so be it. 103

Even prior to the call of the Battalion Brigham had concluded that most of the saints must settle at Grand Island on the Platte River. From their studies of Fremont's
recent expeditions to the Rocky Mountains, Mormon leaders knew it was "the longest fresh water river island perhaps in America," with rich soil, abundant timber, and sufficient elevation to secure it from the annual spring floods. Fremont had recommended it "as the best point for a military position on the Lower Platte."¹⁰⁴ Sarpy supported their tentative plan and Captain Allen, while recruiting, recommended it as the best place for wintering between the Missouri River and Fort Laramie. Both men indicated that the Island was large enough for grazing their numerous cattle, sufficiently well timbered, had a good salt spring, and was home to numberless buffalo.¹⁰⁵ Only Mitchell, the Council Bluffs sub-agent, was critical of the Grand Island plan wondering how so large a group of people could comfortably winter there amidst a less than friendly Pawnee population.¹⁰⁶

Mitchell's comments apparently went unheeded for by the second week of July Brigham had determined to settle at Grand Island. "Thither we want to go without delay," he wrote in a letter to the saints at Garden Grove, "with all the teams of the camp, unload from five hundred to one thousand of the wagons and return immediately to Nauvoo, Garden Grove, etc. and before spring carry to the Platte every poor but honest soul that has not the means to go."¹⁰⁷ Demanding "no deafness" on the matter, Brigham believed the plan providentially provided. "If everyone is diligent, we expect the whole Church will be together, at that point before winter closes upon us. That is the Gospel."¹⁰⁸
George Miller would scout out the location while retrieving Sarpy's furs and confirm the propriety of their deliberations.

Had the Grand Island scheme materialized, Garden Grove would have been sold off to the highest bidder, Mount Pisgah, if not a victim of the same fate would have been but meagerly maintained, and a few would have wintered cattle along the east banks of the Missouri River. Most, however, would have assembled on the Island away from possible Missouri depredations and fortified against any Indian or government attacks. With the Grand Island camp underway, a very small party might yet head over the mountains, put in spring crops, and fulfill Brigham's long-held dream of an 1846 toe-hold in the area of the Great Basin.

But the arrival in camp of Thomas L. Kane and Wilford Woodruff in mid-July seems to have greatly modified the Island plan. As indicated, Kane convinced Church leaders that Washington would not interfere militarily against the Mormons. Secondly, he strongly advised against Grand Island on political grounds and suggested a Missouri River encampment, convincing Brigham that he stood a better chance of persuading the Office of Indian Affairs not to interfere with Mormon settlements at the Missouri than at locations further west.

Woodruff's report to the Council of the Twelve was a double barrel of bad news. Fresh from a mission to England, Woodruff reported that Church affairs were in desperate straits with Reuben Hedlock, presiding authority, channeling
money originally earmarked for emigration purposes into schemes for his own personal enrichment. Furthermore, James J. Strang had deployed to England Martin Harris, one of the original Three Witnesses to the gold plates, and other missionaries to work among the Mormon congregations. Unless something was done immediately, the Church stood to lose everything in the British Isles, possibly its richest source of converts. The Twelve hastily decided to send three apostles, John Taylor, Orson Hyde, and Parley P. Pratt to England with travel funds largely supplied from Battalion contributions. With such key leaders required elsewhere, to move the main camps 200 miles further west, cut hay, and complete all preparations in time for winter would be that much more difficult.

Woodruff also brought firsthand information on the deteriorating situation in Nauvoo. Though by July the city was rapidly being evacuated, the most destitute, unless removed systematically now would require desperate rescue later. All through summer reports had pointed to a deteriorating condition that culminated in September's "Battle of Nauvoo". Rather than sell off the Iowa farms and move the encampment further west to the Island with all attendant complications of crossing the Missouri and sufferings of a further march, would it not be wiser to remain near the Bluffs and provide a closer winter quarters for the inevitable Nauvoo exiles?

There were other contributing factors. To ferry across the Missouri the entire population, now taking up
encampments on the east side, would be terribly time-consuming. Furthermore, another complicated ferriage would be required to cross the Elkhorn River only thirty miles west. To move a small company of 2,000 or less may have been manageable, but to carry over the entire Church was now nearly impossible given their time constraints. Finally, the delays encountered in raising the Battalion were fatal to the Grand Island scheme. It had taken weeks of their time to explain, convince, and recruit.

So it was that by 17 July 1846, scarcely ten days after Brigham's proclaimed "gospel" of wintering at Grand Island, plans were being drastically revised quite literally in mid-stream, once again evidence of the spontaneity and changeability in the Mormon decision-making process. Immediate needs were over-riding any master plan that may have existed either in heaven or on earth. Hundreds of wagons were already on the west side of the river while perhaps two or three times as many were awaiting their turn to cross. Despite the almost non-stop operation of their ferry, the improvements on their west bank landing, and the probable use by some of Sarpy's "old Gentile ferry," long delays were inevitable. 113 Wrote Parley P. Pratt, "The ferry ran night and day for a long time, and still could not complete the crossing of the camps till late in the season." 114 Several hundred on the Iowa side were following the lead of Henry W. Miller and others whom Brigham had assigned to remain on Pottawattamie land, assist in cattle grazing efforts, and help bring on Nauvoo refugees.
While organizing east bank settlers, Brigham received discouraging news from fur-laden teamsters returning from Grand Island and the Pawnee Indian villages. The island was not nearly as habitable as previously reported, travel getting there was difficult along the Platte River bottoms, and the area seemed to be a center of warfare between the Pawnee and Sioux. Even government farmers and Presbyterian missionaries were fleeing the area "through fear of the [Sioux] Indians." George Miller had also learned firsthand that the Pawnee would not willingly permit a Mormon stay. The Pawnee were off hunting when Miller arrived at their village, but visiting Ponca Indians informed Miller "that it would not do at all; that our big captain knew nothing about Indian customs, that the Pawnees wintered their houses at Grand Island, and that our immense herd would eat up all the feed before winter would be half gone, and when the Pawnees came in from their summer hunt they would kill all our cattle and drive us away." The plan, at least in the eyes of the Ponca, "was wholly impracticable."

Such news spelled the demise of whatever remained of the Grand Island scheme so that by the end of July, even the idea of sending the Twelve and other leaders first to Grand Island and possibly further west, was once and for all abandoned.

Some serious consideration was given to establishing headquarters at the Elkhorn River twenty-five miles north in order to stay clear of the Omaha and Ottoe Indians and to be
that much farther west come spring, but after due consideration even that idea was abandoned. Brigham and the Twelve finally concluded by late July that while Bishop Miller might spend the winter among the Pawnee, the main camp would winter on the west banks of the Missouri despite the fact the Pottawattamie would have welcomed and the government have allowed them to stay on the east side. The reasons for choosing to winter on the west banks of the Missouri River were compelling and increasingly obvious. Their great herds of cattle could graze on either side of the river on the pea vines and rush bottoms that provided excellent feed even during winter months; they were relatively close to the Missouri settlements of St. Joseph, Linden, and Savannah where they could carry on trade for desperately needed grain and materials; the area was well watered; transporting large machinery and components for mills and other operations to a river site would be easier and cheaper; the many valleys on both sides of the river offered needed shelter from the hot summer sun and from the cold winter winds; proximity to the saints on the Iowa side was important for fast communication, easier trade, and church unity; and finally, by staying they could get right to work preparing for the coming winter. Brigham, analyzing all the pros and cons involved, concluded to stay "notwithstanding" the fact that the land was hotly disputed by both Ottoe and Omaha Indians. "I am willing," he said, "because the advantages are more than the disadvantages." In retrospect, one wonders where else they could have gone
without moving everyone, at great exertion and difficulty, back across the river to the east side necessitating, in turn, a time-consuming recrossing in the spring.

The decision to stay at the Missouri was probably their only choice given the delays, broken plans, and frustrated schedules. The Iowa trek had exhausted and detained them beyond expectation. The absence of a ready-built ferry of sufficient size had necessitated the construction of their own which was not completed until almost the first of July. Establishing good relations with Sarpy and other traders as well as with the local Indian agents had required careful consideration and time. News from Nauvoo and England demanded immediate attention. Even before Allen's call for the Battalion, it had become obvious they could not proceed much further. The Battalion, however, provided them temporary permission to winter in the vicinity. By the time they learned the Grand Island scheme was unfavorable, thousands were already across the river. Hence, with most on the west side or in the process of crossing over, and some taking up winter residences across the river on the east or Iowa side, Brigham and the Twelve decided that headquarters of the camp for the upcoming winter should be on the west bank of the Missouri River. It wasn't the Rockies but for a season "Zion" could rest in the "borders of the wilderness."
FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER THREE

1 William S. Muir to Brigham Young, 11 June 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

2 Their herds were estimated at between 10,000 and 30,000 head of cattle alone. The lower figure was likely closer to the truth.

3 Many who left Nauvoo in March and April, as originally planned, made the Iowa crossing in excellent time - five to eight weeks.

4 See Chapter Two.

5 Sometimes called "Pull-Point" by the Mormons. Peter Sarpy had been in charge of the post at Trader's Point since at least 1834, but by 1846 was virtually a free agent. Coming from a long line of explorers, fur trappers, and traders, his father, Gregoire Gerard Sarpy, had been the first man to navigate the Missouri River in keel boats. Both his brothers, Thomas and John, were clerks for the American Fur Company. He had both an Indian and a white wife living on either side of the river. Eccentric and excitable and one who loved horses and liquor, Sarpy became a wealthy man later opening stores at St. Mary's and Decatur, Nebraska. He later farmed large acreages near Council Bluffs, Iowa. He died in 1865. See Charles Kelly, ed., Journals of John D. Lee 1846-47 and 1859 (Salt Lake City: Western Printing Company, 1938), p.44; and Lawrence D. Clark Papers, LDS Church Archives; also Hiram Martin Chittenden, The American Fur Trade of the Far West, 2 vols. (Stanford: Academic Reprints, 1954) 1:390.

6 The history of the "blockhouse" long preceded the arrival of the Mormons. The local Pottawattamie tribes, originally of Algonquin extraction from homelands near the Great Lakes, had by an 1837 treaty sold their eastern lands for a large tract of land in western Iowa roughly between the Missouri and Wissabotona Rivers.

Sensitive to Pottawattamie fears of attacks and atrocities from the marauding, war-loving Sioux to the north and west, the War Department dispatched Colonel Stephen W. Kearny to the Pottawattamie tract where, near the banks of the Missouri and on or near Bryant Spring within the limits of the present city of Council Bluffs, Iowa, he supervised the construction of a small fort or blockhouse. Later, in the spring of 1848, the Jesuit priest, Father Pierre Jean de Smet, a name synonymous with the Catholic Christianization of the Indians in America's north-west, established the "St. Joseph's Mission" among the Pottawattamie. Kearny donated the blockhouse to Father de Smet who promptly remodeled the crudely made, wind-swept cabin post into a miniature churchhouse, hospital, and all
round Catholic community center designed to meet the spiritual and social needs of the local Indians. D.C. Bloomer, "The Old Blockhouse in Council Bluffs," Annals of Iowa 3rd Series 2 (October 1896): 549. The Blockhouse, bounded by Broadway, Voorhis, Union, and State Streets in Council Bluffs, was torn down in 1855.

7 Heber C. Kimball's scribe described the view from their encampment.

"[The river] is her[e] only about 1/4 of a mile wide and the bank on this side is about 15' high and rest up and down so that somebody had to dig out steps so as to get down to get water. The hills which incloses [sic] this great meadow are consisting of yellow clay. On the other side the river is thick with willows and cotton trees but the higher up seemeth to be good timber."

Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 14 June 1846.

8 Journal History, 15 June 1846.

9 A conservative levy of $1.00 per wagon ferried would have cost the Mormons $2,000 - a prohibitive sum. This might also explain, in part, why they decided against Banks' Ferry.

10 Journal of John D. Lee, 14 June 1846.

11 Journal History, 15 June 1846. Miller was also assigned to operate a small fishery to provide a good supply of much needed fresh food.

12 See Diary of Hosea Stout, 26 April 1847, 1:163-64; and the Journal of Eliza R. Snow, 28 August 1846. The location of this 'upper ferry' is difficult to determine with exactness but was probably near the present Union Pacific Railroad bridge connecting Council Bluffs and Omaha.

13 See Journal History, 28 June 1846; and Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 6 July 1846.

14 Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 13 July 1846. Most writers have erred in concluding that the Mormons crossed the Missouri at either Sarpy's ferry or at a later ferry at Winter Quarters upstream some six miles. Although some did cross at Pointe-aux-Poules to explore the western side, most crossed at their own ferry. See Diary of Hosea Stout, editor's note, 1:175; and J. Sterling Morton, Illustrated History of Nebraska (Lincoln: Jacob North and Company, 1906), vol. 2, p.126.

15 See Journal History, 15 June 1846; and Journal of Warren Foote, 10 July 1846. Pinpointing the exact location
of the Mosquito Creek encampment is almost impossible. So many fanned out in all directions.

16 Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 16 June 1846. Peter Hansen was a spiritually adopted son of Kimball's. For more on adoption, see Chapter Ten.

17 Brigham Young to William Huntington, 14 June 1846, Brigham Young Papers.


19 The Pottawattamie were largely in favor of leaving western Iowa for new lands to the southwest in present Kansas because of the money and the protection the treaty afforded them. As to the latter, their fear of Sioux depredations had been realized on more than one occasion despite sporadic U.S. army intervention and protection. As to remuneration, just nine days before the Mormon arrival, the Pottawattamie concluded a treaty with the federal government intent on granting statehood to Iowa for a cash sale settlement of $850,000, an incredibly large sum. Most began moving to their new home in the summer of 1847. See Leland L. Sage, A History of Iowa (Ames, Iowa: The Iowa State University Press, 1974).

20 See Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 17 and 20 June, 1846; and Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 20 June 1846.


No one was to trade, negotiate, or in any other way transact business with Indian tribes without prior permission from the federal government and its licensed appointees. When Brigham Young first met with the Indian agents at Council Bluffs, he came in contact with the capillaries of a large and complicated federal bureaucracy.

The Office of Indian Affairs (presently the Bureau of Indian Affairs) was originally established in 1824 as part of the War Department and remained a part of that agency until transferred to the Department of the Interior twenty-five years later. A Commissioner of Indian Affairs was first appointed in 1832 and bore responsibility for implementing government policies, programs, treaties, and other concerns with Indian tribes all over the country. The Washington headquarters supervised two types of field jurisdictions — superintendencies and agencies. Superintendencies were field headquarters responsible for Indian affairs over a vast geographic region and supervised relations among all Indian tribes within their area and between tribes and persons having business with them.
Additionally, superintendents controlled all conduct and account of agents.

The jurisdiction of the St. Louis Superintendency, established in 1822, was originally very expansive stretching from the Missouri River to the Rockies and encompassed thirty-four tribes from the Apache in the south to the Sioux on the north. By the 1840's five agents reported to St. Louis: the Upper Missouri agency among the Sioux; the Council Bluffs agency; the Fort Leavenworth agency among the Kansas, Shawnee and Delaware; the Great Nemaha subagency among the Iowa Indians; and the Osage River subagency. Thomas H. Harvey held the superintendency from 1843 to 1849 and was succeeded by David D. Mitchell.

The agents and sub-agents, closest government representatives to the Indians, were charged with maintaining and restoring peace, persuading tribes into ceding lands, distributing annuities and goods as required by treaty, implementing efforts at farming, and education.

The official Council Bluffs Agency, established in 1837 and discontinued in 1857, had oversight of the Omaha, Otoe, Missouri, and Pawnee Indians in eastern Nebraska. The Council Bluffs agent originally worked out of Fort Leavenworth but gradually spent an increasing amount of his time in Bellevue.

With the arrival of the Pottawattamie at the Missouri, Edwin James was appointed Council Bluffs sub-agent and established himself just across the river, four miles south of the Council Bluffs agency at Bellevue. When abandoned in 1845, some of the original buildings were moved by Sarpy north five or six miles to a crossing point directly opposite Bellevue, thirty-five miles north of the Missouri line. This place became Trader's Point or Pointe-aux-Poules, the local ferry crossing and Sarpy's new headquarters and official trading station for most of the local Indians on both sides of the river. North of Trader's Point and on the same side of the river, David Hardin, first farmer to the Council Bluffs sub-agency, had erected a grist mill at or near the junction of Mosquito Creek and the Missouri River and was popularly called Council Point. It was just north of the local steamboat landing for the entire Council Bluffs region. See Edward E. Hill, The Office of Indian Affairs, 1824-1880: Historical Sketches (New York: Clearwater Publishing Company, Inc., 1974); and Van Der Zee, "Episodes," p.344; also Bloomer, "The Old Blockhouse," p.549.

23 R.B. Mitchell to Thomas H. Harvey, 29 June 1846, Kane Papers, Brigham Young University Library.


25 Nor was Mitchell the only government official initially impressed with the Mormons. William E. Prince, a military officer at Fort Leavenworth, having heard rumors of
Mormon antagonisms, dispatched a Lieutenant Lincoln to the Bluffs in the latter half of June to ascertain "their numbers and condition." From Lincoln's report, Prince formed a positive impression. "Their general appearance indicates poverty, they are however making every exertion, consistent with their means, for Emigration; order and quiet prevades [sic] their movements and thus for no act of theirs have given occasion for adoption of any feelings."


26 See Journal of John D. Lee, 18 June 1846; and Journal History, 19 June 1846.

27 Brigham Young to William Huntington, 22 June 1846, in "A History of William Huntington," BYU Library. 1846 was the twilight of the great American Fur trade. Since the days of Lewis and Clark in 1804, the Missouri River valley had been the main American shipping lane for furs. In succession, the Missouri Fur Company, the Greater Rocky Mountain Fur Company, the Columbia Fur Company and finally the most famous of them all, the American Fur Company, all took turns in monopolizing the American fur trade and in competing with the all powerful and pervasive Hudson's Bay Company to the north. But by 1840, with a lessening demand for beaver and other furs, with the Indians ravished by disease, weakened by alcohol, and in retreat from the ever advancing borders of civilization, the fur business was in steep decline. See Hiram Martin Chittenden, The American Fur Trade of the Far West, 2 vols. (Stanford: Academic Reprints, 1954).


29 See Chapter Two.

30 See Diary of Hosea Stout, 20 June 1846, 1:168; and Journal of John D. Lee, 11 June 1846.

31 William Huntington to Brigham Young, 14 June 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

32 Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 25-26 June 1846.

33 Journal History, 27 June 1846.


35 Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 25-26 June 1846.

Journal History, 27 and 28 June 1846.

Brigham Young to William Huntington and Council at Mt. Pisgah, 28 June 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 29 June 1846.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 30 June 1846, 1:172.

James Allen had been a captain in the United States Army since 1837. A native of Ohio, he had graduated from West Point Military Academy in 1829 in the same class as Robert E. Lee and Joseph E. Johnston. He had accompanied Henry R. Schoolcraft in his 1832 expedition to find the headwaters of the Mississippi River. In 1842 he had been assigned to Fort Atkinson in Iowa Territory to supervise the Sac and Fox Indian Agency. Between 1842 and 1845 he had travelled extensively all over Iowa territory. Allen died 23 August 1846.


A History of William Huntington, 26 June 1846.


Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 26 June 1846, LDS Church Archives.

Journal History, 30 June 1846.

Ibid.

Jesse C. Little to Brigham Young, 6 July 1846, Brigham Young Papers. See Chapter One.

Journal History, 6 July 1846. Two such letters were written to George Bancroft, Secretary of the Navy, and Amos Kendall, former Postmaster General. See Frank Alfred Golder, *The March of the Mormon Battalion*, p. 26.

See Leonard J. Arrington, "'In Honorable Remembrance': Thomas L. Kane's Services to the Mormons," *Brigham Young University Studies* 21 (Fall 1981), pp.389-90; and Albert L. Zobell, Jr., *Sentinel in the East: A Biography of Thomas L. Kane* (Salt Lake City: Nicholas C. Morgan, Sr., 1965) pp. 3-4. Most Mormons view Kane extremely favorably, as a sympathizer and indispensible
supporter and mediator of the Mormon cause. Bernard De Voto, however, without minimizing Kane's immense and timely influence for the good of the Mormon cause, has described Kane as "a romantic and neurotic young man, sentimental humanitarian, the kind of miniature Gerrit Smith who loved all good workers and by the hundred obstructed the path of serious reformers." De Voto, The Year of Decision 1846, p. 237. A bust of Colonel Kane is on permanent display in the rotunda of the Utah State capital building, a silent testimony to the place of honor Kane holds in Mormon and Utah history.

50 Part of Kane's letter to Mr. Dallas said, "He [Little] visits Washington, too, I believe, with no other object than the laudable one of desiring aid of the government for his people, who forced by persecution to found a new commonwealth in the Sacramento valley, still retain American hearts, and would not willingly sell themselves to the foreigner, or forget the old commonwealth they leave behind them."

Thomas L. Kane to the Honorable George M. Dallas, Vice-President of the United States, 18 May 1846, Thomas L. Kane Papers, BYU Library. It appears that Little believed the Mormons would settle in present-day California.


52 The immediate cause of the war had been the outbreak of hostilities in southern Texas over boundary disputes. Texas claimed all territory south of the Rio Grande River while Mexico maintained that the border was further north at the Nueces River. Polk accepted the Texas claim and ordered General Zachary Taylor to occupy the disputed strip. Such an act of deliberate provocation enticed Mexican forces to cross the river and engage the Americans in late April. A more serious cause of the conflict was the American design to wrestle New Mexico and, more especially California from Mexican half-hearted control before Great Britain made claim to the area. See Charles L. Dufour, The Mexican War – A Compact History 1846-1848 (New York, Hawthorn Books, Inc. 1968); and Bernard De Voto, Year of Decision 1846; also David M. Fletcher, The Diplomacy of Annexation: Texas, Oregon, and the Mexican War (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 1973).


55 Ibid., p. 437.
56 Golder, The March of the Mormon Battalion, p.34.

57 W. Ray Luce has argued that this was "the first recorded mention of a Mormon fighting group" and replaced the previous ideas of the Mormons building stockades or other forts along western overland trails or of shipping provisions and munitions on contract for the government. See W. Ray Luce, "The Mormon Battalion: A Historical Accident?" Utah State Historical Quarterly (Winter 1974):33.

58 Golder, The March of the Mormon Battalion, p. 83.

59 Thomas L. Kane to Elish Kane, 29 May 1846, Kane Papers, BYU Library. The British communications probably were invitations to settle Vancouver's Island. Months letter, in February 1847, Orson Hyde, Parley P. Pratt, and John Taylor presented a petition bearing 13,000 names to the British House of Commons and Her Majesty, Queen Victoria, proposing a plan for Mormon migration to Oregon on Vancouver's Island. See Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 8 February 1847. Whether or not the Mormons were genuinely serious, it was an effective bargaining tool.

60 Ibid. The President provided Kane with personal letters and authorized rights of passage which Kearny immediately recognized.

61 Quaife, Diary of James K. Polk, p.444.

62 Ibid, p.446.

63 Ibid., pp.449-50.

64 Luce, "Historical Accident?", p.37.


67 Ibid., pp.396-97.

68 Governor J.C. Edwards to W.L. Marcy, 11 August 1846, as quoted in Golder, The March of the Mormon Battalion, pp.97-98.

Ten months after Marcy's orders were dated to Kearny, Mormon leaders first heard of their exact content in a letter from William Pickett to Brigham Young. Having seen the published order in St. Louis, Pickett described them in detail taking full notice of the 1/3 provision. They made no reference to any statement of waiting till they arrived in California.

70 Colonel Stephen W. Kearny to Captain James Allen, 26 June 1846, as quoted in Golder, The March of the Mormon Battalion, pp. 101-103.

71 Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 1 July 1846.

72 Golder, The March of the Mormon Battalion, p. 103.

73 Journal History, 1 July 1846.

74 Leonard J. Arrington, Great Basin Kingdom, p. 21.

75 Journal History, 1 July 1846.

76 It appears that most recruits thought the Church would settle on the coast, a belief widely shared in the camps. Had they known they might have to march an additional 1,000 miles or more after their discharge to rejoin their families, recruiting may have been almost impossible.

77 The myth that the Mormon Battalion was the primary cause for the Mormon stay in the wilderness has persisted to the present day. It also became popular, not long after the fact, to claim that the Battalion call was a sham, a bait of Mormon-haters like Missouri's Senator Thomas Benton. As early as 1847 Brigham, relying on speculation from Kane, was telling his followers that their enemies in Congress believed the Mormons would be too incensed to enlist which refusal would justify Missouri militia to attack and destroy the saints. See Frank A. Golder, The March of the Mormon Battalion, p. 104; and Daniel Tyler, A Concise History of the Mormon Battalion in the Mexican War 1846-47 (Glorieta, New Mexico: The Rio Grande Press, Inc. Lithograph of 1st Ed., 1969), p. 117; also L.J. Arrington and Davis Bitton, The Mormon Experience - A History of the Latter-day Saints (New York: Vintage Books, 1980), p. 99.

If, indeed, the Battalion was but a pretext for a war against the Mormons, no concrete evidence exists to support the claim. True, there was genuine concern over Mormon collusion with the Indians and negotiations with the British, and disagreement over their ultimate destination, all of which Mormon enemies likely did foment. Nevertheless, to conclude that Polk, Marcy, and the administration were scheming for war against the Mormons at the same time they were straining every resource and using every regiment to win a war whose outcome at that time was
anything but certain, is difficult to accept. Furthermore, it would only succeed in driving them closer to the British or the Mexicans. Though the Mormons were popularly despised, better them friends than enemies.

78 Journal of Samuel H. Rogers, BYU Library, 5 July 1846.

79 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 16 July 1846. This myth, too, has perpetuated through the years.


81 Believing Independence, Jackson county, Missouri, and its surrounding regions as "Zion", the promised site of the New Jerusalem, Joseph Smith had dedicated the area as a city of refuge and gathering place for the Church in August 1831. By 1833 a temple lot had been surveyed and by year's end 1,200 Mormons had taken up residence in the frontier community. But in the summer and fall, for various political and religious reasons, they were driven out of the county and sought refuge in nearby Clay county. But the same concerns that had aggravated their Jackson county neighbors compelled those in Clay county to expel the Mormons in the summer of 1836. Differences over slavery as well as Mormon interests in the Indian were again dominant factors.

Thus from 1836 to 1838 the Mormons lived in Caldwell and Daviess counties purposely created for the Mormon exiles. Their most important community was at Far West, Caldwell county. Daviess county, according to Joseph Smith, was sacred land where Adam called his posterity together before his death and where some day he would return. But once again persecution became intense as misunderstandings and prejudices deepened on all sides resulting in the "Haun's Mill Massacre" of 1838 in which seventeen Mormons were killed and in Governor Lilburn W. Boggs' executive order to "exterminate" and drive the Mormons from the state. Joseph Smith and other leaders were incarcerated in Liberty, Missouri, while the Mormons were driven out of the state to Illinois. Repeated attempts at redress were rebuffed. When President Martin Van Buren received an appeal he replied, "Your cause is just, but I can do nothing for you." See James B. Allen and Glen M. Leonard, The Story of the Latter-day Saints, pp.59-134.

82 William Hall, Abominations of Mormonism, p.49.

83 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 3 May 1846.

84 Diary of Hosea Stout, 27 May 1846, 1:163-64.

85 Lucius N. Scovil to Brigham Young, 14 April 1846, Brigham Young Papers.
The Diary of Hosea Stout, 28 June 1846, 1:172.

Journal History, 5 July 1846.

Such sentiments were concisely expressed by William Hyde who later became a sergeant in the Battalion. "The thoughts of leaving my family at this critical time are indescribable. They were far from the land of their nativity, situated upon a lonely prairie with no dwelling but a wagon, the scorching sun beating upon them, with the prospect of cold winds of December finding them in the same bleak, dreary place. My family consisted of a wife and two small children who were left in company with an aged father and mother and a brother. . . . When we were to meet with them again, God only knew."

The Journal of William Hyde as quoted in Daniel Tyler, A Concise History of the Mormon Battalion, p.128.

Journal History, 13 July 1846.

Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 17 July 1846. It was Brigham's intent that most wages would be pooled and administered centrally for the co-operative benefit of all. See Chapter Six for a fuller treatment of this issue.

Journal History, 17 July 1846.

Ibid., 21 July 1846.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 5 July 1846, 1:178.

 Said Helen Whitney of Kane: "This young man looked a mere stripling, being delicate in form as well as features. But we soon learned who he was . . . as it were, like an angel of mercy . . . one whom the Lord, no doubt, raised up to act as a mediator." Helen Mar Kimball Whitney, "Our Travels Beyond the Mississippi," Woman's Exponent 13 (1884-85):50.

Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 11 July 1846.

The Diary of Hosea Stout, 13 July 1846, 1:178.


The "Liberty Pole," located approximately two miles south of Redemption Hill or Mosquito Creek Encampment, was
probably on the west banks of the west Mosquito Creek. Cut and raised by W. Johnston and Samuel N. Rogers on 12 July, it consisted of a white sheet with an American flag underneath. The pole was both the rallying point for the Battalion and landmark. Another Liberty Pole was raised at the Elkhorn River and a third possibly directly across the river from the eventual Winter Quarters encampment.


99 Thomas L. Kane, "'The Mormons'. A Discourse Delivered Before the Historical Society of Pennsylvania March 26, 1850," (Philadelphia: King and Baird, 1850); p.31. It seems that Kane's recounting of this episode is slightly over-dramatic, something Kane was prone to do when drumming up sympathy for the Mormon cause. Helen Mar Whitney says that this song was called "Jewish Maid" and had been introduced in Nauvoo by the popular singer and writer, John Kay. According to Whitney, the chorus was changed by Kay so that after singing "By the rivers of Babylon we sat down and wept, we wept when we remembered Zion," the words were deliberately altered from "No more shall the children of Judah sing" to "Again shall the children of Judah sing the lays of happy time." Concluded Whitney: "this was sung according to the faith of the Saints, who did not weep when they 'remembered Zion' for Zion they had brought with them." See Helen Mar Kimball Whitney, "Our Travels," Woman's Exponent 13(1884-85):10.

100 Clarke, Kearny, p.113.

101 Journal History, 5 April 1848.

102 Journal History, 2 July 1846. R.B. Mitchell, Indian sub-agent, also signed the treaty concluding "I willingly certify that it is for the apparent good of both parties, and that there is no prospects [sic] of evil arising therefrom." For Allen's permission, see Journal History, 10 July 1846.

103 Said Allen: "The Mormon people now in rout [sic] to California are hereby authorized to pass through the Indian country on their rout, [sic] and they may make stopping places at such points in the Indian country as may be necessary to facilitate the emigration of their whole people to California, and for each time as may reasonably be required for this purpose." Journal History, 18 July 1846.

The English difficulties were not entirely unknown. Woodruff had complained of these matters as early as the previous October. "It has caused me tears and sorrow," Woodruff then wrote from England, and "I have grown old under it." Elders Hedlock, Ward, and Clark of the Joint Stock Company, the agency established to co-ordinate emigration affairs, prevented Woodruff from examining the emigration office minute books and account ledgers. Although he at one time called for their dismissal for mismanaging funds, Woodruff later concluded matters had improved and were well under control. See Wilford Woodruff to Brigham Young, 1 October and 24 October 1845, Brigham Young Papers.

But by the time Woodruff reported back in person matters had so deteriorated that the three other apostles were dispatched and arrived in England 3 October, 1846. Learning that £1500 of hard-earned immigration contributions - money that would have financed chartering ships for passage of English Mormons to America - had been "squandered" and that debts were being incurred at the rate of £300/year, they took stern action. Wrote Hyde and Taylor: "Every department was run into debt just as far as possible" as Hedlock and Company had embezzled funds for their own private purposes. Hedlock was excommunicated and Ward disfellowshipped, 17 October 1846. Hyde was highly critical of Woodruff's failure to 'clean house' earlier. See Orson Hyde and John Taylor to Brigham Young, 22 October 1846, Brigham Young Papers; also Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 17 October 1846.

See Chapter Four.


Journal History, 29 June 1846.


Journal History, 27 July 1846.

118 Diary of Hosea Stout, 31 July 1846.

119 See Journal of John D. Lee, 1 August 1846; also Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 17 July 1846.

120 See Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 20 July 1846; and Journal History, 20 July 1846.

121 Journal of John D. Lee, 7 August 1846.
CHAPTER FOUR

SETTLING IN AT WINTER QUARTERS AND ENVIRONS
SEPTEMBER - DECEMBER 1846

While awaiting final word on the Grand Island plan, those pioneers already on the west side of the Missouri River had stopped at a temporary resting place, recommended by George Miller, on the Petit Papillion Creek which they called Cold Springs or Butterfly Bluff.\(^1\) Located four miles northwest of the ferry landing and fifteen miles above Bellevue, Cold Springs served as camp headquarters providing a much needed rest for most of a hot, sweltering July.\(^2\)

Once the decision to winter at the Missouri had been made, several parties of men explored northwesterly along the Missouri river banks as far as the old Missouri Encampment and old Fort Calhoun and as far west as the Elkhorn to scout out a larger, more suitable winter campsite.\(^3\) But they could find "no place better" than the relatively well-timbered, well-watered area about Cold Springs.\(^4\) However, as increasing numbers of wagons rolled into an already overcrowded campground a more commodious, more defensible location was required.

Consequently, explorations intensified in early August along "the divide" between the Missouri and the Elkhorn rivers resulting in the discovery of a more acceptable camp site fourteen or fifteen miles north of Cold Springs and on
higher ground three miles west of the Missouri River.\textsuperscript{5}

Called "Cutler's Park" after Alpheus Cutler, the man who found it, the site was situated on a raised prairie between two ridges or bluffs among the gently rolling steppe lands two-and-a-half miles west of the Missouri River.\textsuperscript{6}

The sheltered hollow was soon filled with wagons which were separated into two divisions - Brigham's camp on the south and Heber C. Kimball's on the north. Both divisions in turn were organized into two large squares. Plenty of good water was available and everything seemed ready for the building of Nebraska's first city.\textsuperscript{7}

Colonel Thomas L. Kane who mingled with the Latter-day Saints for two months before returning to Washington vividly described Cutler's Park in its formative days.

It was situated . . . upon some finely rounded hills that encircle a favorite cool spring. On each of these a square was marked out and the wagons as they arrived took their positions along its four sides in double rows, so as to leave a roomy street or passage way between them. The tents were disposed also in rows, at intervals between the wagons. The cattle were folded in high-fenced yards outside. The quadrangle inside was left vacant for the sake of ventilation, and the streets, covered with leafy arbor work, and kept scrupulously clean, formed a shaded cloister walk. This was the place of exercise for slowly recovering invalids, the day-home of the infants, and the evening promenade of all.

At a general meeting 9 August in a shaded grove north of the camp site, Brigham and the Twelve gave their official approval (despite the relative lack of timber), announced an organizational blueprint, and indicated their intentions to establish government and maintain order. The first priority
was to re-order the camp from a traveling into a resident organization of two or three standing divisions or companies with a local government organized along theocratic lines. With the Twelve recognized as God's spiritual government and Brigham as spokesman, they were unanimously supported in appointing a local "Municipal High Council," which the people sustained but did not elect. These men were "endowed with all the powers of a High council of the church" and also the powers of common council of a municipality and hence "all powers both political and ecclesiastical were centered in them who were to act under the jurisdiction of the Twelve of course." Alpheus Cutler was appointed "President" of the Winter Quarters High Council and sustained by uplifted hand by the over 300 people in attendance. Cutler was responsible not only for the performance of his council but also, indirectly, for the one across the river. After its selection the Municipal High Council appointed a standing guard or a police force to act under the jurisdiction of the newly-appointed marshal, Horace S. Eldridge. Brigham concluded with several instructions respecting camp cleanliness, trespassing on nearby Indian cornfields, and other immediate concerns.

That night Brigham and Willard Richards drew up a master encampment plan and also drafted a rambling letter, on Kane's advice, to President Polk outlining their successful response to the government's request for a battalion, their intention that Cutler's Park be only a
temporary settlement, and invoking the president's sympathetic view of their stay on Indian lands west of the Missouri. 13 Brigham further partitioned the two grand companies or divisions into smaller subdivisions of hundreds and tens with a foreman over each "to have the charge of all the men and boys in his subdivision". All were to work under him and be subject to the council. 14 The advantages of this almost militaristic style of rule and order had been learned from their Iowa experiences. Leaders with stewardship over smaller, well-defined units could more effectively manage the labors of the camp and more adequately fulfill the needs of those in their jurisdictions. By 12 August the first division and its twelve subdivisions numbered 324 men over ten years of age. 15 An inclusion of the women and children swelled its total population to at least 1,200. Kimball's division, always smaller than Brigham's, encompassed only five subdivisions and numbered 228 men and boys, 230 wagons, and comparatively fewer animals. 16

For weeks they worked at cutting hay, fencing in herds, erecting a meeting place, digging wells, draining mires, and, lastly, building cabins. Until sufficient hay had been cut and stacked as winter feed for cattle - and by early September they had cut from 1,500 to 2,000 tons from the prairie wild grass - cabin-building would have to wait. 17 Consequently most lived in tents or wagons with an ever increasing number suffering from sickness and exposure. Colonel Kane took so sick that Brigham, fearing critics who
might blame the Mormons for his possible death, summoned special doctors from Fort Leavenworth. By mid-August, thirty to fifty cases of serious fevers were reported, an omen of what lay ahead. A burial ground was soon selected and William Huntington was appointed sexton.18

Aware they were on disputed territory between two warring bands of Indians, camp authorities arranged to meet first with the Omaha and later with the Ottoo after they had returned from their biannual buffalo hunts. Albert P. Rockwood, Jedediah M. Grant, and Charles Bird were directed to arrange a council with the Omaha in late August.

Going into the 'pow-wow' of 28 August 1846, both sides knew what they wanted from the other. Not only did the Mormons need permission to settle for at least two years, use a reasonable amount of timber, cut grass, and make improvements, but they also wished for strong Indian support and a positive reception to deflect simmering criticisms from the Office of Indian Affairs. For their part the Omaha saw the opportunity as a way to protect themselves from the warring Sioux. And in return for timber concessions, they would seek assistance and favors of every kind.

Big Elk, principal chief of the Omaha nation, his son, Standing Elk, their interpreter, Logan Fontenelle, a half breed and experienced trader in his own right, and seventy other lesser chiefs and braves arrived at Cutler's Park and conferred with Brigham Young, the Twelve, and the High Council. The meeting was held in a large double tent so crowded that the camp historian, Willard Richards, listened
from outside the canvas wall. After shaking hands and smoking the traditional pipe of peace, Brigham presented his case. He reviewed the call of the Battalion and their decision to stop at the Missouri for the winter, and offered the Omaha assistance in planting their crops, learning mechanical trades and blacksmithing, and transporting corn from Trader's Point, but stressed their determination not to participate in any conflicts with warring tribes. "We wish to do you good," he concluded.19

Big Elk, through Fontenelle his interpreter, got right to the point.

I am an old man and will have to call you all my sons. I am willing you should stop in my country but I am afraid of my great father at Washington. . . . We have been oppressed by other tribes because we were weak. We have been like the hungry dog which runs through camp in search of something to eat and meets with enemies on every side. We have been oppressed for ten years; many times we could have defended ourselves, but our great Father told us not to fight. . . . We heard you were a good people, we are glad to have you come.20

In agreeing to offer the Mormons use of timber and water, he exacted a promise for agricultural and mechanical assistance, gun repair, and a pledge not to kill much game in the area. Big Elk, knowing the Ottoe would want a share in the treaty provisions, advised the Mormons to move their encampment several miles northward to undisputed Omaha land "so that we may have the benefit of your improvements after you leave." Agreeing to a Mormon stay for up to two years Big Elk concluded, "While you are among us as brethren, we will be brethren to you. I like, my son, what you have said
very well."21 His only provison was that negotiations would have to be approved by the Indian agents. Three days later their agreement was put into writing.22

At the same time Orson Pratt led a delegation to the Ottoe Indians to arrive at a similar understanding and "to know definitely whether we might stay in peace."23 The Ottoe were anxious that the Mormons "should not close with the offer of the Omahas and go up the river" since they, the Ottoe, might not share in whatever improvements were made.24 They, too, promised non-interference.

Conspicuously absent from these councils was John Miller, newly-appointed Council Bluffs Indian agent. Whether enroute to his new post or simply uninvited, Miller would not look kindly on these proceedings and eventually contested the treaties despite Captain Allen's permission and Colonel Kane's assurances. In time it would spell trouble, but for the present and foreseeable future, Brigham got what he needed and the Indians capitalized on their opportunity.25

Though the Mormons did not accept Big Elk's offer to move to his undisputed land (possibly because they didn't want to be any further away from Missouri trading centers or any closer to the Sioux), they did explore Omaha lands near the end of August. During this search they discovered a better camping area nearer the river, closer to their newly-proposed ferry site, and convenient to the ruins and bricks of the old abandoned fort.26
Consequently on 8 September Alanson Eldredge, Alpheus Cutler, Albert P. Rockwood, Jedediah M. Grant, and Ezra Chase were appointed a committee to locate the precise site and recommended a spot that Brigham already had in mind. Located three miles east of Cutler's Park and eighteen miles north of Bellevue on a bench of land above the river, the favored spot was drained on the north and south by two creeks and bounded on the north and west with high bluffs naturally good for defensive purposes. The primary arguments presented for making the change from Cutler's Park to the new site were the latter's natural defenses, seclusion from strong prairie winds, and proximity to good streams that might permit the construction of a water-powered flour mill.

On Friday, 11 September the Twelve officially selected the new site. Surveying began under Brigham's personal direction in the late afternoon and continued for several days until on the morning of a misty, cool 23 September, the first parties began to select their lots on the new site.

The City Lay-out

Winter Quarters was situated on a level flat on the second bluff from the river with brooks on the north and south end. Running roughly parallel to the bend of the river (see map next page) the town plat also encompassed a relatively high bluff on the north where the artillery would be placed.
[The map or plat of Winter Quarters on the following page is taken from the Thomas L. Kane Collection, BYU Library, Box 2 Fd. 7. See FN. #59 for a cautious attempt to pinpoint prominent homes and landmarks]
Major Thomas H. Harvey who visited Winter Quarters in late Fall offered this description:

While at Council Bluffs I visited the Camp of Israel (Mormons). The camp as they call it, is situated on the South bank of the Missouri river 18 miles above Bellevue in the Omaha country, upon a beautiful table land, rising I would judge about fifty feet above common water, running back about 600 yards to the Bluffs, and extending down the river... about 1 1/2 miles; the Bluff or rather the high land rises beautifully above the table land. The camp is a regularly laid out town embracing the width of the table land and extending along the river a mile or more.

Covering some 600 to 800 acres gently sloping towards the Missouri, the site was closer to the river than many preferred. At a general council meeting of the Twelve, the High Council, and others on 16 September, at least three men, Jedediah M. Grant, Samuel Russell, and Lorenzo Young, objected to extending the city boundaries so close to the river bottoms. They believed higher land to be much healthier. \(^{33}\) Half of those in attendance voted for locating a little higher and a little further to the west and over a broader area, \(^{34}\) but they were reluctantly persuaded by Brigham, Orson Pratt, and Heber C. Kimball, that the chosen, more compact site near the river was preferable. And as for the unhealthy, poisonous gases arising from vegetable decompositions along the river banks, Kimball assured them they would rise and be blown away by the prevailing winds without injuring the settlement. \(^{35}\)

Brigham had surveyed the city into five acre blocks measuring twenty by forty rods (380' x 660') each with twenty lots per block. \(^{36}\) In turn each lot measured four by
ten rods (72' wide x 165' deep). Sufficiently wide streets were envisioned, two of which, First and Second Main, were to run south-east to north-west at an angle of 22½° west of north parallel to the river, and another fourteen streets to intersect at rightangles to the two main streets. As the drawing indicates, the city plat initially called for forty-one blocks, sixteen named streets, and 594 lots. Brigham proposed that all houses be built on the outside of each block near the streets with yards running inward up against those of the homes behind them so as to form, as at Cutler's Park, a ventilated, protected garden area. Such an arrangement, it was thought, would also create more community comraderie. Five wells per block (none on the streets) were the maximum permissible. Outhouses were to be placed at the rear of every lot and dug at least 8' deep. Hence a full-sized block could accommodate twenty houses and a population of from 150 to 300 people. South of the city a large stockyard was sectioned off to contain the cattle.

Bridges were soon constructed across the creek on the south leading to the cattle yards and across Turkey Creek (formerly Willow Creek and later Mill Creek) on the north adjoining the city with the military installations above the northern bluff. Contracts were also let out to build a large water mill on Turkey Creek west of the bridge.

Available evidence seems to indicate that the city was apportioned out along family divisional lines with Brigham's division occupying most of the center of the city, Heber C.
Kimball's company in the more southerly neighborhoods, Wilford Woodruff and his forty families occupying one entire block presumably along Woodruff Street, and Cutler's clan along the river banks where most of the sheep were stockaded and haying operations were conducted. 44

Overlooking the city and the river upon a bluff some 100' high was their military hardware including several brass cannon. On the first day of moving onto the site, yet another rumor reached camp that a United States Army of Dragoons was approaching. 45 Though again a false alarm, it was the catalyst behind reorganizing the former Nauvoo Legion (that city's authorized militia) into twelve companies of twenty-five men each and an artillery company of sixty-three men under John Scott. Winter Quarters' Nauvoo Legion was a volunteer standing militia on call at any given notice. 46

Later, in November, because of Indian pillagings, most lots south of Hyrum Street were evacuated "to form a line of defense against the Indians on the south." At the same time, lots were extended up to and including Turkey Creek and its outlet so that the city was moved northward and considerably compacted. Most houses from below Hyrum Street were repositioned into a line along the north side of Hyrum Street to form a solid wall of buildings. A tall picket fence was eventually constructed running from this line to the bluffs and to the river's edge. 47 But the removal was not difficult since most cabins had not yet been constructed.
"Like Jonah's Gourd"

Once groundbreaking for spring crops, fencing of fields, haycutting and stacking, and some preliminary sowing were completed, erecting suitable shelter was of immediate necessity. Up until mid-October virtually every man, woman, and child had been living in tents, make-shift hovels, and wagons now practically waterlogged and canvas-torn. And with the lateness of the season upon them, the situation was fast becoming critical. Complicating matters was the relative lack of timber in the area, and both the Indian's and government's restrictions on the use of available timber. Consequently timber parties began travelling upstream in October to cut cottonwood, lynnwood, and willows, some six to fourteen miles above camp and then raft the wood down the river, though not always without mishap due to strong currents and frequent sand-bars. While it is true that contrary to government instructions some got their logs from the opposite shore on Pottawattamie lands, most relied on timber from upstream. Most gathered their firewood from a small island across from camp which at the time possessed an abundance of driftwood.

The quality of the homes varied widely from large, sturdy, two-story affairs with solid floors throughout to cabin shanties inadequately and incompletely finished. Many of these were without doors or floors and had only partial roofs. Some were not cabins at all but mere dugouts in a near-by bluff. Quality varied according to the talents,
health, and economic well-being of the builders. Many families, particularly of absent Mormon Battalion soldiers, were totally dependent on the skills and schedules of those appointed to assist them.

Some of the leaders had the most substantial homes largely because many more lived in these homes than elsewhere. Heber C. Kimball's house was a story-and-a-half high built of logs hewed inside and containing two small rooms on each floor. Like most of the larger, better built houses it was covered with oak shingles, had a brick chimney (from brick gathered at the old abandoned garrison sites fourteen miles away), puncheon floors (logs split three inches thick and hewed on one side), and peculiar to Kimball's home, a six-paned window in each room. For extra protection against wind and rain, he spread two tents on the roof, a not uncommon practice. Residing in this single structure were Heber C. Kimball, his wife, and four little boys in one room, William Kimball's young family in another room, six people in another, and two of Heber's other wives in the fourth room, a total of at least eighteen persons. This home, Kimball's largest, was not completed till mid-December. His six other homes, for family members and plural wives, were built almost adjacent to the larger one mentioned above. Heber C. Kimball and family went on to build another twenty-five cabins most of which were for the poor in his division.
Surely the most singular looking edifice in town was Dr. Willard Richards' home. Called "the Octagon," potato heap, coal pit, round house or doctor's den, depending on the mood of the observer, it functioned as private residence, office for the Twelve and High Council, and post office. As the sketch on the following page illustrates, it was a true eight-sided octagon with sloping roof made of puncheon logs reaching to a window frame at the center of the raised ceiling thereby providing for natural sunlight. The roof was covered with straw and forty-five loads of earth. 57

Near Brigham Young's large home on Main Street, 58 the bishops constructed a one and one-half story Council House, a sort of community center, town hall, and gathering place all in one. It was 22' x 32' in size and had hewn log floors, fire places, and windows. Most social events and many indoor religious gatherings were held there. 59 A bowery near the Council House was erected to serve as the outdoor center for public meetings, conferences, and other forums for large assemblies.

While some homes were large and adequately built, most were considerably smaller, 12' x 18' or 12' x 12' single room structures possibly seven feet high and made of lynn or cottonwood logs. Most had dirt floors. Roofs were made by splitting oak timbers into boards or "shakes" (6" wide by 3' long and ½" thick) kept in place by weight poles. Others were made of willows, straw, and earth about a foot thick. Several covered parts of their roofs with animal hides for
Willard Richards' Octagon and Office

Winter Quarters, 1847

Source: Journal History, 31 December 1846
extra protection. Chimneys were made either of prairie sod or brick, and doors were made of shakes pinned together and wooden hinges, finished with a string latch. Inside, log houses were daubed with clay and other make-shift caulking. A few had fire places made of either brick or pounded clay.  

Many people were forced to move into only partially completed cabins and were glad even of that. Hosea Stout, on 24 November, the day his family moved into their "little shanty" said, "this day was the first day that my only living child [he had lost several by this time] now seven months and two days old ever was in a house, being born in the wild [,] rude and uninhabited prairies and remained so till now, a perfect child of nature." Eliza R. Snow described her humble cabin, which in all likelihood was similar to most others, as follows:

The log house we moved into was partly chinked and mudded, leaving large crevices for the wind - then cold and blustering. This hastily erected hut was roofed on one side, with a tent-cloth thrown over the other, and withal was minus a chimney. A fire, which was built on one side, filled the house with smoke until it became unendurable. . . . Our cooking was done out of doors until after the middle of November, when a chimney was made. . . .

Being on gently sloping land caused serious problems, particularly during thunderstorms. Since gutters were unknown, scenes like the following were common.

In the evening the wind came from the North accompanied by torrents of rain which ran like rivulets down the streets. It bursted into my house in torrents, and filled it up in a few moments until [sic] I had to
throw the water [sic] out by the bucket full until [sic] we were all completely drenched. 63

Interior furnishings were meager, even crude. Fireplaces were rare and stoves even more so. Most of their furniture either had been left behind in Nauvoo or long since discarded or traded away back in Iowa. A typical household contained barrels, chests for tables, the occasional wooden chair or two, trunks, and homemade bedsteads. 64 One new bride, with more to be thankful for than most, provided this helpful description.

We made curtains serve as partitions to divide the bedroom, repositories, etc. from the kitchen. Most of our furniture we had made to order—such as cupboards and bedsteads—they being attached to the house, also tables and chairs, and stools, and an occasional rocking chair, relics of other days, graced our ingle-sided. I was fortunate in having one of the latter, which I had brought with me. And here I received my 'setting out' in crockery ware, etc. which, though not very extensive, was deemed quite immense for these times. 65

Although bare, drafty, and uncomfortable, the cabins were better than the dug-outs or caves some were living in near the river banks and bluffs. These "sod caves" as many called them, looked like outdoor potato cellars and had a fire place at the upper end. They were supported by a ridge-pole and two center uprights. The ceilings were reinforced with willow and straw to minimize seepage. Blankets improvised for doors. A few had window panes positioned right into the dirt walls. Margaret Phelps, whose husband had recently died while marching with the
Battalion and was herself deathly sick with fever, described her habitat in less than glowing terms.

Winter found me bed-ridden, destitute, in a wretched hovel which was built upon a hillside; the season was one of constant rain; the situation of the hovel and its openness, gave free access to piercing winds and water flowed over the dirt floor, converting it into mud two or three inches deep; no wood but what my little ones picked up around the fences, so green it filled the room with smoke; the rain dropping and wetting the bed which I was powerless to leave. 66

Realizing how unhealthy such sod houses and caves were and fearful of cave-ins from heavy spring rains and runoffs, Brigham constantly encouraged those living in cabins, who had room, to let in the others. Come spring he instructed the sod dwellers to leave "and go into their tents and wagons and live in them and they will do well." 67 Most incredibly of all, some families passed the winter living in snow-covered tents and poorly heated covered wagons. 68

Some women, like Eliza Lyman, were not content with mere hovels or to wait forever for their husbands to build them a home. She wrote:

My sister Caroline and I have been trying to build a log house for ourselves as we do not feel comfortable where we are. We first got possession of an old house which we pulled down and had the logs moved to a spot where we wanted it put up again. As we could not get anyone to lay it up for us, we went at it ourselves and laid it up the rest of the way and put dirt soot on it. There I built a fire place and chimney till it was about as high as my head and some brother stopped it for me. We had one window of three panes of glass. We divided the room with a wagon cover and let D. R. Clark and wife have one part as he had helped to build it. We had each room enough
to put our bed by having the foot of the bedsteads come together and about six foot square from there to the fire.

Owing to their industry and the spirit of mutual cooperation and support that characterized their endeavors, the Camp of Israel transformed itself into a city in barely two months. Luckily, they were blessed with a long, mild fall.⁷⁰

Thomas Bullock, recently arrived from Nauvoo, made this observation of the city in late November.

[I] went through the City — where, nine weeks ago there was not a foot path, or a Cow track, now may be seen hundreds of houses, and hundreds in different stages of completion — impossible to distinguish the rich from the poor. The Streets are wide and regular and every prospect of a large City being raised up here.

By 30 December 1846 Winter Quarters consisted of 538 log cabins, eighty-three sod houses, and a population of 3,483 souls.⁷² Eventually "about 800" cabins, huts, caves, and hovels were built and occupied.⁷³

As the cold, dark winter began to set in little wonder Brigham could indulge in some self-satisfaction.

I feel like a father with a great family of children around me, in a winter storm, and I am looking with calmness, confidence and patience for the clouds to break, and the sun to shine, so that I can run out and plant and sow and gather in the corn and wheat and say; 'Children, come home, winter is approaching again, and I have homes, and wood, and flour, and meal . . . and I am ready to kill the fatted calf and make a joyful feast to all who will come and partake.'⁷⁴
The Poor Camp Rescue Mission

If conditions were stabilizing at the Missouri in the fall of 1846, they were rapidly deteriorating for the remnants left back at the Mississippi. Most had fled Nauvoo by the summer. Over 2,000 had come on in February's advanced camp. Hundreds followed intermittently throughout March and April. At least 3,000 left in May, so that by mid-August, according to one informal census, only "250 males old and young" or an estimated population of 1,000 - 1,500 remained. Many of those who had departed found places of employment along the Mississippi river at Galena, Burlington, St. Louis, or elsewhere in hopes of outfitting themselves and families and of joining the main camp later in the year. Those remaining couldn't afford to leave and were dependent on absent sons and husbands at the Bluffs, in the Battalion, or elsewhere. Their reliance on others is aptly portrayed in an imploring letter to Brigham Young from Elizabeth Gilbert, a widow who was left behind by those she believed had promised to take her to the Bluffs.

It [Nauvoo] is truly a lonesome and dismal place . . . I want to know what I shall do [?] Is it best for me to remain among the gentiles? . . . my body is almost worn out a struggling to get a shelter for my head . . . . tell all my friends that I yet live and my faith in the gospel is as firm as the everlasting hills and strangism has no effect on my mind . . . if you think it wisdom for me to come out this fall how shall I gather [?] Council [sic] me as though I was your child or Sister and whatever you say that I will do.
Such pleadings had always motivated Brigham. As the Nauvoo Covenant of October 1845 plainly illustrated, he was committed to bringing on all the Elizabeth Gilberts and anyone else who wished to come.

It had always been the plan to send teams and wagons back to Nauvoo as soon as circumstances at the Missouri permit.-d. As shown, the need to bring out the poor was a contributing factor to the demise of the Grand Island plan. 78 While appointing the High Council for the Pottawattamie land settlements on 21 July, the Twelve gave it the charge, among other duties, to bring "all the poor saints brought from Nauvoo and locate them here for the winter." Much consideration had also been given to selling the temples with most of the funds to go to the outfitting of latecomers or, more preferably, to pay river passage for the entire lot to within a few miles of the Bluffs. 79

Sometime in September, Newel K. Whitney, whose duties as Presiding Bishop were directed toward the temporal welfare of the entire Church membership, returned to Nauvoo to purchase much-needed flour and other provisions for those left behind. 80 By 9 September, while almost every other hand at Cutler's Park was preparing for winter, a dozen or more men whose families were still back at Nauvoo, eagerly volunteered to join Orville M. Allen's relief company and return with extra teams to help out. 81 More were to come.

But the matter took on greater urgency only a few days after Allen's departure. On 24 September, Daniel H. Wells
and William Cutler arrived in haste from Nauvoo by buggy with news of the late "Nauvoo Battle." Feared and rumored since even before the February '46 exodus, the armed conflict had begun 12 September. A handful of town defenders, perhaps a hundred, had fought against a vastly superior force.\textsuperscript{82} Despite the obvious departure of so many city residents and the promise of the rest to leave as soon as possible, Mormon opponents determined to force the expulsion of the remnant population.

Fearing the inevitable crisis, everyone who could possibly afford it got out of town. But those too poor to leave had no other choice but to turn to the Church for help. On 31 August 1846 the Nauvoo trustees reported that 750 people were calling on them daily for aid to leave and "to procure food to subsist on; they are also very destitute of clothing."\textsuperscript{83} A series of lynchings broke out in farms near Nauvoo just prior to the attacks on the city itself. The "Nauvoo War", as it was called, lasted five days during which time several were killed on both sides before the defenders prudently surrendered on 17 September.\textsuperscript{84}

The end of the battle was effectively the beginning of the so-called "poor camp" as scores of families with the barest of provisions crossed the river to Iowa to flee hostilities. Several atrocities were purportedly committed against those unfortunate few not able to get out in time. Jane Johnston, one of those forced to leave the city, recalled "a party of the mob" riding up, surrounding her
wagon, and demanding their weapons. "I then had a pistol in my bosom," she said, "which I drew out and told them it was there, and that I would use it before I gave it up. They did not take it from me, but threatened to throw me in the river that night." 85

By far the greatest, most sustained suffering occurred among the homeless, impoverished refugees once across the river. Thomas L. Kane, while returning to Washington, stumbled on the scene and though given to a crusading pen, was likely not far from the mark in his description of their plight.

Dreadful indeed was the suffering of these forsaken beings. Cowed and cramped by cold and sunburn, alternating as each weary day and night dragged on, they were, almost all of them, the crippled victims of disease. They were there because they had no homes, nor hospital nor poor-house nor friends to offer them any. They could not satisfy the feeble cravings of their sick: they had not bread to quiet the fractious hunger cries of their children. Mothers and babes, daughters and grandparents, all of them alike, were bivouacked in tatters, wanting even covering to comfort those whom the sick shiver of fever was searching to the narrow.

Such was the news of Wells and Cutler with the further intelligence that the sale of the temple and other properties was a virtual impossibility given the disruptive social climate.

Later word trickling back from Nauvoo substantiated their information. O. M. Allen reported that the poor camp was very sick and subsisting on boiled or parched corn for days at a time. 87 "I wod [sic] rather die chewg [sic] a root, than lie bleaching on the banks of this river,"
reported Thomas Bullock. Henry Young said that they were without food, clothing, shoes, tents, wagons, or beans and that many had died "from sheer want of nourishment." He further complained against what he considered a callous, careless attitude on the part of the Trustees. Thirty-three others cosigned Young's complaint critical of the Trustees for constantly underestimating their perilous circumstance.

In fact, the Trustees and their clerks were doing as much as could be reasonably expected. Joseph L. Heywood was on a "begging" mission to St. Louis by late October drumming up sympathy and relief pledges while desperately trying to close a sale on the temple. Unfortunately he could report "only moderate success." John M. Bernhisel spent three weeks on a similar mission of relief to Burlington, Davenport, Rock Island, Galena, and Dubuque, but managed to raise a mere $100 for though "many thought the Mormons had been harshly treated, yet the prejudice against them was deep and strong."

Such sad tidings naturally aroused the sympathies of almost everyone at the Bluffs themselves yet without shelter, many of whom had relatives in the poor camps. At a special meeting on Sunday, 27 September on the west side of Main Street in Winter Quarters, Brigham described the sufferings and called for immediate relief teams and donations.
Since the decision had only recently been made to vacate Cutler's Park for Winter Quarters causing further hay-cutting and house building delays, and since those over in Iowa were better prepared, with supposedly more time to prepare for the coming winter, the Twelve instructed the east side settlements to carry the burden of rescuing the poor camp. "Let the fire of the covenant which you made in the House of the Lord burn in your hearts" counselled Brigham. 94

The specifics of the plan as presented to the "Pottawattamie High Council" were to send back one or two other rescue companies led by James Murdock and Allen Taylor, with some twenty-five more teams and to assist Captain Allen in his relief efforts. 95 While returning to Nauvoo they were to cut and stack all the hay they could "in some bye place each day" to guarantee feed during their return journey in the colder weather of late fall. The poor camps were then to be located at Garden Grove, Mt. Pisgah, and other Iowa farms to minimize travel and to prevent a further burden on the already hard-pressed settlements at the Bluffs. 96 However, not everyone on the east side agreed with Brigham's assessment that they were better prepared than their counterparts at Winter Quarters. They were already carrying the brunt of providing for Mormon Battalion families and felt that this was another heavy burden. Yet most responded favorably. 97 Murdock and Taylor and company were on their way not long before Allen arrived at Montrose, Iowa, attempting the first rescue. 98
By 9 October, the Allen company was on its way west with the first rescue company of 157 souls in twenty-eight wagons. The Taylor/Murdoch camps rounded up the rest by early November. The return journey over what Bullock referred to "as the most damnable road I ever travelled," was relatively uneventful though because of constant sickness, exhaustion, prairie fires, and not a little squabbling, the Allen company took fifty days to make the trip of 335 miles, far longer, apparently, than Taylor's. Surprisingly only one or two perished during the entire episode.

Although Brigham sent word to leave the poor at either of the two Iowa farms, upon arriving at Mt. Pisgah Allen was told by Charles C. Rich, presiding officer at the Grove, "not to leave any of the poor there, as they had so many already on their hands that they could not take care of them." They could not even share in the corn, but instead Allen's cattle were forced to feed off the range. An angered Orville Allen declared this "is worse than I expected."

Many now worn out, tired, and disillusioned, decided to take their chances wintering at either the east or west forks of the Nishnabotona River or at other small, prairie shantyville settlements that had been popping up all along the Mormon trail in western Iowa ever since the previous summer. Almost all of them depended on trade with Missouri farmers and settlements for survival. The rest were likely absorbed into any one of scores of encampments on the
immediate east bank of the Missouri which were forming on almost every spring or creek that could boast a grove of timber. By year's end, the east side Mormons were scattered over 10,000 square miles and as far east as Bentonport and Farmington. Only a handful of the poor camp, including Thomas Bullock, made it all the way to the Missouri, arriving, finally, at Winter Quarters 28 November 1846.

Miller's Ponca Settlement

While the main body of the Church was settling in at Winter Quarters and in western Iowa, one other satellite settlement was making camp on the Running Water or Niobrara River some 150 miles north of the Bluffs. Led by the independent and increasingly disenchanted George Miller, the so-called Ponca settlement resulted from a combination of broken plans, differing objectives, and, ultimately, disobedience.

George Miller and James Emmett, be it remembered, had been dispatched to Grand Island by Brigham Young in late June on the double assignment of exploring Grand Island and beyond for a winter quarters site and to bring back a possible fur shipment for Peter Sarpy. Miller had also been given orders to await the Twelve for a possible trek to the mountains that year. Miller's company of fifty-two wagons arrived at the Pawnee Loup Indian village of 175 lodges in mid-July only to discover that the Sioux had recently destroyed the place while the Pawnee had been away on a buffalo hunt. Only the quick thinking of the white farmers
and instructors had saved the Pawnee women and children from certain death and they were leaving the camp as Miller arrived. Miller agreed to send back some men to protect the missionaries and families on their way back to the Indian agency at Bellevue and to carry Sarpy's furs. Having heard of the Sioux attacks, Brigham sent out another company of twenty-five men and their families on 22 July, under the direction of John Mikesell, Newell Knight, and Joseph Holbrook to reinforce the Grand Island encampment and to wait for further instructions. Mikesell and his company of seventy-two wagons reached Miller at the Pawnee Village 1 or 2 August. He at that time was exploring the area, repairing damage, restoring the Pawnee corn crops, and awaiting further word.

But between the 22 July and early August, the Twelve had definitely abandoned all plans for a mountain trek that season and for a major Grand Island encampment and sent out an express to Miller and his enlarged company either to winter alone at Grand Island or preferably, to return to the Missouri. Miller received word of the new plans 7 August along with Brigham's directions that if he opted to remain at the South side of the Loup Fork or at Grand Island on the South Platte and wait for the Twelve in the spring, he was authorized to organize a High Council and to serve as senior president over the camp.

When Brigham's communication reached Miller, he was in conference with eight Ponca Indian chiefs who had arrived in the village to make a defense pact with the Pawnee against
the warring Sioux, their mutual enemy. Though disappointed at not finding the Pawnee at home, the Ponca did meet with Miller and invited his company to winter with them on the Niobrara River. Miller and Emmett, his chief counsellor and part-time Indian interpreter, despite serious reservations from many in the High Council and objections from several in camp, and before waiting for any possible counsel from Brigham, agreed to the Ponca invitation. Miller spelled out some of his reasons in a letter to Brigham Young, including his belief that the Pawnee station too dangerous. He went on to say that the Ponca promised them protection against the Sioux, the use of their timber and land for sowing grain and corn, and a pledge of non-interference all in return for blacksmithing and farming assistance. Since the Ponca were supposedly "not more than fifty miles" north and "on our direct course to fort Larimie," [sic] Miller thought the plan a good one.108

The truth of the matter is that Miller and Emmett had designs of their own to set up a community similar to what Emmett had previously established on the Vermillion River based upon "common stock principles" with all private property surrendered into the hands of Emmett and Miller.109 It was much the same economic order that Lyman Wight in Texas was creating.

Fourteen families refused to follow Miller and stayed back at Grand Island.110 Led by Jacob Gates, this small contingent soon hosted the return of the Pawnee who
"appeared friendly" and "expressed a willingness that the brethren should stay and promised to use them well."$^{111}$ Brigham and the Twelve, upon hearing of the Grand Island split, concluded that Miller "was deceived in reference to the locality of Puncia [sic] and that he was running wild through the counsel of James Emmett."$^{112}$ They also considered Gates and his few followers in "rather precarious" circumstances and sent Jackson Redding to direct them to return to the Bluffs forthwith.$^{113}$ The Gates camp subsequently arrived back at Winter Quarters 10 October.$^{114}$

Brigham's objections to Miller's course of action were both political and religious. They were well aware of Emmett's sordid track record among the Indians and the unkind attitude both the Sioux and Indian agents harbored against him. They also feared that an isolated Mormon encampment on the southern borders of Sioux territory was an open invitation to serious trouble, a move that might endanger the entire Mormon settlements at the Missouri. Emmett was a maverick, a wild-eyed dreamer in Brigham's mind, a dangerous man in the wilderness. On the other hand, Miller greatly esteemed Emmett. "The excellencies of this man Emmitt [sic] as a skilful [sic] hunter and pioneer cannot be too highly spoken of" said Miller. "He was perhaps never excelled, even by the renowned Daniel Boone."$^{115}$ But Brigham was convinced Miller and Emmett had been too easily persuaded to winter with the Ponca and might well become unwilling instigators of Sioux attacks.
By now Brigham had good reason to believe that Miller, if not in open competition, was determined to prove he could build an equally successful camp as Winter Quarters. He believed Miller might openly vie for leadership of the Church, certainly for some other gathering place than the Great Basin. As renegade members of the Council of Fifty, Miller and Emmett were not taking lightly Brigham's tightening grip on the reins of Church leadership. Consciously pursuing an inevitable clash, they were stayed only by their increasingly suspicious and defiant High Council.\textsuperscript{116}

Brigham would have ordered their return but perhaps sensed his instructions would not be followed. Besides, Winter Quarters was already so hard-pressed for provisions and pasture that Miller and Emmett might just as well stay where they were but under strict guidelines to fulfill all promises with the Ponca, maintain strict neutrality between tribes, and "cultivate the spirit of perfect peace".\textsuperscript{117}

The journey from the Pawnee to the Ponca village took eleven days and was considerably further than anticipated, (some 150 miles instead of 50), a fact Emmett likely knew but took careful pains to conceal.\textsuperscript{118} Travelling in three companies, Miller's, Emmett's and Holbrook's, they finally arrived at the Running Water 24 August.\textsuperscript{119} Although the Ponca settlement was surprised at this unexpected arrival of 178 wagons and almost 400 white settlers, they accepted them without serious incident. However, after Chief Tea-Nuga-Numpa (Buffalo-Bulls-Two) died just two days after rejoining
his people, his successors had to quell a village suspicion that the whites were somehow responsible. For safety sake Miller was advised to move further east and settle on the north side of the Running Water River. On the 8 of September they laid out a site for their winter quarters about two miles from the confluence of the Missouri and Running Water Rivers near rushes on both rivers and fine fishing holes. After cutting several tons of hay they erected a picket fort 106' wide with a gate at each end and large enough to accommodate 110 lots all of which were taken. 120

Meanwhile five to ten or so families led by Asahel Lathrop had become so disenchanted with Miller that they left the Ponca settlement to follow the Missouri south till they arrived at Winter Quarters or until they found a suitable site for their own winter encampment. 121 On hearing of this further split in the ranks Brigham confided "Perhaps the Bishop has acted some things unwisely, or drawn the cords too tight on common stock principles and protections to the red man or poncas. Time will tell." 122 In a letter of 20 September, remarkable for its indications of Brigham's tolerance of Miller's ways despite the hazards risked by his settlement, Brigham with less condemnation than persuasion counselled Miller to forsake his ways, abandon the settlement, and come on down to the Bluffs. "If you want to locate your families here you have only to build a boat and drop them down to this place where you can become partakers of such like blessings as we enjoy." 123 Not
surprisingly, Miller did not budge. The settlement was never threatened by the Sioux, although a frightening fire of 26 December that "spread over the prairie as fast as a horse could run" burned most of their hay, several of their wagons, and so consumed the energies of the defenders that several died, including Newel Knight. 124

Census in the Wilderness

The end of 1846 is an ideal time to calculate their numbers since everyone had settled in for the winter, and the large migrations from Great Britain were yet to arrive.

Counting heads has always been an inexact science. A historical count is even more treacherous and difficult, no less so in the present circumstance. Most historical accounts have inflated estimates of the Mormon population. The long assumed number, first presented by John Taylor and later accepted by B. H. Roberts, is 15,000 at the Missouri at the end of 1846. 125 J. Sterling Morton, one of Nebraska's finest turn-of-the-century historians, relied on Heman C. Smith, former historian of the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints in concluding that 16,000 Mormons crossed the Mississippi with 12,000 of them at the Missouri River by the fall of 1846. 126 Similarly William Alexander Linn estimated a very large host, at least 15,000, contending that practically the entire Nauvoo
population crossed the Mississippi.  Perhaps both men relied on Colonel Thomas L. Kane who estimated 5,000 Mormons scattered over Iowa in the late fall of 1846 and 11,000 at Winter Quarters and across the river.

Significantly the more contemporary the manuscript, the more conservative the figures. Thomas H. Harvey, an on-site visitor to Winter Quarters in November 1846, hazarded a guess of 10,000. His Council Bluffs Indian Agent, R. B. Mitchell, who was a far more frequent visitor to the Mormon communities, estimated a lesser number of between 5,000 and 8,000.

Without question the largest concentration of the Latter-day Saints was at Winter Quarters but at no time did its population exceed 4,000. At the conclusion of a ward-by-ward census of the city in December conducted by the several bishops, the exact population stood at 3,483 of which 757 were men leaving a balance of 2,736 women and children. Even by June 1847, Brigham did not estimate a Winter Quarters population in excess of 4,000.

Across the river figures are less exact and harder to come by. It is known that by the end of 1846 210 people lived in Bishop Joseph Knight's ward and 319 lived in the nearby Blockhouse Branch. A conservative estimate of the numbers of people in surrounding groves and settlements, at Trader's Point, on the Boyer River, and in the immediate vicinity would be 2,500. Almost 400 people spent the winter with George Miller at the Running Water, while Asahel Lathrop's grazing center 100 miles south of Miller
constituted some fifty others. It is argued, therefore, that in the Winter Quarters vicinity almost 7,000 Latter-day Saints spent the winter.

Add to this number the almost 1,500 at St. Louis, the estimated 500 east of Garden Grove at Chariton Point, Burlington, Farmington, Iowa City, and other points (Kane estimates 1,325, likely an exaggeration), another 500 between Mosquito Creek and the Nishnabotna River, the 500 in the Battalion, 700 at Mt. Pisgah, 600 at Garden Grove, fifty in Nauvoo, 300 in Burlington, Galena, and Alton on the Mississippi, and 200 at St. Joseph and Savannah, Missouri, and one arrives at a combined figure of approximately 11,800. (See Figure 4:1).

If 17,000 had lived in and about Nauvoo in December 1846, almost 70 percent of them were accountable among various Mormon clusters and encampments a year later. Of the remaining 5,000, several had converted to Strang while others returned to their homes disillusioned and disaffected. A small number were never Mormons to begin with.

Thus by the end of 1846, the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints lay uprooted and strewn over a vast terrain stretching from Nauvoo to Winter Quarters, awaiting the wintry blast.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Winter Quarters</td>
<td>4,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Bank Missouri River</td>
<td>2,500 (est.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miller's Ponca Settlement</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lathrop Settlement</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total at the Missouri River</strong></td>
<td><strong>(6,950)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Louis</td>
<td>1,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between the Mississippi River and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Garden Grove</td>
<td>500 (est.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between the Nishnabotona River and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Fork Mosquito Creek</td>
<td>500 (est.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mormon Battalion</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mt. Pisgah</td>
<td>700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Garden Grove</td>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nauvoo</td>
<td>50 (est.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burlington, Galena, Alton, etc.</td>
<td>300 (est.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Joseph, Savannah, and other</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>northwest Missouri towns</td>
<td>200 (est.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total in Iowa and Missouri</strong></td>
<td><strong>(4,850)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GRAND TOTALS</strong></td>
<td><strong>11,800</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER FOUR

1 Some diarists called it "Big Spring."

2 The precise location of the Cold Springs encampment is uncertain. Some contemporary writers said it was thirteen miles from Mosquito Creek while others claimed it was only four miles from Council Point. See Heber C. Kimball Journal, 13 July 1846; and Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 21 October 1846. A concensus estimate would place it four miles from the west bank landing, obviously in present Omaha, Nebraska. Gail Holmes contends it was on the Little Papio Creek just north of Interstate 80 and near the corner of 61st and Patterson Streets in Omaha. See Gail George Holmes, "Winter Quarters Revisited - Untold Stories of the Seven-Year Stay of Mormons in the Missouri Valley 1846-53," pp. 19-20; also Holmes' leaflet "Historic Mormon Sites to Visit in Greater Omaha - Council Bluffs."

3 The history of the white man in the area begins with Lewis and Clark who in the summer of 1804 disembarked just north of present Omaha on the west side and named the spot "Council Bluffs," later called Ft. Calhoun. In 1811, Manuel Lisa, early developer of the Missouri Fur Company, established Fort Lisa in the same region. Eight years later in 1819, Colonel Henry Atkinson established a military post and engineer encampment just one-half mile north of Fort Lisa and five miles below the original Council Bluffs. Initially named Camp Missouri, it was successively called Cantonment Missouri, Cantonment Council Bluffs, and finally in 1820 Fort Atkinson at which time it was removed to the old Council Bluffs site. Ft. Atkinson was abandoned in 1827. See Jacob Van Der Zee, "Episodes in the Early History of the Western Iowa Country." The Iowa Journal of History and Politics 11 (July 1913):331; Chittenden, The American Fur Trade 1:114; and Mattes, The Great Platte River Road, pp.104-122.


5 See Brigham Young to Captain Jefferson Hunt and all members of the Mormon Battalion, 19 August 1846, Brigham Young Papers; and Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 7 August 1846.

6 The exact site of Cutler's Park probably corresponds to where Springville school now stands at the corner of 60th and Girard Streets in Omaha, Nebraska. Other local historians have suggested the boundaries as 48th, 60th, State Streets and Hartman Avenue which includes the west half of Forest Lawn Cemetery. The author, who has visited the site on several different occasions, believes it was
situated on either side of Mormon Bridge Road west of Forest Lawn Cemetery and included Potter Field, now an old cemetery lot.

7 *Diary of Hosea Stout*, 7 August 1846; 1:184.

8 Kane, "The Mormons," p.84.

9 See *Diary of Hosea Stout*, August 1846, 1:184; and *Manuscript History of Cutler’s Park*, 9 August 1846, LDS Church Archives. The organization of a High Council was nothing new in Church history. Such had served as the local seat of church government at Kirtland, Far West, and at Nauvoo. What apparently was different here was the name "Municipal" High Council and its secular functions in the absence of a mayor and other elected civic officials.

10 Constituting the Municipal High Council were Alpheus Cutler as president, Reynolds Cahoon, Cornelius P. Lott, Albert P. Rockwood, Ezra Chase, Daniel Russell, Alanson Eldredge, Thomas Grover, Jedediah M. Grant, Samuel Russell, Winslow Farr, and Benjamin L. Clapp. *Manuscript History of Cutler's Park*, 7 August 1846.

11 Journal History, 9 September 1846.

12 See *Journal of John D. Lee*, 9 August 1846; and Journal History, 9 August 1846.

13 Brigham also used the opportunity to express publicly for the first time his intention to petition Congress for a territorial government "as soon as we get to California." If, after all their plans and expectations, fate was determined to stand between them and the mountains that season, they would at least spell out their intentions.

14 *Diary of Hosea Stout*, 12 August 1846, 1:186.

15 See *Journal of Willard Richards*, 12 August 1846; and *Winter Quarters High Council Minutes*, 13 August 1846. The 1st Division also included 359 wagons, 1,051 oxen, 142 horses, and 588 cows.

16 *Winter Quarters High Council Minutes*, 4 September 1846. These divisions were in part family units since many leaders of the various subdivisions had been "spiritually" adopted into either Brigham Young’s or Heber C. Kimball’s families in the Nauvoo temple. Those daily arriving who were not yet 'adopted' or attached were assigned to one or the other at least temporarily. A third division was organized September 9th in order to accommodate the ever swelling population. *Winter Quarters High Council*, 17 August 1846. For more on adoption see Chapter Ten.
Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 3 October 1846.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 4 September 1846. For more on health and disease see Chapter Seven.

Ibid., 28 August 1846.

Ibid. See also Journal History, 28 August 1846.

Ibid.

22 The treaty, officially signed 31 August, 1846, read as follows:

"We the undersigned chiefs and braves representative of the Omaha nation of Indians, do hereby grant to the Mormon people the privilege of tarrying upon our lands for two years or more, or as long as may suit their convenience, for the purpose of making the necessary preparations to prosecute their journey west of the Rocky Mountains, provided that our great father, the president of the United States, shall not counsel us to the contrary.

"And we also do grant unto them the privilege of using all the wood and timber that they shall require. 

"And we furthermore agree that we will not molest or take from them their cattle, horses, sheep, or any other property.

Big Elk            Standing Elk      Little Chief"

Journal History, 3 September 1846. Significantly nothing was included about Indian ownership of improvements.

23 Journal History, 9 September 1846.


25 For a more thorough treatment of Mormon-Indian affairs, see Chapter Five.

26 Journal History, 5 September 1846. The fact that the wells at Cutler's Park were not yielding sufficient water was another factor. The new or "upper" ferry was in fact the first one moved north approximately twenty miles. It was designed to provide a much more direct course between Miller's Hollow on the east side near the Blockhouse and Winter Quarters on the west side thereby eliminating the long and hazardous journey up steep bluffs that had always characterized the original or "lower" ferry. Sarpy, who had been promised
eventual use of the Mormon ferry, willingly agreed to the move.

27 Journal History, 8 September 1846.
28 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 18 September 1846.
29 Manuscript History of Cutler's Park, 10 and 11 September 1846.
30 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 23 September 1846.
31 Diary of Hosea Stout, 24 September 1846, 1:201.
32 Thomas H. Harvey to William Medill, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, 3 December 1846, Winther, The Private Papers and Diary of Thomas L. Kane, pp.25-29.
33 Many remembered all too well the sickness and death suffered by the inhabitants of the swampy, low lying, river front areas of Nauvoo.
34 Journal of Eliza R. Snow, 22 September 1846.
35 Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 16 September 1846. Heber C. Kimball, who professed to know something about "philosophy" and the workings of chemistry observed "that the best mettals [sic] was always the heaviest and when melted would settle at the bottom and the bad [impure air contaminants] or useless dross arise and run off and he believed the principle was true and would carry cut on any or all subjects."
36 See Journal History, 23 September 1846; also Helen Kimball, The Woman's Exponent 13 (1884-85):115. In Nauvoo, each block contained four, one-acre lots.
37 See map of city lay-out earlier in this chapter.
38 The number of lots later increased to 820 as the city expanded. See Journal History, 26 February 1847.
39 Most wells were thirty-five feet deep and built with stones readily available from the river bed. Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 31 December 1846.
40 Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 22 September 1846.
41 Wilford Woodruff records that on his block two families were assigned per lot or forty families to the block. Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 23 September 1846.
42 Journal of Norton Jacob, 24-26 September 1846.
Journal History, 29 September 1846.

See Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 23 September 1846; also Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 23 September 1846.

Account book of Gilbert Belnap, 21 September 1846, LDS Church Archives.

See Journal History, 22 September 1846; and Journal of Norton Jacob, 22 September 1846.

Journal History, 24 February 1847. Later the vacated land was used for planting garden crops.

A Methodist minister who lived near Winter Quarters as early as 1848 has commented on the scarcity of timber in the region.

"In the uplands the trees were more scattering and shorter, requiring, according to the idiom of the country, two trees in order to get a log long enough to make a fence post. Indeed, timber was so scarce in the bluffs that we did not expect to see the prairie between the Missouri and the Mishnabotona all settled up in our lifetime."

Reverend John Todd, *Early Settlement and Growth of Western Iowa*, p.64.

Wrote R. B. Mitchell, Indian sub-agent, concerning woodcutting on Pottawattamie lands: "It becomes my duty to suffer no useless waste of timber within the limits of the sub-agency. I hope that you will charge strictly those that have settled within my sub-agency to use the timber only so far as may be necessary for conveniences and comfort."

Journal History, 12 September 1846.

See Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 13 October 1846; and Journal of Joseph G. Hovey, Fall 1846.

Journal History, 3 November 1846. Those on the east side, like Henry W. Miller, who had claimed pre-emption rights to Iowa land, were legally free to cut their own trees. Very possibly they invited friends from Winter Quarters to aid in clearing off their land and to help themselves to whatever unwanted timber was available.

Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 10 December 1846.


Helen Whitney, "Woman's Exponent" 13 (1884-85):139.

Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 10 November 1846.
Journal History, 19 December 1846.

See Manuscript History of Winter Quarters, 3 December 1846; and Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 3 December 1846; also Diary of Hosea Stout, 2 January 1847, 1:222-28.

Little is known of the Brigham Young home other than that it was on Main Street, six rods west of Willard Richards' Octagon and close to the Council House. It had a brick chimney but no windows and was probably similar in design to Kimball's. Journal History, 8 November 1846 and 7 January 1847. For many years some Florence, Nebraska area residents believed the old James C. Mitchell home on State Street overlooking Florence Park was the original Young home but this is not so. See Scrapbook of Lawrence D. Clark, LDS Church Archives.

See Journal History, 13 and 22 December 1846; and Ray F. Larson "The Mormons: Their Trek Across Iowa", p. 57; also Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 19 September 1846. It is, unfortunately, impossible to pinpoint the exact location of most buildings in Winter Quarters since little, if anything, now remains and no plat with house locations has yet been found. An educated guess would place the Council House on lot twenty-two not far from Brigham Young's home, likely on the corner lot on Main Street on block twenty-five. Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 19 September 1846.

Other public buildings included a store, a carding machine house, a hostel for visitors, and possibly a few small school houses. Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 16 September 1846.

See Record Book of Bathsheba W. Smith, p.14, BYU Library; and Journal History, 31 December 1846.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 24 November 1846; 1:213.


Diary of Hosea Stout, 8 July 1847, 1:265.


Helen Whitney, Woman's Exponent 13 (1884-85):134.

Daniel Tyler, A Concise History of the Mormon Battalion, p.130. It is a mistake to conclude that Mormon Battalion families possessed inferior housing to the rest; generally, the opposite was true. Latecomers were almost invariably consigned to sod houses or caves. Journal History, 7 August 1847.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 28 February 1847.
Journal History, 15 February 1847.

Journal of Eliza Maria Partridge Lyman, May 1847.

See Brigham Young to the Nauvoo Trustees, 14 November 1846, Brigham Young Papers; and Journal of Joseph G. Hovey, Fall 1846. As one old settler said, "for twelve years he had not seen such a moderate season."

Journal of Thomas Bullock, 28 November 1846.

Manuscript History of Winter Quarters, 19 December 1846.

Journal History, 1 April 1848.

Ibid., 26 February 1847.


James Whitehead to Brigham Young, 18 August 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Elizabeth Gilbert to Brigham Young, 13 August 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

See Chapter Three.

Journal History, 25 August 1846.

Ibid., 6 October 1846.

This first relief mission consisted of Orville M. Allen, Samuel Smith, Amos Tubbs, Pliny Fisher, William H. Kimball, Amasa Russell, John Y. Greene, James McPike, Joseph Knight Jr., Samuel Savoy, Charles Decker, W. G. Sterritt, Clement Evans, Peter Van Orden, and one or two others. See Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 8 September 1846; also Journal History, 9 and 14 September 1846.


Nauvoo Trustees to Brigham Young, 31 August 1846, Research Card #1400, Nauvoo Restoration Corporation research files of James L. Kimball, LDS Church Office Building, Salt Lake City, Utah.

The terms of the treaty were a) the surrender of all Nauvoo arms to be returned to the Mormons once across the river, b) guaranteed safety of all those surrendering, c) ten men, including the Trustees and clerks to remain in Nauvoo to hasten evacuation and complete business transactions, and d) a speedy evacuation. Roberts, A Comprehensive History, 3:15.
Diary of Joseph Smith Black, typescript of manuscript, BYU Library, p. 5.

Thomas L. Kane, "The Mormons," pp. 9-10. Kane confided to Jesse C. Little, once back in Washington, that he would propagandize "the murderous treatment at Nauvoo" as further ammunition in his efforts to persuade the Polk administration to sympathize with the Mormon plight and permit settlements on both Pottawattamie and Omaha lands. "You may depend upon it," Little wrote, "the Colonel has done us good." Journal History, 6 October 1846.

This is a good example of the Mormon aptitude for capitalizing on real and perceived injustices. They did it with Missouri's Haun's Mill Massacre, with the Mormon Battalion, now with the poor camp, and later with Mt. Pisgah's and Garden Grove's difficulties. If they were to suffer, they'd make it pay a dividend in one form or another.

Journal History, 7 October 1846.

Journal of Thomas Bullock, Fall 1846.

Henry Young and co-signers to Brigham Young, 27 October 1846, Brigham Young Papers. A legitimate difference of opinion arose over the number of teams required to bring on the camp, but Brigham responded encouraging patience and forbearance.

Journal History, 2 October 1846.

Joseph L. Heywood to Brigham Young, 2 October 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Journal History, 4 November 1846.

Ibid., 27 September 1846.

Ibid., 28 September 1846.

Bishop Newel K. Whitney, who had already returned to the Mississippi to arrange for the purchase and delivery of the most essential provisions, had reported that a maximum of fifty wagons would be sufficient to remove all the camp. Allen had returned with twenty or more so that Murdock and Taylor required only an added twenty-five or thirty. Journal History, 6 October 1846. The precise number in the poor camp is difficult to estimate. As late as 31 August, trustees estimated 750 adults in Nauvoo and 175 in Lee County, most of whom were barely subsisting and "very destitute of clothing." Research Card 1400, Nauvoo Restoration Corporation research files of James L. Kimball, 31 August 1846. But by October many had already left. It is estimated from the 151 souls listed in A. M. Allen's
return company roster that the total poor camp, including those in Murdock's rescue company, approximated 350 to 400.

96 Journal History, 28 September 1846.

97 Minutes of the Pottawattamie High Council, 2 October 1846.

While assisting Allen in organizing the first rescue company in sight of Nauvoo across the river, Thomas Bullock, company clerk, recorded what must have seemed at the time a miraculous occurrence and is even now regarded as a stroke of incredible fortune. On 9 October, at a time when food supplies were in shortest supply, several large flocks of quails flew into camp some falling on the wagons, some under, some even on the bare breakfast tables. Wrote Bullock:

"The boys caught about 20 alive . . . every man and woman and child had quails to eat for their dinner - after dinner the flocks increased in size. Captain [sic] Allen ordered [sic] the bren [sic] not to kill, when they had eaten and were satisfied . . . not a gun was afterwards fired and the quails flew round the camp, many a lighted in it . . . this was repeated more than half a dozen times."

To the suffering faithful, it was a miraculous sign of providential mercy. Journal of Thomas Bullock, 9 October 1846. Few other accounts of this famous "Mormon miracle" exist. Orville M. Allen's journal at the time was kept by Bullock and the two accounts are almost verbatim. Thomas L. Kane's report of the incident is likely second hand since he probably was not an eye witness.

99 Kane also began the myth that several children were born while the poor camp languished on the Mississippi's west side. One recent article contends that the pioneer story of nine babies being born in one night did not occur at Sugar Creek as Eliza R. Snow intimated, but with the poor camp. See Carol Lynn Pearson, "'Nine Children Were Born': A Historical Problem from the Sugar Creek Episode," Brigham Young University Studies 21 (Fall 1981): 443-44. Pearson relies heavily on the reminiscences of Jane Johnston as dictated orally almost forty years after the fact.

The truth of the matter is that nine children were not born during the entire poor camp sojourn of over a month near Montrose. Bullock's census of the largest contingent of refugees lists names, birth dates, and birth places. Only one child was listed as having been born within the month and that one at Nauvoo. See Journal of Thomas Bullock, 7 October 1846. The chances of nine children being born in a camp of only 400-500 within a month's time are minute; nine born the same night beyond belief. More likely the old references are to nine births while Brigham's
first company crossed from Sugar Creek in the east to Mosquito Creek in the west of Iowa.

100 Journal of Thomas Bullock, 15 November 1846. Their sickened state is well remembered. Wrote Bullock: "My wife, washing, although so very sick that she had to leave the wash tub to vomit and when spreading her clothes on the ground to dry, had to lie full length on the prairie."

101 Brigham Young to Orville M. Allen, 3 November 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

102 Orville M. Allen to Brigham Young, 15 November 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

103 Journal of Thomas Bullock, 22 and 24 November 1846.

104 Record book of Bathsheba Smith, p.17.

105 Journal History, 1 February 1847.

106 See George Miller to Brigham Young and the Twelve, 1 August 1846, Brigham Young Papers; and Autobiography of Anson Call, 22 July 1846.


109 See Journal History, 15 September 1846; and Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 12 December 1847; also Orson Spencer to Brigham Young, 20 October 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

110 Jacob Gates to Brigham Young, 2 September 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

111 Journal History, 9 September 1846.

112 Ibid., 20 August 1846.

113 See Diary of Hosea Stout, 15 September 1846, 1:193; and Journal History, 9 September 1846.

114 Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 10 October 1846.

116 Remembered Anson Call, a member of the Ponca High Council: "They sought to lead the Company into the wilderness, upon their own responsibility independent of the Council of the Twelve. Every member of the council opposed them." Autobiography of Anson Call, Fall 1846. For more on the split, see Chapter Eight.

117 Brigham Young to George Miller, 20 September 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

118 Journal History, 1 February 1847.

119 Autobiography of Joseph Holbrook, 23 August - 1 September, 1846, p. 47.

120 Ibid., 8 September 1846.

121 See Hiram Clark to Brigham Young, 9 September 1846, and Brigham Young to Orson Spencer, 20 October 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

122 Brigham Young to Orson Spencer, 20 October 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

123 Brigham Young to George Miller, 20 September 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

124 Autobiography of Joseph Holbrook, 26 December 1846-31 January 1847. Nevell Knight's loss particularly was mourned among the Mormons for he had played a prominent role in the very early days of the Church in upstate New York.

125 See Roberts, Comprehensive History 3:52; and The Latter-day Saints Millennial Star 8 (November 15, 1846): 114.

126 J. Sterling Morton, Illustrated History of Nebraska, pp. 134-35.


128 Winther, Diary of Thomas L. Kane, pp. 30-34.

129 Ibid., pp. 25-29.

130 R. B. Mitchell to Thomas H. Harvey, 29 June 1846, Kane Collection, BYU Library.

131 See Journal History 31 December 1846; and Diary of Hosea Stout, 24 December 1846, 1:219. The same study accounted for 514 wagons, 145 horses, 388¾ yoke of oxen, and 463 cows.
Brigham Young to Sam Brannan, 6 June 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

See Journal History, 31 December 1846; and Minutes of the Blockhouse Branch 1846-49, 27 December 1846, LDS Church Archives.

The 2,500 figure is based upon the following: 1) membership statistics of two branches which are on record; 2) the fact that several other bishops reported to the Pottawattamie High Council whose jurisdictions were small but nearby; and 3) that only fifty-three of the over 500 in the Mormon Battalion came from Winter Quarters, the rest coming from the east side and the farms. See Pottawattamie High Council Minutes, 24 July 1846; and Journal History, 31 December 1846; also Minutes of Blockhouse Branch.

Stanley B. Kimball, "The Saints and St. Louis, 1831-1857: An Oasis of Tolerance and Security," Brigham Young University Studies 13 (Summer, 1973): 507. Kimball argues that in late 1845 only 400 Mormons lived in St. Louis, but by 31 January, 1847, the number had more than tripled to 1,478.


Journal History, 12 February 1847. (based on five members per family)

By using clerk records kept by the poor camp and sexton records at Winter Quarters and Cutler's Park, a preliminary overview of national origins is possible. Based on a sample of 312 people, native Americans constituted 76% of the Mormon population; Britains 21%; Canadians (Upper and Lower Canada) 2%. The five states of New York, Pennsylvania, Illinois, Ohio, and Massachusetts combined to claim 48% of the total with New York the largest source of converts. 11% claimed origin in one of the traditional southern states.
CHAPTER FIVE

MORMONS; INDIANS, AND INDIAN AGENTS

Planting a large, white man's community no matter how temporary in Indian territory among a destitute, well-armed, and suspicious native population was hazardous enough; to do so on disputed lands between two jealous tribes and within easy striking range of the marauding Sioux was simply a calculated risk of potentially disastrous consequences. Even though treaties had been signed between principles of the Latter-day Saints and the Omaha and Ottoe, the Mormon people rightly suspected difficulties. Their precarious situation demanded artful negotiations, incredible patience, and unending restraint to preserve a harmony and peace. In a very short time they found themselves on the receiving end of repeated Indian depredations and in the middle of intensifying and bloody inter-tribal wars. In large measure they were the architects of their own unenviable situation and eventually paid an unexpectedly high price for their deliberate decision to stay on Indian lands. Nevertheless, despite the trials, Mormon relations with the Indians remained uncommonly and surprisingly peaceful.

But if patience and cooperation characterized their relations with the Indians, a spirit of suspicion came to dominate negotiations between them and representatives of the office of Indian Affairs. A positive dialogue that
commenced in mutual respect and understanding deteriorated into unfortunate acrimony, accusation, and some bitterness. At issue were a host of factors: the obscurity of Mormon intentions; recurring changes and delays in their departure dates; alleged prejudice of Indian agents and sub-agents; Mormon negotiating tactics; and, at base, the very legality of building a sizeable, seemingly permanent community on Indian lands.

This chapter will attempt to weave into one the account of Mormon efforts to live in peace with the Omaha, Ottoe, and Sioux Indians and the government's increasingly active concerns to preserve the perceived rights and interests of these Indian tribes.

In the Land of the Lamanites

Brigham's single objective was to live in peace among the Indians. He did not want and could not afford war and would sacrifice much to insure that beneficent end. The Saints had no conflict with the Indians and wished to live in harmony while regrouping and preparing themselves for the further trek west.

Much in their theology prepared them to relate positively with the Indian. While other faiths believed in Christianizing the Indians and had established schools, churches, and missions among numerous tribes such as the Catholics had done among the Pottawattamie and as the Presbyterians were doing among the Pawnee, the Mormons believed they owned a special commission.
A central doctrine of the Book of Mormon, regarded by them as additional scripture and a companion volume to the Bible, indicated that the American Indian, anciently called "Lamanites," was a descendant of Jacob of the Old Testament, a remnant of the tribe of Joseph through Manasseh, and consequently part of the ancient House of Israel, God's "chosen people." The Book of Mormon stated that though a fallen and cursed people because of transgression, "there are many promises which are extended to the Lamanites" and "at some period of time they will be brought to believe in his [Christ's] word."\(^1\) According to the accepted revelations given to Joseph Smith, "Jacob shall flourish in the wilderness, and the Lamanites shall blossom as the rose."\(^2\) Although some of the early missions of the Church to the Indians had not proven successful, it was believed that the Lord's special promises were about to be fulfilled. Mormons felt they had a particular gospel to preach to the Indian and that God would preserve and support them in their efforts.

Wilford Woodruff, writing on New Year's eve, expressed a wish "that 1847 may not pass away until the Lamanites with their chiefs may begin to receive the gospel which the gentiles have rejected and cast out of their midst."\(^3\) The expulsion of the Mormon people from their homes in Missouri and most recently in Nauvoo was perhaps a sign that God was removing His gospel from the 'Gentiles' and was about to remember his ancient covenant people, the Lamanites.
These beliefs were held not only by camp leaders but pervaded the attitudes of the commoner as well. Fanny Murray, a sister to Brigham Young, writing to a friend back east said, "We do not suffer anything from fear of the Indians, for we know that for their sakes we are suffering all these things, and we are sure that the Lord Our God will not suffer them to destroy us." Though many in camp did not share this absence of fear and while prejudice against the Indian was not unknown, there was something in the doctrines of the Church that demanded a genuine interest in the Indian's temporal and spiritual welfare. And much of the blame for the pitiable condition of the Indian, common sufferers in exile, the Mormon placed upon the same governments that had driven them out.

Regardless of their religious convictions, Brigham made it clear that this was neither the time nor the place for spreading the word. While at Winter Quarters they made few, if any, attempts to proselyte among their Indian neighbors and refrained from manning missions and school houses among any of the tribes. The converting process would have to wait for a more propitious time.

To make war upon the Indians, then, was not only politically foolish and inexpedient, but patently offensive to Mormon beliefs. With so many men away in the army it was questionable whether the Mormons could have sustained any sort of extended armed conflict. Besides, the Indian might
be a valuable ally in warding off any attacking Missouri mobs or federal soldiers.

But aware of the potential danger Brigham took every precaution. The lynch-pin in his peace policy was to show, but never use, a strong display of force unless required in self-defense. This accounts, in part, for his determination to keep the settlements close together and for his scarcely concealed opposition to George Miller's establishment among the Ponca. Safety lay in convincingly large numbers and a strong, well-armed defense.

In January 1847 a company of Sioux with chief Eagle at their head made a surprise visit to Asahel Lathrop's small encampment several miles north of Winter Quarters. Attracted, no doubt, by the immense number of cattle under Lathrop's jurisdiction, they represented a band of over 300 warring Sioux then in the neighborhood and clearly posed a serious threat to Lathrop's small contingent. While in the vicinity they killed thirty of Lathrop's herd and appeared poised for more. Lathrop invited Eagle and thirty of his braves to a feast, presented them gifts, and endeavored to make peace. Eagle responded that their purpose was to kill the Omaha and not the white man but that he sometimes had difficulty restraining his warriors.

On hearing of this the first serious encounter with the dreaded Sioux, Brigham immediately sent twenty-three extra armed men to bolster Lathrop's defenses and prevent any further outbreaks. His instructions to Lathrop were clear
and underlined his policy of dealing from strength, not weakness.

Let the loss be what it may, but you must be diligent and sleep with one eye open, and never again let the Indians or any other enemy within your fort. To do this is to throw yourself in the power of your enemy, as it gives him an advantage you cannot recall, until it is too late . . . keep them at respectful distance with the power always in your hands . . .

Now, Brother Lathrop, you must watch as well as pray, and let the Indians get no advantage of you, or learn your numerical strength again, but do the best you can to give them such an opinion of your resources as to put them in awe . . . and at the same time inspire them with confidence in your good intentions [and] promote peace.

The Sioux never again returned and never constituted a serious threat against the Mormons even though the opportunities to do so were many.

At Winter Quarters, meanwhile, it became standard policy to station armed guards near the cattle herds and around the perimeters of the city and in other conspicuous places to deflect and discourage Indian prowlers. The occasional cannon firing, military drills, and other conspicuous shows of force were all designed for their defense and self-preservation.

A second and related policy was not to take sides or form alliances with one tribe against the other. As much as the Omaha and Ottoe maneuvered for protection and favoritism, for the Latter-day Saints to incline to one or the other was extremely dangerous. Call for peace among them, but let the Indians fight their own battles. In early negotiations with the Omaha, Brigham agreed to assist in
their agricultural endeavors "but would not interfere in any of their difficulties with other tribes." Such a course of action would surely have embroiled them in a savage crossfire and would have drawn the scorn and objections of the Indian agents who were already concerned that just such an impasse might develop. Strict neutrality must govern all their dealings.

A third principle was to leave the Indian alone, not to engage in any social or economic intercourse whatever, especially on an individual basis. In reality this was virtually impossible, given the Omaha's natural curiosity and constant visits to the camp and the documented sympathy many had for the begging and forlorn among the Omaha, especially the women and children. This policy coincided with federal regulations and Brigham preferred not to contravene such laws thereby giving cause for investigation and annoyance.

When in August several Ottoe brought roasting ears into camp to sell, Brigham, supposing they had been stolen from Omaha corn fields, warned his people not to buy them. Trading must be left strictly to camp leaders and only on a collective basis. Liquor ("ardent spirits"), available in camp, was especially contraband trade with the Indians who often sought it, and those found guilty of selling or distributing it among the Indians were punishable by the whiplash. Feeding the Indian out of sympathy or for any other causes, was likewise discouraged and prohibited. Furthermore they were constantly reminded to prevent their
cattle from ranging on Indian corn fields and to be extra
diligent not to disturb their graves and unexpected burial
places. Children especially, who playfully roamed over the
hills and surrounding graves, must be particularly careful
and "should be taught to let them alone."

It was a strict rule that under no circumstances would
mating between races be permitted. Such a practice had
already caused grief and difficulties and would not be
countenanced. All forms of friendly camaraderie must be
guarded against. Shooting back, stealing, and every other
form of vengeful activity were likewise prohibited. "It was
wrong to indulge in feelings of hostility and bloodshed
toward the Indian, who might kill a cow, an ox or even a
horse," Brigham counselled. "To them the deer, the buffalo,
the cherry and plum tree or strawberry bed were free. It
was their mode of living to kill and eat." But if they
persist in robbing and stealing, "after being warned not to
do so, whip them," Trespassers were best handled by the
whip and not by the gun. The Saints must refrain from
shooting Indians even "if they did catch them skinning their
oxen." At all costs bloodshed must be avoided. If
anyone shot and killed an Omaha for stealing, he was guilty
of murder and would be delivered to the appropriate Indian
chief "to be dealt with as the Indians shall decide, as that
was the only way to save the lives of the women and
children."
Yet despite their policies of non-alignment and non-involvement, meaningful and helpful exchanges between peoples occurred. In December 1846 an unsuspecting party of Omaha, while asleep, were attacked by either a band of Sioux or Iowa within gunshot range of Winter Quarters. The wounded Omaha, including chief Big Head who had been shot in the arm, hand and head, and several others were brought into camp and their wounds immediately dressed. For a time many of the Omaha, fearing further attack, were allowed to pitch their tents next to Brigham's home. "They would weep and howl, cry, writhe and twist and make every gesture that could be imagined," recalled Hosea Stout, and "they made such a noise that President Young had them stop [sic]." Big Elk's statement that "we have been like the hungry dog which runs through camp in search of something to eat and meets with enemies on every side" was being fulfilled.

Accounting for their outburst was the even worse news that sixty miles north an Omaha hunting party had been attacked at night by the Sioux (likely Chief Eagle's warriors) and seventy-three of their number had been killed. Appleton Milo Harmon records that most of the victims had been shot through the head or heart while still asleep. "The Soux [sic] then cut off the noses of the dead as a token of spite and contempt which they held towards them and retreated." When the surviving remnants passed through town, they took with them Big Head's party and encamped a little north of Sarpy's ferry. Having pity on
the Omaha and their tenuous circumstance, the High Council decided "to build them a house" at a spot naturally well fortified and from which they could discern the approach of an enemy at some distance. Eventually many Omaha crossed the river to seek safety among the Pottawattamie. Of all the tribes, the Mormons sympathized most with the Omaha. Said Harmon, "the sufferings of these poor miserable beings was immense [sic] and excited the sympathy [sic] of our people who gave them several beef cattle and a great amount of bread."22

As a result of their deliberate attempts to deal justly and peaceably with the Indians, Indian agents, at least initially, were complimentary. "With regard to their intercourse with the Indian tribes in particular," said R. B. Mitchell, "I would remark that it has been greatly more circumspect and unexceptionable than is usually found to be the case with emigrant bodies passing through this region of country."23 Later on this same Mitchell remarked, "So far as I know, the general conduct of the Mormon people has continued irreproachable."24

But as time passed inter-racial problems became ever more exasperating and disruptive. Unsuccessful in their recent buffalo hunts and unproductive in growing corn and other crops, the Omaha either stole or starved. Said Whitney, "They have had for some time in contemplation a grand buffalo hunt, which they have abandoned in expectation of living and sustaining themselves by the killing of our cattle instead."25 Often they would kill camp beef and then
try and sell it back. The increased tempo of Indian thievery persuaded the High Council to fence in the city's southern perimeter and to picket most of the rest of town. Despite their labors, by mid-October the Indians "were killing two or three oxen per day."26 Brigham, sermonizing one Sunday morning on Indian pilfering, counselled his listeners "not to let them into their tents for they would steal with one hand while you give them a loaf of bread in the other."27

Though concerned with their economic losses, Brigham worried more about restraining his people from overreacting. Believing dialogue the better alternative to confrontation, he called for a series of meetings. "We want such an understanding with the Omaha" he wrote, "as to prevent any collision or trouble for our feelings are kind toward them and all men."28

Chief Elk in response admitted, "I can not guide all of my people; they are wild; they are just like the wolves of the prairie for when they are hungry they don't know better than to take what is handiest [sic]."29 Big Elk confessed that his tribe called him "a liar" when he told them the Mormons would do them well. As a partial solution, he and Logan Fontenelle recommended they build fences around every cattle herd, large or small, in or out of the city, and that they whip any stealing Indian.30 They further advised that they neither socialize nor befriend loiterers nor sell their dogs to the Indians. The Indians would kill them "so that they could more easily pilfer from us."31 On repeated
occasions Big Elk returned many stolen items in an effort to preserve peace and harmony. But despite their efforts, the stealing and killing of cattle increased straining relationships almost to the breaking point. By late October at least fifty oxen and many sheep had been killed. By April 1847 Stout said, "The amount of cattle killed by them the past winter and spring is incredible." "Incredible" meant "from 3 to 5,000 dollars worth of cattle" as Brigham estimated, enough to cast serious doubt on any chance of moving the camp en masse to the mountains come spring.

Making matters all the more untenable the Indians, so the Mormons claimed, were increasingly killing and stealing not only because of hunger, but also out of spite and agitated maliciousness. Not only were the Omaha and Ottoe involved but by the spring of 1847, Ponca and Pawnee Indians also "were in the neighborhood stealing horses and cattle."

Apparently the Mormon cattle herds were becoming a popular attraction.

What had soured the soup? It would be easy though not necessarily incorrect to say the Omaha were running scared. Their numbers had been decimated, they felt themselves the victims of both Sioux and Ottoe depredations, and were taking out their frustrations on peaceful neighbors. Without a supply of buffalo meat, beef would do just as well.

But the Mormons had been guilty of some indiscretions of their own despite counsel otherwise. After the above-described slaughter by the Sioux of more than seventy
Omaha, Henry W. Miller and Arza Adams, while leading a cattle-grazing company, had inadvertently stumbled onto the massacre site some days after the tragedy. Most of the dead bodies had been stripped of buffalo robes, moccasins, and leggings by the Sioux, while tents and lodges had also been taken. But Miller, after nursing the wounds of one dying squaw, inappropriately took some tattered robes and twenty to forty beef hides stolen from the Mormons and two stray Indian horses. Hearing of it, an anxious Brigham bolted off a letter saying, "if you have committed any such overt act in any degree, give not sleep to your eyes . . . till you have replaced every article which has been removed." He urged them "to appease the wrath of an ignorant but insulted people and therefore, if possible, save your lives".38 Though the goods were all returned, an insult had been carelessly made.

While the Mormons had been careful not to use much of the already scarce surrounding timber, the small amounts undoubtedly used gave cause for provocation. Too, the Omaha were jealous of their many guns and their marksmanship in shooting wild turkey and other small animals. Because of their sheer numbers, the Mormons probably shot more game than the Indians liked to see. Mormon efforts at keeping the Indians out of the camp especially during the winter and preventing them from enjoying their fires and shelter were other contentious points.
In an April conference of all interested parties, Chief Big Elk gave his side of the matter as reported by W. W. Phelps.

\[\text{Said we were not wise in complaining so 'You cut hay but people must buy it if one wants to warm can't do it but you can take our wood and it won't grow up tomorrow - our fa[ther] will not buy our lands so good. . . . your head men said you would shelter us, but you come among us and first we know up rises a city eat up our grass kill our game scare it away come to live where we used to hunt and find pea vines and plenty of cattle must not kill your Cattle but our game all scared away - vines all trodden down - You were here to protect us, but down comes the Sioux and murderers [sic] us that your fault . . . . You can't raise up our timber can't raise up 25 dead men so you are the aggressors.}\]

By the time Brigham had departed westward in April 1847 on his long postponed journey to the Rockies, relations between Mormons and Indians had rapidly worsened. With Brigham gone leadership eventually fell to Orson Hyde, the only apostle left at Winter Quarters after John Taylor and Parley P. Pratt led out a large company in June in Brigham's wake. Hyde, only recently returned from Britain, relied heavily on Hosea Stout, leader of the town police, and who was somewhat of an impetuous hothead.

After meeting with Stout and Cornelius Lott in an acrimonious confrontation in late May, Big Elk wished that the "Big Red headed chief" [Brigham] were back "for he would treat them better."\(^{40}\) Ten days later, eighty Omaha came to town to negotiate peace and better understanding, but Stout met them on horse back and in armed fashion "according to
the Danite system of horsemanship and consequently I was in the center of the line."41 Brigham's dialogue was being replaced with Stout's intransigence and belligerence and Hyde's ambivalence.

Matters came to a dangerous climax in June when word was received back at Winter Quarters that Omaha Indians had shot and killed Jacob Weatherby, unarmed, a few miles east of the Elkhorn River, the first apparent case of bloodshed between Mormons and Indians at the Missouri.42 The Omaha were also charged with allegedly killing four or five other whites sent out from the Indian agencies.43

After Weatherby's death Stout tried to round up an army of 150 men to seek revenge upon the guilty Omaha. On 22 June Stout rode out at the head of a slightly smaller than anticipated posse of fifty-three men "with the intention of making war on the Omahas in case they did [not] give up the murder[er]."44 Speaking to the same matter, Orson Hyde indicated they intended to demand of Mitchell that he get the Omaha to turn over the offender.45

But upon arriving at Bellevue, Mitchell told Hyde and Stout that being only the sub-agent and with responsibilities for only the Pottawattamie, he had no authority to act in behalf of the absent senior agent, Major John Miller. Stout, considering Mitchell a prejudiced, spineless "inveterate enemy to us" and "a most infamous rascal" suddenly saw into what he considered a conspiratorial pretext to justify federal interposition. Said Stout:
It would have therefore been very easy for him to played [sic] the game to engage us in a war with the Omahas and leave us in the difficulty ... in case he led us into an engagement and did not maintaín [sic] his position or attempt to desert or betray us we would have put him to death.\(^46\)

John D. Lee, who went along for the ride to Bellevue, recalled that Mitchell discouraged any armed foray against the Indian and told them to beg off their hunt for the murderer. "Jesus Christ," he said, "could not hinder them from killing the cattle." Lee, like Stout, concluded that Mitchell was deliberately uncooperative and was cleverly trying to goad them onto armed conflict "to justify them in calling the militia on us."\(^47\) Frustrated by Mitchell's determination not to pursue the criminals, Stout's posse returned home and "the whole expedition came to naught."\(^48\)

**Mormon Relations With Indian Agents**

The above-described confrontation underlined the faltering relationships between the Mormons and the Office of Indian Affairs. The meeting at Bellevue was but a dramatic expression of a spirit of mutual distrust that had been developing for several months. The heart of the Mormon complaint was the widespread conviction that the Council Bluffs Indian agents were stooping to unethical tactics to guarantee their early removal from the Indian lands. Inspired by religious prejudices, these agents, so it was believed, were poisoning the sentiments of the Omaha and Otoe and deliberately agitating them against the Mormons.
Brigham was convinced that Mitchell "from what he could learn" had been part of the Davies county Missouri mob that put Joseph Smith in Liberty Jail in 1838. How could justice be served from such a supposed Mormon-hater? Willard Richards also pointed to Miller's refusal to reappoint one Mr. Case, a former government farmer among the Ottoe and Pawnee for twenty years and now a recent convert to Mormonism as further proof of prejudice against them. They also charged Superintendent Harvey with partiality for not paying any Pottawattamie tribute money to G. Herring, Joseph Herring, and Lewis Dana, native Indian converts to Mormonism who had been adopted into the Pottawattamie nation. It was Pottawattamie money; let them decide who gets what.

These were, however, comparatively petty and minor issues. Far more serious were Mitchell's and Miller's alleged covert tactics at inciting the Omaha and Ottoe against the saints. The Mormons believed that all the complaints Chief Big Elk levelled at them - demanding timberland, scaring off game and worst of all, causing the Sioux to attack - were phony objections implanted in their minds by agents under pressure to insure the Mormon stay would, indeed, be only temporary.

Although such a charge is hard to prove, it does appear that the two agents were very busy and more than normally concerned about reminding the tribes of their rights. Admitted chief Young Elk "Everything we [the Mormons] were doing was a great hinderment in selling the land etc. Agent
had taken some considerable pains to learn them all their rights if they killed our cattle." The Indians were also being told, charged Brigham, that the saints were not intending to abide by the original agreements and were planning to stay several more years than originally agreed making the Omaha and Ottoe overly sensitive and concerned. And though Brigham had not stipulated in writing that improvements made upon their lands would eventually belong to the Indians, Miller had been particularly vigilant in reminding them of their rights of possession. In short, the pioneers blamed the agents for bringing undue pressure to induce an early departure by prejudicing the previously friendly Indians against the Mormons. In effect, Weatherby's murder was to Miller's blame, ultimately, as was the increasing level of Indian theft. Perhaps Kane said it best. As irritating as economic matters were,

The real question to be considered is whether the women and children left behind in the Omaha town [Winter Quarters after the pioneers' departure] . . . are to be satisfied of their own safety; or whether they shall remain as they have been prey to constant anxiety and believing themselves at the mercy of every petty official whose indiscreet impertinence may indulge itself in such remarks as reported.

Clearly the Mormons believed that "petty officers" were "carrying sail in the West."

But from the perspective of the Office of Indian Affairs, charged by Congress to enforce the June 1834 Intercourse Act designed to prevent white intrusion and permanent settlement on remaining Indian lands, the Mormons
were, at least, borderline trespassers and potential troublemakers. Among the law's several provisions it prohibited whites from hunting or trapping in Indian country; it prevented settlement or inhabitation of any and all lands guaranteed the Indians; it prescribed penalties for anyone selling liquor or defrauding the Indians; and it called for the forcible eviction of anyone violating its provisions. Its entire purpose, while not to discourage westward expansion, was designed to protect the Indian at least so long as he occupied his own territory. And in simple terms the Office of Indian Affairs never was convinced that the Mormon encampments at the Missouri, particularly on the west side, were in the best interests of the Indian and of the United States.

Although agents could point to various infractions of the law by the Mormons such as some unauthorized liquor sales, timber cutting, and other improprieties, there were two issues that created serious problems and disagreements between the two sides and which eventually resulted in a serious rupture. First, because the Mormons were deliberately evasive and ambiguous in their settlement and departure plans, a climate of misunderstanding, suspicion, and distrust developed. The Office of Indian Affairs quite simply never was convinced it understood Mormon intentions. It was all too vague and ill-defined to be comfortable. Second, and ultimately most damaging, Mormon negotiating tactics and political maneuvering became increasingly disturbing and unacceptable.
From the very beginning Indian agents were aware of oft-quoted criticisms that the Mormons intended to ally themselves with Indian populations and disturb America's frontier borders and overland trails. The public's mind was abused with such a possibility both in the East and in the West. Warren Foote, a Mormon who left Nauvoo in May and crossed Iowa, provided this insight into a popular attitude of homesteaders on the frontier, in this case near Garden Grove, Iowa Territory.

The inhabitants here are very much scared. They are afraid that the 'Mormons' will soon be upon them and slay men, women and children. I called into a house to see if I could sell anything. The man was not at home. As I turned to go out the woman said, 'You are a Mormon[?] . . . Yes, I replied. She said, 'There is a great many Indians up there where you are camped . . . we hear that you are building forts and your women are marrying in with the Indians and that you are combining together and are coming down here to kill us all off.' I told her that these stories were false . . . She then said, 'There are a great many women here that are almost scared to death, they are just ready to run.'

Missouri Governor, John C. Edwards, writing to the Honorable William L. Marcy, Marcy, Secretary of War, strongly suspected a Mormon-inspired insurrection:

They are a bad and deluded sect, and they have been harshly treated; but I suppose very correctly; yet they do not believe so, and under the treatment which they have received, if they are not enemies, both of our people and our government then they are better Christians and purer patriots than other denominations, a thing which no body in the west can believe.
Many in Congress, according to Thomas L. Kane who tirelessly advanced Brigham's cause in the halls of government, were convinced that the saints intended "to loiter near the Bluffs and not go over the Mountains at all." From their Missouri River encampment they were in a better position to pay with vengeance some overdue accounts. 59 "We have long feared the consequences of their settlement on Indian lands," reported the St. Joseph [Missouri] Gazette, "and would that they were all safely landed in California." 60

The following excerpt of a letter from some Missourians in Putnam County, to President James K. Polk in early July, reflects what likely was a popular conviction.

There is a set of men denouncing themselves Mormons hovering on our frontier, well armed, justly considered, as depredating on our property, and in our opinion, British emissaries, intending by insidious means to accomplish diabolical purposes, [If circumstances favor, we consider it the duty of our common American father, to assume the responsibility, in defence of the 'brave and hardy men of the frontier' to take the necessary measures to disarm and expel them from our border.

Indian agents, impressed at Mormon friendliness toward the Omaha, wondered if there was not some ulterior motive. "Ascertain, if possible, the real intentions of these people," Commissioner William Medill instructed his field workers on more than one occasion. 62

Brigham well understood the popular concern over possible Mormon Indian collusion and although he never seriously entertained such action, he knew it was an ace in his hand when negotiating for government cooperation and
understanding. As he had done before by talking of settling in British Canada and thereby courting favor in Washington, so he would do again with the Indians. If the government "would treat us as they ought to," he said, "the saints would fight for them, and do them good, but they never would consent to be governed again by unjust judges or governors, let the consequence be what they might." And as to the Lamanites, "We have more influence with the Indians than all other nations on the earth and if we are compelled to, we will use it." If an advantageous political situation presented itself, Brigham wouldn't shy away from it.

Brigham's stance in this matter paralleled that of his tactics with the Indians. Bargain from a position of power, threaten to use it in self-defense if necessary, but never really employ force. He could not seriously think of war with 500 men away, with little money, with so much sickness, with such great dreams. No, as it had always been, the Mormon plan was to escape and not engage their enemies.

At another occasion Willard Richards, writing for the Twelve, made it clear that allying with the Indians was never part of their thinking.

To the oft repeated and unqualified declaration that the 'Mormons' are forming alliances with the Indians, and preparing to come down upon the U.S., we offer but one proof: all the tribes we have passed through or located amongst, or are surrounded with that we have any knowledge of, have killed our cattle without number and stolen all our horses they could lay hands on, and if stealing and death does not assure an alliance, we cannot prove it.
While official concern over the possibility of a Mormon-inspired Indian insurrection declined the longer the Saints stayed at the Bluffs, the more immediate ambiguity in the minds of the agents was the location of their several encampments and the length of time they intended to stay. It had been initially understood from permission granted by Captain James Allen that the Mormons intended to reside in Iowa territory. To this plan sub-agent Mitchell had given his permission, subject to his supervisors, believing it would be "for the apparent good of both parties." In response to a 13 July 1846 letter of Superintendent Thomas H. Harvey detailing the Mormon arrival in the Council Bluffs sub-agency, Commissioner Medill manifested an understanding and conciliatory posture in offering tentative, conditional permission.

Your direction to Mr. Mitchell that 'so long as they (the Mormons) conduct themselves with propriety, and are only in the country on their passage west, he would not embarrass their movements' was correct and judicious, and they should also be distinctly informed that they cannot be permitted to make any permanent location there [east banks], or any longer stay than is actually necessary, and that it is expected that they will abstain from all interference with the Indians and move onwards as soon as possible.

A follow-up letter of 22 August confirmed this understanding stressing that while his department would not "violate any principles of hospitality or employ hardship towards people in apparent difficulty and distress, no encouragement must be given to the Mormons to remain in the Indian country a
moment beyond a suitable time for them to continue their journey."\textsuperscript{67}

Thus even before Thomas L. Kane had presented to President Polk in person on behalf of the Mormon refugees their request to winter on Pottawattamie lands, Medill had given all the necessary permission needed. But after Kane's presentation and after Judge J. K. Kane's special appeal to Polk in support of his son's efforts,\textsuperscript{68} one can almost detect a hint of irritation in Medill at having been outflanked. Furthermore, from what Kane apparently implied, the Mormons might want to stay longer. In a third letter to Harvey, six weeks after having first given permission and a few days following Kane's personal overtures to Polk, Medill said, "The object and intention of the Mormons in desiring to locate upon the lands in question, [Pottawattamie] are not very satisfactorily put forth." He continued: "If their continuance is really to be temporary for such length of time only as will enable them to supply their wants and procure the necessary means for proceeding on their journey, the Government will interpose no objection."

Fearful that an extended stay might "jeopardize" the survey and sales of newly acquired territorial land "and" bring about a difficulty between Iowa . . . and the General Government," Medill instructed Harvey to visit the Mormons personally and "ascertain, if possible, the real intentions of these people in desiring to remain."\textsuperscript{69} Medill, while consenting to a temporary stay on the grounds of humanity
and "hospitality," was becoming convinced that a serious problem was in the making.

Following instructions, Superintendent Harvey, in company with his subordinates, John Miller and R. B. Mitchell, made a visit to the Mormon encampments in early November. Willard Richards recalled, "Their stay was too brief to call a council, indeed, I know not that any member knew of their presence until they were absent, except General Young." Meeting the three officials "by the roadside" near his home at Winter Quarters quite by accident since they had come unannounced, Brigham was as surprised at their visit as they were at the size of Winter Quarters, at the signs it showed of permanency, and at the industry of the people. Above all, Harvey was baffled at this large community on the west bank when permission had only been granted to stay on the Iowa side—and that, too, for only the season. Here was a city going up on Indian land without authority or permission!

During their "long chat", Harvey told Brigham Young that while he knew the Mormons had clearance to stay on the Iowa side, he "was not aware that they had authority from the Government to stop on Omaha lands, but they might have authority that I knew nothing of." He expressed a desire that they had built their city on the Iowa side. Brigham responded that Captain Allen, before leaving with the Battalion, had preferred permission for settlements in Indian land if necessary. Harvey knew nothing of such a document nor did Medill since it was never transmitted to
Washington, likely because of Allen's untimely death. Nor did he admit to any authority Allen had to make such a statement. Brigham went on to say they could not be moved until the Battalion returned. "I asked him," Harvey recalled, "how long they expected to remain where they were. He replied until they got ready to go. I enquired [sic] how long it would take them to get ready." Brigham, not one to be pushed, said "it might be two, three, or four years." 74

Without question Brigham believed he had good grounds for camping among the Omaha. Captain Allen had given authorization, the Omaha had consented in writing for at least a two year stay, and the government shouldn't now be so surprised at the sight of Winter Quarters when agents Mitchell and Miller had had ample time to report on the matter earlier. Brigham, aware that about that time Kane was presenting the matter to the administration and seeking written, more official permission, put up a stiff front and gave Harvey to understand "that we would not be neither drove or pushed." 75 In a letter to Charles C. Rich, Brigham concluded, "Major Harvey visited us and seemed pretty much disposed to move us to the east side of the river, but acknowledged we were too strong for him. We apprehend no difficulty from anything he can say or do having our confidence in a higher power." 76

Many other points were discussed including a strong reminder not to cut Indian timber and not to infringe on Indian rights of any kind. Harvey concluded his report by saying,
I am at a loss in forming an opinion in relation to the future movements of this . . . deluded people, they say their intentions [are] to cross the Mountains, if so, I cannot see any satisfactory reason for their making on the Missouri such substantial improvements. It may be that their object is to establish a chain of improvements to the Mountains, commencing on the Missouri.77

Meanwhile back in Washington, Kane, armed with letters and documents from Willard Richards, was endeavoring to clarify the ambiguity and misunderstandings while trying to nail down official permission for staying, but this time on the west rather than on the east bank. Though his efforts were tireless, they eventually failed.

Sensing that Allen's permission for west Indian land settlements might not be legally sufficient, Brigham and the Twelve as early as 9 August 1846 had drafted a letter to President Polk reiterating Allen's assurances, and requesting the President's views "of Allen's permit for us to stop on Indian lands, as soon as your convenience will permit."78 Another letter was drafted three weeks later explaining the desire of the Indians to receive instruction in education, mechanic arts, and agriculture "and our facilities for giving them the desired information."79 Brigham had made these overtures to the Omaha not only to gain their cooperation, but also to court the favor of the President who by now was probably wondering why the Mormons were seeking permission to stay west of the river.
Apparently both these letters were sent to Jesse Little in Philadelphia since Kane did not leave the Mormon encampments until 7 September and did not get back to Washington until early November. Little called upon Polk early in October and discussed "lands we might settle on provided California is retained", i.e. somewhere in the valleys of the mountains, and their desire to stay on Indian lands among the Omaha. He reported the same request to Medill shortly afterwards, apparently the first time either Polk or Medill had heard of a west bank encampment. According to Little their response was positive and "everything will be right." "There will be less difficulty with regard to the Omaha lease," said Kane, "than my Father had with regard to that of the Pottawattamies." In early November Kane confidently reported from Washington that he was about to obtain official sanction "with regard to the Omaha." But permission to remain among the Omaha until spring came only after great difficulty. Several members of Congress, both Whig and Democrat, caught up with the progress of the Mexican War, acted very negatively against the Mormon course of conduct and openly suspected their designs. The above-described fear of Indian collusion was very real. Kane "had to ward off and resist the fearful apprehension of some Western members [of Congress] that the Mormon camp intended to loiter near the Bluffs and not go over the Mountains at all". Kane "expressed his utter astonishment at the irrational and sensitive conduct of
distinguished men both politically and religiously, in opposition to our welfare." 85

Writing confidentially to Brigham in early December, Kane admitted he had found it "next to impossible to do much for you before public opinion was corrected. Your permission for this winter was only obtained by personal influence . . . it became incumbent on me to manufacture public opinion as soon as possible." 86 Not only was Kane sparring with a general climate of prejudice, a bewildered and increasingly suspicious Office of Indian Affairs, and a President preoccupied with the Mexican War, but also was he trying to play down other indiscretions in Texas where the war effort was most immediate. Critics charged that Lyman Wight, a disgruntled Mormon apostle doing his own thing in Texas, was busy interfering with the Cree Indians and "meddling" with the government's interests in the area. "His conduct was the reason of prejudice to the body of the Saints." 87 Wight's indiscretions could not have come at a worse time so far as Kane and Brigham were concerned, but was beyond their influence and instruction. Nevertheless Kane was able to defuse many of the objections and clarify some ambiguities and, after great effort, secured permission to stay on Indian lands until the spring of 1847. 88

But Kane's reopening of negotiations in the spring of 1847 by request of the Twelve for at least a one-year's extension was too much for Medill. Realizing that he couldn't use the Battalion call any longer as a negotiating
ploy, or Allen's permission, Kane argued that without the Mormons, the Omaha would be annihilated by the Sioux. 89

Kane also argued that the present Indian agents at the Bluffs, because of prejudice and ineptitude, should be replaced by men "chosen out of their own number." 90 As early as the preceding fall, Kane had broached this subject in an unsuccessful effort to have Mormons appointed as agents among the Ponca, the Cree, the Choctaw, and several other tribes. 91 Part of Brigham's thinking was no doubt to bridle Wight down in Texas, to facilitate his future settlements further west, and to insure safety among his people at the Missouri while the pioneer companies found a place of refuge. His desires underlined his conviction that local agents were acting deliberately and prejudicially against the peace and safety of those at Winter Quarters.

It was this last request that turned Medill finally and definitely against Kane. He had countenanced the argument that Allen had given permission which Medill never believed was his to give, he had endured Kane's end-runs to the President, he had agreed to the unauthorized removal from the east to the west side, and despite all the attendant ambiguities consented to another winter-long stay among the Omaha until the spring. But he would not tolerate charges of prejudice and ineptitude against him or his agents and would not permit the appointment of Mormon substitutes among his staff organization. 92
Countering Kane’s circuitous argument that if the President had the authority to remove white settlements from Indian lands then he could likewise allow their prolonged stay, Medill stated, "the Executive does not legally possess the power . . . to give any positive permission since he, like anyone else, was bound to uphold the Indian Intercourse Act." The whole "Western Country has been settled by emigration from the various states without any other aid than has been extended to the Mormons," Medill argued, "and are they more meritorious than the men who now populate the Whole West? Are they more deserving?" \(^{93}\)

Medill believed the law had to be maintained and that making exceptions here would undermine the statutes and their intents. Furthermore he would do all in his power to thwart any effort by any group to assert "independence" of the agents of his department. Such a precedent would be untenable. And as to the Mormon request for their own agents, Medill replied that it was "not so much the want of Agents . . . that is complained of as a desire to obtain such as can be made subservient to a particular interest." To him, it was an unacceptable case of "special privilege". \(^{94}\) Medill wrote Kane 24 April 1847 once and for all denying all further government permission for the Mormons to stay another year or more at Winter Quarters, although this was later modified to extend their stay till spring 1848. \(^{95}\) In a follow-up communication responding to Kane’s query whether he intended to use force to implement his decision, Medill said,
The Department does not intend to make any distinction between the Mormons and any other portion of our citizens travelling through the Indian country. The controversy between you and the officer, if any exists, is one of special privilege.

A few months later, Charles A. Dana who was in Washington on a relief mission, called on various government officers, including Medill, "who found a good deal of fault with Colonel Kane and his treatment to them." Dana further recorded,

[He] told me also that the Colonel wanted them to appoint some of the Mormons to act as agents for the Indians and this they refused to do, some of the colonel's requests he says they could not grant because it was contrary to the law which he read also read several letters from agents complaining of our people trading with the Indians and cutting timber and making permanent settlements etc. etc.

The contention, therefore, is that Kane pushed Medill too far and created an impasse over what he saw as tampering and unwarranted criticism. It was not so much geography but rather politics that got in the way. Had Kane not argued for what Medill saw as "special privilege," the Mormons might not have had to abandon Winter Quarters and their many improvements in April and May of 1848.

Once permission to stay had been indisputably and finally withdrawn, Church leaders, recently returned from the trek west, decided on 9 November 1847 to abandon Winter Quarters in the spring of 1848 "as the Government was unwilling for us to remain here any longer" and settle on the east side of the river, now officially Iowa Territory.
The actual removal occurred in tandem with a large exodus west so that while some headed to the mountains, a greater number sought a new home on the bluffs of Iowa.

During the second and final year of Winter Quarters, relations between the Omaha and the Mormons greatly improved largely because Brigham's sense of diplomacy and justice replaced the impetuousness and lack of common sense among several of his over-zealous lieutenants. The Saints planted and harvested large corn crops and for the Omaha, transported many of their shipments, and in other ways worked diligently at fostering peace. In light of the generally positive climate between the two peoples, Brigham's benign policies toward them and effective protection of a small tribe which the Sioux in all likelihood would have destroyed, it is difficult to agree with the contention that "if the Mormon encampment was not positively harmful to the Indians, it did them little good." And though Brigham wasn't convinced the initial agreements with the Omaha extended to their possessing all improvements on the Winter Quarters site after its abandonment, when Brigham and the High Council finally agreed in November 1847 to leave it, he demanded that the Omaha inherit as much of the city as possible and that the government take immediate steps to protect them. He even recommended that Major Miller move the Council Bluffs agency from Bellevue to Winter Quarters. "It is our anxious wish," said Brigham in a letter to agent Miller, "that the Omahas should have the benefit of our labors, and we feel that if
the whites do not have possession of our vacated houses and farms, immediately after our vacation, that the Sioux will come down and burn the houses and drive away the poor Omaha's.\textsuperscript{102}

Brigham's policies of neutrality, negotiating from strength, benevolent detachment, patience, and restraint despite constant Indian stealing and some momentary confrontations when he was away, fostered a generally healthy social climate between the two peoples. Cooperation, not confrontation, was imperative. Brigham's policies with the local tribes proved so successful that they formed the basis of his later dealings with the Indians in the mountains."

To what extent Council Bluffs agents were acting prejudicially against the Saints seems open to debate. When in May of 1848 Brigham cursed agent John Miller "in the name of the Lord and said his bones should rot and his soul be damned," he was convinced that Miller had persuaded both the Omaha and the Ottoo to get all that they could in terms of compensation and improvements from the departing Mormons—something Brigham never believed he had consented to.\textsuperscript{103} Even the Ottoo, who all winter long had remained silent, by the time of the exodus were demanding payment for living on their land, a more purportedly encouraged by Miller.\textsuperscript{104} Undoubtedly the Mormons believed Miller and Mitchell were exerting undue pressures, were overstepping their bounds, and were causing ill will and potential serious danger. If the agents were so concerned with the plight of the Omaha,
the Mormons contended, why not buy their lands as they had
done with the Pottawattamie and move the Omaha to the safety
of another site further south? Such a move would have
extended to the Omaha the protection and long term security
they required. 105

Finally, Medill acted out of great patience in dealing
with so many different spokesmen for the Mormon cause.
Despite every good and honorable intention of Thomas L.
Kane, who surely performed admirably in Brigham's service,
the effort to appoint Mormon Indian agents and obtain other
special privileges definitely turned a once cooperative
Medill into an obstructing, offended Commissioner of Indian
Affairs. More than any other factor, the question of
"special privilege", the bending of the law for a particular
people and requests for their own agents, got in the way.
In retrospect, had Kane argued more intently for a
government purchase of Omaha land, which even the agents had
been strongly recommending, and less stridently for the
appointment of Mormon Indian agents, Winter Quarters may
have lasted longer than merely two years.
FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER FIVE

1 The Book of Mormon, translated by Joseph Smith, Jr. (Salt Lake City: The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1959), Alma 9:16-17.

2 Doctrine and Covenants, 49:24.

3 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 31 December 1846.


5 Hosea Stout blamed the intrusion on Bishop George Miller for allying himself with the Ponca against the Sioux. Charles Kelly, ed, Journals of John D. Lee to 1846-47 and 1859 (Salt Lake City: Western Printing Company, 1938) 12 February 1847, p. 72. However, it is more likely that the Sioux, in their war of extermination against the Omaha, stumbled upon Lathrop's herds without any particular inducement.

6 Journal History. 13 February 1847.

7 Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 27-28 August 1846.

8 Journal History, 1 August 1846.

9 Ibid., 7 August 1846. "The Omaha frequently deposited their dead in the branches of trees, wrapped in buffalo robes and blankets leaving with them arrows, pipes and other trinkets, which they considered sacred and they should not remove them".

10 Some writers have argued that Brigham taught and encouraged interracial marriages. See James S. Brown, Giant of the Land: Life of a Pioneer (Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, Inc., 1960), p.320; and William Hall, Abominations of Mormonism Exposed, p.59. But if he ever did consent to it before or after, Brigham was resolutely opposed to it at the Missouri.

11 Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 7 August 1846.

12 See Journal History, 26 March 1847; and Diary of Hosea Stout, 18 October 1846, 1:205.

13 Journal History, 18 October 1846.

14 Ibid., 25 March 1847.

15 Ibid., 9 December 1846.
Diary of Hosea Stout, 9 December 1846, 1:216.

Ibid., 12 December 1846, 1:217.

Ibid., 7 January 1847. The initial report was of forty deaths but the number increased as more information trickled into camp. See Journal History, 12 December 1846 and 4 January 1847.


See Journal History, 12 December 1846; and Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 14 December 1846. Fighting between the Sioux and the Omaha eventually drove the Omaha and Ottoo into an alliance. William W. Major to Brigham Young, 10 June 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

Diary of Appleton Milo Harmon, p.10.

Journal History, 21 July 1846.

Ibid., 19 September 1846.


Journal History, 15 October 1846.

Ibid., 18 October 1846.

Brigham Young to Logan Fontanelle, 17 October 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 25 October 1846. It was Big Elk's suggestion that a picket fence be raised on the southern line of Winter Quarters.

See Journal History, 18 and 24 October 1846; and Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 18 October 1846. Alpheus Cutler thought it best for the people "to live close together in small groups inclosed by a strong fence [sic]."

Diary of Hosea Stout, 18 October 1846, 1:205.

Logan Fontanelle to Brigham Young, 12 November and 28 December 1846, Brigham Young Papers. In December these included a tent, two poles, a kettle, and a dress.

Journal History, 24 October 1846.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 18 April 1847, 1:250.
See Journal History, 8 May 1847; and Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 19 April 1847.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 19 April 1847.


Ibid., also 8 January and 1 and 7 February 1847.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 19 April 1847.


Ibid., 5 June 1847, 1:259.

The history of the Danites is as clouded by the lack of firm evidence as it is by the polemical literature bent on proving they were a Mormon "Ku Klux Klan." Begun in the summer of 1838 during the Missouri persecutions by Sampson Avard, this secret society, first called "the Brothers of Gideon," then the "Daughters of Zion," and finally "the Sons of Dan" was established initially to intimidate dissenters and prevent apostates from inciting Missouri retaliations. Later it became a vehicle of aggression to punish non-Mormon troublemakers. Although unclear, Joseph Smith was apparently not a partner in the creation of the band although Sidney Rigdon, his counsellor, apparently played a founding roll. Eventually the Danites "went beyond the bounds of legality or propriety and began retaliation against those who had committed crimes against the Saints." See James Allen and Glen Leonard, The Story of the Latter-day Saints, p.121.

Apparently such a pirate band continued on in Nauvoo under the names of Danites or "Destroying Angels." Bill Hickman and Tom Brown are two names associated with this group. See J.M. Reid, Sketches and Anecdotes of the Old Settlers, and New Comers, The Mormon Bandits and Danite Band (Keokuk, Iowa: R.B. Ogden, Publisher, 1876), pp.34–36.


See also Chapter Nine for a discussion of police at Winter Quarters.

Journal History, 19 June 1847.

Orson Hyde to Nathaniel H. Felt, 21 June 1847, Brigham Young Papers.
See Diary of Hosea Stout, 22 June 1847, 1:262; and See also Manuscript History of Winter Quarters, 24 June 1847.

Orson Hyde to Nathaniel H. Felt, 21 June 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 24 June 1847, 1:262.


Diary of Hosea Stout, 24 June 1847, 1:262.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 1 November 1846. Whether Mitchell was such has not been determined.

Willard Richards to Thomas L. Kane, 16 November 1846, Journal History. According to Richards, Harvey dismissed Case from his employment without pay and ordered him to cross the river.

Journal History, 6 November 1846.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 19 April 1847.

Thomas L. Kane to William Medill, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, 21 April 1847, Thomas L. Kane Papers, Collection, Yale University, microfilm copy LDS Archives.

Robert O. Trennert, Jr., "The Mormons and the Office of Indian Affairs: The Conflict Over Winter Quarters, 1846-1848" Nebraska History 53 (Fall 1972), p.382. Trennert's five article is somewhat critical of the Mormons and generally defends the actions of the government.

Journal History, 24 December 1846. Peter Hawes, for one, was found guilty by the High Council for selling liquor to the Indians.

See Chapter One.

Journal of Warren Foote, 16 June 1846, LDS Archives.


Orson Spencer to Brigham Young, 26 November 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

See St. Louis Weekly Union 30 March 1847; and Journal History 30 March 1847.

62 William Medill to Major Thomas Harvey, September 1846; and Oscar G. Winther, *The Private Papers and Diary of Thomas Leiper Kane*, pp.45-46.

63 Journal History, 31 August 1846.

64 Journal History, 24 February 1847.

65 Journal History, 20 July 1846.

66 William Medill to Thomas H. Harvey, 27 July 1846, Letters sent by the Office of Indian Affairs 1824-82, microfilm set, The Marriott Library, University of Utah, hereafter cited as "Letter of the OIA."

67 William Medill to Thomas H. Harvey, 22 August 1846, Letters of the OIA.

68 William Medill to Judge J. K. Kane, 3 September 1846, Letters of the OIA. Until his son had returned home to Philadelphia, Judge Kane presented documents and arguments before the President on his son's behalf.

69 William Medill to Thomas H. Harvey, 2 September 1846, Letters of the OIA.

70 Ibid., 16 November 1846.

71 Thomas H. Harvey to William Medill, 3 December 1846 as quoted in Golder, *Diary of Thomas Leiper Kane*, pp.25-29.


73 Harvey to Medill, 3 December 1846, as quoted in Golder, *The Diary of Thomas Leiper Kane*, pp.25-29.

74 Ibid.

75 Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 1 November 1846.

76 Journal History, 15 November 1846.

77 Harvey to Medill, 3 December 1846, as quoted in Golder, *The Diary of Thomas Leiper Kane*, pp.25-29.

78 Journal History, 9 August 1846.

79 Ibid., 20 August 1846.
See Jesse C. Little to Brigham Young, 6 October 1846, Brigham Young Papers; and Journal History, 7 September 1846.

Jesse C. Little to Brigham Young, 6 October 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Thomas L. Kane to Brigham Young, 26 October 1846, Journal History, 5 December 1846.

Thomas L. Kane to Brigham Young, 5 November 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Orson Spencer to Brigham Young, 26 November 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Ibid. Reported Spencer:
"... two thirds of the Trustees of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Chh [sic] had visited him and Dort Robert Breckenridge of Baltimore Chief among the Chief Priests had come from that city solely to expostulate with him. Dort B [sic] said to him: what in the name of God are you doing! Do you mean to uphold the Mormon religion?"
Little wonder Brigham could say to Kane, "God be with you always to protect and cheery you, my boy, in your pilgrimage of mercy." Journal History, 4 September 1846.

Thomas L. Kane to Brigham Young, 2 December 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Orson Spencer to Brigham Young, 26 November 1846, Brigham Young Papers. For more on Wight see Chapter Two.

William Medill to Thomas H. Harvey, 24 April 1847 as quoted in Winther, The Diary of Thomas Leiper Kane, p. 40. Trennert overlooks the fact that permission to stay among the Omaha was indeed given until the spring of 1847. See Trennert, "The Mormons and the Office of Indian Affairs," p. 393.

The official document of permission, however, had not reached the Bluffs before spring, if ever. "We would like to see the permit," asked Willard Richards of Kane, "and hope the hard earned paper may not be lost so as to weary our friend over again." Journal History, 15 February 1847.

Thomas L. Kane to William Medill, 21 April 1847, Thomas L. Kane Papers.

Thomas L. Kane apparently to President James K. Polk, approximately 20 March 1847, as quoted in Winther, The Diary of Thomas Leiper Kane, pp. 35-36.
Letter of Orson Spencer to Brigham Young, 26 November 1846, Brigham Young Papers; and Journal History, 31 December 1846.

Superintendent Thomas H. Harvey, in response to Mormon charges of religious prejudice on the part of Indian agents, had said earlier,

"Your party, being Mormons, does not constitute the objection, but the fact of your being there without authority of the Government; in the execution of my duty I know no sects or parties, and I am sure that the Government at Washington acts upon the same principle."

Thomas H. Harvey to Alpheus Cutler, 5 November 1846, Journal History, 6 November 1846.

As to the quality of his agents, Trennert argues that John Miller "was one of the better men in the Indian service and was devoted to protecting the tribes in his charge from frontiersman and the ineptitude of the government." Trennert, "The Mormons and the Office of Indian Affairs," p.384.

William Medill to Thomas H. Harvey, 24 April 1847, as quoted in Winther, The Diary of Thomas Leiper Kane, p.42.

Ibid.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 10 October 1847.

William Medill to Thomas L. Kane, 29 April 1847, Letters of the OIA.

Journal of Charles R. Dana, Volume 2, 14 October 1847, LDS Archives. Dana went on to say of Medill's objections, "that was the time I wanted to laugh. And that was the time that I saw the revelation being fulfilled that says in my own due time will I (the Lord) vex this Nation and if the heads of the Nation are not vexed then I am no judge of such matters."

Despite his own predictions, Dana recorded that a week late, in a subsequent meeting, Medill said "he would do all in his power to aid our people ... provided that they will officially through the head of the Church make known their requests." President Polk and James Buchanan each gave Dana "$10 in support of the Mormon encampments." Journal of Charles R. Dana, 18, 20, and 21 October 1847.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 9 November 1847, 1:287.

Journal History, 23 January 1848.

G.D. Grant to Brigham Young, 17 April 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

102 Journal History, 19 November 1847. Brigham also made overtures to the missionaries at Bellevue to move north to Winter Quarters which they could buy "at a very moderate price." Brigham Young and Council to the "Chief Missionary at Bellevue," 19 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers. Neither invitation was acted upon. After the Mormons left, the Sioux again attacked, as suspected, and the desperate Omahas took scattered refuge among the Pottawattamie and Pawnee lands.

103 Journal History, 8 May 1848.

104 Diary of Hosea Stout, 7 May 1848, 1:303.

105 Record Book of Bathsheba W. Smith, p.18, BYU Library. Significantly, even Commissioner Medill had suggested to Harvey this same solution to the entire problem. Such land, if purchased, would have become federal property and no longer governed by the stipulations of the Indian Intercourse acts.
CHAPTER SIX

"IN ONE COMMON CAUSE FOR A SEASON"

THEIR ECONOMIC ORDER

"Nothing in American history - not the ephemeral towns of mining rushes nor the hardier ones of real estate booms is like Winter Quarters. An entire people had uprooted itself and, on the way to the mountains, paused here and put down roots."1

Nor, perhaps, in Mormon history. Never in the sixteen year history of the Church was their physical situation more tenuous, their economy more fragile, and their very survival more in question than in the fall of 1846. With the winter coming on, the Mormons at the Missouri and scattered across Iowa faced a raft of formidable economic problems. Few if any crops had been planted; provisions were meager; property sales in Nauvoo were at a standstill; the amount of money forthcoming from the Battalion payments remained questionable and unknown; Indian thefts of their cattle and livestock were increasing; and trading with Missouri wholesalers, farmers, and merchants was still much suspected and uncertain. Either they band together and mutually support one another, or reap the inevitable consequences of mass suffering and starvation. In the fair and equitable distribution of what little they had, individually and collectively, lay the temporal salvation of all. Many were asked to make incredible sacrifices; some wore out with
giving. The overriding concerns were community preservation and preparation for their departure westward.

Their very survival depended on a high degree of economic bonding, an economic order in which the private interests of the individual were made distinctly secondary to the welfare of the whole. Although individuals were not asked to surrender private properties into any kind of common stock enterprise, they were required to give abundantly of their time and substance for the welfare of those around them. It was the Nauvoo Covenant in action. The intent of this chapter is, first, to examine the economic order of Winter Quarters and to understand how it operated; and second, to ascertain its failures and successes.

At least four principles governed the Winter Quarters economy:

a) community self-sufficiency and independence;

b) consecration of substantial wealth and sacrifice of income to the Church for the benefit of all;

c) Church distribution of resources in fairly equitable proportions;

d) individual stewardship, agency, and accountability.

These principles represented much in Joseph Smith's "Law of Consecration and Stewardship" practised in the very earliest days of the Church in Missouri and Ohio, and adumbrated much of Brigham's later United Order in Utah. Joseph's law had called for "economic equality, socialization of surplus incomes, freedom of enterprise, and
group self-sufficiency." For various reasons his plan had been replaced by the less demanding law of tithes and offerings in which individuals retained their property but paid ten percent of their increase to the Church.\(^2\) Whereas the earlier law had required the surrender of private property to the bishop in exchange for privatized stewardship over land and resources, Brigham's Winter Quarters economy did not go quite that far. This was an economy on the move and in transition. He would wait until a more settled and favorable time to implement his finer interpretations.

Attemps at Self-Sufficiency

Convinced that their spiritual welfare depended on their physical well-being, Brigham called on his followers "to unite with us in the principles of self preservation" including "all business matters pertaining to our present salvation."\(^3\) His first order of business was to make the camp as self-sufficient as possible. In part this was inevitable since they could expect little assistance from outside sources. But their goals were to retain as much as possible what little wealth they had in camp and secondly, to develop small industries, keep gainfully employed, and open two-way trade with Missouri. Their poverty, sickness, uprooted condition, and removal from ample grain supplies prevented them from ever reaching economic independency. In time the Mormons were reduced almost to begging, but the attempt characterized their community.
By far their richest resource was their massive herds of livestock amounting to over 10,000 head of cattle stationed in at least four locations: in the stockyards immediately south of town where the "old beeves" were kept for slaughtering; on grazing grounds six miles north of town kept mainly for strays; above the Boyer River for cattle on the Pottawattamie lands; and Asahel Lathrop's large herd over 100 miles north of Church or "public" cattle. Most families retained milch cows on their own city lots. Beef and slaughter committees were chosen by the Municipal High Council to pay herdsmen, control sales and distribution, and coordinate all livestock matters. As per agreement with the Indians, killing local game was prohibited although this did not seem to apply to wild turkey and other fowl.

A good example of creating small industry was the manufacturing of willow baskets and related items. Though the women had started this work, the Seventy's quorums built a "basket house" or "basket factory," a 20'x14' sod hut. At the height of production in January 1847, thirty men were employed making willow baskets, washboards, bushel and half bushel baskets, and tables for trade in Missouri in exchange for grain and other necessaries.

They also tried to land additional fur-hauling contracts with Sarpy as well as with Indian agents. When learned that the government was about to pay $6,000 to remove the Pottawattamie to the Kansas River, Brigham counselled his people to "take all the contracts" they could.
Their most ambitious attempt at self-sufficiency was the construction of a large, expensive, water-powered flour mill in the city's north end on Turkey Creek. Since the purchase and grinding of grain was their biggest expense, Brigham and Alpheus Cutler recommended they build their own grist mill large enough to meet their growing needs for processed flour. Ample flour was needed for both the winter and for the spring overland companies to the mountains. At a public meeting in August at Cutler's Park, Brigham proposed building the facility. The original plan was to build and use it there and later carry most of the burlstones, gears, and other working parts to the West. David Boss, Halmagh Van Wagoner, Ira and John Eldridge put up $800 to purchase two sets of burl mill stones with all the fixtures in St. Louis and have them sent back by steamboat.9 Pleased with the quick and favorable response to the mill proposal, Brigham responded, "There now we will have a mill and as for poverty, it shall not have a name in this Church".10 Two or three horse-drawn corn mills were also established and, when necessary, the Mormons were allowed use of the small government mill on Mosquito Creek on the east side (though at the expensive price of 56¢/bu. of meal).11

In late September building contracts were let out to furnish the heavy timbers, studs, rafters, framing, and hewing for the mill with construction starting 5 October 1846 on a site proposed by Frederick Kesler.12 The High Council appointed Brigham Young, a master carpenter, to
supervise all phases of construction. They had expected to complete the mill before the ground froze, but were repeatedly frustrated by a scarcity of laborers and volunteers, shipping delays, broken dams, relocating the mill race, and other complications. The result was the mill did not begin grinding operations until the early spring, a costly postponement and a serious disappointment. Once in operation, however, it could grind ten or eleven bushels an hour, much greater than the average mill production of thirty to fifty bushels per day, but was in such demand that patrons waited several hours, even days, to use the facility. Its benefits were never fully realized since even during its second year of operation it was plagued with problems. Brigham later made several unsuccessful attempts to sell it to the Council Bluffs Indian agencies, but was stymied by the Omaha who laid claim to all improvements on the campsite. Eventually the mill was largely dismantled and the hardware ended up either in mills on the east side or in the Salt Lake Valley.

Considering the cost to build it and the less than bounteous return on the investment, the mill cannot be considered a financial success. The total cost of construction, labor, and operation amounted to almost $3,000, much of which Brigham apparently paid himself. In March of 1847 he sold it at a loss to John Neff, one of the relatively few wealthy men left in town, for $2,600 enabling the Church to pay off certain debts incurred in the construction and operation of the mill. But if it did not
turn a profit, it at least paid the wages of 150 men for much of the winter.

Consecration of Wealth and Church Distribution

We do not believe in having all things in common and on general principles, as some have taught, both in the Church and out, but we believe that it is right for every man to have his stewardship according to the ability that God hath given him; yet, there are cases, situations and circumstances where it is quite right for the brethren to unite all their energies and labors in one common cause for a season, as . . . we are now doing.19

The best documented example of cooperative economics was the Newel K. Whitney store or "bishop's storehouse" that first opened its doors for business in December 1846. Based on the principle of buying in bulk at wholesale prices, the store was made possible only after Mormon Battalion families had turned over to Church leaders a large amount of cash.

Early in August, Battalion members, then at Fort Leavenworth, were paid $42 each as clothing money for the year (over $20,000). Of that amount they sent $5,835 back to their families via Parley P. Pratt who interrupted his journey to England to return the money to the camp. The Battalion also contributed several hundred dollars to Parley P. Pratt, Orson Hyde, John Taylor, and Jesse C. Little for their missions to England and the east coast. The money was specifically directed to individual families although as a packet it was sent to Brigham and the Twelve who received it in cash 11 August.20 Daniel Spencer was assigned to
disburse the funds among Battalion families. At a meeting of the Municipal High Council two days later Brigham suggested the "propriety" of sending Newel K. Whitney, Jonathan C. Wright, and John Van Cott to St. Louis "for such dry goods and groceries, hardware and provisions as they [Battalion families] most need and can be most advantageously procured. . . . We want the whole applied to wholesale purchases, so that no portion of the money shall be squandered." While at St. Louis, Whitney also would purchase the hardware for the proposed mill and provisions for the Iowa camps. After considerable arm-twisting, Battalion families turned over $4,375.19 to Bishop Whitney. Brigham considered this money "a peculiar manifestation — of divine providence" at just the right time for the purchase of provisions and goods for the winter supply of the camp. "By the wisdom of heaven we will make every dollar sent us count as good as two or three at ordinary traffic." The Battalion money amounted to almost half of the 7,906.81 Whitney and company took with them in early September. The balance came from other families and general Church funds.

Whitney was delayed in returning because of low water river conditions which increased freight costs and prevented steamboats from going beyond St. Joseph, 140 miles south. Consequently, in early November a score of teams and wagons left the Bluffs and retrieved the sixty ton shipment of goods and supplies. Construction began on the storehouse 12 November and it opened 8 December even before all of the
shipments had arrived. Goods purchased specifically for individuals as per prior agreement were privately distributed.

The Whitney store operated until 26 March 1847 and carried a full line of foodstuffs, textiles, household and hardware goods, various herbal medicines, and some books. Many items were taken on credit or on an exchange basis so that in time the storehouse, clearly the most popular place in town, traded in a large quantity of used items. Many crossed over to Winter Quarters from the east side, some from as far away as Mt. Pisgah and Garden Grove to shop at the store.

Essentially a Church operation under the control of the presiding bishop, the storehouse was not a private enterprise although every effort was made to operate at a profit. Sales-generated income was controlled by Church authorities and used to buy additional merchandise, pay back debts, provide gratuitous payments of food and provisions to needy families, and for other financial purposes. It served as the city's financial institution and clearing house of obligations and performances. Eventually, after the Whitney store closed in the spring of 1847, privately-owned stores briefly flourished including one by a Missouri, non-Mormon merchant named Estill who was encouraged to come and "commence a barter trade." He was allowed to use the Council House as his base of operations.

But additional wealth in various forms had to be collected and distributed. Lacking any other form of
government, Church appointed officials and councils played a central role, particularly as members of the Municipal High Council. In the absence of financial, legal, and civic institutions, the governing court of law, licensing bureau, chamber of commerce, and board of trade was the Municipal High Council backed up by the Council of the Twelve. When problems arose regarding trading with Missouri merchants and farmers who, seeing a good opportunity, arrived in town with wagonloads of onions, turnips, potatoes, and other commodities, it was the High Council that appointed a committee "to buy grain, fruit, or anything which might be brought into camp by strangers for sale." By doing so, items could be bought in bulk at a cheaper cost and then sold to the citizens at prices determined by the Council. Cattle, sheep, and hog prices were set by Council-appointed committees for payment at times of exchange on sale for slaughter. Likewise it was the High Council which governed big volume purchases of grain from the Missouri settlements to the south and then supervised distribution. It even decided probate matters determining the value of the deceased's estate and of those who, out of disaffection and apostasy, had left the Church and the community.

The High Council also governed wages. Most labors, whether cattle-ranging, butchering, shepherding, mill construction, blacksmithing, ferrying, well-digging, policing, fishing, land clearing, fencing, road-building, barrel making, wagon repair, clerking or any number of other activities were coordinated by the Council. A report of all
labor performed was returned "weekly" to the Council. On a final settlement, every man drew his pay "in proportion to his amount of labor."\textsuperscript{31}

Such procedures did not prevent private trade and contracting between individuals in camp and the incurring of private debts and obligations. Certainly this applied to professional services such as nursing and medical care. One doctor, for his several visits relating to a maternity case, was paid "one days work, ten bushels turnips, 5½ bushels of buckwheat, one bushel beans [and] one quart whiskey."\textsuperscript{32}

As the doctor's payment indicates, the Winter Quarters economy was built on "a general barter trade."\textsuperscript{33} The city made no scrip or paper money of its own (unlike the Kirtland era in Church history) and very little coin or specie. Payments between private parties were usually in kind and on an exchange or bartering basis. Cattle seemed to be as popular an item of exchange as any other, but almost any needed commodity, including corn, eggs, or butter, would suffice. "I have got thousands of dollars owing me," said Brigham, "and I wish my debtors would offer me grain, corn, turnips, hay or even hemlock slats after harvest."\textsuperscript{34}

Even the distribution of land acreages outside the city and of lots within it was controlled by the High Council and on an "equal occupancy" basis. To illustrate, in the summer of 1847, while major efforts were underway to cultivate large acreages of ground, instructions were given "that one man shall not have an acre of land to his house while he has only 10 cattle to take care of to the exclusion of another
man who should come here with 60 head of cattle and only have 6 rods of ground."\(^{35}\) Despite these provisions, land values fluctuated with those nearer town regarded as the more valuable. Lots were allotted to the highest bidder, but the Council, not owning what was agreeably Indian lands, could not legally transfer title or ownership. In effect it could only distribute a favorable location, and the improvements to the land in the form of fences, ploughed and cleared ground, etc.\(^{36}\) There was no private land ownership on the west banks of the Missouri River in and about Winter Quarters during the entire Mormon stay. This was not the case with those on the east side where Indian claims had been surrendered to the United States.\(^{37}\)

The High Council also regulated the collection of municipal taxes based on assessed personal property values. The money was used to pay herdsman, road builders, the police, cemetery workers, the city marshal, and other individuals. It was also to pay for materials for the camp historian. The rate of assessment was set at 0.75\%. Total value of all assessed property in Winter Quarters subject to taxation was $101,550.\(^{38}\) An additional tax of 37\%\% was assessed in November on every man who did not volunteer to work periodically on road building and repair.\(^{39}\) Another tax of time was levied that same month in which "every able bodied man" reserved each tenth day for wood collecting.\(^{40}\)

While Winter Quarters in levying the above-described taxes was likely similar to other frontier American communities of the time, that which more uniquely
characterized it was the religious dictum of paying tithing, or one tenth, a principle faithful Latter-day Saints regarded as a commandment with promise. 41 Whether paid in cash, kind, or time, everyone was expected to live the "Lord's law of economy", a law that if lived, they believed would bring the blessings of heaven, the riches of the fields, and every necessary temporal need. "There was a great difference," said Brigham, between tithing and taxation. The former was "a standing law of God for one tenth was required of every man and woman when at the head of the family," whereas taxes were levied "according to circumstances." "All have got to pay tithing," he said, even "if it's only a pound of catnup." 42

The need to facilitate the payment and distribution of tithes and to better care for the needs of the poor in camp were two of the instigating factors leading to the call of bishops on both sides of the river. 43 Shortly after the departure of the Mormon Battalion, ninety bishops had been called on the east side answerable to the Pottawattamie High Council. 44 Each was assigned to "attend to the necessities" of two or three families. 45 (Most Battalion families lived on the east side, at Mt. Pisgah, and Garden Grove). These "Battalion" bishops functioned in a strictly pastoral role exercising few other ecclesiastical or administrative functions. After the return of the Battalion and the start of overland journeys west, these several bishops, if not already gone themselves, were absorbed into a growing
network of wards and branches and their early calling suspended.

At Winter Quarters, meanwhile, the city was divided in October into thirteen wards with a bishop appointed over each ward.\textsuperscript{46} Seven weeks later, at a 25 November meeting of the Winter Quarters High Council, Brigham proposed increasing the number of wards to twenty-two since each ward was getting too large for one man to oversee effectively. It was also agreed that each ward would encompass approximately one city block.\textsuperscript{47} Up until that time they had part of three blocks in one ward which he said "would be hard to understand in history" let alone to administer. Unlike their counterparts on the east side, Winter Quarters bishops had to be High Priests, were allowed two counsellors, and exercised both pastoral and administrative functions.\textsuperscript{48}

But clearly their primary duty was to provide for the poor in their wards, insure the equal distribution, and devise ways and means for the poor to sustain themselves "instead of calling on the rich to hand out what they have."\textsuperscript{49} Bishops were also expected to keep careful records of the sick and dying, report on housing needs, list the number of animals and other private properties in their wards, and to report on all spiritual and physical needs to the High Council. "Bishops ought to be able to tell what every man is doing in his Ward . . . see that every man, woman and child has something to eat."\textsuperscript{50} Where absolutely
necessary, they were expected to care of the poor out of their own pockets.

During the winter the bishops not only acted individually but collectively. In mid-February, a series of feasts and picnics were arranged for the 117 poorest adults and their families at Winter Quarters. The first eight wards staged the first day's spread, the next eight the following day, and the third eight on the third day. At the conclusion of the affair, twenty-two bushels of provisions remained "untouched" and twelve baskets of fragments remained."

Finally it devolved upon the bishops and their counsellors to collect tithing from their ward membership and to distribute it among the "poor and destitute and sick" in their own wards, for it was standard practice that tithing wealth remain in the jurisdiction from which it came, whether at Mt. Pisgah or at Winter Quarters. Eventually, because "of the whining and dissatisfaction" of some people to pay tithing to their own bishops, (likely because of their disagreement with who in the ward received assistance), the High Council voted that all tithes on both sides of the river be "paid in to the presiding Bishop Newel K. Whitney and that he supply the various Bishops under his Presidency." Theoretically, this approach would generate anonymous, more equitable distribution.

The placement of bishops at the block and ward level did more than encourage a higher percentage of tithe payers. It also proved successful in creating a much stronger sense
of community bonding and economic cooperation than otherwise may have been the case. Wilford Woodruff, while speaking at one ward in March 1847, said,

[I] requested the people that had means to carry something to the Bishop to the poor to carry flour meal meat coffee and sugar etc. - I promised I would do the same. . . . I carried [to] the Bishop 30 lb. flour half bushel meal, 4 lb. shugar [sic], 2 lbs. coffee and others took him some things . . . [we] went to visit the sick. 34

As Woodruff indicated, even more than taxes and tithing, everyone was called upon to give and sacrifice almost everything excess they possessed. As one aptly recalled, "the spirit of gain was not among us," and poverty was everywhere. Those relatively better off, the John Neff's, David Boss's, Helmagh Van Wagoner's, and Ellis Sanders', were made poor through constant giving or providing loans that were never repaid. More than one large corn or grain contract was purchased with borrowed money from John Neff. 55 Ellis M. Sanders, according to Heber C. Kimball, "let go" an incredible $3,600 to the Church. 56 Worried that such men could be ridden too long and too hard, Brigham confided, "[Sanders] has given his all to the church, and I do not believe in pressing him down to death, he has feelings, he has given money time and again, let that money turn upon his tithing."

Individual Accountability

One of the best guarantees of community survival and self-sufficiency was providing for individual initiative and
performance, albeit in a very regulated social order. Though not owning land, individuals were responsible for its upkeep and owned the produce, crops, and whatever other gains their labor realized. All were encouraged to plant their own private gardens. Many farmed large acreages south of town starting in the spring of 1847 with land given out on the basis of the highest pledge of fence construction and other improvements.  

Those with trades and skills were encouraged to set up shop. Several small smithing establishments were in operation as were coopers, boot and shoe makers, and tailors. In the fall of 1846 a carding machine house was erected to prepare wool and other material for clothing. Trading beef and other goods with the Indians in exchange for buffalo robes and deerskin leggings provided for some adequate winter apparel. Many women, by using their own or borrowed spinning wheels and domestic drilling purchased from Whitney's store, filled their family's minimal clothing requirements.

Men not employed about camp in trade work or at the mill or basket factory, or who were not involved in livestock and other operations, were encouraged to go to Missouri and labor as hired hands for farmers and homesteaders. "They have possession of one of the choicest lands in the world," said one biased laborer about the Missourians, "yet they have no spirit of enterprise no desire to make buildings which are considered convenient and comfortable for civilized and enlightened people."
Fence-building, threshing and cleaning wheat, painting, plowing, milking, stump-clearing, these and many other jobs were commonly taken. And although few had little good to say about Missouri, the paradox exists that had it not been for Missouri, its quickness to trade, and the cooperative nature of its farmers and settlers to hire on so many Latter-day Saints, albeit at irresistible wages, the history of the Mormons at Council Bluffs would have been a far more tragic one.

As much as possible, then, the individual and his or her family tried to meet their specific needs. But the welfare of the community at large usually demanded sacrifices of the individual. In so many of the community-wide projects such as exploring, hay-cutting, fishing, herding, and building, the efforts of everyone were repeatedly called upon often at the expense of one's time, income, and personal desires. A good example of this occurred while settling in at Cutler's Park where some who complained that camp rules were too tight received this bit of advice.

There has been some fault finding by those who have recently arrived in camp, because they want to cut their own hay and put in their own turnip patch, but we must be one and feel a genuine interest for the whole, and when anyone is told by the foreman to pick up a basket of chips and tumble them out again, then pick them up again and find no fault.

The economic freedom to do as one pleases was constrained by the inevitability to use that agency for the welfare of all.
Not Without Opposition - Problems and Criticisms

Given their desperate plight and the sacrifices they either volunteered or were called upon to make, it was inevitable that serious conflict, criticism, and dissent would arise. In the charges and complaints that were leveled can be glimpsed their precarious position and the inadequacies in even their best efforts.

Despite all their efforts and sacrifices, many people were very hungry, particularly in the more isolated areas east of Mosquito Creek. One reporter who visited the area in the fall of 1846, wrote Horace Greeley of New York Daily Tribune fame describing the Mormons as "already on the verge of starvation," and calculated they had only enough food "with their most careful husbandry to keep soul and body together till next summer."64 Charles C. Rich, in reporting on the worsening situation at Mt. Pisgah, admitted that "many have suffered for want of proper nourishment because it was not to be had."65 The remnants of the poor camp struggling at the Nishnabotona and elsewhere without even the benefit of Mt. Pisgah's provisions must have suffered even worse. After enjoying the luxury of wild grapes, plums, walnuts, and berries that grew in abundance along the Missouri during the summer, by late fall most at Winter Quarters were confined to a scant diet of course flour and meal supplemented with an occasional beef. The delay in completing the mill caused other dietary problems. Willard Richards recorded that many had to grind their wheat by
hand. "Some ate their wheat boiled; others boiled their corn in lye." Parley P. Pratt said his family had spent much of the winter subsisting on "a little corn meal, ground on a hand-mill with no other food." Until the first large provisions arrived from Missouri and spring garden crops began to grow, hunger was the chief concern.

Scarcity of food was one problem; distribution was another. Nancy H. Davison complained to the Winter Quarters High Council that her bishop "would not let her have anything to eat, and that she had nothing to eat, nor her children anything to wear." Just because her brother wasn't paying tithing was no reason for her not to receive the bishop's welfare, she contended. The Council agreed.

But while many went without, some diarists report a healthy diet of wild turkey, baked goods, and other comparatively richer diets. William Clayton, the store clerk, never went hungry, nor did most of the prominent families. Jealousies developed because of the varying degree of family wealth that existed despite distribution efforts.

Not a few women expressed disappointment in their housing conditions. Fanny Parks Taggart, whose husband was in the Battalion, and who arrived in Winter Quarters late in the fall, recalled her disappointment.

My husband had written to me in a letter that I received before leaving Nauvoo that there would be some provisions made for the families of those that went in the Mormon Battalion, and this had kept up my courage on the way, but the
answer I received from President Young made me feel like bursting into tears.

She probably had been told that she would have to spend the winter in a sod cave or share a tent with some others. She continued: "on looking up I saw a woman standing in the door of a tent, I wiped my eyes and went to her and inquired for Asa Davis she showed me his house and I went there and was made welcome to such accommodations as they had."  

While living in the house in the day, she slept in their wagon at night. Before the winter was over, Taggart moved to several different cabins. Others encountered similar difficulties.

Lost or stray cattle was another irritant. Those in charge of the stray herds, which included "many of the soldiers cattle", were reporting that numerous stray cattle "have not been found . . . some have swam the river from hence and crossed over on your side and we know not where they are." Other strays were reported "as low down the Missouri river as seventeen miles and other places". Many were never found. After listening one night to endless cattle complaints by John Smith and others, Hosea Stout recorded "The thing was talked out of countenance" after which Brigham "moved to have the whole matter laid over till the 1st resurrection" and then "burn the papers the day before."
Many flatly rejected paying their taxes, fines, and tithes. There just wasn't enough money, they felt, to make the rounds. How could they give that which they felt they didn't have. Why keep demanding so much from so little?

The dissatisfaction reached such a level that by late December, Church leaders were preaching "on the subject of the insubordination of some of the people and their stubbornness, their murmurings and complaining refusing to pay tax and tithing." Warned their leader, "all those who did not intend to abide council [sic] had best flee to the gentiles again for all who are among us should both help support the poor and pay their tax whether they belonged to the church or not, or leave the camp."74

But the loudest criticisms, then and since, revolved around Brigham's handling of the Mormon Battalion funds. Some condemned his actions in "leeching" Battalion funds for his own purposes in building a store and returning the profits. One particularly vitriolic contemporary dissenter wrote, "all this money" was "clinched by these vultures to enable them to live in affluence and splendor."75 A more recent author charges that instead of distributing the Battalion supplies, Brigham "invested" most of it in goods which were "sold at a stiff profit." Because of Brigham, Battalion families received little of the money paid by the army.76 Another critic of recent times argues the Twelve took "about forty thousand dollars" sent by the Battalion and was the cause of starving innocent women and children.77
Many claim that Church leaders forced Battalion members to give up their money against their will and then used the money to stock the store and sold the provisions at "a stiff profit" all at the cost of the health and well-being of the Saints.

Since this has become the focus of such attention, it deserves further examination not to vindicate or attack but to clarify. Unquestionably Brigham and other Church authorities saw the army money as an unexpected god-send, especially in a time of such economic exigencies. They knew also that their designs in using such funds differed from those of some in camp. When the Twelve first broached the plan to pool the money "for the benefit of the entire camp," fifty-seven people on the east side, a distinct minority, registered their dissent.78 Most of these had already made arrangements "with the expectation of receiving funds" and were not happy at surrendering part or all of it. Their needs were reasonable. George and Linda Coulson, for instance, requested $30 of the $40 their son sent back to buy tools for a blacksmithing shop. "We have divided our little [sic] to them that are in poorer circumstances than ourselves and continue to do so," wrote Mrs. Coulson, "but I think we soon shall want some assistance ourselves."79 Bulah S. Clark requested $10 of the $30 sent home to purchase "a good new milch cow and the balance they can buy what they see fit."80

Seeing the problem, authorities convened a large outdoor meeting of Battalion families at Council Point 23
August 1846. Bringing with him the money recently arrived from the soldiers, Brigham first presented the plan of using most of it to buy materials at wholesale prices in St. Louis "so that no portion of the money shall be squandered without doing the company good." He argued that they were not the only poor, indeed they were now the richer poor. Everywhere, he said, the camp was strained with poverty. All would benefit from pooled purchases, he argued, and if they did not choose to participate, the camp had little responsibility to provide for their needs such as taking care of stray cattle. "It is not right for any person to hoard up the wealth which is earned by their friends in the army, while their brethren, who are around them in the camp are toiling from day to day to sustain them and their teams." While most accepted, "there were some wonderful exceptions," and though the vote was overwhelmingly in favor of the proposed action, it was by no means unanimous.

After the meeting, bishops were instructed to compile a list "of such things as wanted by the soldiers families" so that the most pressing needs could be met. Most reasonable requests were apparently filled. Battalion families retained $1,500 or twenty-four percent of the total sent home and gave over the balance for large bulk grain purchases and a limited number of specific orders in their behalf.

What was most disappointing to both the families and leaders was the small amount of money, comparatively, the soldiers sent back. Of the approximate $22,000 paid them as
clothing allowance, slightly more than $5,000 was returned, nothing near $40,000! Perhaps much had to go to buy boots, blankets, hats, and other necessities. A few of the men had no family back at the Bluffs. Whatever the reasons, Brigham wasn't happy. Responding to continuing sporadic complaints, he "told the Sisters that they ought not to grumble" after the Twelve for not having a sufficiency to live on, "for their dear husbands who were in the Army were . . . reserving to themselves only $17,000 for the Grog Shop, Ballroom and card Table."85 Never one to be misunderstood, his highhandedness, bluntness, and uncompromising stance did little to dampen criticism. To obtain more Battalion money, John D. Lee and Howard Egan were secretly appointed to intersect the Battalion at Santa Fe and return with donated wage money. Lee returned 21 November with a disappointingly small $1,277 in Battalion money.86 Some wives had written critical letters of Church authorities which obviously discouraged some men from sending back more. The money was used primarily to buy much needed grain, hogs, and other provisions in Savanna, St. Joseph, and other north-west Missouri river towns in December, the most expensive time to buy.

In answer to the criticism that the Winter Quarters store "gouged" its captive customers, it is true that Whitney had to pay more for shipping and freight during the first produce mission because of shallow river conditions which more than doubled freight costs. And it is equally true that by the fall and winter traders were paying from
60–90¢ for a bushel of wheat, $2–$4 for a pound of pork, and
40–50¢ for a bushel of corn because of low winter
supplies. But a more accurate picture of prices in the
context of the time and place is provided by the Winter
Quarters store account book which gives retail prices
charged customers.

Figure 6:1 compares known Nauvoo retail prices of May
1843 with those in Winter Quarters 31⁄2 years later. Price
comparisons are deliberately restricted to items for which
cross comparisons are available. Clearly prices were
considerably more at Winter Quarters. Had a person
purchased the sample grocery basket presented, the Nauvoo
price would have been $6.29 in Nauvoo compared to $9.46 in
Winter Quarters three years later, an increase of almost
exactly fifty percent.

Another comparison can be made between store prices at
Winter Quarters and those at Kirtland, Ohio, headquarters
for the Church for most of the 1830's. Figure 6:2
compares retail prices of the two country stores and is in
many ways a fairer comparison since the Kirtland store was
also operated by Newel K. Whitney and as at Winter Quarters
was the only store in operation. The Winter Quarters prices
averaged less than those at Kirtland ten years previously,
at least with articles for which cross comparisons are
available.

Figure 6:3 compares retail prices the store charged its
customers and the wholesale prices Mormon traders first had
to pay to get the goods. The items selected are
restricted to those for which wholesale and retail prices are available, thereby offering the fairest basis of comparison. The quantities approximate an average or typical order. As seen in the price lists, certain items were marked up considerably, but most only marginally so. If a person purchased large amounts of whiskey, tobacco, and soap his costs would have been proportionately higher. Those purchasing more of the basics such as coffee, sugar, flour etc. would pay proportionately less. While the store did operate at a profit, an estimated sixty-four percent mark-up from wholesale to resale prices cannot be considered "exhorbitant", especially in light of their increased freight costs. As Gerald Carson in his definitive work on country stores of the nineteenth century has contended, a merchant of the time along any of the great rivers would have considered a markup of fifty per cent as low. A seventy-five per cent advance over the wholesale price "was more common", and many spoke of making "one per cent" which meant what cost one dollar to buy sold for two dollars.  

Of the total $7,906.81 spent in St. Louis and other Missouri trading centers, $1,187.46 was paid in freight, fifteen percent of the total, not including the cost of sending the twenty-one pick-up teams from the Bluffs to St. Joseph and back. After deducting freight charges, the Winter Quarters store was selling at fifty percent above St. Louis wholesale prices.  

Therefore prices were higher than at Nauvoo but cheaper than at Kirtland, Ohio, nine years before. The increased
costs are directly traceable to their distance from key markets and necessary freight charges. Furthermore, the mark up between wholesale costs and retail prices was well within acceptable standards, perhaps below the average norm.

Whether Brigham pocketed some of the profits to repay himself for expenses incurred in constructing and operating the mill, is difficult to substantiate. John D. Lee admits to some pangs of conscience for selling goods "at a heavy percent" mark-up in order "to liquidate the debt of building the mill." He was likely referring not to the sale of the Whitney-purchased goods but more likely to the prices of hogs, teams, and wheat which he purchased out of the second installment of Battalion funds. It seems probable that some money was transferred to Brigham to pay back, in part, the several hundred dollar debt he incurred in building and operating the mill.

Winter Quarters provided Brigham the first opportunity to implement his own social and economic order. Though temporary, it was characterized by efforts to reach at least a minimal level of community self-sufficiency, by the consecration of wealth for the benefit of the whole, by the central role of the Church in the collection and discrimination of resources, and by individual ownerships and accountability. Though there were serious criticisms and understandable grumblings, the welfare of all was made to prevail over the interests of the individual.
FIGURE #6.1

Nauvoo/Winter Quarters Retail Price Comparisons*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Commodity</th>
<th>May 1843 Nauvoo Prices</th>
<th>1846/47 W.Q. Prices</th>
<th>% Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Molasses/lb.</td>
<td>.37 1/2</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
<td>270%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sugar/lb.</td>
<td>.10¢</td>
<td>.15¢</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coffee/lb.</td>
<td>.12¢</td>
<td>.15¢</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saleratus/lb.</td>
<td>.07¢</td>
<td>.16 2/3¢</td>
<td>222%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rice/lb.</td>
<td>.06¢</td>
<td>.12 1/2¢</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whiskey/gal.</td>
<td>.25¢</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
<td>400%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flour/cwt.</td>
<td>$3.50</td>
<td>$3.00</td>
<td>-16 1/3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sample Purchase

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Nauvoo</th>
<th>Winter Quarters</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2 lbs. molasses</td>
<td>.75¢</td>
<td>$2.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 lbs. sugar</td>
<td>.50¢</td>
<td>.75¢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 lbs. coffee</td>
<td>.60¢</td>
<td>.75¢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 lbs. saleratus</td>
<td>.14¢</td>
<td>.33 1/2¢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 lbs. rice</td>
<td>.30¢</td>
<td>.62 1/2¢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 gal. whiskey</td>
<td>.50¢</td>
<td>$2.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 cwt. flour</td>
<td>$3.50</td>
<td>$3.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$6.29</td>
<td>$9.46 (+50%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

FIGURE #6.2

Kirtland/Winter Quarters Retail Price Comparisons*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Commodity</th>
<th>1836/37 Kirtland Prices</th>
<th>1846/47 Winter Quarters Prices</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Molasses/lb.</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sugar/lb.</td>
<td>.17¢</td>
<td>.15¢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saleratus/lb.</td>
<td>.19¢</td>
<td>.17¢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soap/lb.</td>
<td>.13¢</td>
<td>.13¢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linsey/yd.</td>
<td>.22¢</td>
<td>.31¢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tobacco/lb.</td>
<td>.25¢</td>
<td>.19¢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buttons/doz.</td>
<td>.08¢</td>
<td>.13¢</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

FIGURE #6.3

Wholesale/Retail Price Comparisons*  
Winter Quarters Store 1846/47  
Sample Order

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Commodity</th>
<th>Wholesale</th>
<th>Retail</th>
<th>% Difference (+,-)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 lb. sugar</td>
<td>.12 1/2c</td>
<td>.15c</td>
<td>+ 20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 lb. coffee</td>
<td>.12 1/2c</td>
<td>.15c</td>
<td>+ 20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 lb. salt</td>
<td>.15 1/2c</td>
<td>.40c</td>
<td>+ 260%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 gal. whiskey</td>
<td>.40c</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
<td>+ 250%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 lb. tobacco</td>
<td>.10c</td>
<td>.38c</td>
<td>+ 380%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 lb. pepper</td>
<td>.20c</td>
<td>.25c</td>
<td>+ 25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 lb. saleratus</td>
<td>.08c</td>
<td>.17c</td>
<td>+ 52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 broom</td>
<td>.10c</td>
<td>.12c</td>
<td>+ 20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 lb. soap</td>
<td>.03 1/2c</td>
<td>.13c</td>
<td>+ 400%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 yd. linsey</td>
<td>.25c</td>
<td>.31c</td>
<td>+ 22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 dozen buttons</td>
<td>.10c</td>
<td>.13c</td>
<td>+ 30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 comforter</td>
<td>.50c</td>
<td>.38c</td>
<td>- 22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 bucket</td>
<td>.33 1/2c</td>
<td>.50c</td>
<td>+ 50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>$2.50</td>
<td>$4.07</td>
<td>+ 64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flour</td>
<td>$3.50/cwt</td>
<td>$3.50/cwt</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER SIX


2 Leonard J. Arrington, Feramorz Y. Fox, and Dean L. May, Building the City of God (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1976), p.15. Joseph's Law of Consecration and Stewardship was abandoned on 1834, and in 1838 the so-called "lesser-lev" of tithing was introduced. See Doctrine and Covenants, 119.

3 Journal History, 23 August 1846.

4 This herd was driven into town every Saturday when all hands turned out to select their lost cattle. Diary of Hosea Stout, 3 October 1846, 1:203.

5 Asahel Lathrop, formerly with George Miller's Ponca camp, became disenchanted with Miller's leadership, and left the Running Water settlement with ten other families and came to Winter Quarters. Having travelled the west banks of the Missouri for 200 miles he recommended his tiny settlement as an ideal grazing ground for the almost 1,200 head of Church cattle at a spot roughly equidistant between Winter Quarters and the Running Water River. The prairie grass, rush bottoms, and pea vines were particularly abundant at the Lathrop settlement. Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 6-13 February 1847.

The Rush Bottoms along the Missouri above Winter Quarters were covered with a growth of rushes or "jointed grass" which stayed green most of the winter. It is now almost extinct. Lathrop's herd was probably located just east of Tekamah, Nebraska. Journals of John D. Lee, editor's note, p.23.

6 Seventy is a proselyting office in the higher or Melchizedek priesthood of the Church. Two other Melchizedek Priesthood offices are elder and high priest.

7 See Journal History, 8 November 1846; and Journal of John D. Lee, 14 December 1846, p.37; also Diary of Hosea Stout, 2 January 1847, 1:222-23.

8 Journals of John D. Lee, 2 February 1847, p.64. It was public knowledge that the Senate had ratified the Pottawattamie treaty in the summer of 1846 and had agreed to pay the Pottawattamie $850,000 over several years. Transportation costs would be paid out of an initial $50,000 payment.

9 See Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 16-17 and 20 August, 1846; and Journal History, 30 August 1846. By contemporary standards, the Winter Quarters mill was a large
affair. The average capital outlay for most mills of the
time in the state of Missouri was only $500. See Priscilla
Ann Evans, "Merchant Gristmills and Communities, 1820–1880:
An Economic Relationship," Missouri Historical Review 68

10 Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 16 August
1846.

11 Journals of John D. Lee, 14 December 1846, p.38.

12 Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 20 September
1846.

13 Ibid., 8 November 1846.

14 Journal History, 19 March 1847. Efforts to
accelerate the mill's operation were repeatedly made. By
late November residents were urged to volunteer three days
out of every nine to complete the mill race. George
Miller's expertise was also utilized in the late winter when
asked to leave his Ponca settlement. Winter Quarters High
Council Minutes, 28 February 1847.

15 See Thomas Bullock, Historical Department Journals,
LDS Church Archives, 20 March 1847; and Journal of Wilford
Woodruff, 16 February 1848. Compare with Evans, "Merchant
Gristmills," p.323.

16 Some local historians contend that the mill stood
for many years at the corner of 9124 North 30th Street in
Florence, Nebraska. See Gail G. Holmes, "Reflections on
Winter Quarters," an undated, unpublished paper, Utah State
Historical Society, p.4; and Papers of Lawrence D. Clark,
LDS Church Archives. The mill now standing in Florence and
marked as the old Mormon mill corresponds to the original
location but contains little, if any, of the original
materials.

17 See Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 28
February 1847; and letter of Brigham Young to Thomas J.
Thurston, 27 December 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

18 Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 25 March
1847. The sale, approved by the High Council, was one of
convenience and expediency. Neff agreed to purchase the
mill and allow Brigham the right to manage it "as he sees
proper." In return Neff agreed to take only 20% of grinding
tolls the first year.

Early in 1848, Indian Agent John Miller, on behalf of
the government, offered to buy the mill for the Indians, but
the sale was never consummated apparently because of
objections from the Omaha who believed they owned all
Journal History, 7 August 1847.

Orson Hyde to Brigham Young, 7 August 1846, Brigham Young Papers. Hyde said this clothing money payment was "unexpected." According to Willard Richards, the amount returned was $5,860. Journal of Willard Richards, 11 August 1846.

Journal History, 12 August 1846.

Ibid., 13 and 14 August 1846.

Ibid., 21 August 1846.

Winter Quarters Store Account Book, p.76, Brigham Young Papers. Although some of the soldiers money was set aside to purchase personal items specially requested, most was earmarked for the bulk buying of wheat, flour and other edibles. $982.75 were to buy wheat alone. Journal History, 6 September 1846.

See Journal History, 1 November 1846; and Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 12 November 1846.

Winter Quarters Store Account Book. William Clayton was one of the principle clerks and adjusters.

See Journal History, 25 March and 16 June 1847. William E. Clifford and a Mr. Hathaway opened a small store at the home of Albert P. Rockwood in early February 1847. Whether it operated in competition with the main store or if it operated after Whitney's store closed is unknown. Journal History, 8 February 1847. Said Brigham to Mr. Estill: "The church store house will not probably be of the size and height to suit your taste and convenience, but you can doubtless get some place on your arrival that will accomodate [sic] you while you can build or purchase, if you choose. Should you wish to build our people can accomodate [sic] you on short notice."

See Journal History, 22 September 1846; and Journal of Willard Richards, 4 October 1846. (Notwithstanding this regulation, persons were at liberty to purchase materials at Sarpy's trading post although they were generally discouraged from doing so.)

Journal History, 27 August 1846.

Ibid., 11 November 1846. "If a man apostatizes," declared Brigham "his property need not apostatize - if any brother sees his neighbor giving away and leaving his family on this people who has property he can go to Brother Higbee and tell him the case and I'll warrant you he won't cross him." Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 7 November 1847.
Brigham Young to George Miller, 20 September 1846, Brigham Young Papers. Brigham continued, "every one will preserve his individual interest and receive his just dues, even if he does nothing for it these [sic] be publicly known that he is an idler and he will have the privilege of retiring among the gentiles and eating the fruits of his own labors." Slavery, even among those from the South in camp, was barely noticeable. Some slaves may have been in camp with their southern owners but likely few. At one point Brigham said he didn't want slaves. See Brigham Young to Joseph Herring, 13 September 1846, Brigham Young Papers. The official policy was to hold neither with slavery or abolitionism as "our creed teaches us more the principle of holding men, either white, red or black by moral power than by any legal ties." Meeting of the Twelve, June 1849, Brigham Young Papers.

Autobiography of Joseph Holbrook, 5 February 1848, LDS Church Archives.

Journal History, 7 August 1847.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 7 November 1847.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 25 July 1847.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 29 April 1847, 1:253.

Mormon occupants on the east side acquired valuable pre-emption rights up and down the river for over fifty miles north and south and thirty to forty miles inland. B. H. Roberts, The Mormon Battalion, p.24.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 24 December 1846, 1:220. Assessed property included cabins, wagons, furniture, domestic animals, and all improvements.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 8 November 1846. The sexton's charge per burial was $1.50 plus the cost of a coffin.


Doctrine and Covenants, 119. "Those who have thus been tithed shall pay one-tenth of all their interest annually; and this shall be a standing law unto them forever." 119:4.

Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 17 December 1847. Despite such comprehensive declarations, some of the most destitute and some Battalion families not producing income were exempt from paying on the donations of goods and services they received. Also some of the rich who had given so very much to others, if not exempted, had their
contributions figured as tithing. Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 19 December 1847.

This transaction was very much in accord with the then-current interpretation of the office of bishop. Church doctrine expressly taught that in an ideal economic order, all substance imparted to the poor "shall be laid before the bishop of my church and its counsellors . . . to administer to those who have not, from time to time, that every man who has need may be amply supplied and receive according to his wants." Doctrine and Covenants 42:31, 33. More administrative duties were later assigned bishops.

Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 17 July 1846.

Pottawattamie High Council Minutes, 3 August 1846. Initially, families chose their own bishops.

Journal History, 4 October 1846.

Diary of Hosea Scutt, 25 November 1846, 1:214. The Winter Quarters High Council divided the city into twenty-two wards, and nominated the following men as bishops. Those not already High Priests would be ordained to that office. See city drawing, Chapter Four.

Wards: 1st - All those south of Joseph St. - Edward Hunter
         2nd - North side of Joseph St. - William Fossett
         3rd - South side of Smith St. - David Fairbanks
         4th - Block 24 - Daniel Spencer
         5th - Block 25 - Levi Riter
         6th - Block 26 - George W. Harris
         7th - Block 27 - Joseph Matthews
         8th - Block 28 - Luman H. Calkins
         9th - Block 29 - Dr. Lang
        10th - Block 30 - Isaac Davis
        11th - Block 31 - Abraham Hogland
        12th - Block 32 - Ephraim Badger
        13th - Block 33 - David Yearsley
        14th - Block 34 - John Benbo
        15th - Block 35 - Unknown
        16th - Blocks 36 and 41 north to the Creek - Benjamin Brown
        17th - Block 37 - Brother Lutts
        18th - Block 38 - John Vance
        19th - Block 39 - John Higbee
        20th - Block 40 and north to the Creek - Joseph B. Noble
        21st - All north of Creek and west of 2nd Main St. - A. Everett
        22nd - All east of 2nd Main St. and north of Creek - Willard Snow
A 23rd ward, with Joseph Knight, Jr., bishop, comprised clusters of settlements about Miller's Hollow near the Blockhouse on the Iowa side. Journal History, 26 November 1846.

48 Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 25 November 1846. For more on bishops see Chapter Nine.

49 Journal History, 23 November 1846.

50 Journal of Thomas Bullock, 13 December 1846.

51 Journal History, 16 and 27 February 1847.

52 Ibid., 15 November 1846. Some of the collected tithing was used to pay the partial support of members of the Quorum of the Twelve. See minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and others, 17 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers. Compare with the Journal of Joseph Fielding, LDS Church Archives, p.127.

53 Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 26 September 1847. Exactly how tithes were collected under this revised method is not given.

54 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 7 March 1847. Picnics, dances, and parties for the poor were also arranged by some of the more ambitious bishops.

55 Journal History, 8 November 1846.

56 Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and others, 18 December 1847, Brigham Young Papers. The original figure was $36,000, but it is presumed the true figure was $3,600. Extra zeros were often carelessly added.

57 Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 19 December 1847.

58 Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 26 September 1847.

59 After two years, twenty boot and shoe makers were in operation on both sides of the river. Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 21 January 1848.

60 John Pack returned from Missouri 1 October 1846, with a carding machine purchased at a cost of $40, money likely provided from Church funds. See Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 2 October 1846; and Journal of Willard Richards, 2 October 1846.

61 The Diary of John Pulsipher, p.12.

Journal History, 16 August 1846.

Journal History, 20 November 1846.

Charles C. Rich to Brigham Young, 3 October 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Journal History, 31 December 1846.


Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 28 November 1847.


Autobiography of Fanny Parks Taggart, LDS Church Archives, late fall 1846.

Pottawattamie High Council Minutes, 31 October 1846.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 4 February 1847, 1:235.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 28 November 1847.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 15 December 1846, 1:218. Only a handful in Winter Quarters were non-Mormons.


Journals of John D. Lee, editor's note, p.34 and p.55.


Pottawattamie High Council Minutes, 18 August 1846.

George and Linda Coulson to Brigham Young, 18 August 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Bulah S. Clark to Brigham Young, 19 August 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Journal History, 14 August 1846.

Ibid.

See Pottawattamie High Council Minutes, 23 August 1846; and Journal History, 26 August 1846. As to the "arm twisting." Brigham warned those that kept all their money
that "such a course of conduct will release us from all obligations that we are under to see that they are provided for and taken care of. . . . for it is not right for any person to hoard up wealth which is earned by their friends in the army, while their brethren, who are around them in the camp are toiling hard from day to day to sustain them and their teams." Journal History, 14 August 1846.

84 Pottawattamie High Council Minutes, 23 August 1846.

85 Journal of Thomas Bullock, 13 December 1846.

86 See Journal History, 21 November 1846; and Journals of John D. Lee, 21 November 1846, p.21. The mission was kept secret not because authorities were unwilling to tell Battalion families, but to prevent possible "robbery and murder." Lee was paid $160 for making the perilous journey. Journal History, 29 August 1846.

87 See Eldridge Tufts to Brigham Young, 10 February 1847, Brigham Young Papers; and Diary of Hosea Stout, 2 January 1847, 1:222.

88 Nauvoo retail prices are taken from The Mormon Neighbor, 1 May 1843, Vol. 2 #1, p.3. What few 1846 Nauvoo prices are known indicate a slight decrease in retail prices. See Hancock Eagle, 8 May 1846, vol. 1 #6, p.3. Winter Quarters prices are derived from the "Winter Quarters Store Account Book," Brigham Young Papers. The sample amounts approximate any of the several hundred individual purchases made at the store.

89 See "Gilbert and Whitney Day Book," Kirtland, Ohio, November 1836 - April 1837, Library and Archives, Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints; and "Winter Quarters Store Account Book."

90 The basis for the wholesale price list is the prices charged Mormon traders at St. Joseph, Savannah, and Oregon, Missouri, in December 1846 by Smith and Donnell, Nave and McCord, Middleton and Berry, and Mr. Tootle and Company. See Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 14 and 22 December 1846, and 12 January 1847. Though not the same as the St. Louis prices Whitney paid, they probably were not much more. River towns tried to be competitive.

The retail prices are taken from the Winter Quarters Store Account Book, Brigham Young Papers. There is no difference in price between December 1846 and March 1847.


92 A full comparison of prices charged at Sarpy's Trading Post with those at Winter Quarters is not possible. However, a handful of items can be compared.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Molasses/gal.</td>
<td>0.75¢</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sugar/lb.</td>
<td>0.13¢</td>
<td>0.15¢</td>
<td>0.10 - 0.40¢</td>
<td>0.25 - 0.64¢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coffee/lb.</td>
<td>0.12 1/2¢</td>
<td>0.15¢</td>
<td>0.02 - 0.40¢</td>
<td>0.19¢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liquor/gal.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
<td>$6.00</td>
<td>$1.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flour/cwt.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>$3.00</td>
<td>$6.00</td>
<td>$2.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Whereas it may be argued that Sarpy was able to undersell certain items, other trading posts charged comparatively much higher prices. See Unruh, The Plains Across, p.265; also The Journals of John D. Lee 15 December 1846, p.39; and Winter Quarters Store Account Book.

95 Journals of John D. Lee, 27 January 1847, p.60.

96 Ibid., 27 January 1847, pp.60 and 61 and 27 February 1847, p.102. As late as November 1847, Brigham still owed money to Battalion families.

END OF VOLUME I
MORMONS AT THE MISSOURI: A HISTORY OF THE LATTER-DAY SAINTS AT WINTER QUARTERS AND AT KANESVILLE, 1846-52 - A STUDY IN AMERICAN OVERLAND TRAIL MIGRATION

Volume II

By

Richard Edmond Bennett

A DISSERTATION Submitted to the Graduate School of Wayne State University, Detroit, Michigan in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

1984

MAJOR: HISTORY

APPROVED BY:

Philip P. Mason (Advisor) March 26, 1984 (Date)

Stanley D. Farmer (Member) March 26, 1984 (Date)

Marc W. Kamman (Member) March 26, 1984 (Date)

R. Dale Virginia (Member) March 26, 1984 (Date)
CHAPTER SEVEN

"AND SHOULD WE DIE"

SICKNESS AND DEATH AT WINTER QUARTERS

And should we die before our journey's through,
Happy day! all is well!
We then are free from toil and sorrow too;
With the just we shall dwell!

William Clayton's memorable hymn, "Come, Come Ye Saints", written while crossing Iowa in the spring of 1846, became an instant favorite among his compatriots, a prairie-born hymn of both triumph and disaster. While predicting eventual rest in the West it also foreshadowed the inevitable and impending loss of life at the Missouri.

The saga of Winter Quarters is remembered primarily for its story of suffering, tragedy, and death. While one of the purposes of this study is to change and revitalize that image and to credit what transpired there, the true and accurate story of the pain, disease, and death suffered demands careful study and revision. Besides verifying numbers and providing a more accurate statistical overview, this chapter will attempt to weigh the effects such an ordeal wrought upon the Mormons and how they coped with it.

"A Terrible Tax Upon the Saints"

It was all bound to catch up with them sooner or later. The hasty, wintry exodus from Nauvoo, the exhausting trek across Iowa, the endless spring storms, their insufficient
provisions and scanty diet, inadequate and improvised shelter, the forced exodus of the poor camp, and unhealthy riverbank encampments — these were not the building blocks to good health. By early August, after deciding against the Grand Island plan, Brigham and fellow leaders were becoming ever more aware that their people needed immediate rest and recuperation in the hollows at the Bluffs to "preserve their health."\(^2\)

Even before August, reports were filtering in from along the trail that chills and fever were dramatically on the rise. Back at Mt. Pisgah, William Huntington reported in late July on the "much sickness in camp" in the form of ague, fever, and chills.\(^3\) Lorenzo Snow, a counselor in the Mt. Pisgah presidency, reported that July and August "witnessed a general and almost universal scene of sickness" when the sick greatly outnumbered the healthy. "It was indeed a distressing scene. A great number of deaths occurred."\(^4\)

After Huntington's own death in late August, Charles C. Rich became president of the settlement and immediately advised that because of weariness, fever, and chills it would be impossible to send many more to the Bluffs.\(^5\) "Pisgah turned out to be a very sickly place," one traveller reported; "the whole family of us were sick during the fall and some of us all winter . . . we had a miserable time of it."\(^6\) Garden Grove fared little better. The tired and weary were suffering and dying there in proportionate numbers.\(^7\)
And that which decimated the ranks at Garden Grove, Mt. Pisgah, and all along the Iowa trail was also beginning to paralyze the Missouri River encampments. Major A.J. Dripps, a former Indian Agent, on his way down from Fort Pierre (South Dakota) to St. Louis in the winter of 1846/47 passed through several Mormon encampments describing them "as enduring great privations and suffering, many of them being entirely destitute of provisions. These people, from all that we can learn of their position and condition, have endured more privations during the winter than even many of those who are suffering from famine in Europe."^8

The accounts of sickness at Winter Quarters are plentiful. Louise Barnes Pratt recalled arriving at Cold Springs "half dead". "The shaking ague," she recalled, "fastened deathless fangs upon me" and "I shook till it appeared my very bones were pulverized. I wept, I prayed, I besought the Lord to have mercy on me."^9 Heber C. Kimball had never before seen so much sickness as he did in August 1846 at the Missouri.^10

And the chills and fevers of August continued to ravish the encampments through the fall until the onset of cold weather in late December. Special envoys were sent to St. Louis in mid-October to purchase medicines to try and stem the sickening tide, but to little effect. Little wonder, then, that after burying one son and about to bury another, Wilford Woodruff lamented in November, "I have never seen the Latter-day Saints in any situation where they seemed to
be passing through greater tribulations or wearing out faster than at the present time."\textsuperscript{11}

Serious sickness was no respector of persons or position. Willard Richards was incapacitated for weeks. Brigham took so sick he said he had died and visited the spirit world. Colonel Thomas L. Kane, himself gravely ill at Cutler's Park, reported seeing women sitting "in the open tents keeping the flies off their dead children" while waiting for grave diggers to catch up with the overflowing scourge."\textsuperscript{12}

The Cause of Their Afflictions

Kane concluded that the cause of their tribulation was "a sort of strange scorbutic disease, frequently fatal, which they named the Black Canker."\textsuperscript{13} Many writers have since concluded from Kane's account that scurvy was the chief cause of all deaths at Winter Quarters summer, fall, and winter.\textsuperscript{14} However, until the onset of winter, they were suffering more from exposure than from insufficient diet, a fact which they themselves recognized.

Many contemporary observers blamed their plight on the inhospitably wet Iowa spring. "The almost unparrelled [sic] rains . . . and the contamination of the atmosphere by the overflowing of the water," recalled Erastus Snow, "spread disease and death through all our camps and weakened our hands as though the Lord . . . had as in days of old given the Prince of the Power of the air especial leave to open his floodgates upon us."\textsuperscript{15} John Pulsipher agreed with
Snow's assessment. "The great exposure and fatigue in all kinds of weather since we left Nauvoo was more than my constitution could bear." He suffered from "the bilious fever" for nine months. Likewise, Wilford Woodruff blamed their condition on "being exposed to the sufferings of a tedious journey of ten months in tents and wagons without houses." Eliza Lyman, who gave birth to an infant son in a wagon at Cold Springs, complained of her exposure to "the scorching sun shining upon the wagon through the day and the cool air at night" as almost "too much of a change to be healthy." Stricken with fever she was reduced to "a skeleton so much so that those who have not been with me do not know me." Shelter was inadequate for most and offered scant protection from the elements. Attention has already been drawn to the construction of the wind-swept cabins, lean-to's, and sod caves or hovels that provided minimal protection from the elements. Some shivered in wagons all fall and winter.

Kane and several other writers, contemporary and historical, blamed the outbreak of sickness on the "singularly pestiferous," swampy, mosquito-breeding Missouri river purportedly described as the "Misery Bottoms." "In the beginning of August," he wrote,

"the river diminished one-half, threaded feebly southward through the center of the valley, and the mud of its channel, baked and creased, made a wide tile pavement between the choking crowd of seeds, and sedgy grasses, and wet stalked weeds, and growths of marsh meadow flowers, the garden
homes, at this tainted season, of venom-crazy snakes, and the fresher ooze by the water's edge, which stank in the sun like a naked muscle shoal."

James Linn described the river as it receded in the late summer "a quagmire of black dirt, half-buried carrion and yellow pools of what the children called frog's spawn." From out of the "miasma" of the river, great clouds of mosquitoes rose almost blocking the sun. "After it became impossible to keep them from forming a crust on my horses neck," one traveller observed, "they were not content to aim at my face but stung me through my gloves and pantaloons." Settlers further downstream blamed the mosquitoes for repeated outbreaks of malarial fever which likely was one of the major causes of their ill chills, fever, consumption, and dropsy.

With chills and fever listed by the Cutler's Park and Winter Quarters sextons as the single largest cause of death (see Figure 7:1) it may well be that in today's vernacular, they were dying from malaria, pneumonia, and tuberculosis throughout the summer and fall, all exposure-related diseases. Several noticed a marked, albeit temporary improvement in the health of the camp with the arrival of colder weather, possible evidence that mosquitoes and bacteria-laden, decomposing vegetation along the river were significant mortality factors.

What extent bad drinking water and crude sanitation efforts contributed to the general malaise is difficult to determine. Although the Missouri River was notoriously
muddy, it was not polluted with raw sewage and other contaminants. Much of their drinking water probably came from the two near-by creeks of cleaner, clearer water. And most outhouses were positioned away from the river resulting in minimal seepage. Only three fatal cases of typhus fever and three of diarrhea/cholera were reported between 1846 and 1848.

But their respite was short-lived. Whereas the majority of deaths before the year's end were arguably exposure-related, most in the winter and early spring of 1847 resulted from protein, vitamin, and other dietary insufficiencies. Most noticeable was the outbreak of scurvy or as they often called it, "black-leg" or "black-canker." Wrote one diarist, "It commences with a sharp pain in the ankles, swells and finally the leg get[s] almost black and in many cases it proves fatal. There have a great many died, within the last month." Horace Whitney revealed that they knew the cause of the disease - "by the want of vegetable food and having to eat salt food" - but were nevertheless powerless to do much about it.

In the late summer and early fall they had supplemented their diets with wild choke cherries, melons, strawberries, grapes, and other fruits along with various vegetables obtained from Missouri farmers. But without means of refrigeration, these perishable foods were quickly consumed reducing their diet once again to cornmeal, bacon, and some beef. The failure of the mill to commence operation as
scheduled compounded their difficulties so that their winter menu was meager. Remembered Helen Whitney,

Many of the brethren had gone down into Missouri to work or to trade for provisions, which consisted, mostly, of corn and bacon; the latter, with corn meal cakes, was our main subsistence during the winter. Vegetables, and many of the necessaries of life were not obtainable. Indian meal cake and puddings we considered very nice when used as rarities, as we were accustomed to doing in the east, but when we had little or no change, they became somewhat nauseous, particularly to the sick and delicate.29

The descriptions of the disease are as repulsive as they were abundant and from all accounts pointed to a dreadful time. "It is suposed [sic] to be the dregs of the ague and kanker [sic]", wrote John D. Lee, "that falls into the feet and legs and commences on the toes first with a pain, then they die away without feeling and so on continuing until the person expires."30 "The flesh would rot and drop off some to the bones" another recalled.31 Mary Helen Grant remembered "people dying by hundreds, principally with the scurvy." A favorite antidote seemed to be potatoes, she recalled. "We purchased one half bushel, which were used only for the sick ones, bathing their limbs in the water they were cooked in, binding the skins on to take out the black."32

Some, like Isaac Haight, equated scurvy with the black canker. "The black canker is beginning in her gums," Haight said referring to his daughter, "and has eaten them all off her forward teeth; nothing that we can do has yet done any
good." One woman, shortly after giving birth to a still-born child, fell victim to the disease before ultimately recovering.

The scurvy laid hold of me, commencing at the tips of the fingers of my left hand, with black streaks running up the nails, with inflammation and the most intense pain, and which increased till it had reached my shoulder. Poultices of scraped potato, the best thing it was considered to subdue the inflammation; it would turn black as soon as applied, and for all they were changed every few minutes for fresh ones, it was all to no effect.

The Death Count

Much misconception still surrounds this unhappy time and the numbers of those who died. A few facts have been repeated by a great many authors bent upon developing faith, or inculcating affectatious sentimentality. Such writings have, in turn, created a backlash of recent revisionist interpretations determined to minimize and downplay the scale of suffering at the Missouri. All have failed to describe anything more than the Cutler's Park and Winter Quarters scenes and have totally ignored the other nearby Mormon settlements.

The standard interpretation, first presented by Thomas L. Kane and later given the stamp of approval by B.H. Roberts, is that 600 died at Winter Quarters in the winter of 1846-47, mostly from scurvy. William A. Linn accepted Kane's estimate of deaths arguing that malaria rather than scurvy was the greatest killer. J. Sterling Morton
FIGURE #7.1
CAUSE OF DEATH*

(For Reported Deaths at Cutler's Park, Winter Quarters and Mt. Pisgah, 1846-48)

1. Chills and Fever 75
2. Canker 37
3. Consumption (Tuberculosis) 32
4. Scurvy 22
5. Measles 17
6. Bowel Inflammation 15
7. Lung Inflammation 8
8. Summer Complaint 8
9. Dropsy 8
10. Others 47
11. Not diagnosed 116

TOTAL 385

*Sources: Cutler's Park and Winter Quarters sexton records; Mt. Pisgah Historical Records; various private journal.
likewise concluded that 600 died, mostly of malaria, a pestilence, he argued, that returned annually until 1851. 37 Clyde A. Aitchison accepted Kane's figures unquestionably. 38 Present-day promotional literature continues to rely on Kane's interpretation and figures. At the Winter Quarters cemetery in Florence, Nebraska, a heroic bronze monument lists the names of over 600 people who died supposedly at Winter Quarters in 1846-47.

More recent scholarship has tended to restrict the period of suffering and to reduce the death count. James Allen and Glen Leonard have argued that between mid-September 1846 and May 1848 only 359 are definitely known to have died. 39 Leonard Arrington and Davis Bitton put the winter death toll at 200, or one in thirty. 40 One local Council Bluffs historian has argued that merely sixty-seven died at Winter Quarters in the winter of 1846-47 and of them only a handful from scurvy. 41 While it may not be possible to prove convincingly the causes of death, given mid-19th century medical diagnoses and descriptive terminology, one can arrive at a more accurate understanding of the extent of their sickness and death.

Between February and June 1846, the period between the initial Nauvoo departures and the arrival at the Missouri, comparatively few (perhaps a dozen to a score) had died. 42 The first rush of deaths broke out at the farms, Mt. Pisgah and Garden Grove, starting in June, lasting through the summer, and climaxing in the fall. With fifty certain deaths recorded as early as 3 October 1846, it is
Figure 7.2
Seasonal Graphic Representation of Listed/Named Deaths
on West Bank of Missouri River
(Cutler's Park and Winter Quarters)

1st Year: Aug/46 - July/47=248
2nd Year: Aug/47 - July/48=113
conservatively estimated that by May 1947, at least eighty died there. Garden Grove, only slightly smaller in population, suffered little less. Mt. Pisgah coffin builder, Nelson W. Whipple, recalled there being "much sickness in that place in the fall and many deaths among which was Father Samuel Bent . . . Sister Lewis . . . also the wife of Samuel Williams". He concluded that "many others" died for whom he "made all the coffins and buried them." 

The single best starting point for mortality studies at Cutler's Park and Winter Quarters is the sexton records of both places. 361 people were buried in both the Cutler's Park burial ground and later in the near-by Winter Quarters cemetery (or cemeteries) between August 1846 and May 1848. As figure 7.2 indicates more than twice as many people (248) died the first year than in the succeeding year at Winter Quarters, a possible evidence that they were better prepared, better provisioned, and better sheltered the second time around. The seventy deaths in the summer of 1847 might, however, indicate a recurrence of malarial difficulties.

But for several reasons the 248 figure is merely a starting figure giving the number of only known and recorded deaths and it cannot be depended on for a complete picture. First, if the sextons' complaints are to be believed, many died without proper records. Levi Stewart criticized the bishops who were assigned to keep mortality records "because
people would go and bury in the Grave Yard unbeknowns to him and sometimes bury between the graves thus altering the number of those already reported." He confessed "that he did not know who were buried thus." All through the ensuing fall and winter the sextons were constantly nagging the bishops to provide the names of those "who had been buried and not reported." During one week alone in March 1847, the sexton complained that four or five had been buried without his knowledge.

Although some of these may have been recorded eventually, the problem of non-reporting and undercounting constantly plagued officials. It is highly probable, therefore, that a large number of deceased were never officially tabulated. Some may not have been able to pay the $1.50 burial charge and the cost of coffins, ranging up to $3.50 depending on the kind of wood. Burials in the frozen ground during the winter months were all the more difficult, and some apparently tried to take care of matters themselves.

A second reason for doubting the accuracy of the sexton reports is the almost total lack of deaths reported in June, July, and August 1846. For this time period, only two deaths are recorded during which Kane said he saw numerous children dying all around him. Even without putting much credence in Kane's comments, it is hard to believe the official count when, during the similar period, fourteen known deaths were recorded at Mt. Pisgah alone. Until the Cutler's Park cemetery was laid off in late
August, interments were probably occurring at any convenient place on either side of the river. By 17 August, 100 cases of fever were reported and by 20 August, Heber C. Kimball was already aware of several deaths on both sides of the river. 53 Said Brigham on 13 August, "I want this people planted in a healthy country where they may not be forever dieing." 54

A third reason for skepticism is the undercount of scurvy-related deaths. Although cause of death was admittedly hard to explain then and even more difficult for a researcher to piece together now, certainly they recognized the disease, as earlier descriptions indicate. It is hard to balance the small number of only twenty-two scurvy deaths with the several contemporary journal entries. 55 John D. Lee said that "this and other pestilences have taken many to their silent tomb." 56 Horace Whitney, a trusted diarist, wrote "a great many" died from scurvy in February 1847 alone while the sexton records list a mere handful of scurvy deaths for that month. 57 John Pulsipher said "What the number was that died [of scurvy] I can't tell for certain, but it far exceeded anything that I ever witnessed before." 58 All three men were eye-witnesses.

Furthermore, scurvy deaths were also underestimated if the Mormons used the term canker or "kanker" synonymously with scurvy as has been argued. 59 Although the sexton's records listed only thirty-seven deaths by canker and a combined total of fifty-nine from both canker and scurvy, sixteen less than the number expiring from chills and fever,
Lee recorded that "the kanker seems to be more fatal than any other disease that has been in camp, which is certainly the dregs of colds, augues [sic], which have been inhaled by exposures in an unhealthy atmosphere." 60

George Bean remembered the scene he came upon when returning from a relief mission.

Father was off in Missouri one hundred miles away seeking for bread and other provisions. Mother was sick, Casper had gone with the Mormon Battalion [sic], his wife and child were sick, my brother James A., and sister Mary Elizabeth, aged ten years, were sick in bed, and my youngest sister had died two months before, aged seven years... Nancy, the oldest, was the only one well enough to wait upon them. To make matters worse, they had nothing whatever for sick people to eat or for medicine. Dozens of neighbors had died with scurvy and blackleg, because of no vegetables or decent food. 61

It is argued, therefore, that the sexton records are late stating, incomplete, and inaccurate. A more believable figure of total deaths on the west side between June 1846 and May 1847 is at least 400, a death rate of better than one in ten. William Appleby admitted that by the late fall of 1847 well over that number had died at Winter Quarters with "many" other deaths, as Brigham said, "in all places where [sic] we have stopped [sic]." 62

But these 400 were only on the west side! Evidence abounds that among the estimated 3,000 on the immediate east banks and in settlements at the Nishnabotona and west of Mt. Pisgah, sickness was equally prevalent. 63 Brigham said that considerably more sickness prevailed on the east than on the west side. 64 As early as August Wilford Woodruff reported
forty or fifty wagons at Council Point containing "many sick" and afflicted. A burial ground was finally laid out on the Pottawattamie side near a bluff top not far from the Blockhouse, but unfortunately no sexton records have survived. Based on the estimated east side populations and the death rate of the west side, at least 150 died on the Iowa side during the first year. Meanwhile twenty-three died during the winter at George Miller's Ponca settlement to the north.

Therefore, as estimated in figure #7.3, a minimum of 723 died between June 1846 and May 1847 at Winter Quarters, Cutler's Park, Cold Springs, the Ponca Settlement, on the east banks, and in all the settlements as far east on Garden Grove. Based on the lower number of counted deaths at Winter Quarters the following year and with all estimates revised downward in the same ratio, over 1,000 died among the camps during the two years.

From the information available, infants and young children suffered most. Of the 385 recorded deaths on the west bank, 166 or 46% were of infants two years and under. Over 53% of all recorded deaths were children nine years old and under. This proportion is not particularly unusual for the time and while child deaths were of infinite disappointment to the families, they were not entirely unexpected. Back in Nauvoo children under ten had accounted for 59% of all deaths in 1843 and 52% in 1844.

More women died because roughly twice as many women than men were living in the camps. This can be partly
FIGURE #7.3

ESTIMATED NUMBER OF DEATHS AMONG MORMON SETTLEMENTS*

1846 to 1848

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Settlements</th>
<th>June/46 - May/47</th>
<th>June/47 - May/48</th>
<th>TOTALS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Winter Quarters, Cutler's Park, and Cold Springs</td>
<td>400 (248 count)</td>
<td>150 (113 count)</td>
<td>550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miller's Hollow, Trading Post, and other Iowa Settlements west of Garden Grove</td>
<td>150 (est.)</td>
<td>70 (est.)</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mt. Pisgah</td>
<td>80 (50 count)</td>
<td>35 (est.)</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Garden Grove</td>
<td>70 (est.)</td>
<td>25 (est.)</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ponca</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTALS**                                          | **723**          | **280**          | **1,003** |

*Sources: Cutler's Park and Winter Quarters Cemetery records; Journal History; Mt. Pisgah Historical Record; various private journals.
FIGURE #7.4
DEATH BREAKDOWN BY AGE*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Combined</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-12 Months</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-2</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-9</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-19</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-29</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-39</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-59</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60-69</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70-79</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80-90</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Given</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>208</td>
<td>385</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Sources: Cutler's Park and Winter Quarters Cemetery records; Mt. Pisgah Historical Record; various private journals. Only recorded deaths.
explained by the absence of many men temporarily away in Missouri settlements and of 500 others in the Battalion. Although only three women were reported as having died in childbirth, several others likely perished from maternity complications but which were diagnosed as chills or fever. (See Figure 7.4).

While the proportion of infant mortality was not unusual, the total number of deaths for that time frame was much higher than normal. On the west bank or Nebraska side alone, 400 deaths presented an alarming 1846/47 death rate of one in ten. Including all the Mormon settlements and an estimated 723 deaths out of a population of 8,750, they were perishing at a ratio of one in twelve or 82.5/thousand. In comparison, Nauvoo's estimated death rate for 1843 was 32.1/thousand and in 1844, 24.8/thousand. In 1849, during the cholera epidemic in St. Louis, a disease that did not affect the Mormons until 1849 (and then only sparingly), an estimated 4,285 out of a population of over 50,000 died, another one in twelve ratio. That tragedy influenced President Zachery Taylor to proclaim a day of nation-wide fasting and prayer.

From the available statistics, the hard and soft counts, real and estimated, and from a careful study of contemporary accounts, disease and death were omnipresent, exacting a vicious toll on almost every family. In October and November 1846, Henry L. Uttley (7), Jacob Uttley (9), James S. Uttley (14), Sarah E. Uttley (16), and mother Maria Uttley (34) all had died victims of measles, dropsy, or
canker. During a six week period in late 1846 and early 1847, Stillman Pond lost three daughters and one son to the chills and fevers. Come May his wife, Almira, also passed away.72

How They Responded - Medically

The medical response to their condition may have been as much a contributor as a deterrent to sickness. By modern medical standards, treatment barely fit the malady. While medical orthodoxy of the day called for bleeding and purging, the Mormons relied more on "poison doctors", the "Thompsonian" school of medical attention which specialized in herbal medicines and in abstaining from "the five deadly sins - tea, coffee, alcohol, tobacco and opium." Willard Richards was just such a doctor and the level of his medical knowledge amounted to dispensing herbal remedies. Dr. Samuel L. Sprague and a Dr. Cannon also in camp were likely of the same persuasion. Apparently their principal physician had departed with the Battalion since they thought he would be most needed there.73

Virtually every prescription for recovery was herbal in nature. Though not slavishly tied to herbal remedies, many Mormons believed that God had given herbs to men to be used to treat the sick. "All wholesome herbs God hath ordained for the constitution, nature, and use of man" proclaimed one of Joseph Smith's revelations.74 Willard Richards, in writing to the Battalion, warned them to "let surgeons medicine alone" and to rely on herbs and mild foods.75 When
Dr. Sprague travelled to St. Louis in late October with $55 to buy medicines, he purchased mainly botanic medicines and herbal ointments such as lobelia, (a wild Indian tobacco), quinine, calomel, and saleratus. Brigham advised a would-be store keeper from Missouri that "in general the botanic medicines will be the most called for." Some people, including "a Sister Lane a quite a notable doctoress," claimed to have discovered or concocted various herbal remedies and acted as an amateur physician. Others obtained remedies from the Indians.

Joseph G. Hovey was just one of hundreds who treated a loved one with "herbs and mild foods" only to see her expire despite his efforts. "My wife could not take any food, only a little water," he recalled. "For nine days she took but very little of anything. After considerable persuasion I got her to take an amerrick of Lobelia and this helped her. She said the ice water tasted good." The following night she "took a death of cold," fell unconscious, and died.

Contributing to the ineffectiveness and scarcity of their medicines were the lack of hospitals, rest centers, nursing care, and other facilities modern American society expects. Doctors made rounds reporting weekly to the High Council on the numbers of sick and dying and bishops kept a current tabulation on the health of their ward membership, but no central nursing station or accommodation was ever constructed. Some women hired themselves out as nurses and mid-wives but more often gave of their service gratuitously. Had they not been aware of a green, leafy,
high-protein diet as an antidote to scurvy, their death toll would have been far greater. They also knew that fresh fish was a good preventative. "We hauled in many loads of choice fish fresh from the water," John Pulsipher wrote, "which was a great blessing to the suffering poor — and the best medicine to cure the scurvy that we could get." Leaders also counselled "those living in dugouts to get a house on the top of the ground to live during the [coming] summer, or they would be sick." It was generally assumed that damp, dank, and otherwise inadequate shelter during the winter particularly had contributed to their sickly state.

How They Responded — Politically

Ironically, for all their suffering, Church leaders claimed the Winter Quarters climate healthier than Nauvoo's maintaining that as they neared the mountains and increased in altitude, the air was purifying. "All the body of Nauvoo," said Willard Richards, "was a slough where this people have been filled with disease." Apostle Ezra Taft Benson agreed blaming "the greater portion of their diseases was inhaled into their systems before they came to this place." All their colds, agues, fevers, and other afflictions were residuals of "an unhealthy atmosphere" at Nauvoo and elsewhere, "but I do not think this [Winter Quarters] an unhealthy location." To have concluded any differently would have questioned the inspiration they were following.
Brigham, in almost all his public statements and letters, acted as if their health was perfectly normal. "We recommend the fresh air of [the] Missouri hills and a fresh draught of the River Water," he wrote in one letter. "It is a good preventative for constant agues." In another letter to the trustees he referred to "some sickness" in camp, but "not so severe as was usual in Nauvoo." By mid-fall he was reporting "the brethren in good health," that Winter Quarters was "a good place to winter" and "the health of the camp improving." And in a letter to Sam Brannan, Mormon leader in California, he described passing the winter of 1846-47 "as comfortable as possible" with "no more sickness than might very reasonably be expected."

Why he was masking their true situation is not difficult to understand. Nothing must interfere with the gathering. He wanted all behind to assemble themselves and prepare for the impending trek the following spring. To admit to decimating sickness was politically unwise and unacceptable especially since James J. Strang and other contenders would use their plight as an argument against the "Brighamites".

And Strang indeed did try to make mileage out of it. Appearing in the Strangite press were decidedly unfavorable articles on the Mormons at Council Bluffs, such as the following example:

We have taken some pains to ascertain the health of the western camp, and finally succeeded in getting the sexton's account of the burials at Council Bluffs. Don't stare, reader...
The sexton's accounts show eight hundred deaths at the Bluffs in one year from April 1847 to April 1848. We could not ascertain the number the preceding year, but those who have visited the ground say the burials cover more than twice the space, and it is universally agreed that the former year was far the most sickly.

The article concluded by arguing that one in five had died. 89

It was just this kind of information Brigham feared would scare off would-be immigrants both back east and in England. If, then, the anti-Mormons felt justified in exaggerating the crisis, he would do the opposite.

While minimizing publicly their setbacks, most leaders privately admitted their plight. Apostle Parley P. Pratt, returning from his mission to England, found his family suffering from cold, hunger, and sickness. "One of the family was then lying very sick with the scurvy, a disease which had been very prevalent in camp during the winter, and of which may had died." 90 Writing to Joseph Stratton, President of the St. Louis Branch, Brigham admitted, "There is some sickness at this place, but no more than might be anticipated in the fulfillment of the prophecy 'They shall wear out the saints of the most high' when we contemplate labors and toils of the camp the past year and the many exposures they have been subject to." 91

In a letter to Kane in December 1847, Brigham blamed their ill health on over-work and poor climate. "Our brethren have been diligent; many of them too diligent," he remarked, and "labors have been so excessive as to produce
sickness; many more have been sick from the influence of the climate and many have died." In that same pleading letter, Brigham compared their sufferings to the recent Irish famines and urged Kane "to rouse the sympathy of the American people" and obtain donations "for the benefit of our camp" lest they "perish by cold, by sickness, and all the calamities incident to the wilderness and savage country."92

John D. Lee, in a journal entry for early March 1847, gave a clear indication of how pervasive and depressing their sickening state really was. "Aggatha [Ann] is rather better of her illness but Louisa is worse and I myself am almost down. This certainly is [a] time of deep affliction and sore lamentation with this people, for daily more or less of them are consigned to the tomb."93 It was in a private letter to Orson Spencer in England, and then not until January 1848, that Brigham finally confessed that the "disease and sickness have been a heavy tax on the saints."94

How They Responded - Doctrinally

The agony of disease, the embarrassment, the discomfort, the waking up to die, the unmarked graves - it all must have seemed that God was punishing the wrong people. Washington they could deal with; Missouri they could defend against; but how do they cope with Israel's angel of death? 'Why bring us this far only to be orphaned and abandoned on the borders of nowhere?' William Clayton
may have called his city block at Winter Quarters "Cape Disappointment" because of the sickness he and so many others were experiencing there.  

Perhaps the first response made to serious sickness was requesting a priesthood blessing. Clayton, deathly sick of a fever, called upon priesthood leaders to administer to him for the restoration of his health. "The brethren all laid hands on me and rebuked my disease in the name of the Lord, President Young being mouth. I immediately felt easier and slept well all night."

Baptizing the sick was also practised. Not to be confused with baptism into Church membership, baptism of the sick was performed to cleanse the physical body of the illnesses of the flesh. Many at Winter Quarters, Mt. Pisgah, and in all the Mormon settlements were immersed in water for the recovery of their health.

Women also gave blessings of health and comfort. Louisa Barnes Pratt, having arrived at Winter Quarters in great distress, recalls how the women "thronged" about her wagon. "The sisters were moved with sympathy: they assembled at my tent, prayed, anointed me with oil, and laid hands upon me. Although I was not wholly restored, I was comforted."

Throughout the months ahead many women, including Patty Sessions, "visited sick in several places anointing and laying hands" on those in need, particularly to pregnant women and those suffering from female disorders.
Their religion also offered several explanations for their trials varying according to the time and circumstance. A favored response was in paralleling modern with ancient Israel. As God once chastened and purified the Israelites in their exodus from Egypt, even so would He reprove His people once again. If they were sick, the Lord was both punishing them for their waywardness while purifying them for His purposes. They must become a tried and tested people.

Blaming disobedience for their discomfort, Brigham felt they would continue to be "subject to sickness and disease and death until they learned to be passive and let council dictate their course." But suffering could be as much a blessing as a punishment. "All of this pain, sorrow, death and affliction," said Brigham on one occasion "is for a wise purpose in God" to give them "their exaltation and glory in the Eternal world."

While death was so common, spokesmen guarded against any tendency to hope for it as an easy way out. It was not something to give in to. "He gave warning against wishing ourselves dead," said one of Heber C. Kimball, "for the sake of getting out of trouble and . . . into heaven as we ourselves have to create our heavenly happiness by our conduct." Life was a divine gift, to be lived purposefully. Taking one's own life was the cowardly, criminal way out.
They had the hardest time coping with infant mortality. In one of his few recorded funeral sermons at Winter Quarters, Brigham, speaking at the funeral of a two-year old girl, gave several explanations delving into the operations of the world of spirits and how they affected physical health. "Some times we lay hands upon the sick and they are healed instantly," he said. "Other times with all the faith and medicine they are a long time getting well; others die." Devils, he said, though not able to destroy the spirit, were striving to obtain mortal tabernacles and were responsible, in part, for some deaths, especially infants. "Some children are killed in this way," he said, "for the devil is making war with everything that has a tabernacle especially the saints."104 It was an explanation seldom employed, but reflected a genuine conviction that the Indian wilderness they frequented "was the slaughter ground of the ancient Nephites and Lamanites and the spirit of Devils are hovering around it and if you are not on your guard they will enter you and lead you captive at their will."105

These religious responses were not always sufficient, and many refused consolation. One woman whose brother, James A. Scott, had died among the Mormon Battalion sick at Pueblo, demanded "why has he fallen, and . . . in the path of duty, under the direction of the church, fallen contrary to his faith and expectations[?] I repeat why oh why has he fallen[?]"106 Others must have begged the same question.
The story of sickness and death at Winter Quarters will always be of interest to the Latter-day Saints. Some have promoted it merely for faith-strengthening purposes. Most of these have conveniently omitted discussing the separations and disaffections caused by their tribulations. Certain it was, as discussed hereafter, that these afflictions contributed to camp apostasies.107

Others have purposely de-emphasized the scale of suffering in efforts to focus on more positive episodes. While their intent may be understandable, they have neglected data which documents distress among all the Missouri River encampments on a much larger scale than previously believed.

Finally, whether these doctrines and practices were able to comfort and retain them throughout their tribulation is impossible to prove convincingly. But like any other believing people, most did not easily surrender. Sounded Brigham,

We are willing to take our full share of trouble, trials, losses and crosses, hardships and fatigues, warning and watching, for the kingdom of heaven's sake; and we feel to say; Come, calm or strife, turmoil or peace, life or death, in the name of Israel's God we mean to conquer or die trying.108
FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER SEVEN

1 Hymns - The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1973), Hymn #13. For an adequate summary of the history of this popular song see Paul E. Dahl, "'All is Well . . .' : The Story of 'the Hymn That Went around the world." Brigham Young University Studies 21 (Fall 1981): 491-514.

2 Journal History, 3 August 1846.

3 "A History of William Huntington," 26 July 1846. Ague was defined loosely as an acute or violent malarial fever characterized by fits or paroxysms consisting of a burning fever followed by severe cold and shivering.

4 Journal of Lorenzo Snow, Summer 1846.

5 Charles C. Rich to Brigham Young, 11 August 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

6 Journal of Charles R. Dana, volume 3, Fall 1846, LDS Church Archives. Incomplete death records kept at Mt. Pisgah give the names of seventeen people who died between May 31 and September 17 alone. It is obviously incomplete, not even including William Huntington, but provides an incontestable basis for approximating the degree of suffering at the upper farm. Mt. Pisgah Historical Record, LDS Church Archives.

7 Journal of Nelson W. Whipple, Summer 1846.

8 Journal History, 29 March 1847.


10 Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 12 August 1846.

11 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 17-21 November 1846. Appleton Milo Harmon echoed the sentiments of both Kimball and Woodruff.

"The past winter in fact the past twelve months has been as trieing [sic] a scene for the Saints as they ever had to pass through. Sickness death loss of cattle and teams poverty in all most [sic] every shape. Exiles in a Christian land."

12 Kane, "The Mormons", p. 94.
13 Ibid., p. 92. Since the first recorded death by scurvy was not reported until February, one wonders if Kane, who left the preceding fall, really did see such scenes on the scale he indicated.
15 Journal of Erastus Snow, April/May 1846, LDS Church Archives.
16 Diary of John Pulsipher, approximately January 1847, p. 15.
17 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 17-21 November 1846.
18 Journal of Eliza Maria Partridge Lyman, 14 July 1846.
19 See Chapter Four.
21 Linn, The Story of the Mormons, p. 376.
22 Todd, Early Settlement and Growth of Western Iowa, p. 98.
23 Wincher, Diary of Thomas L. Kane, p. 13.
24 Todd, Early Settlement and Growth of Western Iowa, p. 95. Norma Kidd Green, a student of frontier river settlements, has written the following:
   "Malaria was ever present along the westward moving frontier where settlements were always on the water front. Heavy rains and flooding brought stagnant ponds and produced swampy land, perfect breeding places for mosquitoes. That ubiquitous insect was not just suspected of a connection with the 'shakes' or 'ague,' but this illness had become associated with low lying ground."
25 See Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 7 October 1846; and Brigham Young to Charles C. Rich, 7 January 1847, Brigham Young Papers. Deaths in the following year, though a third of the 1846/47 count, were again much more common in the summer than in the winter, another possible proof that malaria and other similar communicable diseases and disorders were greater summer killers than all other causes.

27 Ibid. See also Journal History, 18 March 1847.

28 See Journal History, 24 August 1846; and Diary of Hosea Stout, 24 and 30 July 1846, 1:181; also Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 18 June 1846; and Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 5-7 October 1846.


30 Journals of John D. Lee, 28 February 1847, pp.104-5.

31 Diary of John Pulsipher, p.13.

32 "Incidents in the Life of Mary Helen Grant," Journal of History 10 (April 1917):177.

33 Journal of Isaac Haight, 16 September 1846.

34 Helen Whitney, Woman's Exponent 14 (1885-86):78.


36 Linn, Story of the Mormons, p.376.

37 Morton, History of Nebraska, p.127.

38 Aitchison, "Mormon Settlements," p.281. Aitchison blamed scurvy for destroying 1/9 of the local Indian populations the year before, a conclusion not borne out by correspondence from Indian agents.


40 Arrington and Bitton, The Mormon Experience, p.98.

41 Gail G. Holmes, "Reflections on Winter Quarters," p.3.

42 This estimate is derived from most of the camp journals, the Journal History, and correspondence of the time. See particularly helpful records such as the Journal of Patty Sessions, LDS Church Archives, 17 and 18 March, 3 and 9 May 1847; and the Horace K. Whitney Journal.

43 Charles C. Rich to Brigham Young, 3 October 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

44 Journal of Nelson W. Whipple, Summer 1846.
See the Andrew Jenson's compilation, Manuscript History of Cutler's Park and of Winter Quarters, LDS Church Archives. There were at least four sextons, Levi Stewart, William Huntington, a Brother Wallace, and Benjamin R. Laub. Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 8 November 1846, 16 January, and 25 April 1847.

The Mormons had at least two, possibly three burial grounds on the west side of the Missouri. Their first was "the mound" or Cutler's Park cemetery, two-and-a-half miles west of Winter Quarters (likely near the present day "Potter Field"). The second was the Winter Quarters cemetery "east of the Mound" and "on the hill west of Winter Quarters." Burials began in the Winter Quarters cemetery 15 September, a week before people began moving onto the site. See Journal History, 15 September 1846; and Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 15 September 1846.

The action taken in mid November "to lay out a new burying ground on the second bluff west of Winter Quarters" seems to indicate that they moved the first Winter Quarters cemetery higher up the bluff. See Journal History, 16 November 1846. Two contemporary observers pinpointed the cemetery "just back of Winter Quarters," southwest of the city, "on the right hand side of the road going to Cutler's Park." See Diary of Appleton Milo Harmon, Winter 1846-47, p.9; and Journal of Joseph G. Hovey, 21 June 1847, p.40.

This sexton record is amplified with the author's inclusion of almost thirty deaths listed in various private journals but not recorded in the sexton's reports.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 8 November 1846.

Ibid., 21 March 1847.

Ibid., 16 January 1847. Basswood or walnut were the popular choices.

Appleton Harmon, however, records that both his mother and sister died in January 1847 and were buried in the Winter Quarters cemetery even though the ground was frozen three feet deep. Diary of Appleton Milo Harmon, Winter 1846-47,p.9.

Mt. Pisgah Historical Record.

See Journal History, 17 August 1846; and Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 20 August 1846.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 13 August 1846.

By 20 August, 1846, Heber C. Kimball was already aware of several deaths.
56 Journals of John D. Lee, 28 February 1847, pp.104-5.
58 Diary of John Pulsipher, p.13.
60 Journals of John D. Lee, 6 March 1847, p.110.
62 See Journal of William Appleby, 9 December 1847; and Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 23 February 1848.
63 See Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 24 August 1846; and Journal of Warren Foote, 2 and 10 November 1846, and 26 March 1847.
64 Journal History, 1 August 1846.
65 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 22 August 1846.
66 Journal of Warren Foote, April 1849. This may have been on or near the present site of Fairview Cemetery in Council Bluffs. Others who died on the east side may have been buried near settlers' homes or on recently acquired private property. See Journal of Nelson W. Whipple, "Spring of 1848."
67 Russell Rich, Ensign to the Nations, p.83. These twenty-three deaths, out of a population of 396, occurred within a nine month period.
68 Matthew Thomas, "Disease in a Mormon Community," p.32.
69 See Figure 5:1.
70 Thomas, "Disease," p.32. These are conservative estimates. The Nauvoo death ratios were probably based on the calendar year whereas the figure determined at the Missouri was from June until May.
72 Jenson, "List of Burials," Manuscript History of Cutler's Park, LDS Church Archives.
Winther, The Diary of Thomas L. Kane, p.22.

Doctrine and Covenants 89:10.  As early as 1834 members were taught that roots and herbs should be "applied to the sick in order that they may receive health." Donald Q. Cannon and Lyndon W. Cook, eds., Far West Record — Minutes of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1830-1844 (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1983), pp.96-97.

Journal History, 19 August 1846.

Ibid., 21 October 1846.

Ibid., 25 March 1847.

Journal of Warren Foote, 24 February 1847.

Journal of Joseph G. Hovey, 14-15 September 1846.

Journal History, 14 August 1846 and 12 January 1847.

The Diary of John Pulsipher, Summer 1847, p.13.  The best fishing holes were in small lakes several miles north of Winter Quarters.  Ice fishing was little practised, if at all.

Journal History, 26 March 1847.  Apparently few lived in the dugouts the following winter and fewer still in exposed wagons.

Minutes of a Meeting of some of the Twelve, 6 March 1847, Brigham Young Papers.


Brigham Young to W. W. Phelps, 7 September 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Journal History, 25 August 1846.

Brigham Young to the Nauvoo Trustees, 27 September 1846.

Journal History, 6 June 1847.

The Gospel Herald, 29 June 1848, p.2.

Parley P. Pratt, Autobiography, p.357.

Journal History, 6 February 1847.

Ibid., 6 December 1847.  Though Brigham was over dramatizing slightly in order to create sympathy, he had every reason to paint a less than rosey scene.
Journals of John D. Lee, 8 March 1847, p.113.

Journal History, 23 January 1848.


Ibid., 22 August 1846, p.62.

Journal of Leonora Cannon, 17 September 1846. One wonders how wise it was to perform such a rite on those suffering with chills, fever, and pneumonia. The practice is no longer current in the Church.

Louisa Barnes Pratt diary, Heart Throbs of the West, 26 September 1846, p.241.

Journal of Patty Sessions, 9 and 18 May, 1847. Occasionally both husband and wife administered together. See Sessions, 1 April 1847. For more on women and their activities, see Chapter Nine.

Doctrine and Covenants, 136:22.

Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 21 March 1847.

Ibid., 23 February 1848. "The sectarian world," Brigham said," with the knowledge they have would if it was in their power sweep the fall of man, death, pain, sorrow and affliction with all their attendant evils into oblivion and caused man to have lived externally as he was before the fall . . . but such a cause would in the end have been the greatest curse that could have been heaped upon man."

Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 9 August 1846.

Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 23 February 1848. It would be a mistake, however, to conclude that they saw the devil as the root cause of all illness and death. Disease was a natural part of living and death was ultimately in the hands of Providence. Far West Record, p.97.

Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 15 December 1846. Nephites and Lamanites were ancient American people in Book of Mormon history that continually warred against each other. Ultimately the Lamanites exterminated their foes and, according to belief, became the ancestors of the American Indian.

Margaret Scott to Brigham Young, 17 September 1848, Brigham Young Papers.

See Chapter Ten.

Journal History, 16 April 1847.
CHAPTER EIGHT

FROM WEST TO EAST
LOCATING A NEW ZION, ABANDONING WINTER QUARTERS,
AND RETREATING TO IOWA

While most Mormon histories have hurried to get the Saints out of Winter Quarters, over the trails, and to their mountain Zion in the West, few, if any, have focused on the life and activities of the great majority left behind. It is an unfortunate omission. The overwhelming interest has centered on a comparatively small cluster of vanguard settlers who spent their first year in the Salt Lake Valley. Almost totally forgotten are the several thousands back at the Bluffs.

Equally inexplicable are the omissions of the extensive, behind-the-scenes deliberations at Winter Quarters during the winter of 1846-47 which culminated in the April 1847 pioneer exodus. Much pertaining to that trek such as who should go, what rivers to follow, the plausibility of a way station east of the mountains, their ultimate destination, and who should be in charge were all finally decided at the Missouri. In consideration of these blind spots, this chapter will focus on the following three related topics: 1) planning for the overland migrations to the Great Basin and embarking upon that journey; 2) life at Winter Quarters during the summer and fall; and 3) the
return of the advanced camp in the fall of 1847 with the
subsequent preparations to move east, back
across the river.

**Planning for the Exodus Westward**

While building their cabin city, hassling with Indians,
sparring with agents, eking out a living, and coping with
sickness and disease, Church authorities analysed and
reanalysed their departure plans. These planning councils
were essentially extensions of their earlier Nauvoo
deliberations, but their stay at the Missouri provided time
to restock their supplies, rethink their plans, confer with
"gentile" traders, trappers, and missionaries who knew the
West first-hand, obtain the most reliable maps, and
formulate a more deliberate, fool-proof plan of action. Yet
despite these advantages, many details of their impending
march and eventual destination were not finalized until the
very eve of their exodus. And if Brigham knew precisely
where he was going when he and the advanced party finally
left in April 1847, it was the best kept secret in camp.

Besides Peter Sarpy, who told all he knew of the
prairie and mountain west, Brigham and the Twelve conferred
at length with Father De Smet who visited the settlements
19 November 1846.1 "They asked me a thousand questions
about the regions I had explored," De Smet later reported,
"and the spot which I have just described to you [the Great Basin] pleased them greatly from the account I gave them of
it."2
Their destination remained the same as a year before, i.e., some secluded valley in either the Great Basin or Bear River country. In all the official correspondence coming out of Winter Quarters between August 1846 and April 1847, their references to an ultimate destination were consistent but guarded. In August 1846 Brigham told Colonel Kane "they were intending to settle in the Great Basin or Bear River valley."\(^3\) John D. Lee, privy to most of their private discussions reported they had definitely ruled out California "but intend settling [sic] the grater [sic] part of our people in the great Basin between the Mountains near the Bear River Valley."\(^4\) A letter to President Polk plainly targeted "the Great Salt Lake or Bear River Valley".\(^5\) In September Brigham again spoke of Bear River, the Great Basin, or some other favorable valley.\(^6\) And five months later, camp historian Willard Richards repeated their intent. "We have not changed our views relative to a location. . . . It must be somewhere in the Great Basin, we have no doubt."\(^7\)

But if their target remained consistent, the complex plans of getting there evolved through at least three subtly distinguishable stages of development. In constant debate were such matters as the time of departure, the number of men, the route, the need for another farm, regulating authority, and camp organization. Not where but how became the divisive issue.
a) The September-November Preliminary Plan

The essentials of their first plan were to send "over" the mountains to the Great Basin or Bear River Valley a substantial number of able-bodied men, plant extensive crops, erect substantial improvements and facilities, and a year or two later return and bring on as many of the Missouri River encampments as possible. Central to the operation was completing the Winter Quarters mill well enough in advance to provide abundant seed, departing early in the spring, and gaining the full cooperation from families both to surrender their sons and husbands and then to remain a year or two longer at the Missouri.

The proposed company was variously described as "a portion of our effective men,"\textsuperscript{8} a "few hundred men",\textsuperscript{9} and "all the able bodied brethren who possibly can".\textsuperscript{10} These were to consist of carpenters, millwrights, fence-builders, and experienced farmers who, after reaching their destination, would lay out a city, select a temple lot, sow large acreages, build permanent living quarters, erect mills, and in every possible way "prepare something tangible for our families and the Saints when they follow after."\textsuperscript{11} The plan demanded that the advanced company winter in the West. In short, they were envisioning a large work party of several hundred men who would accomplish far more than merely locate a site.

Critical to the plan was reaching their destination in sufficient time to plant abundant summer crops and build
extensively before winter. They predicted reaching their chosen valley in a minimum of "six weeks," certainly no later than 1 June 1847.12 To make it they would have to leave "at the earliest moment,"13 "say one month before grass grows,"14 or as finally defined, "by the first of March."15 Without families and excessive paraphernalia, they could "expedite their passage," leave early, and travel quickly, a lesson Iowa had taught them the hard way. Following the route of the pathfinder, John C. Fremont, they would travel up the North Platte to Fort Laramie, along the Springwater, and through the South Pass.

Meanwhile their families would remain at the Bluffs "or up and down the river and back in Iowa" if forced to vacate Winter Quarters, "one or two years"16 and then come en masse in "the spring of 1848."17 Bringing on large numbers of families before reaping sustaining harvests out west was potentially disastrous. Realizing the perennial objections of those left behind, Brigham argued that "a year's comfortable situation in any civilized community for women and children is far preferable to a year or two's risque [sic] of starvation in the wilderness."18 Once their new settlement was secured, crops sowed, and adequate shelter provided, "then they will come to us, or we can come and bring them."19

Finally, in a move to lessen family fears and bolster faith in his leadership, Brigham called a special meeting in mid November. Among other statements of assurance, he related a dream he had "concerning the Rocky Mountains" and
promised that all "should go in safety over the mountains, notwithstanding all the opposition and obstacles government officials and others might interpose."\textsuperscript{20}

b) The Council of 50's December Plan

But the "general council" or Council of Fifty had other ideas, dreams or no dreams.\textsuperscript{21} The Council of Fifty had been instrumental earlier in the closing days before the departure from Nauvoo in planning the trek west. As an advisory arm to Church leaders, its voice was important. In a series of meetings in November and December, the Council of Fifty, reconvening officially for the first time since Nauvoo days, met to discuss "the organization of the camp of Israel and our contemplated journey."\textsuperscript{22} The most important meetings were held in December. George Miller and James Emmett travelled down from the Ponca settlement on Christmas eve day to attend. The Council of Fifty assembled the following day, Christmas, at Richards' octagon, starting at 4 p.m. Its deliberations lasted till ten that night, from 10 a.m. until 9 p.m. the following day, and concluded late in the afternoon of Sunday, 27 December 1846.\textsuperscript{23} Significantly, Brigham and Willard Richards were ill at the time and attended only intermittently. George Miller later indicated that his ideas were not "wholly overlooked in their deliberations."\textsuperscript{24} What resulted from the Council of Fifty was a plan of action that superseded the preliminary proposal of just a few weeks earlier.
Central to its approach was the establishment of a large farm or way station, like Mt. Pisgah or Garden Grove, in an isolated setting in Yellowstone country north of Fort Laramie. By planting spring crops at the "foot" rather than "over" the mountains, they would choose the safer alternative rather than risk all on an over-the-mountain dash. Fewer men would be required since few large facilities were envisioned and only planting required at this temporary site, while more could come on after spring. If successful at the Yellowstone, a small band might later go over the mountains, find the right valley, and at least make a tiny foothold and plant some fall crops. If successful on both counts, the bulk of the Church could be brought out in the spring of 1848 as per their original consultations. This second plan, more cautious than the first, was in part a scheduling change, a guarantee for essential wilderness crops in the summer and fall of 1847. The end result, however, should be the same. Prompting the revision was the advice trappers were offering, the 300 pounds of flour per man required, the failure of the mill to begin operating in time to supply the pioneers with sufficient seed grain, and a feeling that a way station further west would be a safe bet.

Much of the plan apparently stemmed from George Miller. Miller and Emmett, from their conversations with local Indians and explorations up the Running Water River, were convinced that the spring expedition should travel west up the Running Water rather than the more southerly route along
the North Platte. Writing as early as October, Miller argued that his route was "the nearest and best route [sic] to the pass in the mountains" and that it was "a level road all the way to Fort Laramie [sic]." Miller sent Emmett and Butler to explore the river and upon their return in December reported it as a "good route."

Then, in late November, Justin Grosclaude and a Mr. Cardinal strongly endorsed Miller's proposed route. Grosclaude, a trader for the American Fur Company, and Cardinal, an expert hunter and trapper, claimed a knowledge of most of the Indian languages and all the best trails to and over the Rockies. They spoke favorably of at least a summer way station in the Yellowstone country near the forks of Tongue River "just five or six days above Fort Laramie," in present southeastern Montana. The two men, according to Horace K. Whitney, had settled in the area of "the Salt Lakes" for sixteen years. "They narrated [and] gave an account of the climate, etc. which was quite interesting indeed." They offered "to pilot the camp over the mountains" the following spring for $400. A noncommittal but interested Brigham listened carefully to their recommendations of establishing a summer farming station in the Tongue River area as he himself had tentatively introduced the idea some weeks previously. As one of the clerks recorded, "Mr. 'G.' gave an interesting account of the sources of the Yellowstone and sketched with pencil a
map of the country west of the Missouri and north of Puncah above the Yellow Stone." Because of his conversations with the two men, Brigham gave more serious consideration to Miller's Running Water-Tongue River Plan. "The thought occurred to us," he said in a letter to Bishop Miller, "that perhaps Brothers Emmett and Butler might like to explore that country [Yellowstone] this winter to see if there was a chance for a good location or any other speculation in that vicinity and become familiar with routes." Though Brigham was never overly enthusiastic about the Yellowstone proposal, before long Grosclaude's suggestions had become their concrete plans.

By mid-December, after the November round of Council of Fifty meetings, letters were dispatched describing "the route to our next intended location on the head waters of the Yellow Stone River." At a Sunday public meeting in Winter Quarters two days after Christmas and immediately after the December meetings of the Council of Fifty, apostle Orson Pratt validated the way-station plan explaining their intention to

send out a pioneer company to get to the head waters of the Running Water by the time grass comes or before and be ready to go over the Black Hills [of present-day eastern Wyoming] and put in a crop of corn somewhere on this side of the mountains near the head of the Yellow Stone. He was followed by Woodruff and Benson approving of his views on the subject. 

Brigham indicated that after conferring with George Miller and others at Christmas time, the Council of Fifty decided
to send ahead 200 or 300 men "as early as circumstances
would possibly permit" to the Yellowstone river "perhaps at
the Fork of Tongue River," and prepare a large summer crop
for "some thousand or two of the saints, who should follow
after them as soon as grazing would permit." All who did
not go to the Yellowstone in either of the first two parties
would "remain at this place and raise crops preparatory for
emigration the following Spring."34

c) The Quorum of the Twelve's Plan

Yet despite his tentative agreement and the words of
support given the Yellowstone plan by various members of the
Twelve, Brigham never warmed up to it. After receiving more
information and considering all the geographical and
administrative matters concerned, he tendered a revision of
the original plan, only this time with the weight of divine
approval behind it. Involved were far more than routes,
rivers, and way stations; rather, the matter had become an
issue of leadership and authority.

He developed several objections. First of all, he
didn't like the direction the Yellowstone plan would take
them. He saw in it a repeat of Miller's Ponca settlement -
off the main line and north by hundreds of miles from where
they were intending to go. Why risk living among other
potentially hostile Sioux and Mandan Indian tribes for
another winter? Why chance unnecessarily an uncertain crop
in an unknown area away from trading posts and settlements?
In short, why delay at all? Better to take the risks of
getting over the mountains than to mire in the swamps of the Yellowstone.

Second, he didn't like what he was hearing about the Yellowstone. He gradually concluded that Grosclaude and Cardinal were influencing Miller and others the same way the Ponca Indians had done earlier and possibly for their own advantage. Joseph Holbrook, after returning from his explorations with Emmett west, told Brigham that while the Running Water was a fairly direct route, the feed along the way was "entirely eat out" by large buffalo herds. More seriously, the Sioux Indians "expressed an unwillingness for us to pass through their country and make a large road as it would serve to drive off their Buffalo and other game." The Ponca, confided Holbrook, "expressed the same opinions as the Sioux." 35 If the war-like Sioux were concerned about a tiny exploration party, how would they react to large caravans? Besides, the Sioux were already serious enough hazards to the settlements at the Missouri. To aggravate them further would be risking the lives of overlanders as well as weakly defended settlers back at Winter Quarters.

What Logan Fontenelle described was equally unsettling. Fontenelle, it will be remembered, was the interpreter to the Omaha Indians and a frequent visitor to Winter Quarters. A half-breed son of the mountain man Lucien B. Fontenelle, he possessed extensive knowledge of the far west. Fontenelle disagreed with Grosclaude and thought the Yellowstone plan unwise. "The soil about Tongue River is red and yellow clay and you cannot raise crops on it" he
advised in mid-December. "From the Ponca to the Oregon trail is a broken country - between the divides are swamps - the Creeks that run into the Running Water are not miry, but it is a rough Country . . . up the Running Water you will see trouble and may break your wagons. I would not undertake to go up that River." Instead, Fontenelle strongly recommended they stick with their original plan to follow the North Platte, which he described as "a level prairie and good sound road to the Mountains." He also spoke encouragingly about the "best soil" south of the Salt Lake. 36

Another drawback to the Yellowstone plan was the increased hardship it would place on the Battalion. Brigham was keenly aware that after their discharge in the summer of 1847, many of the soldiers would be returning from the coast to their families. 37 He therefore wanted a large number of Battalion families in the proposed summer train of 1,000 or 2,000 so that as few soldiers as possible would have to travel all the way back to the Missouri. 38 They had already marched far enough and at his insistence. The Yellowstone scheme would add to the soldiers' march several more hundred miles than if the pioneers could reach the Basin directly. Enough criticisms had already been raised over the Battalion matter - why make it worse?

Third and most importantly, in addition to disliking the direction and the added input he was receiving about the Yellowstone plan, Brigham suspected the source from which it came. George Miller and his companion, James Emmett,
represented a disobedient, excessively independent spirit that had manifested itself before the exodus from Nauvoo, all across Iowa, at the Missouri, and most recently at the Ponca settlement. Their goals and perspectives were repeatedly at variance with his and the Twelve's. Miller and others of the Council of Fifty, Brigham believed, like Lyman Wight, were following the shadow of the deceased Joseph Smith, not the living Quorum of the Twelve, and were really not convinced that settling the Church in the Great Basin was of any merit. Even during the winter, Miller had disobeyed counsel by trading with Missouri without clearance and had steadfastly refused to pool his funds with Whitney's to buy at cheaper wholesale prices.

At a raucous meeting at Daniel Cahoon's cabin at Winter Quarters on 29 October, Miller railed against Brigham's policies and ambitions in the presence of Willard Richards. After their meeting had adjourned,

  Brigham appeared at the door and took up the subject. He had been without and heard all that was said. He handled the case very ruff [sic]. He said that Miller and Emmett had a delusive spirit and any one that would follow them would go to hell etc. that they would sacrifice this people to aggrandize themselves or to get power . . . and that he would not clean up after him any longer. He said that they would yet apostatize.

  Brigham wanted to dispel once and for all any doubt that the Quorum of the Twelve was in command. Several in and out of camp like Peter Haws, George Miller, Lyman Wight, Lucien Woodward, and others were clinging to the belief that the Council of Fifty was directing the migrations west and
held supreme authority at least over temporal and political matters. Miller, Hawes, Emmett, and Wight all felt they were equal trailblazers to Brigham as fellow members of the Council and would not willingly submit to his direction, particularly regarding secular affairs.

To take matters once and for all out of the hands of the Council of Fifty or any other similar group, and to scotch the already approved Yellowstone plan would require a forceful declaration. On 11 January 1847, Brigham told of another dream he had the night before of Joseph Smith and his mother Lucy Mack Smith and reported that he and Joseph "conversed freely about the best manner of organizing companies for emigration."\(^{40}\) Three days later, he presented his one and only canonized revelation to the Church. Recorded today in the Doctrine and Covenants and received then as "the Word and Will of the Lord, concerning the Camp of Israel in their journeyings to the West," the document was a brilliant and well-timed statement not because of what it said regarding the organization of companies (since they had already had companies of hundreds, fifties, and tens all across Iowa), but for what it declared concerning the source of final authority. Above all, it was a lecture on apostolic supremacy.

Given first to the Twelve on 14 January to the High Council two days later, to the general priesthood quorums on Sunday, 17 January, and finally to the general membership on 19 January, the Word and Will of the Lord said many things, but perhaps none more importantly than this — that their
journey westward, its matter of organization, its conduct—all must be "under the direction of the Twelve Apostles." For the first time since Joseph, the faithful proclaimed, God had once again given direction, had not left his people alone in the wilderness, and would not abandon them, and had stated unequivocably who was in charge. Though it said nothing about their final destination nor of the feasibility of a way station and indeed left these matters entirely open, it did establish final authority. Not the Council of Fifty, not the High Council, nor any other group, but the Twelve was in control. And the issue was not missed by those who participated in the meetings and procedures to ratify the revelation.

Brigham endeavored to show that the apostles were following the will of Joseph Smith while others were pretenders. "The Church has been led by Revelation just as much since the death of Joseph Smith as before," he said on 17 January. "Joseph received his apostleship from Peter, and his brethren, and the present Apostles received their apostleship from Joseph, the first apostle, and Oliver Cowdery, the second apostle."

Hosea Stout, aware of the tensions over conflicting claims to authority, recorded his impressions to the revelation.

This will put to silence the wild bickering and suggestions of those who are ever in the way and opposing the proper council. They will now have to come to this standard or come out in open rebellion to the Will of the Lord
which will plainly manifest them to the people and then they can have no influence. 44

The revelation was delivered in person to the Ponca settlement in early February by apostle Ezra Taft Benson, Erastus Snow, and Orrin Porter Rockwell. They relieved Miller of his command, told him he was wanted back at headquarters, and put the camp under apostle Benson's jurisdiction. 45

Shortly after reading Brigham's document, even though it did not necessarily forbid the Yellowstone scheme, George Miller came out in public opposition to the plan, to the authority of the Twelve, and to Brigham personally. "I was greatly disgusted at the bad composition and folly of this revelation," Miller later recorded, "so disgusted that I was, from this time, determined to go with them no longer. . . . I must confess that I was broken down in spirit on account of the usurpation of those arrogant apostles and their oppresive measures." 46

In a letter to Brigham of 17 March 1847, Miller stated his long-held but unexpressed objections to settling in the Great Basin where, he declared, "we would find it hard to sustain ourselves in food and raiment; and would, most likely, bring on the thoroughfare where all the slime and filth, malcontents from Missouri, Iowa, Illinois, Indiana, etc. would pass nearby us to the newly acquired Territory of California and Oregon." Better to find a location in some lonely valley in Oregon (probably the genesis of the Yellowstone plan) or, better still, in the far south-west
"on the Camanshee [Comanche] lands on the eastern side of the Cordilleras Mountains so far south that we could grow cotton and even sugarcane." Such a colony he argued, (one very close to Lyman Wight's in southern Texas) could stand as a buffer state between warring Mexico and the United States. As a go-between, they could affect a treaty by which "we could get sea-coast on the Gulph [sic] of Mexico, where we could land emigrants from the States of England, France, Germany, Norway etc. in our own ports." He concluded with this parting, poignant testimony:

Although I am in poverty and rags, I am not unwilling to undertake to do anything that this people persist in doing to build up this Kingdom. I have been as a beast of burden ever since I came into the church, and have never swerved in my actions, or feelings, to do with my might all things to push forward the cause of Zion, and am, and ever have been, willing to spend and be spent for the cause. I do not say this by way of boasting, but because of the frankness of my heart.

Miller and Emmett left the Church shortly thereafter. Miller went south to Texas in July 1847 and lived with Lyman Wight for a short time until he discovered that Wight was "an intoxicated no-good." In October 1847 he travelled north to Voree, Wisconsin, and took up Strangism with fervor. Thrilled at Miller's defection, and at having landed another former authority in Brigham's church, Strang gave Miller prestige and high sounding titles such as "Prince, Privy Councillor and General Chief in the Kingdom of God" though very little real authority. Miller eventually left Strangism and lived his remaining years,
spent and disillusioned, in Illinois. His loss was keenly felt by many in camp even if they had disagreed with him. Said Joseph Fielding, a friend of Brigham's and a fellow member of the Council of Fifty, "he was dear to me in the office he held, he was indeed a fine man, and I hope to see him again in our midst."\(^{50}\) Emmett, too, was disfellowshipped (a form of censure) and left the Church.

The third plan, then, the Quorum of the Twelve plan, was more than a mere re-statement on camp organization or direction. It pronounced in unambiguous terms once and for all the supremacy of the Quorum of the Twelve over not only spiritual but also temporal and political matters. It cost the Church the allegiance of some of its finest pioneers and frontiersmen who, in the end, probably ran aground as much over personality differences as purely ecclesiastical or doctrinal concerns. Miller and Brigham were two powerful, domineering personalities who couldn't live near each other for very long.

With the matter of authority settled once and for all, they could now focus on the details of preparing for their departure. Four days after announcing his revelation, Brigham stated confidently that "he had no more doubts nor fears of going to the mountains, and felt as much security as if he possessed the treasures of the east."\(^{51}\) But at this point he had more confidence than answers. Who would go in the advance party? Was the Yellowstone still a viable option? How soon could they realistically get away given the need to re-organize all the camps? When would all the
rest come on? Many of these questions would not be answered until the eve of their journey.

Determining the make-up of the pioneer companies was a two step affair and must be seen as part of a larger effort to organize the entire Mormon encampments at the Missouri. According to the revelation, everyone had to be accommodated within a travelling organization whether or not they could leave in the spring or fall. Brigham wanted to put the camps on a stand-by basis, alert to the need of leaving as soon as possible. He would overlay the existing ecclesiastical structure with a travelling organization so as to constantly remind his followers that their stay was only temporary.

Three other companies besides his and Heber C. Kimball's were to be organized and from out of these, the best prepared, most able-bodied men would be selected to form the advance company. Each of the five would take an equal proportion of widows and orphans and Battalion families. Brigham and Heber C. Kimball would divide up the Winter Quarters population basically along adopted family lines. Wilford Woodruff and Orson Pratt were to take the remnants of Winter Quarters before incorporating everyone in Mt. Pisgah and Garden Grove. George A. Smith and Amasa Lyman were ordered to organize the east banks settlements. It took these apostles five to six weeks to tour all the settlements, read the new revelations, choose captains of hundreds, fifties and tens, and complete their preparations.
Even Mt. Pisgah and Garden Grove were included. Ezra Taft Benson, meanwhile, reorganized the Ponca settlement.

Evidence indicates confusion over which families to include in the anticipated departing spring companies. The earliest would leave in March followed by a second caravan once grass was up. This later company would consist of many of the Battalion families. Later companies would depart in intervals until 1 July 1847. All the rest would vacate the Missouri the following spring.

But the matter of who would go was inextricably part of another dilemma - where to go and how to get there. By the end of January, Brigham had reverted back to taking the Platte route and advised his Ponca followers to convey that information on to Grosclaude and Cardinal. "Say to them we have none but the best of feelings towards all good men, themselves particularly so far as we are acquainted."

They did not decide on the way station possibility until the eve of their departure. By mid-February they were leaning heavily towards risking a non-stop, over-the-mountain thrust to the Great Basin with this one precaution: "should our bread stuff fail for lack of means to procure, we will then be obliged to stop a part of the camp at the foot of the mountains and plant late crops." In other words, they would reverse the order and priority of the Council of Fifty plan by putting in a spring crop in the Basin first, and then if required, plant fall crops at the foot of the mountains. As Benjamin Clapp put it, we "may
as well stick the stake this year, as three or four years hence."  

Though early March had been their target date, Brigham conceded early in 1847 that it was "very uncertain whether the Pioneers will leave here before April." Aggravating matters was the failure of the Winter Quarters mill which never operated all winter long. Obviously they could not provide large numbers of people with either adequate flour or enough seed for large mid-way farms. 

Another complicating factor had been seen before - constant naggings from families not to be left behind among the Indians and in such a sickly place. Some complained the pioneers were taking with them most available foodstuffs leaving the rest with a scarcity of provisions until the first spring crops.

In response Willard Richards argued that the purer, wholesome air of the mountain regions would prove fatal on an already unhealthy people unless accommodated gradually. "If we go in the sick state we now are in to the mountains, we should drop like the wind. If I don't want to kill my family, I wont [sic] ... take them too sudden to this purer atmosphere." Ezra Taft Benson agreed saying "I do not think this [Winter Quarters] is an unhealthy location. At least I would not be afraid to leave my family here." Come spring, surely their health would improve as they rested and planted abundant crops.
As to the Indians, the Twelve promised that the police force would be maintained and that a large picket fence be built along the exposed southern flank of the city. Every precaution would be taken to keep the city as safe as possible even though some of the cannons would have to go west in the later company. And as to the concerns of families of the Battalion, Brigham promised every effort to include them in the ensuing summer companies.\textsuperscript{66}

As to provisions, every family in the city was encouraged to plant "a garden of their own" and that large "public fields" or farm lands be administered south of the city on a personal pledge of improvement. Large separate family farms were also envisioned for members of the Young, Kimball, and Richards adopted families.\textsuperscript{67}

In response to lingering fears and ongoing complaints, Brigham was characteristically blunt.

You poor stinking curses, for you are cursed and the hand of the Lord shall be upon you and you shall go down to hell for murmuring and bickering. This people means to tie my hands continually as they did last year so that we can't go to the place of our destination. They are already coming to me saying can't you take me along? Don't leave me here, if you do I am afraid I shall die, this is such a sickly place. Well I say to them, die, who cares. If you have not faith to live here you will die over the mountains.\textsuperscript{68}

This time he would not be hindered.

Monday, 22 March, had for some time been targeted as their departure date, but the last minute elimination of the Yellowstone plan, delays due to organizing according to the 'Word and Will of the Lord,' difficulties in gathering
provisions, and the time required to confront objections all forced a postponement. Part of the change involved a sizeable reduction in the size of the pioneer company from well over 300 to less than half that number. A smaller company could move more quickly. 1 April another target date, also came and went. Finally on Saturday morning, 5 April the first of Heber C. Kimball’s company began rolling out. Others followed the Monday following.

But the sudden arrival of Parley P. Pratt from his mission to England forced another week’s delay. Brigham, Heber C. Kimball, Ezra Taft Benson, Orson Pratt, George A. Smith, Wilford Woodruff, and Willard Richards all returned on horseback to Winter Quarters on 12 April while the rest of the advance company was sent ahead to the Platte River to cross it before heavy rains intervened.

Parley P. Pratt met in council with his fellow apostles that evening, reported on their mission to England, the "demise" of Reuben Hedlock's "Joint Stockism", the perils of their journey, Strangism's progress in England, and indicated that John Taylor, hourly expected, was bearing the treasures of England with him - 469 sovereigns of gold representing tithes from the British Saints. He was also bringing almost $500 worth of astronomical and other instruments very useful to the Pioneers on their journey.

The next day John Taylor did arrive by boat up the Missouri with the money and two sextants, two barometers, two artificial horizons, one circle of reflection, several thermometers, and a telescope. The Twelve continued their
deliberations and many commendations and criticisms were expressed of Taylor and Pratt's work in England. At the same time, Brigham Young urged Taylor and Pratt to make every effort possible to come on and join the advance party, but the two were more anxious to catch their breath and spend time with their families. Their refusal did not square well with Brigham and later became a source of irritation and complaint within the Quorum. 74

It was decided that Brigham should have the disposal of the money brought by Taylor and Pratt. It was also determined that Pratt and Taylor be responsible for organizing the first "Emigration Company" along the patterns set forth by the "Word and Will of the Lord" and that other smaller companies, if well enough provisioned, come on in groups of no fewer than seventy-five until 1 July 1847. These later emigration companies were to amply provide up to 500 pounds of breadstuff per person, enough to last eighteen months, as a precaution in case the pioneer companies failed to reach their destination in time to put in fall crops.

After their departure, Orson Hyde, expected back later in the spring after visiting branches of the Church in the eastern states, would, as he had done in Nauvoo the preceding spring, be in charge of the rearguard settlements.

On 14 April, all but Taylor and Pratt returned to the Elkhorn and rejoined the pioneer company near the Platte rivers the following day. After organizing the company of 143 men and boys, three women, and two children, (essentially amalgamating leaders from the selected pioneers
from all five companies), at 2 p.m. on Friday, 16 April, after months of planning, turmoil, and twisted expectations, Brigham and his pioneers headed west. 75

Summer Life at Winter Quarters

The pioneer company left behind "upwards of 4,000" people in Winter Quarters alone.76 An article in the Missouri Republican exaggerated population figures to almost 7,000, but probably included the approximate 3,000 on the immediate east side of the river.77 During the spring and summer, as per the Twelve's orders, the city was entirely fenced in for protection.78 After Whitney's store closed, a non-Mormon store keeper, on invitation, set up business for a few weeks in the Council House in the heart of the city.79 Ill health, most likely caused by the return of the mosquito infestations, accounted for a minimum of 106 counted deaths between May and October.80 Nevertheless, the summer of 1847 was a healthier and more pleasant experience than the year before.

Their primary objective was to plant and harvest substantial crops, gather provisions, organize themselves as per the proscribed pattern, and, in short, prepare for an exodus to the West as soon as possible. Preparation rather than permanence, sacrifice rather than settle - these were the orders of the day. As they had been counselled, "all preparation and organization is for journeying and not for a permanent location at Winter Quarters."81
To emphasize the need for preparation and to keep the camps on a stand-by basis, Brigham demanded that the organization stipulated by the "Word and Will of the Lord" replace that of the Winter Quarters High Council. "All the High Council that is necessary . . . will be the president and captains of emigration companies."82 And as one emigration company left, new captains of tens, fifties, and hundreds within the various divisions would be chosen.83 In practice, however, mainly to maintain civic functions, the Winter Quarters Municipal High Council continued with Alpheus Cutler senior counsellor. Bishops continued to be responsible to the High Council.84

The business of farming preoccupied everyone for reasons already stated and took three different forms; private, public or Church, and family endeavors. Those owning property on Iowa's side naturally farmed their own land claims. After George Miller's defection, his Ponca settlement under Titus Billings' leadership was dismantled and on the 8 May 1847 crossed over to Iowa on the Winter Quarters ferry settling seven miles north as a unit on "a good spring on Musquitoe [sic] Creek."85 Almost everyone on the east side grew their own crops specializing in corn, turnips, potatoes, beans, watermelons, and other market fruits and vegetables.

Meanwhile, on the west side where federal law still prohibited homesteading, families were encouraged to plant and cultivate large gardens. Captains of hundreds and company presidents were held responsible for allotting to
each family "all the ground they need, or can till, for a
garden in the City of Winter Quarters, or its immediate
vicinity." They were also expected to regulate the larger
farm acresages that extended two miles south of the city and
to let out the land in lots of five and ten acres each. Later in the summer many went to Missouri to assist in the
wheat harvest receiving their pay in much needed wheat.

Most unique of all their busied agricultural pursuits
were the large family farms of Brigham Young, Heber C.
Kimball, Willard Richards, and possibly of one or two other
apostles. Based on the religious principle of spiritual
adoption, these farms consisted of large numbers of
families who had been spiritually adopted into one of the
leading families. In a sense they were family cooperatives
and were designed at the last moment to replace the once-
anticipated way stations further west.

Before leaving Brigham instructed those of his
forty-one families not going west, to farm on land he had
chosen about eighteen miles north near Old Fort Calhoun. Isaac Morley was to manage the 600 acre farm, popularly
called "Summer Quarters," with John D. Lee as foreman. Lots were laid off early in April when work began on small
buildings and fortifications.

But jealousies and serious personality clashes
prevented Summer Quarters from ever succeeding as
anticipated. The root cause of their difficulty stemmed
back to Lee's apportionment of the land. He and his company
obtained seventy acres of apparently the best timbered land,
George D. Grant received thirty, Isaac Morley fifteen, and forty-five acres were divided among twenty persons. Late in April, Joseph Busby, S.A. Dunn, T.S. Johnson, and G. Arnold censured Lee and Morley for "acting partial and doing injustice in the dividend [division of produce] of the land" and threatened "to go to Missouri sooner than bear it." Eventually the Winter Quarters police were brought in to settle several disturbances and hostilities among them.

The dissension that racked Brigham's farm and which ultimately led to John D. Lee's trial before the Winter Quarters High Council and the Twelve Apostles, did not seem to work its same harmful effects on the Heber C. Kimball farm six or seven miles north of Winter Quarters (probably near the old Fort Lisa or Engineer cantonment locations). Daniel Davis supervised "Heber's Farm" of thirty families who lived in homes built in a square "fort fashion," presumably like Summer Quarters. It was located only half a mile from the river. Several hundred acres were planted and a good grist mill put in operation. Many lived at Heber's Farm through the following winter. In addition, there was also a Willard Richards farm apparently located on the east bank within a mile or two of Winter Quarters.

Reliable statistics are not available for the total 1847 farm acreages among the settlements. One visitor likely exaggerated when he estimated 30,000 acres. A more realistic estimate would be closer to 10,000. Had the family farms been more carefully prepared, the overlapping and somewhat competing levels of authority better defined,
and sickness not so prevalent, their harvests would have been even more abundant. Nonetheless, the fall of 1847 found them in a much stronger, more prepared, and better provisioned state than the year before.

With the arrival of good weather, the "Emigration Company" prepared to depart under the leadership of apostles Parley P. Pratt and John Taylor. They, however, varied from the organizational patterns set out in the "Word and Will of the Lord" with one president (John Smith) over spiritual matters and another (John Young, Brigham's older brother) over temporal affairs. Pratt and Taylor saw fit to make other personnel changes, as required. The quarrelsome, disorganized situation at Summer Quarters resulted in far fewer prepared to go west that summer than originally anticipated. Other problems arose between the two apostles and Hosea Stout who was belatedly asked to come along. "I felt insulted abused and neglected," Stout recorded. Their authority is seems was not universally accepted. And whereas Brigham had originally envisioned several departing parties of a minimum of seventy-five men leaving intermittently until 1 July, Pratt and Taylor organized only one large company.

Brigham later severely castigated Pratt and Taylor for trifling with revelation and muddying the works. "When one or more of the Quorum interfere with the work of the majority of the quorum they burn their fingers and do wrong." Though bothered by their tampering of revelation, he was more irritated by their ineffective
control over civil government, and their ineffectiveness in curtailing Indian problems and in stemming disaffection. After Pratt and Taylor's departure west, those at the Bluffs were re-organized along Brigham's original plan.

Whatever their problems, the Pratt-Taylor Emigration Company assembled at the Elkhorn the second week of June. By 20 June, their departure date, the company consisted of 1,490 souls and 573 wagons. Following the North Fork of the Platte River in the wake of the advanced pioneers, the Emigration Company reached the Salt Lake Valley in good time, 25 September 1847, two months after the vanguard company.

The Successful Return

Returning to Winter Quarters, Brigham and other clusters of pioneers met the advancing Pratt-Taylor company in late August in present western Wyoming. While some of the pioneers made it back to the Missouri as early as 3 October, the main pioneer company of 143 did not return until 30 October and then only after Hosea Stout had led out relief teams to meet them at Grand Island.

Their re-entry into Winter Quarters on 31 October was one of triumph and rejoicing. Wrote Wilford Woodruff, "We drove into the city in order. The streets were lined with people to shake hands as we drove along each one drove to his own home. I drove up to my own door [and] was very rejoiced to once more behold the face of my wife and children again."
Several formal meetings and informal gatherings were held shortly afterwards in which the pioneers sang the praises of their new home "far away in the west." Heber C. Kimball, telling his listeners "he was not going to flatter the country but would tell us as it is," described the large valley, the surrounding snow-capped mountains, the salt lake "so strong it would bear a person up," the scarcity of timber, and the dedicated temple plot. Then he drew the following comparison with that at the Missouri.

It seems to me [like] a person living in a four story building in the upper room all finished off in good style and the comforts of life and then move down in a cellar where it is damp and chilly and sickly; that is the contrast between the valley there and this place here in Winter Quarters. This is as near as I can compare it. 108

To underline their intentions to abandon Winter Quarters and to discourage a growing sentiment to stay permanently at the Missouri, and to obey the orders of an exasperated Commissioner Medill, the Twelve decided in council on 8 and 9 of November, less than a fortnight after their return, to vacate Winter Quarters in the spring. The threat of further Indian troubles and continued sickness on the west banks were other factors. 109

Apostle Orson Hyde, who had lived in Iowa all summer, was particularly full of praise for the east side. "It is a natural place for a town," he claimed. "I fell in love with the place," speaking specifically of the Miller's Hollow area in present upper Council Bluffs. George W. Harris recommended that a committee be established "to go into Iowa
and look for a location for a city." It was determined that the former Council Point High Council be reorganized to form the Pottawattamie High Council with Frank Allred as presiding officer under Orson Hyde. On 10 November the decision to vacate the following spring was presented to the Seventies, High Council, and bishops for their sustaining vote. Four days later, Brigham publicly declared their intentions to vacate Winter Quarters in the spring of 1848 and that those able to go west in the spring should do so while everyone else should move across the river.

On 21 December, the Twelve unveiled its "General Epistle to the Saints Throughout the World", a communique designed to inform the entire international Church membership about the new-found Salt Lake Valley, to make a plea for contributions and donations, and to encourage everyone to emigrate to the Rockies. "We have named the Pottawattamie lands as the best place for the brethren to assemble on the route."

As early as 20 March 1848 Winter Quarters residents were moving east. The transfer continued through the rest of the spring and early summer with most settling in and about Miller's Hollow and northward near and along Pigeon Creek. During the Church's annual April conference held in Miller's Hollow, Orson Hyde moved that "the place hitherto known as Miller's Hollow [be] named Kanesville in honor of Colonel Thomas L. Kane, who had ever been a true friend to the saints."
But whether they settled east or west of the Missouri, their ultimate destination was now confirmed, at least in Brigham’s mind. Now that they had staked out a new home in the West, no one would be justified in remaining back. Whereas Winter Quarters had once served as headquarters of the Church groping in the wilderness, Kanesville was destined to be merely a fitting out station, a spring-board to Zion.
FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER EIGHT


2Chittenden and Richardson, *Life, Letters and Travels of Father De Smet*, 1:56. Lewis Clark Christian, in a recent dissertation on the factors contributing to the choice of the Salt Lake Valley as the eventual destination, questions De Smet's influence and how accurate and first-hand his knowledge really was of the Basin area. See Lewis Clark Christian, "A Study of the Mormon Westward Migration Between February 1846 and July 1847 with Emphasis on and Evaluation of the Factors that Led to the Mormon Choice of Salt Lake Valley as the Site of Their Initial Colony," (Ph.D. dissertation, Provo, Utah: Brigham Young University, 1976).

De Smet later served as chaplain in the infamous "Johnson's army" of 1858. At that time, De Smet described the Latter-day Saints as "that terrible sect of modern fanatics, flying from civilization . . . [who] never ceased to defy the Government." Chittenden, *Life, Letters and Travels of De Smet*, 1:717-718. His tone in 1846 was apparently more conciliatory. For more on De Smet, see Chapter Two.

3Journal History, 7 August 1846.

4Journal of John D. Lee, 7 August 1846. There is some indication that their destination was private information, not known by most in camp and revealed only to Kane after he had won the confidence and trust of Mormon leaders. Brigham had his reasons for confidentiality. First, Mormon Battalion enlistees might not look favorably at a further march inland from their eventual coastal destination of over 1,000 miles; second, he wished to keep the federal government guessing; and third, in case the valley didn't turn out as expected, changes could easily be made.

Eliza Lyman expressed the popular sentiment while watching the departing pioneer wagons in early April. "They are going west to look for a location for the Latter-day Saints and have no idea where that is but trust that the Lord will lead them to the place." Journal of Eliza Maria Partridge Lyman, 8 April 1847.

5Journal History, 9 August 1846.

6See Brigham Young to the Nauvoo trustees, 11 September 1846; and Brigham Young to Joseph A. Strattan, 12 September 1846, Brigham Young Papers. Lewis C. Christian contends that the Bear River Valley mentioned referred to the one in present Wyoming rather than its counterpart in present northern Utah. See Christian, "A Study of the Mormon Westward Migration," p.223 and 238.
However, most of the trappers spoke highly of the Cache valley area of Utah and it may be that Brigham had the more northerly area in mind.

7 *Journal History*, 15 February 1847. The only modifications of their destination plans was abandoning any further consideration of locating a portion of the British Saints at Vancouver's Island. While as late as August 1846 lip service was still being given to the idea of British converts reaching the area by water rather than by the more costly overland crossing, it was probably never more than a political, half-baked economic alternative, and lost all further meaning after the signing of the Oregon treaty in June of 1846. Considering the need for consolidating their resources once in their mountain retreat, maintaining close communication and unity, and protecting themselves from all potential offenders, it is hard to believe the references to the scheme were anything but a smokescreen to gain any possible British and American concessions. *Journal of John D. Lee*, 7 August 1846.

In February 1847 Orson Hyde, Parley P. Pratt, and John Taylor presented a petition bearing 13,000 names to Queen Victoria and to Parliament "proposing a plan for emigration to Oregon or Vancouver's Island." Years later, during the federal government's efforts to disenfranchise the Church because of polygamy, John Taylor, then president, quietly commissioned studies into the feasibility of relocating the Church to Vancouver's Island, British Columbia.

8 Brigham Young to Joseph A. Strattan, 12 September 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

9 *Journal History*, 28 September 1846.

10 Brigham Young to the Nauvoo trustees, 27 September 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

11 *Journal History*, 15 November 1846.

12 Minutes of the Winter Quarters High Council, 8 September 1846.

13 Brigham Young to the Nauvoo trustees, 11 September 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

14 Brigham Young to the Nauvoo trustees, 27 September 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

15 See Brigham Young to the Nauvoo trustees, 14 November 1846, Brigham Young Papers; and *Journal History*, 15 November 1846.

16 See Diary of Hosea Stout, 9 September 1846, 1:192; and *Journal History*, 28 September 1846.
17 Journal History, 15 November 1846.

18 Brigham Young to the Nauvoo Trustees, 11 September 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

19 Brigham Young to Joseph Herring, 13 September 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

20 Journal History, 8 and 12 November 1846. The nature and details of this dream are not specified, but it did seem to provide him with a certain amount of assurance and confidence.

21 For more on the Council of Fifty, see Chapter Two and Chapter Eleven.

22 Journal History, 29 December 1846.

23 See Journal of Willard Richards, 24-27 December; and Journal History, 27 December 1846.

24 Northern Islander, 20 September 1855.


26 See Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 17 December 1846; and Joseph Holbrook to Brigham Young, 7 December 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

27 Brigham Young to George Miller, 25 November 1846, Brigham Young Papers.


30 Brigham Young to George Miller and Council, 25 November 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

31 Journal of Thomas Bullock, 10 December 1846. He continued: "the Buffalo grass is fine and plenty on the head waters of the Yellowstone - a stream strikes above the two forks on Tongue River - the winter sets in there about the 1st Novr [sic] and lasts till last of March."

32 Diary of Hosea Stout, 27 December 1846, 1:221. Mary Richards, who also attended the meeting, noted that it was similarly contemplated that time and energies permitting, they would send out from the proposed Yellowstone winter base "a company across the mountains" to the Basin or Bear River Valley "to put in a crop of wheat in the fall."
Journal of Mary H. P. Richards, 27 December 1846, LDS Church Archives.

33 Journal History, 7 January 1847.

34 Brigham Young to Hannah Stailey, 8 January 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

35 Joseph Holbrook to Brigham Young, 7 December 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

36 See Journal of Thomas Bullock, 12 December 1846, Brigham Young Papers; and Journal History, 12 December 1846. Fontenelle also suggested that before departing, they build a leather boat or "revenue cutter" to aid in fording swollen streams and rivers.

37 A detachment of the Battalion, incapacitated by illness and weakened conditions, along with most of the women and children, had been sent north to Pueblo. This contingent also wanted to rejoin their families at the earliest moment.


39 Diary of Hosea Stout, 29 October 1846, 1:208.

40 Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 11 January 1847.

41 Doctrine and Covenants, 136:3.

42 Almost everyone at Winter Quarters accepted the revelation without reservation. The Municipal High Council's response was typical.

"Reynolds Cahoon moved that the communication be received as the Word and Will of God, seconded by Isaac Morley. Alanson Eldredge approved of the same; it was plain to his understanding. Reynolds Cahoon said it was the voice of righteousness. Winslow Farr said it reminded him of the first reading of the Book of Mormon; he was perfectly satisfied and knew it was from the Lord. Cornelius P. Lott was perfectly satisfied. George W. Harris was so well satisfied that he wanted all to say Amen at once. Thomas Grover felt that it was the voice of the Spirit.

The vote passed unanimously . . . . Hosea Stout said if there is anything in Mormonism that is the voice of the Lord to the people so is the word and will of the Lord."
Later in the day, the presiding council of Seventies similarly voted unanimously in support of it. Journal History, 14 January 1847.

43 Journal History, 17 January 1847.

44 Diary of Hosea Stout, 14 January 1847, 1:227-29.

45 Journal History, 25 and 29 January 1847.


47 George Miller to Brigham Young, 17 March 1847, Brigham Young Papers.


49 Unbound minute book of Strangite conferences held between July and October 1850, J. J. Strang Papers, RLDS Library and Archives. As late as 1854, Miller was urging Wight to abandon Texas and join Strang. "The more I reflect on the subject the more I am convinced that it would be to the best you could do under all the circumstances [sic], both in a spiritual and temporal [sic] point of view." George Miller to Lyman Wight, 19 January 1854, RLDS Library and Archives. Wight refused.

50 Journal of Joseph Fielding, Spring 1847, Book 5, p.126, LDS Church Archives.

51 Journal History, 18 January 1847.

52 Journal History, 18 and 25 January 1847.

53 See Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 15 and 18 February 1847; and Journal of Erastus Snow, early February 1847.

54 Journal History, 12 and 15 February, 1847.

55 See the Twelve apostles to Titus Billings, 25 March 1847, Brigham Young Papers; and Journal History, 25 March 1847.

56 Journal History, 29 January 1847.

57 Ibid. He went on to say he would "be pleased to have them accompany us." They never did.

58 Journal History, 15 February 1847.

59 Arguing against the way station plan, Isaac Mcrley said it would dilute their efforts. "If there is a company here, a company at the mountains and a company across the mountains it is weakening our hands - the building [of] another city is [full] of trouble and expense." Willard
Richards, at the same meeting and of the same mind as Morley, argued that "if we go 5 or 600 miles to put in a crop this spring, we are too late - we have to be particular in picking our location so as to irrigate the farm. You can plant two acres here to one there." He concluded, "Will it not be better to leave the families here this season where they have houses to shelter them from the storms and other necessaries prepared and let the pioneers go over the mountains and prepare the place, then return and bring the families over next season in perfect safety to the place of gathering without having to make and leave another stopping place for the devil."

See minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and others, 6 March 1847, Brigham Young Papers; and Journals of John D. Lee, 6 March 1847, pp.109-111.

60 Minutes of the Twelve and many of the High Council, 6 March 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

61 Brigham Young to Joseph A. Strattan, 22 January 1847, Brigham Young Papers.


63 Patty Sessions referred to "the scarcity of provisions at Winter Quarters and how hard it was even to get a little corn-meal." Manuscript History of Winter Quarters, 15 April 1847. Camp leaders were aware of the problem. To minimize demands on camp supplies, Brigham recommended they take with them only 100 lbs. of provisions per pioneer. As he had done back in Iowa, Joseph Young objected to the foolhardiness of the scheme and strongly suggested more ample supplies. The final company took with them closer to 300 lbs. of provisions per person. Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 3 March 1847.

64 Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and others, 6 March 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

65 Journals of John D. Lee, 6 March 1847, pp.109-111.

66 Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and others, 6 March 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

67 Ibid.

68 Journals of John D. Lee, 21 March 1847, p.129.

69 Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 22 and 23 March 1847.
Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 8 April 1847. On 8 April, Horace K. Whitney and most camp leaders set out for the main rendezvous point out at the Elkhorn ferry fifteen miles west.

Ibid., 12 April 1847; see also Journal History, 12 April 1847; and Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 12-13 April 1847.

Journal of Erastus Snow, 7 and 8 April 1847. One wonders if Brigham had not been delaying purposely their departure until Pratt and Taylor's return. He must have known the funds and instruments were on their way.

Journal History, 13 April 1847. Besides these instruments they had recently obtained several maps of Texas, Oregon, and California including Fremont's, Mitchell's, and a most recent map from General Atchison. Ibid., 18 February, 27 March, and 4 April 1847.

Said Brigham months later: "I told Bro. Parley if you go with us you will never be sorry for it but if you don't you will always be sorry for it. I tell you, they will lose more ground than they ever gained." Brigham wanted all the Twelve not only to find Zion but also to discuss the creation of a First Presidency. He may also have been suspicious of how Taylor and Pratt would manage affairs at Winter Quarters and with the following immigration companies. See Minutes of Miscellaneous Trustees Minutes, 17 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers; and Diary of Hosea Stout, 26 November 1847, 1:289.

Journal History, 16 April 1847. See Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 16 April 1847; and Journal of Erastus Snow, 16 April 1847. The above two journals disagree on the total number constituting the camp. Whitney says only two women joined them; Snow says three.

See Manuscript History of Winter Quarters, 16 April 1847; and Journal History, 2 June 1847.

Journal History, 6 September 1847.

The picketing, as it had the previous November, required another change in the lay-out of the city. Many homes were moved along a line running west of Second Main Street to form a western stock. The south line, meanwhile, was moved further north. Diary of Hosea Stout, 22 March 1847, 1:242.

Ibid., 16 June 1847.

Sexton records, Manuscript History of Cutler's Park and Winter Quarters. Daniel D. McArthur recalled that their health was generally good until July and August "when nearly
all the inhabitants were seased [sic] with a violent [sic]
fever [sic] with Chills which caused great affliction and
many deaths took place." Autobiography of Daniel D.
McArthur, Summer 1847, LDS Church Archives.

81 Journal History, 16 April 1847.

82 Ibid.

83 See Minutes of the Winter Quarters High Council, 10
July 1847; also Diary of Hosea Stout, 10 July 1847, 1:266.

84 Some slight evidence indicates that the continuation
of the High Council and others of Hyde's policies were
riticized after the rest of the Twelve returned in the
fall. Diary of Hosea Stout, 9 November 1847, 1:287.

85 Autobiography of Joseph Holbrook, 10 May 1847, p.57.
The Ponca camp initially received a very cool reception from
their east bank neighbors who "looked down" upon them "as
cold apostate Mormons." John L. Butler said they "threw out
insinuations about us, and said, oh, they are not worth our
notice, they belong to Emmett's Company and they are
thieves." Brigham later demanded they "quit their talk" and
accept them readily and without prejudice. "A Short History
of the Life of John Love Butler," autobiography, p.53, LDS
Church Archives.

86 Journal History, 16 April 1847.

87 Diary of Hosea Stout, 29 April 1847, 1:253.

88 See Chapter Ten.

89 The land about Old Fort Calhoun had once been
cultivated, perhaps by soldiers of an earlier time.

90 Diary of Hosea Stout, 23 March 1847, 1:242 and 23
August 1847, 1:270. Brigham wanted 2,000 acres under
cultivation eventually.

91 Journals of John D. Lee, 30 March 1847, p.140.
Charles Kelly, in editing the Lee journals, relied heavily
on a Mr. E. G. Connely of Omaha who located and described
the site.

"Summer Quarters is about thirteen
miles (by present highway) north of old
Winter Quarters. The land lies between
two streams, is perfectly flat, with good,
frangible soil . . . and was the largest and
best tract within easy reach of Winter
Quarters."

Ibid., 1 April 1847, p.141.
92Ibid., 16 April 1847, p.150; also 20 April 1847, p.153.

93Hosea Stout, visiting the area in August, penned this negative report. "It is in a low hemed [sic] in place and it looks most desolate, sickly and gloomy. I found a majority of the place sick and in the most suffering condition. Some whole families not able to help each other and worse than all they were quarreling and contending with each other in a most disgraceful manner. . . . They had fine and extensive crops of corn beans cabbage melons etc. and had they been at peace with each other, would have been in a fair way to do well."

Diary of Hosea Stout, 25 August 1847, 1:270.

The month before, the Summer Quarters camp had set off a burial ground on a bluff above the farm. Seventeen died during the summer and were buried there.

94Journal of Jospeh G. Hovey, 27 April 1847, p.35.

95Christeen G. Kimball to her mother, 7 May 1847, Correspondence of Christeen G. Kimball, LDS Church Archives.


97Journal History, 24 March 1847.

98Ibid., 6 September 1847.


100Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 4 September 1847.

101Diary of Hosea Stout, 26 November 1847, 1:289. See also Meeting of the Miscellaneous Trustees Minutes, 17 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers. Some personal matters were also divisive.

102Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 10 July 1847.

103Journal History, 15, 17-18, and 21 June 1847. By September the number of wagons had been reduced to 566. Ibid., 25 November 1847.

104Ibid., 25 September 1847.

105Most of the wagons with oxen returning from Salt Lake to the Missouri left the Valley 16 August. More than half of the original pioneers returned including all of the
106 Having encountered bad weather and Pawnee Indian harassment, their situation up until Stout's arrival was desperate. "The President said it was more joy more satisfaction to meet us than a company of angels," Stout recalled. For their rescue efforts, Brigham "treated" them to some whiskey. "It came welcome to the pioneers." *Diary of Hosea Stout*, 18 October 1847, 1:283.

107 *Journal of Wilford Woodruff*, 31 October 1847.
An unidentified observer described the scene thus:
"The company then drove into the town of Winter Quarters in order, arriving there about an hour before sunset. The streets were crowded with people who had come out to shake hands with the Pioneers as they passed through the lines, and the weary travelers truly rejoiced to once more behold their wives, children and friends after an absence of over six months, in which time they had traveled over 2000 miles, sought out a location where the Saints could dwell in peace, and accomplished one of the most interesting and important missions of this dispensation."
*Journal History*, 30 October 1847.


109 *Manuscript History of Winter Quarters*, 29 June 1848.

110 See Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and some others, 8 and 9 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers; and *Journal History*, 8 November 1847. Not everyone agreed with the ruling including Heber C. Kimball who believed that "if we vacate, the Omahas would come in and the Sioux would come and burn it up." Brigham said if the government wouldn't buy the mill - and it didn't - it would be dismantled.

111 Meeting of the Twelve, Seventies, High Council, and Bishops, 10 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

112 *Journal History*, 14 November 1847.

113 Ibid., 21 December 1846.

114 See *Journal History*, 15 and 20 March, 1848; and *Diary of Hosea Stout*, 1 April 1848, 1:307.

115 *Journal History*, 8 April 1848.
CHAPTER NINE

ERRAND IN THE WILDERNESS
THEIR SOCIAL AND RELIGIOUS LIFE

PART I

If the air of Winter Quarters was saddened by the moans of the sick and the grave digger's shovel, it was also brightened by the voices of happy children, choirs, dancing feet, and instrumental music. Schools in all their rudimentary fashion sprang up spontaneously all over town. The chopping axe, the pounding hammer, the wood saw, the rattling wagon, the laughter of children, sleigh bells in the winter, the crackling fire, the ever-constant braying of cattle and bleating of sheep - these and a thousand other sounds all gave witness to a community bristling with life, industry, and activity.

Young couples met and fell in love. Wives and mothers tended their infants, cooked the meals, cleaned their humble cabin or sod homes, and cared for an almost endless list of chores. Bishop Whitney's store became a center of social intercourse, chit chat - the local rumor-mill. The Council House hosted dances almost nightly. Sunday church services were well attended, the source of instruction, inspiration, the latest news, and future plantings. In so many ways, Winter Quarters put on a happy face, an active appearance, and a normal demeanor.
And yet it was a community with a social and religious difference. For here was the place for implementing, practising, and discovering many of the peculiar doctrines of Mormonism kept relatively secret in Nauvoo and which had been simmering since before the death of Joseph Smith. Here the practice of polygamy or plural marriage came more into the open, strengthening the faith of the initiated while catching many of the unindoctrinated off guard. The related law of adoption was preached publicly for the first time, defining circles and families of identity and social influence. Manifestations of the spiritual gifts of tongues, healings, prophecies, and visions were very much in evidence especially among the women who bonded together in small clusters of noticeable influence. It was a time and a place for dreams and revelations, experimentations and explanations. Temple ordinances without the temple were available for some, but not for others. It was Mormonism in the raw, and on the way to what it came to be the latter half of the nineteenth century.

In the process, life at the Missouri proved a trial of faith and of allegiance. Many, because of sickness, poverty, discouragement, or disagreement abandoned the faith, leaving friends and families never to return. The experience of Winter Quarters left an indelible impression upon those who lived there.
Education, Culture, and Recreation

Though enveloped by the wilderness, the Saints were not engulfed by it. A civilized people, while struggling for survival they maintained a respectable society. Makeshift schools were conducted, though less formally and regularly than at Nauvoo; music, dance, and other cultural art forms surprisingly flourished; law and order were maintained by their own locally appointed police force; patterns of worship were regulated and localized; and in various ways American society, Mormon style, thrived in the wilderness.

Although the Municipal High Council instructed bishops to operate schools in their wards, no formal standardized educational program existed in Winter Quarters or across the river. Eventually school houses were built in Miller's Hollow, but in Winter Quarters schools were mere classes held indoors or under an outdoor bowery. Their quality was uneven. Teachers were usually volunteers accepting a Church assignment and were chosen according to disposition, availability, and presumably because of their ability to read and write.

The evidences of classroom instruction are few. It is known that a handful of spelling readers were purchased at Whitney's store. In November 1847 the Nauvoo Library of unknown size and provenance was forwarded to the Bluffs, but how it was administered and where located are unknown. No city library ever existed.
One instructor, Ellen McGary, had a bowery built in front of her sod cave where she taught twenty pupils. Weather permitting, classes were held outdoors until the winter when larger homes and possibly the Council House provided needed shelter. Nineteen year old George Q. Cannon, a British convert with a comparatively good education, began his classes in late December after most cabins had been constructed.

Popular with both youths and adults were the so-called singing and dancing schools. Singing and dancing had always been favorite activities. As Brigham's own revelation had declared, "If thou art merry, praise the Lord with singing, with music, with dancing, and with a prayer of thanksgiving." As early as September 1846, even the apostles were attending singing school, likely regularly held choir practices. By year's end, thanks to the interest and efforts of Stephen H. Goddard, Winter Quarters could boast of a fine large choir which began a choral tradition lasting to the present time.

Dancing, their principle pastime, had been a popular and approved recreation in Nauvoo where the Mansion House had hosted numerous balls and dancing parties. "When a Methodist," Brigham said referring to his pre-conversion days in upstate New York, "I was not allowed to dance, would not do it for a bush[el] of apples but do it mighty quick now."

Perpetuating the tradition, Hiram Gates conducted a popular dancing school for both sexes and for all ages.
Begun early in February 1847 and held at the Council House, Gates' dancing school operated the first season only in the evenings with about fifty participants. The following year 300-400 "scholars" attended with classes running from 10 a.m. till 3 p.m. and from 4 to 9 p.m. By 14 March 1848, 249 females and 191 males were enrolled. His classes were the most popular attractions in town and were said to have "contributed much to the cheerfulness of the community, amid the hardships and privations to which they were exposed." As Ken Godfrey has rightly stated in an exploratory article on the topic, "dancing was so much a part of Mormon life in Winter Quarters and after, that it almost became a part of their religious faith." It was a morale builder, a safety valve, and a diversion from the tedium of their frontier existence.

Occasions abounded to put into practise what steps they were learning. Their earliest recorded dance was held at Cold Springs, July 13, 1846, under a hastily built bower near their tents and wagons. After moving to the Winter Quarters location and completing their cabins, they celebrated the occasion with song and dance. Horace K. Whitney and friends "spent the evening in dancing" at Brigham Young's "house warming" and those of several others, often not retiring till the early hours of the morning. Quorums, bishops, cattle and police committees, and almost every one else scheduled dances of one kind or another for the Council House. Every notable occasion was celebrated whether the commemoration of the Battle of Nauvoo or the
return of the pioneers and of Mormon Battalion regulars in
the fall and winter of 1847/48.

One of the more interesting times was the Silver Greys
picnic and dance held on two consecutive nights in February
1847. Under the direction of Bishop Newel K. Whitney, with
William Pitt's live band providing the music, the Silver
Greys dance was staged specifically for the older folk in
camp. "This was an interesting day to the Camp of Israel,"
wrote Wilford Woodruff. "At an early hour the band of music
entered my carriage and rode through the city of Winter
Quarters playing so sweetly that it rend the air." So
many of the older folk attended, (over forty years of age),
that they were divided into two companies since the Council
House could not accommodate everyone in one day. After an
afternoon-long feast

the center of the floor was then
cleared for the dance when the 'Silver
Greys' and spectacled dames enjoyed
themselves in the dance; it was indeed
an interesting and novel sight to behold
the old men and women, some nearly a
hundred years old, dancing like ancient
Israel.18

The Jubilee celebration of early January 1848 over on
the east side in the Log Tabernacle lasted five consecutive
days and was a combination of day-time speeches, songs, and
night-time dancing and festivities in commemoration of the
successful harvest, the safe return of the Battalion, and
the recent finding of a permanent home in the Salt Lake
Valley.19 During the winter of 1847-48, twenty dancing
parties were held in the Blockhouse Branch on the east
side.20
In retrospect one observer noted that "we had very little
else to do except go to meetings [,] parties [,] visit our
friends and so on."21

The most unique dancing experience and one with some
religious overtones occurred the night of the dedication of
the Council House. Brigham said he would have the first
dance "so they would set the pattern for the rest." Wrote
Joseph G. Hovey, an eye witness,

They called for the band and on they
came forthwith. Bro. Brigham organized a
number of couples and set the band aplaying
a tune. After which we kneeled down and
prayed to the God of Heaven. I can truly
say that the prayer that was offered up,
and the music and the dance were controlled
with the Spirit of God. . . . Truly I was
lead [sic] to say this was the way the
ancient fathers praised the Lord in dance.22

But what started out innocently and approved soon
became a social, even doctrinal point of contention. During
the Silver Grey picnic, Brigham had said "There is no harm
in dancing. The Lord said he wanted his saints [to] praise
Him in all things." "Dance all night, if you desire to do
so" he counselled, "for there is no harm in it."23 The
approved dance consisted of square dances, cotillions, reels
and rounds and "promiscuous universal dances" where dances
exchanged well-known partners, refrained from alcohol, and
were supervised by bishops and other Church leaders.24

But the gradual development of dancing with "Gentiles"
or non-Mormons who came from the Point or more distant
settlements, of an indecent amount of alcohol on site, and
of other abuses temporarily discouraged Church leaders.25
Alpheus Cutler did not think it appropriate "to have fiddling and dancing carried on in the Camp, while others were languishing on beds of sickness." 26 Brigham counselled his St. Louis followers to "cease their dancing, until such times as are appointed of the Lord, for it is a snare [,] a trap in which many will be caught by the enemy and will be led to destruction." 27 The High Council on both sides of the river sporadically approved or condemned the festivities and "improper dancing".

Some leaders, more unbending than others, were firmly opposed. Wilford Woodruff, for one, condemned such scenes of folly. While there is "so much depending upon us and our prayers" he said, "should we be satisfied with the record of this city of the saints in the eternal world kept by the Angels of Heaven" if their records showed that "the Lord's anointed during the winter of 1847 and 1848 spent nine days of their time in fiddling and dancing where they did one in prayer and praise to Almighty God?" 28

But for all the sermons, pitfalls, and improprieties, dancing remained a popular pasttime, especially among the youth. Brigham, ever the pragmatist, knew that if his youth didn't dance at home they'd go to the Point and elsewhere. "If you want to dance, dance on this floor," he said, referring to the Council House. "I would not go there and dance God forbid - but I would come and dance with you." 29

While dramatic presentations were virtually non-existent, concerts, solo musical performances, and song-
fests were staged fairly frequently. Bishop Knight's 22nd ward for instance, sponsored a concert for the poor of his ward. "Their music is good," recalled William Appleby, "consisting of violins, horns, clarinet, tambourine, trombone, etc." Occasionally visiting performers, like the strange and enigmatic mulatto Choctaw Indian, William McCary, who presented a flute concert at the Council House in 1847, entertained the townspeople. Meanwhile Goddard's fine choir performed not only at the tabernacle on Sundays, but on various other special occasions as well.

Patterns of Worship

The activity most regularly attended was the Sunday worship services which in Winter Quarters took two forms. The large, city-wide convocation was frequently but intermittently convened and was the forum for general conferences, special announcements, important directives and policy statements. The 20 December 1846 outdoor gathering at the open bowery (called the "Tabernacle of the Congregation") in the center of the city was a fine example of this kind of meeting. After the ringing of the Nauvoo temple bell (recently brought into camp), several hundred crowded onto benches, sang, and prayed before listening to Brigham and other leaders speak of reforming behavior. Similar meetings focused on the impending journey and migrations westward, Mormon Battalion concerns, "The Word and Will of the Lord" and other doctrinal pronouncements, Indian concerns, and a host of other topics of general
interest. Frequently they lasted several hours depending on
the weather, the number of speakers, the nature and
controversy of the topic, and other factors. Bad weather
often postponed such meetings until larger facilities were
built on the east side.

The second type of religious meeting was the smaller,
more intimate ward worship services held every Sunday and
directed by each bishop and his two counsellors. Brigham
instructed the High Councils to train their bishops (branch
presidents on the east side) to supervise spiritual as well
as temporal needs of their flocks. In Winter Quarters a
ward corresponded to a city block. Such regular, localized
services were new in Church history since in Nauvoo,
Missouri, and Ohio worship services were usually larger,
city-wide assemblies. Contributing to the establishment
of ward services were the city's lay-out and the call of
twenty-three bishops, the impossibility of housing so many
in a sufficiently commodious facility, and, most
importantly, Brigham's organizational style of operating at
the local levels. Better stewardship, better teaching, more
participation, and learning were possible on a ward basis.
Sunday ward services included conducting ward business,
sacrament (or communion), preaching, the performances of
various ordinances including the blessing of children. Usually two meetings were held, one in the morning and the
other later in the day. Often the apostles and other
leaders received rotating assignments and/or invitations to
visit and preach to specific wards. During the week,
bishops also conducted prayer meetings in which men and women studied gospel principles, bore testimony, and prayed. 39

The Sunday ward service and city-wide general meetings were dominated by the preaching of some local or visiting Priesthood authority. Women seldom, if ever, spoke at any of the Sunday services. Some of the more popular topics, certainly in 1847, were the doctrines of the gathering of Israel, the impending trek, the life of Joseph Smith the Prophet, resurrection, revelation, faith, repentance and reformation, tithing, spiritual gifts and evil spirits, and temple ordinances. On very rare occasions, various spiritual gifts were reportedly made manifest such as Brigham and Heber's speaking in tongues at a 29 December 1846 meeting. 40 An examination into the minutes of several meetings and conferences held on the east side during all of 1848 provide a doctrinal spectrum indicating what topics were then deemed most significant (see Figure 9.1, next page). 41

Weekly priesthood meetings for the elders, seventies, and high priests, the three principle officers of the higher or Melchizedek Priesthood, were regarded seriously and attendance mandated. In the absence of social and service lodges and fraternities such as the Masons, quorum activities were important and served a social as well as a religious purpose. 42 Even the bishops met in council regularly as did the High Councils. The Quorum of the Twelve, meanwhile, met almost daily.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topics</th>
<th>Frequency (number of times)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emigration</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gospel Obedience</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apostate Groups</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Last Days/World Tribulations</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church Government</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of Medicine</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repentence/Confession</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church History</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Order/Reverence</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gospel Restoration</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Priesthood</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dancing</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mission Work in England</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sacrifice/Tithing</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political Governments</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Miscellaneous Minutes, 1848, LDS Church Archives; sermons and addresses given at the Jubilee in January 1848; and the April and October Conferences, 1848.*
Women in Zion

Women, meanwhile, had to devise more informal and spontaneous gatherings to meet their needs and provide an outlet for service, spiritual creativity, dialogue, and social camaraderie. Ever since the woman's Nauvoo Relief Society had been discontinued, women were even more confined to the home and family. Any venturing beyond that domain was apt to be regarded negatively.

Her place and role were rigidly defined. As a mother in Zion or mother-to-be, woman's divinely-appointed commission was to bear and raise children, support her husband in righteousness without unnecessary meddling or nagging, and to exemplify the womanly virtues of charity, patience, unselfishness, and godliness. Brigham was particularly outspoken on the matter but perhaps not out of line with prevailing norms of the day. He preached on the subject regularly. "It is their duty to bear all the children they can," he said, "and raise them up in the Name of the Lord . . . and when she has reared them up to deliver them up to their Father's instead of meddling [sic] with her husband['s] business. [sic]"

With the average family consisting of four children, running the every-day household was an extremely busy and challenging task. A woman's normal daily duties included house cleaning, spinning wool, dress-making, finding stray cows, making cheese, gardening, preparing and cooking meals, conferring with friends and neighbors, visiting the sick,
and washing the family laundry. One writer provides an interesting insight into this last chore while the saints were still at Mosquito Creek.

This place is a poor place as to water as the spring runs very slow and gets thick very easy because of so many people and the brook is very small so that the girls have to go a mile to wash. Four of our women . . . went to go there with a wagon and stopped there the whole day to wash and did suffer much for heat and for want of wood. The water was first rate and there was also very good spring water. The women bore the burden with much patience.

Yet for a variety of very understandable reasons many women were occupied in service-oriented activities outside of the home. With so many men away with the Battalion, or working in the Missouri settlements, or on rescue missions, or herding the several fields of sheep and cattle, not surprisingly women greatly outnumbered the men at Winter Quarters. It was not unusual, therefore, to see women collectively or individually involved in a variety of activities from cattle-feeding to cabin-building. But in the nursing, aiding, and comforting the sick and dying were they most obviously involved. Charitable service, with or without their Relief Society, because of the great sickness in camp, reached new heights and is abundantly confirmed by both male and female diarists.

Vilate Kimball, wife of Heber C. Kimball, and one of the most prominent and beloved women in all of Winter Quarters, went "from door to door ministering food and consolation to the sick, and pouring out blessings upon
them, during which time she scarcely touched food herself."
Her daughter said of her and those that accompanied her on
their rounds, "by their united faith and works, with fasting
and prayer, the sick were healed."49

Those women who had received endowments and anointings
in company with their husbands in the temple before leaving
Nauvoo — and Vilate Kimball was one — were not reluctant to
lay on hands, with or without a male Priesthood bearer, and
pronounce blessings according to the need and affliction
everywhere manifest. One man told of how he called in "all
the men and women who had their endowment" to lay their
hands on his infant son's head and "according to the Holy
order and with the Signs of the Priesthood" anoint and bless
him.50 As more men left and sickness increased, the
occasions in which women blessed and administered to the
sick by the Priesthood, a practice unheard of and
discouraged in the Church today, greatly multiplied.

Gradually women began exercising other forms of
spiritual gifts and operations. Certainly their religion
sanctioned and encouraged the acquisition and exercise of
the gifts of the spirit.51

After the departure in the spring of yet another 145
men including most Church leaders in the pioneer company to
the mountains, several informal "female meetings" sprang up
all over town catering to the needs of various small pockets
of women drawn together either by family, geographical
location, or disposition and friendship. Some were held
three times a week; others, like Lucy Worker's every Thursday.

Patty Sessions tells of visiting with Eliza R. Snow and a Sister Leonard on 13 April 1847 where they "had a good time spoke in tongues, prophesied [sic] and the spirit of the Lord was with us." Again at Sister Leonards on May 1st she attended and presided at a meeting of women "got [up] by E. [Eliza] R. Snow. "They spoke in tongues. I interpreted and some prophesied." Many are the references in Patty Sessions' diary to "a feast of the good things of the kingdom" and to other "great and marvellous things" where the gifts of tongues, prophecy, healing, and discernment were reportedly made manifest.

Some claimed to have received angelic visitations while others spoke of rebuking evil spirits "by the power of the priesthood which had been conferred upon us in the house of God in connection with our husbands." Frequently, without eating or drinking," Helen Whitney recalled, "we would meet in the morning, either at my mother's or some other of my father's houses, and spend the day singing, praying and prophesying." Occasionally some of the men "who could leave their work united with us and received great blessings in connection with the sisters."

Several factors might account for this pentecostal display. As indicated, Mormon theology provided for and encouraged it claiming that "there are many gifts" and "to some is given one and to some is given another, that all may be profited thereby." Furthermore, their failure to
prevent the omnipresent suffering and death drove many to despair, distraction, and a heightened religious sense. What they couldn't do physically to prevent sickness they would try to do in faith. For many it was their last and only hope. One diarist recalls so many sick that "we thought we would have a prayer meeting, so we did. The spirit of God did attend us" he said, as they administered and blessed one another.\textsuperscript{59}

In the absence of many male defenders, fear of the hostile wilderness environment, fear of the Indians, and fear of wild animals, may have been another contributing factor. Public preaching concerning evil spirits and the belief that the Bluffs region in particular was infested with them from ages past might account for the several references to evil forces. One sister tells of how at one meeting they contended with evil spirits taking hold of their small children and being "rebuked by the power of the priesthood."\textsuperscript{60}

Loneliness and grief, accentuated by their removal from all centers of civilization and barricaded behind their make-shift walls must also be considered. Joseph G. Hovey, a recent widower, was invited to one female meeting with sixteen women in attendance and given a blessing under the hands of Laura Pitkin. He later said of it,

\begin{quote}
She laid her hands on my head and spoke in tongues. Sister Harcis [Emeline B. Harris] Whitney did interpret. . . that my wife did watch over me and my little ones and her heart entwined about me and loved me . . . She was taken from me for the trial of my faith.\textsuperscript{61}
\end{quote}
The meeting didn't dismiss until three o'clock in the morning. Others who had recently lost loved ones were similarly blessed and comforted.

Besides the need for hope and faith in a brighter day, many anticipated delivery from their enemies and the wilderness. Distended and uprooted as they were, without permanent or familiar surroundings, future prophecies and predictions were comforting and well received. Patty Sessions tells of "Sister Young and Whitney" laying their hands upon her head "and predicted many things that I shall be blessed with; that I should live to stand in a temple yet to be built" and "should be great." Their new home in the valleys of the West would in every way be an improvement over where they now were, a fulfillment and redemption of all their faith and prayers.

They took comfort, also, in believing that as bad as things were, their trials were but divine chastisements, all for their good. The less faithful and the less valiant must eventually have it much worse. Surely God would punish them.

There were things foretold . . . that are coming swiftly upon those who have turned away and are uniting their voices and influence against that Zion which we were told should be established in [the] mountains. . . . also of the wars that were right at our doors . . . that the times would be when hunger would overcome every tender feeling, and even mothers would eat their own babes. Many terrible things were so clearly portrayed to the minds of those who were present and understood as they were spoken by the gift and power of the Lord, that we felt to pray the Lord to close the vision of our minds.
Finally, the all-enveloping darkness of the long, lonely, winter nights may have played a cruel trick a time or two especially with the more sensitive or superstitious. This was a time forty years before the introduction of the electric light and lamp posts were non-existent in the city. Save for the light of the moon and stars and a few shadowy flickers of light from the occasional fire place, Winter Quarters at night and in the shadow of its own cemetery, was gripped in blackness. Might this not explain how it was that late one night

Satan, it seems, came also, and they aver that his face and shoulders were plainly visible through the window. They not only saw him, but heard his awful footsteps as he walked around outside of the house . . . and the power was so terrible, that it was only by mighty faith and the power of the priesthood that the destroyer was rebuked from their midst. 64

Upon hearing of such rumored visits, many men and women condemned these women's meetings saying it was "all of the devil" and out-of-bounds with normal perceived practices and norms of worship. 65

Although women did not have a corner on spiritual gifts since in fact men were also dreaming dreams and seeing visions; several men expressed a distinct hesitancy in getting involved, perhaps even a thinly disguised suspicion. Hosea Stout, in command of the October 1847 relief mission sent out to arrest the returning pioneer company from the valley, referred to one of their number speaking in tongues. "This was a very singular circumstance," he admitted, "for
there was not one of us who was given to enthusiastic notions of this sort which is so common with some. 66 And although Church leaders exercised their faith and gave numerous priesthood blessings, the gifts of the spirit as described above were, among them, much less public and noticeable.

In time, after Brigham’s return in the fall and as their health improved and plans solidified, and as Church leaders gave stricter counsel respecting such matters, the frequency of female meetings decreased dramatically and the operations of the gifts of the spirit declined in direct proportion. Other socio-religious practices now being introduced would more than occupy their full attention. But for many the pentecostal scenes of Winter Quarters would never be forgotten.

The unbeliever may scoff but we know that it was the Holy Ghost — the Comforter, and that faith born of it, that sustained and buoyed up the drooping spirits and lightened the cares and toils of the weary under the varied and trying circumstances that were calculated to dishearten any but Latter-day Saints, who possessed that living faith that enabled the soul to look forward to a glorious future, trusting to that Mighty One whose power had preserved and led them thus far and had delivered them 'out of the seventh trouble.' 67

Behavioral Expectations

Given, in part, to institute a "reformation" among the people, Brigham's "Word and Will of the Lord" said much about behavior.
Keep all your pledges one with another; and covet not that which is thy brother's keep yourselves from evil to take the name of the Lord in vain... Cease to contend one with another; cease to speak evil one of another. Cease drunkenness... restore that which thou hast borrowed.

The Mormon code of ethics was sufficiently strict and well enough defined that most were guilty of minor indiscretions at one time or another. A very few, laden with economic hardships and facing empty bread pantries, even reverted to criminal action such as stealing and bogus-making (counterfeiting). In the absence of any other law-keeping body, the Winter Quarters police were appointed to maintain law and order and to monitor camp obedience. To every transgression and crime a just punishment was affixed and marshalls, high councils, bishops, and especially the police busied themselves maintaining the law of the land and of the Lord. "No man need be afraid who does right" Brigham declared, but for those who didn't much could be lost.

In a series of questions designed to test the faithfulness and obedience of his Garden Grove branch, President Thomas Kington devised the following set of questions. Do you believe in the general Church authorities? Do you believe in the High Council? Do you believe in the law of tithing? Do you hold family prayer regularly? Do you attend public worship? And do you teach your children the principles of the Gospel and forbid them to swear, lie, or steal? Kington's screening interview could have been applied to any Mormon settlement at the Missouri since strict obedience was expected of everyone.
Both their spiritual and physical well-being depended on it. Since Mormons had a tendency to blame their predicaments on the community level of conformity to gospel standards, he or she who broke the law jeopardized everyone.

Their code of conduct is best described in two spheres separately definable though not mutually exclusive - religious and civil. As the "children of promise" there could be no room for such vices as habitual drunkenness, gambling, swearing, sabbath-breaking, criticizing Church leaders, lying, the non-payment of tithes, idleness, and related offenses. But in reality the offenses existed.

Gambling, a common vice of the American frontier, found its way among the saints. Whether attending some of Peter Sarpy's horse races or those of his own creation, Henry W. Miller, founder of Miller's Hollow and later the first Mormon delegate to the Iowa legislature, was temporarily removed from his post as a counsellor in the Pottawattamie High Council "for betting on a horse race."

Some refused to pay what they considered to be unjust bills. W. W. Phelps, for instance, on being brought before the High Council for not paying three bills for stray cattle said

I refused to pay - and got mad and said as bad [as] I could say. When they came to ask an explanation - told them I had said so and so but I did not mean as I said. I said as bad as I could and I don't think they could tell it half as bad as I said it, but I mean to uphold the authorities and will make any satisfaction.
Swearing was fairly common even though it was always preached against. Most, even prominent Church leaders, were all guilty of the occasional expletive here and there, but for one young man who had doubts about the Church anyway, it was his undoing.

Several of the council complained of Robert King for profane swearing, taking the name of God in vain. Counsellor Coulson said he saw said R. King sitting [sic] on the bank of the river one evening and heard him say that he had said 'by God he would never be a Mormon till the River ran up stream,' but now said he 'by God I'm a Mormon for the River runs upstream,' but soon the current took a log that was floating upstream in an eddy and carried down stream again, now said King 'I'll be Dam'd if I'll be a Mormon any longer for the River has turned down stream again.' "Council then cut R. King off from the church by unanimous vote."

Usually the punishment for such indiscretions was surprisingly mild and merciful. The image of a people, rigid as they sometimes were, ready to pounce upon every transgression, is inaccurate. "We should more than meet a man half way who confesses his errors," said Brigham. More important than all was the desire for honesty, and usually the honest penitent were forgiven. Referring to one man who had confessed his sin, Brigham counselled, "I know it and he knows it and when he confesses let it be dropped let it pass and go along as if nothing had happened."74

But Moral transgressions were usually dealt with more harshly. In September 1846, three young men were turned in for fornication. Said Stout, "They and the girls had been
out for fifteen nights in succession until [sic] after two
o'clock and that it was his wish [Woodruff's], and the wish
of the President that I should take the matter in hand." 75
As a public example to deter further similar action, each
man was whipped thirty-nine times.

The trafficking in liquor, especially among the
Indians, was considered a grave felony. In the days before
the "Word of Wisdom" (the Church's law of health) became
rigidly defined, the prohibition against alcohol was loosely
applied. 76 At Winter Quarters the problem was not so much
in the consumption (unless in excess) as in the control of
liquor. Several are the references to gay times made
brighter with liquid refreshment. 77 A few enterprising
individuals like John Pack bought several gallons of whiskey
privately in Missouri and then returned to Winter Quarters
where he sold his firebrand at 75¢ a gallon. 78 Either
fearful of indiscretions or jealous of the profits Pack and
others were making, the Municipal High Council ordered in
December 1846 that hereafter the sale of "ardent spirits"
shall be administered only by bishops "and the net proceeds
be applied to the poor." 79 The Council was suspicious that
some were selling clandestinely to the Indians. Anyone
found guilty of such traffic would be handed over to the
Indian agents "to be dealt with according to the law of the
United States." 80 Peter Haws, over on the east side, was
eventually brought before the Council for profiting off the
Indians in just this way. 81
More serious civil crimes did of course occur. Theft was not uncommon. For stealing a cow from his neighbor, one man was disfellowshipped for three months. A more serious crime was stealing from the Missouri settlers. One young man who confessed to stealing from a farmer south of St. Joseph was told by Alpheus Cutler "to return the horse as soon as possible and make amends before Missouri wreaks bloodshed on the camp." 83

Another less penitent horse thief, after having been found guilty by two bishops, was sentenced to the standard maximum penalty for serious crimes of thirty-nine whip lashes on his bare back which the marshal inflicted. In addition he was instructed to restore four-fold and pay all costs. 84

Counterfeiting seemed to be a recurring problem especially among a small ring of operators on the east side and further back at Garden Grove. 85 Garden Grove eventually earned so sordid a reputation for counterfeiting and thievery that Orsen Hyde disfellowshipped the entire branch from the Church, at least until local authorities pinpointed the few truly guilty parties. 86 Brawls, disputes, and fights occurred occasionally with reports of even one or two killings. 87

Aware that a very small minority of his people would resort to crime and to discourage it, Brigham sanctioned the establishment of a police force under the direction of Hosea Stout. Originally little more than a security guard to protect cattle, by the fall of 1846 it had become a force of
twenty-six men who received wages from the unpopular police
tax imposed upon the people. Their job was to provide day
and night protection against Indian prowlers and other
outside intruders, prevent crimes and sedition among the
people, provide security for Church leaders, spy out against
federal attacks, and to be a watchdog on camp obedience
reporting any moral or religious indiscretions to the
authorities.

Hosea Stout, who seemed to glory in his role and in the
unpopularity of his position, was glad of his reappointment.

It appears by the foregoing
organization that the system of the
'Old Police' so much feared despised
and beloved in Nauvoo is now revived
on precisely the same plan and mostly
the same men as there was which composed
the old Police in Nauvoo and with the
same Captain at their head those who
dreaded us because of their wickedness
there may well have the same fears now.
For the same men and the same organization
the same leader, the same circumstances
to act on will naturally produce the
same results. 88

It didn't take Stout and company very long to discover
sedious plots, 89 schemes to murder the Twelve, 90 and a
host of other conspiratorial activities.

The police were also instructed to keep an eye open for
"proper dancing," gambling, drunkenness, adultery, and other
moral transgressions and were told that their testimony
"should be taken in preference to any one else and we would
be safe in making all reports." 91 Certainly they held a
position of power in camp and were not hesitant to use it.
Their tactics may have been questionable yet successful. Referring to one sting operation or "police spree" to discover who was "trying to set up a gambling table," Stout said, "Several of us went into a drinking spree with some who were concerned in it. They soon got high enough to develop their plans and thus we learned all about it." 92

Little wonder they earned a dreadful reputation and were popularly despised. When Bishops Daniel Carns and Newell Knight made a move to break up a whiskey ring, it was the police who moved in and confiscated five barrels of whiskey from three illegal distributors. 93 Almost everyone including such notables as William Clayton, Edwin D. Woolley, and Charles C. Rich, despised and hated Stout and his police for going way beyond the mark. A police force was one thing; a morality squad quite another. Eventually Stout himself was put on trial for fighting with Isaac Hill. Very few came to his defense, but one was Brigham who provided guarded support and perspective. "Policemen should be men of more noble minds than to descend to such things. . . . Hosea Stout did descend [sic] to anger and swearing which was disgraceful to a policeman and men that will practice such things are not fit for policemen. Now to the Police I say stop your baldadash pray with each other." 94

Though aware of Stout's excesses and of how unpopular the police were, Brigham also realized they played too valuable a role to forfeit in protecting the camps, in
keeping people honest, and in upholding the law. With all their excesses, the police were necessary. Compliments, like the following from Joseph Fielding were rare.

It is plain that nothing but the strictest laws enforced with what some call vigor altogether considered by many in the Camp oppressive and has been a source of much evil and feeling, yet if we had not had laws a great part of our Corn would have been destroyed. Some of the Police would at times give way to passion, and would seem like blackguards . . . I have heard them call their Brethren . . . damned infernal liars. The office of Policemen is no desirable one [for] if there be any rough ones, they have to deal with them.

Fielding concluded referring to Stout as "a man of experience" and "a good man for his Place." 95

Punishments as proscribed by either the High Councils, or a regularly organized branch of the church, or bishops courts usually took the form of fines, disfellowshipments, excommunications, or whippings, whatever they saw necessary to fit the crime. 96 Whether capital punishment was one such punishment is hard to determine definitively. If ever it was inflicted, several other courts in America were doing the same.

Taken at face value, some of Brigham's statements would indicate a place for capital punishment. Referring to the wicked in camp he said that they "had better go to Missouri and spend the rest of their time with the gentiles, for . . . if they go with us and continue their wickedness their heads shall be severed from their tabernacles and the devils
that are in them shall go out." In the heat of trying to ignite a "reformation" among his people, Brigham and others may have colored their language for emphasis, for at another time he admitted, "I often say cut his infernal throat still I do not mean any such thing I am not good enough to do such a thing." While it is true that various men and women found guilty of crime feared being killed, if any of them were the records do not show it.

In the absence of any other civil authority, and in a wild frontier, it was incumbent to establish mechanisms to provide for law and order.
FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER NINE

5. Lenora Cannon Journal, 30 December 1846.
   Andrew Jenson, Latter-day Saint Biographical Encyclopedia, 4 vols. (Salt Lake City: Andrew Jenson Memorial Association, 1936) 4:704-705. This was the genesis of the future Mormon Tabernacle Choir as Goddard, soon after his arrival in the Salt Lake Valley, became leader of the Tabernacle Choir when it sang in the Old Tabernacle.
9. See Karl E. Wesson, "Dance in the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints 1830-1940," (M.A. Thesis, Brigham Young University, 1975), p.25; and Miscellaneous Minutes, 17 January 1848, LDS Church Archives.
11. Ibid., 12 January 1848. 440 were enrolled.
12. Ibid., 14 March 1848.
13. Ibid., 1 February 1848.
17. Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 5 February 1847.
19 Journal History, 20 January 1848. Although Brigham Young called it a "Jubilo" since "it could not be considered a Jubilee spoken of in revelation for all bands were not broken," most accounts refer to it as the great "Jubilee".

20 Journal of Nelson Whipple, "Spring of 1848."

21 Ibid. , "Winter of 1847-48."

22 Journal of Joseph G. Hovey, Winter of 1846-47, p. 35. It is possible this first dance of Brigham's was a particular religious rite of some kind. Sacred dances had been performed in the Nauvoo Temple a year before and this may have paralleled that experience. Mary Richards said of it,

"Brother G. [Goddard] took me on to the floor the first dance. Here for the first time I joined with those who praised God in the dance when this figure was formed it being the first, and Bro. [Albert P.] Rockwood being at the head [Brigham's first adopted son] according to order, we all kneeled down and he offer[ed] up a prayer. We then arose and danced the figure, and so praised God in the dance."

Journal of Mary H.P. Richards, 26 January 1847. The fact that many, even of the Twelve, had to be taught the steps by Brigham Young might indicate that this was no ordinary dance.

23 Journal History, 5 February 1847.

24 Husson, "Dance in the Church," p.32.

25 Diary of Hosea Stout, 14 November and 21 December 1847, 1:288 and 291.

26 Journal of John D. Lee, 23 August 1846.

27 Brigham Young to Nathaniel Felt, 4 April 1847, Brigham Young Papers. At another time Brigham said "the only lawful place to dance is in a temple or a place of endowments you will never see any music or dancing in hell neither joy or gladness will be there but these things will be in Heaven." Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 17 January 1848.

28 Ibid., 13 February 1848.

29 Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and other leaders, 23 December 1847, Brigham Young Papers. Not so much the kind of dance but its location concerned Church
leaders. Rather than go to public halls and expose themselves to base elements, the Mormons favored "the right environment - their own." Leona Holbrook, "Dancing As An Aspect of Early Mormon (Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints) and Utah Culture," (Papers Delivered at the Third Canadian Symposium on History of Sport and Physical Education, 19 August 1974), p.8, LDS Church Archives.


31 Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 16 February and 29 March 1847. McCary did more than merely entertain. A magician, one-man band, travelling side show, and musician all in one, this charlatan and his wife claimed much more. He was Adam, the Ancient of Days returned and even convinced some men and women that he was a modern prophet. Before they caught up with him, he had taught his own brand of celestial marriage violating the chastity of several women over on the east side. He was finally ridden out of town.


33 Journal of Mary H. P. Richards, 20 December 1846.

34 Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 13 December 1846. On the east side, "Presidents" supervised "branches" and were also instructed to hold weekly meetings.

35 As quoted by Tullidge, Women of Mormonism, p.317.

36 See Journal History, 25 October 1846; and Minutes of the Blockhouse Branch, 10 June 1849. The Blockhouse Branch Minute book lists over 100 names of children blessed.

37 Journal of William S. Appleby, 5 December 1847.

38 See Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 20 December 1846; and Journal History, 3 January 1847; also Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 10 January 1847.

39 Journal History, 4 January 1847.

40 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 29 December 1846.

41 Source of data for figure 9:1 is the Miscellaneous Minutes, 1848.

42 Journal History, 6 and 29 March 1847. Many in camp were Masons or at least former Masons and had at one time been members of the Nauvoo Masonic Lodge. Brigham evinced an animosity and prejudice against any secret society and any secret set of rules other than those manifested in the temple endowment. See Journal History, 6 March 1847.
The last meetings of the Nauvoo Relief Society were held in March 1844. The organization was later revived in the Salt Lake Valley. Allen and Leonard, *The Story of the Latter-day Saints*, p.161.

Journal of John D. Lee, 7 June 1846.

The average of four children per family is derived from Thomas Bullock's census of the poor camp families. Of seventeen families with parents between thirty and fifty years of age, the average family size was 5.9. Journal of Thomas Bullock, October 1846. A study of over forty families in the Mill Branch on the east side revealed a 5.6 average. *Mill Branch Record Book, 1848*, LDS Church Archives.

Journal of Eliza Maria Lyman, May 1847.

Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 17 June 1846.

The Bishops' census report, *Journal History*, 31 December 1846 indicates that at Winter Quarters the number of women exceeded that of men at a ratio of 2.5 to 1.


Diary of Hosea Stout; 25 June 1846, 1:170.

*Doctrine and Covenants*, 46:8-29.


Journal of Joseph G. Hovey, 4 July 1847, p.41.

Journal of Patty Sessions, 13 April 1847, LDS Church Archives. For a corroborative testimony see the Journal of Eliza R. Snow, 1 January and 14 March, 1847.

Ibid., 1 May 1847.


*Doctrine and Covenants* 46:11-12. Joseph Smith, however, had cautioned against excesses, especially the gift of tongues.

Journal of Joseph G. Hovey, 4 July 1847, p.41.


Journal of Joseph G. Hovey, 4 July 1847, p.41.
Journal of Patty Sessions, 29 May 1847.

Helen Whitney, Woman's Exponent 14 (1885-86):98.

Helen Whitney, Woman's Exponent 14 (1885-86):118.

Ibid.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 15 October 1847, 1:282.

Helen Whitney, Woman's Exponent 14 (1885-86):138. Ken Godfrey argues that only "a very, very few of the Mormon women" were involved in the exercising of spiritual gifts. See his "Winter Quarters: Glimmering Glimpses," p.160. However, in light of the documentation available, this does not seem to be the case. In the sources quoted above, at least twenty-two women were referred to by name and several references are made to meetings in which over fifteen people were in attendance. Certain it is that many did not participate, but equally sure is the relative popularity of the female meeting. To what extent similar activities were happening on the east side is not presently known.


Journal History, 13 September 1846.

Ibid., 7 March 1848.

Pottawattamie High Council Minutes, 9 October 1847.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 28 November 1847.

Pottawattamie High Council Minutes, 24 July 1847.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 28 November 1847.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 4 and 5 September 1846, 1:190-91.


Wine and whiskey were occasionally used even by the leaders. See Diary of Hosea Stout, 3 June 1847, 1:259; and Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve, Brigham Young Papers, 5 December 1847. Moderation rather than total abstention was the ruling guideline.

Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 3 October 1846.
Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 24 December 1846.

Journal History, 17 and 24 December 1846.

Pottawattamie High Council Minutes, 6 January 1849.

Pottawattamie High Council Minutes, 15 March 1847. Disfellowshipment was a reprimand given to a member in which he or she was deprived of the opportunities to participate in religious meetings, temple ordinances, and other Church blessings. He did, however, retain his membership.

Excommunication, the strongest religious punishment, meant the loss of one's membership in the Church including the priesthood and all other ecclesiastical responsibilities and powers.

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 1 April 1847.

See Journal History, 17 and 25 January 1848; and Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 17 January 1848.


Journal History, 19 July and 8 August 1846.

Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 14 April 1848.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 19 November 1846, p.212.

Ibid., 21-24 January, 1848, p.299.

See Journal of Isaac Haight, 1 February 1847; and Diary of Hosea Stout, 8 January 1847; 1:224.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 30 July 1847, 1:267.

Ibid., 1 January 1848, 1:293-94.

Ibid., 4 January 1848, 1:294.

Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 17 March 1848.


Apostle Orson Hyde itemized the four levels of adjudication then operative.

"A regularly organized branch of the Church is a competent tribunal to try a member for his fellowship; the Bishop's court is another; and the High Council is another, and the general assembly of the Church with their authorities is the last and highest tribunal."
The Frontier Guardian (Kanesville), 7 March 1849, p.2. For more on this subject see Stephen J. Sorensen "Civil and Criminal Jurisdiction of Latter-day Saint Bishops and High Council Courts, 1847-52." Task Paper in LDS History #17 (April 1977), LDS Church Archives.

97 See Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 20 December 1846; and Journal History, 20 December 1846.

98 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 17 March 1848.

99 See Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 28 November 1847; and Diary of Hosea Stout, 13 March 1848, 1:305.
CHAPTER TEN

ERRAND IN THE WILDERNESS

THEIR SOCIAL AND RELIGIOUS LIFE

PART II

To a people firmly convinced that they were God's chosen, His modern Israel, and freshly endowed with all the powers, authorities, and doctrines requisite for both their own salvation and that of all the families of the earth, their religion was center stage, their motivation, and raison d'etre. Most of the Saints remembered and revered Joseph Smith and now looked to Brigham Young and the Twelve to preserve the prophetic tradition and to implement the doctrines of salvation as introduced by Joseph before his unexpected death.

Brief reference was made in the beginning chapter to the importance Latter-day Saints placed on temple ordinances. Baptisms for the dead, endowments, special anointings, marriages, sealings, and other principles and practises identified with the priesthood and the temple were of commanding significance to the believer at Nauvoo. They were no less so at Winter Quarters where they dictated much of their religious and social behavior. Mormon society cannot be understood without a knowledge of its undergirding theology.
Doctrinal Foundations to Religious Practices

At the heart of their faith was the doctrine of family salvation. No man or woman could be exalted to the highest "celestial" glories, the eternal presence of God, without eternal (temple) marriage. No child could be similarly saved outside of the family unit. Through the atonement of Jesus Christ, one's resurrection, i.e., immortality, was granted unconditionally irrespective of merit. But eternal life, that exalted existence with deity, was attainable only through the mercies of Christ and one's obedience to his commands, ordinances, and sacraments, the highest of which was temple or celestial marriage.

a) The Immediate Family of the Present

Joseph Smith had taught that to obtain "an eternal weight of glory" a man must marry a wife.¹ Their marriage had to be solemnized by one having divine authority or priesthood which Mormons believed Christ and his apostles and most of the ancient patriarchs had possessed. With the proclaimed restoration of this divine authority, the "keys of the kingdom" and the necessary priesthood to officiate in the ordinances thereof were back in place. By the "Melchizedek" or higher priesthood, baptisms could be performed, blessings pronounced, sacraments administered, and all other ordinances made binding both on earth and in heaven. These were said to be the same powers which the apostle Peter purportedly held.²
Above all, marriages could now be performed not merely for this lifetime, but "for all time and eternity." Such "cestial marriages", performed in the temple, were often called "sealings" since if the partners lived deservingly and obediently, their covenants were "sealed unto them by the Holy Spirit of promise" insuring their exaltation and eternal life in the hereafter. "They shall pass by the angels and the gods, which are set there," Joseph had proclaimed, "to their exaltation and glory in all things" and shall receive a "continuation of the seeds forever and ever" - in other words, eternal increase and progression.3 Children of such a union were "born in the covenant" and automatically were possessions of their parents in an eternal family context. For newly converted families and young engaged couples, celestial or eternal marriage represented the ultimate achievement, the crowning ordination, something which they could do in this life to achieve a better one hereafter.

b) The Expanded Family into the Future

But there was more. As with the ancient Old Testament patriarch Abraham who received future promises of the future that "in thy seed [posterity] shall all the nations of the earth be blessed", so Mormons believed that with and through the priesthood the ancient Abrahamic promise would be fulfilled through them. With the restoration of priesthood ordinances and covenants so long lost to mankind, came the injunction to preach unto every nation and raise up a
righteous seed. In other words, to fulfill the divine destiny, two operations were required: first, the gospel must be promulgated to all the world; and second, a righteous posterity enlarged. Missionary work would accomplish the first half of the commandment; the Abrahamic pattern of marriage, i.e., the plurality of wives would begin to fulfill the latter.

Through this expanded form of celestial marriage, the principle of a plurality of wives and a large posterity were made possible through the practice of polygyny, by which one man had more than one wife simultaneously. It was popularly referred to as polygamy while critics and opponents usually denigrated it as "spiritual wifery."

At least as early as 1831, while translating the Book of Mormon and revising passages of the Bible, Joseph Smith, believers proclaimed, was introduced to the doctrine of celestial marriage. It was not proclaimed, however, until 1843 when announced at a session of the Nauvoo High Council. Joseph married several wives, between thirty-one and forty-five, some for eternity and others for time and eternity. It is uncertain whether any of them even bore him children.

Plural marriage was always quietly performed. Fewer than thirty families practised it in Nauvoo for fear of social scorn, persecution, recrimination, or other negative responses. It was even denied at the pulpit by some who were practising it, no doubt for personal safety reasons and for the missionary cause. Nevertheless, all efforts to the
contrary, polygamy was widely rumored about and condemned, especially by opponents and defectors as religious licence for immorality. Opposition to polygamy must be regarded as a contributing factor to the death of Joseph Smith and his brother, Hyrum. Many of Joseph's widows subsequently became the wives of Brigham Young or Heber C. Kimball.

Polygamy was likely the most peculiar and certainly the most criticized practice of early Mormonism and has received its full share of scorn and condemnation since. Yet polygamy, and the vigorous missionary attempt to win new converts, were puristically regarded as the dual means by which the totality of mankind now and in the future could obtain eternal blessings.

c) The Extended Family Throughout the Past

But what of all past generations? What part did they share in the divine scheme of things? To meet their need, the doctrine of family exaltation also extended back through all the generations of mankind. The errand of the Church was to provide an opportunity for the exaltation of the entire human family since Adam. The dimensions of such a tenet were immense and mind-boggling taxing the faith and comprehension of even the most ardent disciples.

This doctrine was based on the belief that between death and resurrection, the spirit lives on in a "spirit world" or paradise where those who never heard the gospel while on earth would somehow, sometime, be taught that message. By accepting the gospel in the spirit world and
with priesthood ordinances of baptism, confirmation, endowment, and marriage done in their behalf by proxy in the temple by those yet alive, residents of this spirit world would enjoy an equal opportunity for salvation. Said Joseph Smith of such work for the dead,

But how are they to become saviors on Mount Zion? By building their temples, erecting their baptismal fonts, and going forth and receiving all the ordinances, and sealing powers upon their heads, in behalf of all their progenitors who are dead, and redeem them that they may come forth in the first resurrection.

According to Joseph, this is what the Biblical prophet, Elijah, referred to when speaking of "turning the hearts of the fathers to the children and the heart of the children to the fathers." Temple work was the "welding link" between the present and past, the living and dead, and the key to salvation for all of mankind. This was what the apostle Paul supposedly meant "that they without us cannot be made perfect."

But the blessings flowed both ways, present to past and past to present. While the current generation could perform temple work to save the former, past generations had extended, through lineal descent, certain promises and blessings to the present. Christ's earthly claim to priesthood and royal authority, Mormons believed, came through his parents' ancestry directly back to David, Abraham, and Adam. He was an heir to the promise by lineal (blood) descent. Another example of priesthood by descent was the ancient Israelite tribe of Levi which had been
entrusted with the Levitical priesthood from generation to generation. The claim of a "royal priesthood" was, therefore, often based scripturally on lineage. By reconnecting into this ancient lineage, the legal rights to the priesthood were renewed pending divine ratification which Joseph claimed he had received.

Yet it was confusing how such blessings could have come through "unbelieving" fathers and grandparents, (many of whom had scorned Mormonism) and beyond them through centuries of apostasy. The solution lay in the now obscure doctrine that Joseph Smith, Brigham Young, and Heber C. Kimball were somehow directly related, by blood, to the "royal lineage" of the ancient patriarchal order and that through marriage or "adoption" into their families, the problems caused by the apostasy were circumvected.¹² Consequently not only were women sealed to their husbands but also were husbands and their families sealed in the temple to other men, namely, sealed as adopted sons to prominent Church authorities who claimed legal right to the priesthood and its attendant blessings and responsibilities.¹³ It was, then, to these multiple aspects of the doctrine of family exaltation that most alluded when speaking of temple work.

The Status of Temple Work in the Wilderness

To those who believed in such things, this was a glorious work. Yet both Joseph and later Brigham had stated unequivocably that these sacred ordinances were performable
only in temples. While it is true that baptisms for the
dead and several sealings had been performed in Nauvoo
before the temple was completed, once constructed the temple
was the only rightful place for such functions. 14

However, Church leaders were pestered by incessant
inquiries requesting temple ordinances in the wilderness,
with or without a temple. Brigham responded that they must
remain in temporary suspension until a later time. With
reference to sealings, he said, "there will be no such thing
done untill [sic] we build another temple. I have
understood that some of the 12 have held fourth [sic] an
idea that such things would be attended to in the wilderness
but I say let no man hint such things from this time fourth
[sic] for we will not attend to sealing till another is
built." 15

A month later he informed George Miller, who himself
was being quizzed about the matter up at the Ponca, that

> the use of the Lord's house is
to attend to the ordinances of the
Kingdom therein; and if it were
lawful and right to administer these
ordinances out of doors where would
be the necessity of building a house?
We would recommend to the brethren
to let those things you refer to, dwell
in the Temple, until another house is
built in which they may be transferred
or continued." 16

Even as late as January 1847, Brigham, who as President of
the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles was the official spokesman
on such matters, reminded his followers that until the
construction of another temple, "let such administrations,
and covenants belonging thereunto, not be named among
No doubt one powerful reason for centralizing such ordinances in one structure was to prohibit unauthorized performances and ordinations and consequent loss of control over what Church leaders viewed as sacred, unifying religious ceremonies.

But what Brigham said publicly and what he did privately not always synchronized. The pressures for exceptions came from several sources and for a variety of reasons. Many in camp were beginning to realize that some of their neighbors and associates had received more instructions, more initiations, more wives, and more blessings than themselves. Reference has already been made to the more prominent influential positions some women enjoyed who had previously received temple endowments and anointings. A similar differentiation and sense of exclusiveness existed among the men. Several had been unable to attend the Nauvoo temple through no fault of their own. Fearful, perhaps, that Brigham and the Twelve might meet disaster on their journey west and never return, they were demanding equal consideration.

Moreover, many who were sick and diseased sought a reconsideration. One man, J. W. Fox, begged Brigham to marry for time and eternity his dying daughter-in-law, Caroline, to his son, David.18 Fox’s request was only one of many from families in similar conditions. Men in the Battalion, like George P. Dykes, apprehensive of their immediate future, wrote imploring letters like the following:
I am now an orphan wandering through a wicked world without a Father of promise. Shall my days be numbered and my pilgrimage ended and I go to the silent tomb without a Father to call me forth from the deep sleep of death? or shall I enjoy in common with other citizens of the commonwealth of Israel the legal rights to adoption ... I who have spent the prime of life in defending the truth ... in the sacred death, or on the Battlefield shall I be forgotten in the day of choosing.

Finally scores of young engaged couples were requesting celestial marriage with or without a temple. It was clear to them that their delay at the Bluffs and the uncertainty of future events would postpone indefinitely the erection of another temple in the West. Joseph had made exceptions; why couldn't Brigham?

Brigham was, therefore, forced to reconsider. He was hesitant to practice in private what he had been preaching against in public. Also, he was unwilling to undermine a primary argument for moving west, namely, the building of another temple. But aware of their travel delays and the painful circumstances surrounding them, compassionate to the beliefs of his people, and anxious to continue what he fervently claimed Joseph had taught if for no other reason than to prove the validity of apostolic supremacy, Brigham began sanctioning several exceptions to his own rule. He would learn by trial and error, implementing and retracting practices as new to him as any other. Experimentation and adaptation would dictate his cautious course.
On 24 January 1847 he performed a temple sealing for Elijah Sheets and his terminally ill wife who died only eight days later.\(^{20}\) Four months afterwards Sheets remarried once again for time and all eternity.\(^{21}\) Later that year, in Willard Richards' octagon office, Rhoda Lawrence was sealed to John Loveless "for eternity" and adopted into his family.\(^{22}\) Baptisms for the dead were a rarity at Winter Quarters; however, Wilford Woodruff, with permission, performed this ordinance in the Missouri River on at least one occasion.\(^{23}\)

But such ceremonies as the above were always conducted privately. Sealings on demand were granted at Brigham's discretion usually in the cabin or hovel of the requesting party or in 'Willard Richards' office. Secrecy was almost always enjoined of the participants.

Adopting the Law of Adoption

Besides marriages and baptisms for the dead, adoption ceremonies formerly reserved for the temple were conducted in the wilderness. On 13 July 1846 Hoses Stout heard for the first time a public pronouncement on the law of adoption from apostle Orson Hyde. Hyde, anxious to recoup lost time for having been away in Nauvoo, invited as many of the unattached as he could to become adopted sons in his family.\(^{24}\) Other apostles and leaders practising the law of adoption included Willard Richards, Heber C. Kimball, Amasa Lyman, Wilford Woodruff, John Taylor, John Smith, Samuel
Bent, Albert P. Rockwood, and Newel K. Whitney had been
practising the law of adoption. Brigham alone had forty-one
adopted sons, most of whom were married with families.

The practice of the law of adoption impacted most
dramatically upon the social order of the Winter Quarters
community. It dictated social spheres of influence and
often one's circle of friends and associates. It even
determined, as at Cutler's Park, the locale of one's tent or
wagon. One's place in the family hierarchy provided some
kind of social stratification, certainly an exclusiveness
which the majority of people, not belonging to any
particular family order, never attained. Those in Brigham's
family lived fairly close together as did those in Kimball's
and Woodruff's. There was the expectation that in
return for spiritual blessings and eternal inheritances due
to their spiritual father, adopted families owed him physical
support. This explains the operation of the three family
farms, Summer Quarters, Heber's farm, and Willard Richard's
farm. Likely there were more. It also explains why
Kimball's clan lived in one part of Winter Quarters,
Brigham's in another, and Woodruff's separate yet.

Occasionally large adopted family meetings were
convened for instructional purposes. At one such meeting of
Brigham's "tribe" (Wilford Woodruff deliberately used the
term) in which all of his adopted children sat by rank
according to their position in the family, Brigham said,

Those that are adopted into my
family . . . I will preside over them
throughout all eternity and will stand
at their head. Joseph [Smith] will stand at the head of this Church and will be their president, prophet and God to the people in this dispensation. When we locate I will settle my family down in the order and teach them their duties. They will then have to provide temporal blessings for me instead of my boarding from 40 to 50 persons as I do now, and will administer spiritual blessings to them. 25

Apostle John Taylor's adopted family, consisting of at least forty-two souls, met even while he was absent on his mission to England. At least eleven families were included in Taylor's adoption most, if not all, of whom had been adopted in temple ceremonies back at Nauvoo. 26

Several went so far as to change their names, at least in private, to reflect their adopted status. This explains the Albert P. Rockwood-Young's, Thomas Bullock-Richard's, and Newel K. Whitney-Kimball's. 27

Theological considerations aside, Brigham apparently saw in the law of adoption a social force for unity. "This is the principle of oneness that this people will have to go into in order to help build one another up." If it eventually spawned individual discord, it originally, and perhaps naively, was seen as a leveler, a unifier, a means of putting all on the same footing, all brothers and sisters of one mighty family in Israel. Disparate origins and nationalities, former creeds and traditions, and ethnic differences, all would be ideally cemented together in family links where men and women would be dependent upon one another for their physical and spiritual welfare. If the unsuccessful practice of the Law of Consecration and
Stewardship (see Chapter Six) had attempted to dissolve their economic differences for the benefit of all, the Law of Adoption would blend into one the differences of culture, training, and nationality among them.

However, the practice soon spawned serious jealousies with people scrambling over one another to gain acceptance into one or other of the greater families. Some felt that unless they belonged to one of the Twelve they would lose position and influence. Church leaders tried to show that it meant no difference which family they were in, but their efforts had little effect in stemming what some saw as class stratification, competition for position, and influence - the very opposite results to the social unity Brigham had originally envisioned. This may explain, in part, why Summer Quarters, Brigham's farm, developed such controversy among adopted members of his family.

What may have been ideally regarded was unevenly, unsuccessfully practised. The whole concept was poorly comprehended even by Church leaders. In mid-February, 1847 at Winter Quarters, Brigham declared he had dreamed a vision of Joseph Smith in which he said "the brethren have a great anxiety to understand the law of adoption or sealing principles, and if you have a word of counsel for me, I should be glad to receive it." That same day during a large indoor feast with his adopted families, Brigham said of the law of adoption, "This principle . . . is not clearly understood by many of [the] Elders in this church at the present time as it will hereafter be, and I confess that I
have had only a smattering of these things, but when it is
necessary I will attain to more knowledge on the subject."

As Gordon Irving has concluded, adoption may have been
good doctrine, "but it failed to work as a principle of
social organization." In time it was discarded entirely
in favor of establishing one's personal blood lineage which
in modern Mormonism is the motivating force for the Church's
genealogical emphasis. Nonetheless while practised at
Winter Quarters the influence of the law of adoption on the
social environment was substantial. It may have been the
result of an over-anxious Brigham Young desirous of doing
what he felt Joseph Smith had done, or an agreed upon means
to more equitably share their meager resources. Whatever
the cause the Law of Adoption seems now to have been poorly
understood, and inequitably applied with at very best uneven
results.

"It is Like Handling Edge Tools"

If permission for some ordinance work was gingerly
given, permitting plural marriages was even more carefully
guarded. Brigham and his fellow leaders were certainly
aware that this was a stumbling block among their critics
and detractors and a potentially divisive issue among their
followers. The plan was to wait until they reached safety
in isolation before outlining the doctrine in full. But
concealing it until that time would be impossible; hence,
wisdom dictated a 'go-slow', low profile, approach. This
may have contributed to their decision to stay on Indian lands, away from Iowa and whatever laws the new state might pass on the matter.

Plural marriage was a new practice demanding strict control and regulation, not an easy task among 11,000 people spread over thousands of square miles. The potential for abuse and experiment was enormous and the risk of negative reactions too great to minimize. It was like gathering seeds after blowing them all over a twenty-acre field. Brigham knew it was a practise that could "cut" and compared it to the edge tools of the garden in the hands of the untrained.

When Helen Whitney had been given in plural marriage to Joseph Smith in Nauvoo, her mother admitted that "these things had to be kept an inviolate secret" since "some were false to their vows and pledges of secrecy."35 But by the time the advance company was regrouping at Sugar Creek in February 1846 several, especially the women, felt freer to discuss the matter openly. Most of those in that first company were privy to these things anyway and that company likely carried with it the bulk of Nauvoo's plural marriage households.

Eliza R. Snow, another widow of Joseph Smith and now wife of Brigham Young, said that despite the cold "we felt as tho' [sic] we could breath more freely and speak one with another upon those things where in God had made us free with less carefulness than we had hitherto done."36 Referring to
the same, more open climate, Zina D. Young, another of Brigham's wives, said of the Sugar Creek encampment,

we there first saw who were the brave, the good, the self-sacrificing. Here we had now openly the first examples of noble-minded, virtuous women, bravely commencing to live in the newly-revealed order of celestial marriage. 'Woman; this is my husband's wife!' Here, at length, we could give this introduction without fear of reproach, or violation of man-made laws. 37

Eliza R. Snow, perhaps the greatest poet in camp, knew that polygamy must be retained within strict bounds until a better day. She penned the following verse in the spring of 1847 just prior to her husband's departure from Winter Quarters to the West.

The time of winter now is o'er
There's verdure on the plain
We leave our sheltering roofs and snow
And to our tents again.

We go where hypocrites will fear,
And tremble at the word
Of him who is appointed here
To wield the two-edged sword.

We'll find the land the prophet said
In vision, when he said
'Then there will the celestial law
Be given and obey'd.' 38

While at Winter Quarters the performance of celestial marriage vows and the practice of plural marriage were at first confined to the various large adopted families. Of such marriages sanctioned by Brigham, most were for his adopted sons such as John D. Lee. As early as 21 December 1846 Lee received a plural wife. 39

Public lectures and sermons on the subject were practically non-existent. Rather, it was discussed in
private and usually behind closed family doors. For instance, on 9 February 1847, during a family meeting, Heber C. Kimball before leaving for the west gathered together five of his wives who had recently borne him children to give them blessings and promises.40

At a meeting of Brigham's adopted family a week later, Brigham and Wilford Woodruff used the occasion to expound upon the topic giving much needed instruction. "The man is head and God of the woman," said Woodruff, "but let him act like a God in virtuous principles and God-like conversation, walk and deportment . . . if not found worthy they shall be hurled down to perdition and their family and kingdom be given to another."41

After two years at the Bluffs the practise of plural marriage had gone beyond specific families and become more widespread. By the spring of 1848, William Snow, a counsellor in the Pottawattamie High Council, indicated that "it [plural marriage] had become a common thing."42

Winter Quarters, then, was a wilderness laboratory, a proving ground where leaders could see and evaluate the successes and failures of the practice. Some swore by it, others swore at it, and there were enough abuses of it to make even the stout-hearted wonder.

As with the law of adoption, the practice of plural marriage aroused several jealousies. A seemingly select few received a disproportionate number of celestial marriages. In a sermon designed to defuse the issue, Brigham also provided further justification of the practice.
Some young Elders who never preached a sermon in their lives were afraid that he should have more blessings than they, or more wives, or something or tother [sic]. He inquired if it was any man's business how many wives the Lord gives him. Let those who are jealous go and spend as much time in the vineyard as he had, and many women would cling to their skirts to be saved.43

Plural wives, then, were sometimes seen as a reward for the devoted and tested disciples.

Jealousy was certainly not only a problem among the men. People like Patty Sessions, age 52, had a difficult time reconciling herself to the fact that her husband had recently married Rosella, a much younger woman. "He has lain with her three nights," she confided in her diary. "She has told him many falsehoods and is trying to have him take her to Nauvoo and then to Maine and leave me for good."44 Things worked out for Patty since Rosella soon left and returned east, but many other marriages didn't last.45

More discord was a logical sequitur to more marriages. Evidence does not exist to show that the practice was any more of a domestic success or failure than the standard monogamous situation although the following ditty by the wife of Heber C. Kimball may have indicated an attitude even among leading women.

The Lord has blessed us with another son Which is the seventh I have Bord May he be the father of many lives But not the Husband of many Wives.46
The most critical problem Church leaders faced was controlling the practice. Some who thought themselves authorized were acting without permission. Others abused priesthood authority by trying to take unfair advantage of a situation. No plural marriages could be performed without the permission of Brigham or his designee. As early as July 1846, while yet at Cold Springs, the Quorum of the Twelve "decided that no man had a right to attend to the ordinance of sealing except the president of the Church or those who are directed by him so to do." As senior president of the Quorum Brigham, in tandem with his fellow apostles, held the "keys" or authority to direct and administer temple blessings, including plural marriages. On rare occasions he authorized others to function in his behalf.

Plural marriage, without such explicit permission, was adultery. Community wife-swapping or rotating love partners was not permissible. And going out on the spur of the moment and presuming authorization to take another wife to satisfy one's own desires was against the rules. It was considered taking unfair advantage.

A man was not at liberty to marry anyone he chose. Several factors usually had to be considered. His first marriage should be intact. The man had to be a faithful follower and a loyal supporter of the Church. Brigham, characteristically, was also concerned with economic needs and disparities, that the poorer women, the widow, and the destitute, be given to someone who might provide them with a better lot than before. In practice, however, it seems the
first wife had the major claim on her husband for support. In one case he permitted one man to marry a young woman only if he married her widowed mother as well. And usually the permission of the first wife was required. 49

On several occasions Brigham roundly condemned men for "killing an innocent ignorant female" telling her she can't be saved without a man and

that there is no harm for them to sleep together before they are sealed, then go to some clod head of an elder and get him to say their ceremony, all done without the knowledge or counsel of the authority of this church. This is not right and will not be suffered."

William W. Phelps, an advisor to the Twelve and one of Brigham's closest friends, was himself guilty of breaking the groundrules. While returning from a mission to England, Phelps stopped off at Niagara county, New York. While there, either of his own doing or by the persuasion of two sisters anxious to migrate with the Church, he instructed a local elder to perform a plural marriage if for no other reason than that he would have to spend weeks travelling in close company with the two young women.

The case eventually came before the Twelve and the Council of Seventy where Brigham exploded.

It is impossible for any man to serve the second women unless given to him by the woman [his first wife] who has the keys of the sealing powers. Then he has the privilege of taking a woman if there's nothing in the way. You are operating in the gentile world to get more wives; no, it is by the celestial law you get wives.
It makes me feel [bad] when I see men in slippery places. No man is fit to hold a license who will do such things. It is like handling edge tools. A man is in danger of bleeding and I tremble and fear. . . . [I] don't fear the Gentiles now, it is nothing to what I fear the Elders."

Brigham worried that "by the strict letter of the law this people will be cut off for whoredom, a good many of them if they don't back out." Phelps was excommunicated on the spot, but immediately afterwards reinstated with the restoration of all his church and priesthood blessings. A legal plural marriage was then scheduled.

The abuse of the sanctioning authority reached a new high in February 1848 with Henry Davis, a local leader back at Mt. Pisgah. He told his listeners that "it was the privilege of every Elder, Seventy, etc. to have as many wives as he could get and that he had the right to marry them." Twenty months later and two hundred miles further east in Iowa City, Sidney Roberts was disfellowshipped for the unauthorized performance of "the spiritual wife doctrine and in such a way as to amount to adultery." These were chilling illustrations of their greatest concerns, namely that in their desire to live the law of celestial marriage, reckless enthusiast and usurpation of authority could very easily get ahead of Church leaders who, lacking effective means of communication and speedy transportation, were often unable to exercise adequate control.
With the breakup of Winter Quarters in the spring of 1848, Brigham did not want any man to return to live in Iowa "who shall have more than one wife with him." He also advised the two or three families "who were in the patriarchal order of marriage" at St. Louis to keep a low profile and emigrate as soon as possible. Better to keep that practice to themselves where it was causing enough of a problem than to bring on further unnecessary external difficulties.
FOOTNOTES FOR CHAPTER TEN

1 Doctrine and Covenants 132:16.

2 Matthew 16:16-19.

3 Doctrine and Covenants 132:19.

4 In the early days of the Church, the term "celestial marriage" usually implied plural marriage. Daniel W. Bachman, "A Study of the Mormon Practice of Plural Marriage Before the Death of Joseph Smith," master's thesis, (Purdue University, 1975), p.19. Bachman's study may herald further research into one of the most poorly understood, hotly debated topics in Mormonism.

5 Bachman, "Plural Marriage," pp.64-68. Bachman infers that Joseph may have understood the doctrine even earlier than 1831. Bachman clearly implies that the doctrine "emerged from a primarily religious context" rather than "rationalizations for his own moral indiscretions." In this view, he stands very much at odds with Fawn M. Brodie, prominent biographer of Joseph Smith, who sees the Mormon prophet as an imaginative, creative genius, a visionary but basically immoral, at least socially naïve, leader. See her No Man Knows My History: The Life of Joseph Smith, the Mormon Prophet (1945; 2nd ed., rev., New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1971).

   See also Smith, Documentary History, V:xxxiii.

6 Bachman, pp.112-115.

7 Ibid., p.176 and p.189.

8 Smith, History of the Church, 6:184.

9 Malachi 4:5-6.


11 Brigham Young taught that even the resurrection was not possible until temple proxy work was completed in behalf of the dead. "As saviours on Mt. Zion," the saints were "to save our fathers and Israel clear back to Father Adam who are still lying in their graves and waiting for the redemption of their bodies through your instrumentality." Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 15 December 1846.

12 For a good introductory overview of the Law of Adoption, see Gordon Irving, "The Law of Adoption: One Phase of the Development of the Mormon Concept of Salvation, 1830-1900," Brigham Young University Studies 14 (Spring 1974): 291-314. A disappointingly small amount of research has been made of this phase of Mormon thought and practice.
and who originated it. Brigham taught at Winter Quarters that Joseph Smith knew of the doctrine and had "had a vision and saw and traced back our bloods to the royal family." See Journals of John D. Lee, 17 February 1847, p.91; and Diary of Hosea Stout, 28 February 1847, 1:238. Brigham took pains to convince his listeners that the doctrine was Joseph's, not his. "Joseph showed me the pattern." Journal History, 16 February 1847.

13 Irving argues that 74% of all those adopted were linked to Willard Richards, Heber C. Kimball, John Taylor, or Brigham Young. Irving, "Law of Adoption," p.245.

14 Roberts, A Comprehensive History of the Church, 2:66.


16 Brigham Young to George Miller, 20 September 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

17 Journal History, 6 and 29 January 1847.

18 J.W. Fox to Brigham Young, 23 March 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

19 George P. Dykes to Brigham Young, 17 August 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

20 Journal of Elijah F. Sheets, 24 January 1847, LDS Church Archives.

21 Ibid., 6 April 1847.

22 Trustees Minutes, Brigham Young Papers, 21 November 1847.

23 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 4 April 1848.


25 Journals of John D. Lee, 16 February 1847, p.83. One of Brigham's first sermons in the Salt Lake Valley was on the adoption doctrine. See Journal of Horace K. Whitney, 15 August 1847.

26 Journal of Leonora Cannon, 2 January 1847.

27 Diary of Hosea Stout, 13 July 1846, 1:178, editor's footnote.

28 Diary of Heber C. Kimball, 31 January 1847.

29 This is the contention of Juanita Brooks. See editor's note, Diary of Hosea Stout, 9 December 1847, 1:290.
Decades later it remained a tenet of mystery and debate. In 1887 several Church leaders said that "even among the members of the Twelve Apostles there seems to be little known about the laws of Adoption. . . . President Geroge Q. Cannon said he did not understand the matter." Daily Journal of John M. Whitaker, 16 November 1887 as quoted in Bachman, "Plural Marriage," pp.150-51.

Journal History, 16 February 1847. The overriding conviction many held that they were true descendants of the ancient patriarchs may well have contributed to the pentecostal fervor of the times. Bishop Newel K. Whitney, during a Kimball family assembly and himself one of Kimball's senior adopted sons said "don't marvel if you should see many great things in your midst yet while you live that you now not have the least idea of; I should not even wonder if some of our old holy fathers should visit us in the flesh whilst we live." Journal of Heber C. Kimball, 14 February 1847. Little wonder, then, that Whitney later tolerated the many women's gatherings, prayer meetings and blessing sessions in Winter Quarters during the summer of 1847.

Journals of John D. Lee, 16 February 1847, p.86.


Said Henry Jacobs, a recently returned missionary from upstate New York,

"No, I did not teach the doctrine.
I defy any person to say I ever taught
a man to have more wives than one,
but I had to contend with it. It is
in every man's mouth, every child in
the east knows it. I've been so
close-pinched as to tell a lie."

Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and several seventy, 30 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

Tullidge, Women of Mormondom, p.369.


Tullidge, Women of Mormondom, p.327.


"About 6 eve. Pres. B. Young by
permission, not according to law,
as the sealing ordinances were stopped
when the Endowment stopped in the
Temple for that ordinance belongs to
the Temple alone, solemnized the right
of matrimony between Emeline and myself.
[He] charged the family to lock these things up in our breast and there let them remain.

Journals of John D. Lee, 21 December 1846, p.43.
Several of Lee's at least fourteen wives were sealed to him at Winter Quarters. Journals of John D. Lee, 27 February 1847, p.103.

40 Helen Whitney, Woman's Exponent 14 (1885-86):11. Two of these five wives, Sarah Ann Whitney and Lucy Walker, were former wives of Joseph Smith who Kimball then remarried "for time only."

41 Journals of John D. Lee, 16 February 1847; p.81.

42 Minutes of the Pottawattamie High Council, 18 March 1848. Snow was condemning the practice of men taking wives and then not supporting them adequately.

43 Journal History, 13 September 1846.

44 Journal of Patty Sessions, 4 November 1846.

45 Minutes of the Pottawattamie High Council, 18 March 1848.

46 Journal of Mary H. P. Richards, 10 February 1847. This was written on the occasion of the birth of her son, Solomon.

47 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 24 July 1846.

48 Patriarch John Smith, for one, who remained back in the Salt Lake Valley during the first year of that settlement, was authorized "to seal Sister Mercy Thompson widow of Robert Thompson to any good man holding the Priesthood that she may choose." Brigham Young to John Smith, 1 September 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

49 There is some confusion on this matter. Polygamy, without the assent of the first wife, was akin to bigamy. It therefore was customary for the husband to remember the "Law of Sarah" and ask the first wife for permission for a later marriage, although this was not rigorously enjoined. If it had not been strictly required in Nauvoo (see Bachman, "Plural Marriage," pp.165-66), at Winter Quarters it was demanded of almost all men. See minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and of various Seventy, 30 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

50 Journals of John D. Lee, 16 February 1847, p.80.
Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and of various Seventy, 30 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers. Phelps' case points out that women may often have compounded the problem by requesting, even demanding, a plural marriage. Certainly women were not passively sitting by.

Ibid.

Journal History, 11 February 1848.

Pottawattamie High Council Minutes, 6 October 1849.

Meeting of the Twelve Apostles, 13 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

Ibid.
CHAPTER ELEVEN

"I AM GOING TO GO IT, THE LORD BEING MY HELPER"

THE REORGANIZATION OF THE FIRST PRESIDENCY

In the afternoon of 27 December 1847, sometime about 2:30 p.m., Orson Pratt, at a special conference of the Church, introduced the matter of business everyone had come to hear - the reorganization of the Church and the re-establishment of the First Presidency. On a motion by William W. Major, the name of Brigham Young was presented as "first President of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints." Heber C. Kimball and Willard Richards were then proposed as President Young's first and second counselors. A "clear vote" by the congregation was registered for each.1 Thus, after a period of three-and-a-half years, the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints was once again organized as it had been before 27 June 1844.

During this 1,283 day interregnum, the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles, with Brigham as president and spokesman, had managed a bewildering array of tasks including the completion and dedication of the Nauvoo Temple, the pronouncement of the endowments and anointings to a large host of believers, the exodus from Nauvoo, the call of the Battalion, the establishment of Winter Quarters, and the
founding of a new headquarters in the Great Basin. Now they would make one final contribution — the reorganization of the First Presidency.

Though destined to forever remain a point of debate, recent scholarship does indicate that Joseph Smith had given the Twelve a charge to 'bear off the kingdom' at least in the short run.\(^2\) Orson Hyde, writing within three months of Joseph's death, had said

> We have had a charge given us by our Prophet, and that charge we intend to honor and magnify. It was given in March last... To us were committed to Keys of the Kingdom, and every gift, key and power that Joseph ever had confirmed upon our heads... We know the charge which the prophet gave us.

Samuel W. Richards, in a letter to Franklin D. Richards, described in greater detail Hyde's comments.

> He said that Joseph was preparing them for the work that they have now got to do which is to hold the keys and build up this kingdom in all the world. Joseph committed unto them all the keys of the Priesthood otherwise the fulness would not have been upon the Earth now [that] he is taken away.

Wilford Woodruff, before leaving on his mission to England in the summer of 1844, also indicated that Joseph "had ordained, anointed and appointed the Twelve to lead the Church" and that upon "your shoulders the Kingdom of God must rest in all the world."\(^5\)

Nonetheless there is also increased evidence indicating Joseph's desires that his son, Joseph Smith III, remain sufficiently loyal and faithful to his teachings so as to assume eventual leadership in the Church. On 17 January
1844, Joseph Smith blessed his son, Joseph Smith III, then but a boy of eleven years of age, to be his eventual successor "an appointment [which] belongeth to him by blessing, and also by right." Most of the Twelve, as they carried on in the absence of their former leader, understood their apostolic charge while remembering young Joseph's blessing and in the days to come would struggle, argue, and debate over the question of Church leadership. For Joseph had given Church leadership to the Twelve without appointing a named successor. A mandate given the Twelve was one thing; re-establishing the First Presidency quite another. If the apostles understood that they had the right to direct the Church, at least temporarily, they did not immediately comprehend (or at least agree among themselves) that they held the authority to appoint another "first president." It was a matter more easily, more expediently postponed than resolved at least in the turbulent short run of 1844-1847.

In the meantime Brigham was acting head of the Church by right of his position as president of the Quorum. If in that tormented summer of 1844 a vacuum of leadership had developed, by late 1847, at least in the minds of thousands at the Missouri, that void had been impressively filled. Brigham had steadily emerged as the dominant, incontestible guiding force in the Church. If Joseph Smith had obtained his appointment by celestial mandate, Brigham was proving his in the crucible of trial and failure, mud and mountain, sickness and sixth sense, boldness and self confidence bordering on arrogance, tempered with compassion. By late
1847 the question wasn't who should lead, but in what capacity and in what presiding quorum, why here, and why now.

**Apostolic Interregnum**

During these three years the Quorum of the Twelve solidified its supremacy over ecclesiastical affairs. In October 1846 at a conference in England, Orson Hyde motioned "that the Twelve be acknowledged in their standing, according to the appointment of Joseph, our martyred prophet, as the 'counsellor' of the Church and 'director of all her affairs." As noted earlier, it was the Twelve that appointed the two high councils on either side of the Missouri River, the Twelve that dispatched explorations and relief parties, and the Twelve that directed mission work to England and the east coast. And it was the plan of the Twelve Apostles that gained the supremacy over the Council of Fifty for the final trek west. Their temporary leadership, as even George Miller admitted, "was pretty generally conceded to them, as they were the quorum next in authority and presidency of the whole Church."

Brigham, speaking later of the role the Twelve performed said,

Joseph told the Twelve the year before he died there is not one key or power to be bestowed on this Church to lead the people into the celestial gate, but I have given you, showed you, and talked it over to you the kingdom is set up and you have the perfect
pattern, and you can go and build up the Kingdom, and go in at the celestial gate taking your train with you.

As the stock of the Quorum of the Twelve rose, so did Brigham's personal star. As Quorum president since 1841, he was its head and mouthpiece, a leader among equals, and their presiding authority. On one occasion in December 1846 he asked the Quorum their opinion of him "when all present expressed the best of feelings and their approval of his course."11 Hosea Stout that same month referred to him as a prophet and leader to this people."12 As their guide, he often reproved his own colleagues and junior apostles in the Quorum.

Wilford Woodruff, writing before the succession conference, spoke of the relationship between Brigham and the Twelve. "The Quorum has always sustained him it has been a general principle it is our duty to uphold him... Brother Young has sometimes occasionally given me a little touch [but]... There has been more union in the quorum under Bro. Young than under any other man."13 Brigham was effectively the acting President of the Church by right of his Quorum presidency in the absence of a First Presidency.

He was also popularly regarded as the sole authority to adjudicate temple sealings, the one man who held the keys or ultimate authority in the priesthood. Shortly after arriving on the west bank of the Missouri River, the Twelve held a very private meeting in which it was determined "that no man has a right to attend to the ordinance of sealing except the president of the Church or those who are directed
It was to Brigham that all requests for sealings, adoptions, and other temple ordinances had been directed, for as he said "if the lot is in me, I have the keys." And it was to Brigham that most important administrative decisions were referred and appeals from lower bishop and high council courts presented.

And midst it all, Brigham increased in self-confidence and boldness. At one point in Iowa, Heber C. Kimball and Willard Richards had publicly contended with him over the timetable for the move west (see Chapter Two); but afterwards, although they may have had differences, they raised them in quiet, quorum privacy. As Brigham tightened control, he manifested growing confidence in his abilities and decisions that some saw as arrogance and which alienated others. For example, while determining a matter of tax assessments, he lectured members of the Winter Quarters High Council

that when the authorities devise a plan do not find fault with it and if you find a man that knows more than you follow him. A man who stands as a counsellor to this people sees as in open vision . . . a thousand things that others do not and if he's always been right do not be afraid to follow him. We would have been far from here [Winter Quarters] now had it not been for want of confidence in him.

Objections and criticisms notwithstanding, Brigham was de facto leader over every aspect of Mormon life. Little wonder, then, that by the succession conference in December 1847 Orson Pratt said, "If I were to go to every man and
woman to ask who is the man, they all know the man." Echoed Amasa Lyman, "He is at the head already." 18

Objections to Re-establishing the First Presidency

If the popular sentiment supported Brigham's leadership, several were apprehensive about forming a First Presidency. While some of their misgivings were well-defined and clearly articulated, others were more subtle and unexpressed. Some posed constitutional arguments, others doctrinal, and a few personal. While no concerted opposition ever developed, an uneasy hesitancy permeated Quorum deliberations.

The timing was questioned. Should Brigham now assume the presidency if Joseph had truly desired his sons Joseph or David to inherit the post? Some supposed "that by appointing a presidency it is robing [sic] some of the rising generation or taking someone's rights." 19 Others wrote letters urging an indefinite postponement so as not to pre-empt the appointment of one of Joseph's posterity. 20 A disciple of George Miller later defended Miller's apostasy claiming that he represented one of many who believed that "young Joseph Smith was appointed by his father to succeed him" and would not accept Brigham's overtures toward the First Presidency. 21

Besides, why get rid of a good thing? If the Twelve had performed so well running Church affairs, why change it? "If three are taken out to become a first presidency" complained Wilford Woodruff, "it seemed like severing a body
in two . . . . I desire that it should continue on as it was."22 Brigham himself had often sermonized on the enduring benefits of unity in priesthood quorums, wards, and branches epitomized in the good will, love, and esteem fellow apostles held one for another. George A. Smith, another apostle said, "I want to stick together as we have done . . . We are good fellows and better in harmony. If three are picked out there may be jealousies. . . ." He concluded, "If it's the will of the Lord that their course should be taken I will twist myself to it but it's not my will."23

Several Quorum members seemed chary of providing Brigham a raised platform from which he could publicly chastise his fellows. Several had already felt Brigham's oral whiplashes and feared that unconstrained, he would speak his mind outside of the Quorum and in public. Said Amasa Lyman, "It murders me to the bottom of my soul to have my name handled before the members of the Church. I have no fears about what may be said by this Quorum concerning me . . . if I do wrong I would like to be told of my faults in the presence of my friends." George A. Smith added, "If there is any chastening, let it be in the Quorum, and let me have it . . . I should like the President to respect the feelings of his Quorum."

Orson Pratt, who originally raised this issue perhaps more as a request of Brigham rather than an objection contended that
The President is the mouthpiece but he has no right to chastise him [a fellow apostle] behind his back. I do not believe Pres. Young has it in his heart to prejudice the minds of the people against anyone of the Quorum. But still it has that effect and I consider it materially wrong. . . .

There is no man in this Quorum who I respect more than Brother Young, and no man that I would wish sooner to be at the head than Brother Young . . . and although I consider I have seen errors in him, I feel that I could lay down my life for him, yet I feel for the rights of my brethren.²⁴

Orson Pratt, alone among all the apostles, opposed the reorganization with constitutional arguments. "There is no authority higher in decision than 7 of the 12," he declared believing that a simple majority of the Twelve was "the President" or supreme power in the Church.²⁵

I do consider the head of this Church lays in the apostleship united together. Paul says 'apostles are set in the Church,' not one individual . . . The Doctrine and Covenants points out that the First Presidency with the Twelve shall do so and so and there is where I consider the highest power lies in the hands of the apostles.

Comparing government by the Twelve to that in Washington, Pratt argued that the Speaker of the House was but a president among equals and that "The majority of the House of Representatives decide and not the speaker."²⁶

The corollary to Orson Pratt's constitutional argument was his doubt that the Twelve held the authority to appoint three of their number to a position higher than they individually or collectively held.
Have the other nine the right to do that, to give such power to the three? Have we a right to make the decision of three of the Twelve [i.e., a New First Presidency] higher than the Quorum of the Twelve or seven when the Book of Covenants say we have the Twelve? If they have that power there is something in the dark yet. The three men need an ordination to be appointed presidents. Who will ordain them? 27

In other words, can the creation be greater than the creator?

Echoing Orson's concern was Wilford Woodruff's belief that a revelation would be required to reorganize the First Presidency. A quorum "like the Twelve who had been appoint[ed] by revelation, confirmed by revelation from time to time . . . would require a revelation to change the order of that quorum." 28

Finally, there ran an undercurrent of unsettling concern that may have been the root cause of all their hesitations. With all of their accomplishments and with all respect to Brigham Young, could there really be another Joseph? Could a 'second' First Presidency ever equal that of the first? The memory of Joseph Smith was still fresh and powerful and his spiritual legacy, so firmly fostered by the Saints, loomed ever so large. Joseph Smith they eulogized as "the Prophet and Seer of the Lord, [having] done more save Jesus only for the salvation of men in this world, than any other man that ever lived in it." It was Joseph, they so believed, who had witnessed the visions and revelations of the restoration, who had received the keys
and powers of God unto salvation, and who had been divinely chosen to bring forth modern scripture. He claimed an almost deified image among the Saints. "He lived great, and he died great in the eyes of God and his people," declared apostle John Taylor. Could anyone ever take his place?

These, then, were some of the prominent questions and concerns in the minds of various members whether in or out of the Twelve. Joseph may have given the Twelve a mandate for leadership and Brigham may have been popularly accepted as spiritual and temporal leader, but it simply was not obvious to most or a natural sequitur that the Twelve had the power or felt the need to appoint a First Presidency.

"Now is the Time to Take Another Stride"

When did Brigham become concerned with the reorganization? Speaking only four months after the fact he indicated that it was "our right and privilege and was at the first conference after Joseph's death to reorganize the Church, but we were not obliged to do it. It was wisdom not to then." Nor was it while crossing Iowa and establishing Winter Quarters. There were then more pressing concerns. The first intimation may have come during the Quorum of the Twelve and Council of Fifty deliberations in the winter of 1846-47 for George Miller later intimated that he first heard of the proposal to reorganize in January 1847.

In the ensuing months, Brigham discussed it on an individual basis, seldom if ever with a full council of even his closest advisors. Orson Pratt inferred that Brigham
first expressed his views "on the other side of the mountains" (Salt Lake Valley). And if not before, Brigham certainly broached the topic while returning from the Valley in the fall of 1847. Wilford Woodruff said that on 12 October 1847, during the return journey to Winter Quarters, he "had a question put to me by President Young what my opinion was concerning one of the Twelve Apostles being appointed as the President of the Church." Said Brigham, "From Great Salt Lake City till now 'theappings of the Spirit to me is the Church ought to be now organized.'" Once back at the Missouri, the matter was discussed intently throughout November.

The timing may have been affected by the uneasy concern over the real and perceived apostasies occurring at Winter Quarters. Reference has already been made to the fact that so many were leaving that Apostles Pratt and Taylor closed down the ferry while taking other deflecting measures. If he hadn't suspected it earlier, Brigham heard of these defections first hand from Pratt and Taylor during their prairie meeting at the Sweetwater River in early September.

That some were defecting because no president had been sustained is seen in Levi Graybill's decision to leave the Church. "I think that it was in the spring of 1847", Graybill recalled years later, "that Bishop Miller came ... and stated to us that we had no church, for the church could not exist without a head, and that we were without a prophet in the flesh."
Meanwhile, James J. Strang, for all the scorn and derision some Mormons were heaping on him, was enjoying a measure of success and as the head of his own First Presidency became a rallying figure for those converted to Joseph but disenchanted with Brigham.

Furthermore, there were legal considerations. Some of the property yet unsold in Nauvoo and Kirtland, including the temples, had been assigned to Joseph's successors "in the First Presidency" or as his successor "as trustee for the Church." Emma Smith, Joseph's widow, bitterly opposed Brigham, refused to go west, remarried, kept her sons with her, and laid claim to as much property in Nauvoo as she possibly could. The heart of her complaint seems to have been her opposition to the practice of plural marriage although other attendant factors — personal, financial, or otherwise — played their part. Like a cat clutching at a carpet, Emma was fighting back and Brigham would require all the legal Church authority he could get.

Subsequently he injected a sense of urgency into November's discussions, and was alone in demanding a solution to the matter. Several times he overrode his colleagues who wanted to discuss other matters. Even court cases turned into deliberations on succession. He was the spark, the catalyst, and driving force and, like a bulldog, persisted through until the resolution. As he said on one occasion, "I am going to go it, the Lord being my helper." But before he could, he'd have to confront and resolve each of the questions and objections presented above.
To the issue of whether he was "robbing" the Smith sons of their supposed right to leadership, he said very little. The passage of time had persuaded many that neither Emma nor her sons would ever join them in the wilderness. Brigham may once have hoped that Joseph Smith III or David would come west, as some have argued, but by late 1847 he was acting under no delusions.\textsuperscript{41} Several vain attempts had been made both before and after the reorganization to bring the family west. For example, in April 1847, in a letter to Lucy Mack Smith, aging mother of the Prophet, Brigham pled with her not to remain with her daughter-in-law.

\begin{quote}
Be assured of this that our faith and prayers have been and are and will be for your welfare; we will rejoice in your prosperity, and as we have hitherto done so will we continue to bless you by all the earthly means in our power. . . . and if our dear Mother Smith should at any time wish to come where the Saints are escorted and she will make it manifest unto us, there is no sacrifice we will count too great to bring her forward and we ever have been, now are and shall continue to be ready to divide with her the last loaf.\textsuperscript{42}
\end{quote}

Several others tried in person to persuade the Smith family, but to no avail.\textsuperscript{43}

Even after December 1847 repeated efforts were made to coax the family west, especially Joseph Smith III, for Brigham's presidency need not prevent one of the sons from eventually taking their place in the Quorum of the Twelve and possibly becoming president of the Church.\textsuperscript{44} George A. Smith, a cousin to Joseph Smith III and regarded as an
amiable man and one of the best peace-makers in the Church, while still in Kanesville wrote the following to young Joseph:

It is my present calculation to move, with my family to the Mountains this summer. I should be happy if you could find it convenient to accompany me. One great work accomplished by your father was the building up of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. About 5000 of that body are already congregated in the mountains, who would be much pleased to see you in their midst. Consult your mother on this subject, and do as wisdom shall direct. But if you shall conclude to make the journey, I should be much pleased to enjoy your company.

Emma and her son never accepted the offer. Eleven years later, Joseph Smith III became founding President of the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints. Having tried without success, yet keeping the door open to a later possible change of heart on their part, Brigham argued that he had done all he reasonably could in this matter.

To the matter of administration, Church government had to be streamlined and made more efficient. The need to employ the apostles in far away places to supervise missionary work, deflect Strang and other contenders, and manage emigration matters weighed far more heavily on Brigham's mind than retaining the quorum around him. He loved his colleagues (as he once declared, "as I love my eyes") but the role of the apostle as decreed in scripture was to be a "special witness" to all the world. Not administration but testimony was their special
responsibility. "Now is the time to take another stride," he said. "Here's the nations of the earth to be gathered. Cut your heart and things and let them expand." The apostles "ought to be in England and in Germany and in France and in Canada, every man ought to be distributed all over the world." Fresh on his mind was the progress Farley P. Pratt, John Taylor, and Orson Hyde had recently achieved in reordering the affairs of the Church in England. Nor could any of them forget their successes in 1841 when the apostles had baptized hundreds in Great Britain. They belonged abroad, not at home.

Amasa Lyman seconded Brigham's proposal. "The interests of Zion are to be watched over in the Valley, States, Europe and all other parts of the world. The quorum has to be spread abroad", while the president is required at headquarters. "Somebody has to preside. I presume three will go to the Valley, there they will . . . watch over the interests of Zion. They may send me," Lyman concluded, "to preside over the Gentiles."  

The logistical difficulties of apostolic presidency were becoming increasingly apparent. While the Church had been travelling as a unit, problems were immediate and addressable. But now that part of the Church was over the mountains, some of the Quorum would have to reside there while others would be needed at the Bluffs over the next several years. Others would be dispatched on missions elsewhere. How could such a disseminated Quorum preside effectively? How could even a majority be available when
required? The problems already encountered between Brigham Young and apostles John Taylor and Parley P. Pratt regarding their supervision at Winter Quarters were sufficient evidence that as united as they were, differences of style, philosophy, and priority very much existed and might eventually cause serious rupture. In sum, government by the Quorum was cumbersome, inefficient, and susceptible to disruption. It was possible, but not preferable and Brigham compared it to fighting with one hand tied behind his back.

Establishing the First Presidency would not only reorient the Quorum of the Twelve but also provide stabilization and direction to the other leading quorums and councils. The First or presiding Council of the Seventy, the third most powerful quorum in the Church, was to assist the Twelve in missionary work. Until the Twelve functioned in that capacity, the role of the presiding Seventy was confused. "When a First Presidency [is] appointed," argued Brigham, "it sets the Seventy at liberty to go and do their business."

Of necessity we must have a quorum to stay at home. Of necessity we must have a quorum to preach to the nations of the earth, ordain patriarchs, bishops. Of necessity we must have Seventy to assist. It is of necessity we have helps, governments in the Church because one quorum cannot tend everywhere.

A First Presidency, concerned with both spiritual and temporal affairs, would also prevent the Council of Fifty from ever assuming temporal leadership. "If you throw the kingdom into the Quorum of Fifty they can't manage it," said
Brigham. That group of men was a "debating body" at best, George A. Smith added, an advisory group regardless of all former commissions and expectations. Three of its fifty members weren't even supposed to be Latter-day Saints. In Brigham's mind at least, government by the Council of Fifty was unthinkable. And certainly the local high councils could never assume leadership over all the Church despite a few scattered arguments otherwise. In short, Brigham argued the re-establishment of the First Presidency, like a keystone in the arch, "when fitly framed together" gave order and stability to the entirety of Church government.

To the widespread concern that he might overstep his bounds and publicly chastise his former colleagues, Brigham was unbending. As President of the Quorum for six years he already had the right and responsibility to correct his colleagues and underlings. What difference would it make if he were "lifted up a peg"? A stout defender of open communication and of his rights as president to reprove his junior officers, Brigham "would not be trammelled." Defending his point he said, "Joseph's instructions were if one of the Twelve were to go into wrong, just go and get him home and smother it up. But I talk to men because I want them to live . . . not . . . to die. . . . The only way to save . . . men is to talk as I do . . . I believe I am able to classify what is right and what is wrong." Someone must have the final say. Unflinching, he argued,

I would rather have been shot in Carthage Jail than be under the necessity of owing to run to my brethren before I
can speak before the public. Must men be eternally grumbling because my stick is the longest... If my lot [as senior president of the Twelve] is to preside over the Church must I eternally be asking when should I speak? If this body is the head of the Church, I am the head of the Quorum and I am the mouthpiece and you are the belly.

Having witnessed the former excommunication and later reinstatement of both Orson Pratt and Orson Hyde, (who were posing the immediate objections), and having seen the fall of several other apostles since 1835, Brigham was not about to commit to silent passivity. Whoever is at the head "must be a lion." It seems most likely that Pratt's objection was more a personal dislike of some of Brigham's forthright mannerisms, not his right to lead.

To counter Orson Pratt's more serious contention that seven, i.e. a majority of the Twelve, were the supreme authority in the Church, Brigham replied this may have been possible in the absence of a First Presidency, but for logistical reasons already identified was impractical. Willard Richards countered Pratt's comparison to a republican form of government by asserting that the Church was not a democracy, but a "theo-democracy, the power of God untrammeled." It was not run by popular vote but by divine mandate. As Joseph had received revelations binding on the Church, he reasoned, should his true successor function with any less freedom? "There is not a set of men on earth who can say that a revelation from the Lord is wrong."

Brigham and Richards may have detected Pratt's real uncertainty and bottom-line reservations. Did the Twelve
have the right to appoint a First Presidency? Furthermore, could Brigham ever approximate the seer and the prophet Joseph had been? In answer to the first question Brigham relied on precedent. He asserted that Joseph Smith and Oliver Cowdery had received by revelation from the ancient apostles the Melchizedek Priesthood and the keys of the apostleship. They, in turn, ordained each other to the office of apostle. As the presiding apostle, then, Joseph had the right to assume the presidency of the Church.

Though the Church membership elected or sustained Joseph as a prophet, seer, and revelator, Brigham argued "he never was ordained to that office." His apostolic ordination presupposed his claim to the First Presidency. "If there is an apostle in the Church all the keys are totally rested in him." Just as Joseph had obtained the First Presidency by right of senior apostleship, so could and should it happen again. With Oliver Cowdery "gone by the board" (excommunicated in 1838) and Joseph "gone to the grave," the rightful solution was once again apostolic succession. Brigham's convincing argument was that an election or an appointment of any other potential candidate could not pre-empt what was rightfully now his by ordination. "You can't make me President because I am President you can't give me power because I have it." What he sought was the unanimous approval and support of the Twelve.

Finally, to Woodruff's and Pratt's demand that such a change must come by revelation as unmistakable as Joseph's, the answer may have come by degree. Heber C. Kimball,
perhaps Brigham's closest supporter and confidant, told his fellow apostles that "since the organization of this Quorum Joseph organized in prison since then there has been a revelation from the Lord appointing Brother Brigham as President." But Kimball's plea did not convince everyone, certainly not Orson Pratt. Brigham knew that in Pratt's eyes "Joseph is still the first President of the Church." A careful review of Brigham's public pronouncements throughout the history of Winter Quarters reveals an unmistakable pattern, an almost conscious effort at forging links between himself and Joseph. His well-known dream of 17 February 1846 was, significantly, of Joseph and further established Brigham as his spokesman.

Joseph stepped toward me and, looking very earnestly, yet pleasantly, said 'Tell the people to be humble and faithful, and be sure to keep the spirit of the Lord and it will lead them right. . . . Tell the brethren to keep their hearts open to conviction, so that when the Holy Ghost comes to them, their hearts will be ready to receive it.

"I want you all to remember my dream," Brigham told the Twelve and his adopted family a few days later, "for it is a vision of God and was revealed through the Spirit of Joseph." On another occasion, he claimed that he and Joseph were spiritual brothers and were both heirs to the priesthood by blood to the ancient patriarchs. Perhaps the most obvious connecting line drawn between the two was "the Word and Will of the Lord" of the preceding January which had been accepted as revelation by the various
quorums, councils, and members at large. Besides establishing apostolic supremacy and giving instructions for the move west, it ended with this very important linkage.

[Be] faithful in keeping all my words that I have given you, from the days of Adam to Abraham, from Abraham to Moses, from Moses to Jesus and his apostles, and from Jesus and his apostles to Joseph Smith, whom I did call upon by mine angels . . . and by mine own voice out of the heavens, to bring forth my work;

Which foundation he did lay, and was faithful; and I took him to myself.

Many have marveled because of his death; but it was needful that he should seal his testimony with his blood . . .

Now, therefore, hearken, O ye people of my church; and ye elders listen together, you have received my kingdom.

In other words, despite Joseph's death, to the believers, the Church was still divinely recognized and the powers still operative within the Twelve and its leader. Though there was no mention of names other than Joseph's, the connection was not missed. Three days later Brigham had said to a body of the Priesthood "that the Church had been led by Revelation just as much since the death of Joseph Smith as before." It was a theme he never relinquished in public or in private. Some may have interpreted it as aspiration, but the majority apparently viewed it with comfort and reassurance.

Only after reassuring Pratt that indeed he had received visions and revelations "as plain as he ever told Joseph and when it comes to you, you will see just as plain," was the
matter finally settled. On 5 December 1847 at 9:40 p.m. in Orson Hyde's home near Miller's Hollow, the nine apostles there assembled motioned, seconded, and sustained Brigham Young as President of the Church with Heber C. Kimball first and Willard Richards second counselor.

"Hosanna, Hosanna, Hosanna"

With the Twelve having approved the establishment of a new First Presidency, it remained only to place the matter before a meeting of the general membership. Contrary to some insinuations that the succession conference was called at a time and place where few could attend, interest was so high that new and larger accommodations were required. A conference began 4 December 1847 at Miller's Hollow, but the meeting house was "so crowded," Wilford Woodruff complained "we could not do business." Subsequently, Brigham adjourned the meetings and appointed Henry W. Miller to superintend the construction ("under the direction of the Twelve") of a much larger, more commodious meetinghouse, to be completed as soon as possible.

Miller immediately went to work and called upon the services of "about 200" men to assist in construction. Nelson Whipple recalled that he made the sash for the window and that nearly everyone in Miller's Hollow and surrounding areas "were cald [sic] on to do something towards it." Within three weeks of hard winter labor, it was completed. Built with logs cut three miles away and carted to the site, the "Kanesville Log Tabernacle," as it came to be called,
The Kanesville Log Tabernacle

Source: Journal History
was impressively large, sixty feet west to east and forty feet north to south. The walls were eight logs high and the log roof was covered with willow, straw, and dirt. A large fireplace angled outward at the west end and two stoves were placed in the building. Also on the west end was a recess of about eight by fourteen feet for the pulpit and clerk's bench. Behind the pulpit were two windows with eight lights (panes:) each. Two similar sized windows were located on the north wall and one on the south "between the two large doors for entrance." The Tabernacle was "capable of containing 1000 seated" with Norton Jacob describing it as "the biggest log cabin in the world." It stood near Indian Creek four miles from "the Point" [Council Point] and near the Block house.

The conference reconvened on Friday, Christmas Eve day in the Tabernacle that was "so very new," said Thomas Bullock that, "it felt cold and somewhat unpleasant." In the first session of conference Orson Pratt consecrated and dedicated the building "as a house of prayer and thanksgiving." "We greatly rejoice at the privilege of meeting under such favorable circumstances," he said, "not pent up as we were three or four weeks ago and we rejoice in your diligence and faithfulness in building the house."

During the following four days the festive spirit of the season was punctuated with numerous addresses and messages from high Church leaders during the day and dancing at night. On Sunday Wilford Woodruff spoke of their new city in the West, Orson Pratt on the victory of the Twelve
over Sidney Rigdon and James J. Strang, Amasa Lyman on the
importance of gathering to Zion, George A. Smith on the
Nauvoo Covenant and the exodus from Nauvoo, Heber C. Kimball
on the need to repent and flee from the gentiles, and Ezra
Taft Benson on "following the torch" of Church leadership.

But their messages seemed increasingly lost in the
growing suspense that a new First President was about to be
appointed. Sunday night, Heber C. Kimball had said to the
conference audience of over 700, "Come here tomorrow and ye
shall have one of the best days you've ever had and see if
we can't have a fire that will not go out from this time
henceforth and forever." Brigham added, "Bring your dinners
and stay all day."78

The following morning, Monday, 27 December, broke clear
and cold and sunny with a calm southwest wind. Well before
ten o'clock over a thousand men and women "crammed" into the
Log Tabernacle to participate in one of the principal days
in the history of the Church. The marshal kept calling for
people to clear the aisles, crowd the benches, free the
seats at the front on the raised platform for the High
Council and the Twelve, and not to crowd the fireplaces and
stoves. Many kept their coats on and several spread buffalo
robes down the rows and across their laps to keep warm.

In the early afternoon after singing "Come, Come Ye
Saints" with accompaniment provided by the Winter Quarters
band, Orson Pratt raised two issues of special concern. The
first related to the pressing demands on the Winter Quarter
mill and the need for fair use and consideration in applying
for time; the second was "in relation to the full organization of the Church."

"The time has come" he said, to reorganize the First Presidency "in order to defeat the adversary." "We have been able to overcome apostates and the powers of darkness with the highest quorum taken away out of our midst. How much more shall we be able to overcome them when we have all the quorums flourishing." After three or four other speakers, the motion was made, the second tendered, and Brigham Young sustained without a dissenting vote as "the first President of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints". His two counsellors were likewise approved and John Smith, uncle of the Prophet Joseph Smith, was lastly sustained "as patriarch to the whole Church."

In Brigham's acceptance remarks he claimed the presence of "the Spirit of the Lord" and that

this is one of the happiest days of my life. There is nothing more done this day than I knew at the death of Joseph. ... Joseph told the Twelve there is not one principle or key to enter in the celestial Kingdom but I have given you ... The Kingdom is set up and you have the perfect pattern and you can lead the Kingdom in at the gate. I am going to rest.

Hosea Stout, a witness to the event, said of Brigham's discourse that it "was very interesting and was received with breathless silence [and] the Spirit rested down upon the whole congregation ... to an uncommon degree."
At the conclusion of the conference, the audience broke out in the sacred chorus used sparingly at such occasions as the dedications of both the Kirtland and Nauvoo Temples: "Hosanna, Hosanna, Hosanna, to God and the Lamb, Amen, Amen, and Amen." Said George A. Smith, "Now the thing is right."

The history of the Mormons at Winter Quarters will be remembered for many things, for it was there on the banks of the Missouri that many suffered and died, proved their discipleship or opted for a new life elsewhere. At Winter Quarters, the trek west was finalized, new doctrines practised and made public, and a unique life style developed. Yet it is entirely possible that the single, most important development at the Missouri was the emergence of the principle of apostolic supremacy and its logical consequence, apostolic succession. What happened in relative obscurity at the Kanesville Log Tabernacle in 1847 established a precedent that continues to dictate ecclesiastical government to this day.
FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER ELEVEN

1 Minutes of the Conference in the Log Tabernacle, 27 December, Brigham Young Papers. See also Journal of Norton Jacob, 24-27 December 1847.

2 The Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints (RLDS), headquartered in Independence, Missouri, has always claimed succession by lineal descent. The president's chair should properly belong to Joseph's descendants. The first president of the RLDS Church was Joseph Smith III and succeeding presidents have come from the expanded family descendants of Joseph and Emma Smith. For a review of the RLDS position, see Russell F. Ralston, Succession in Presidency and Authority (Independence, Missouri: Herald Publishing House, 1958), and W. Grant McMurray, "True Son of a True Father: Joseph Smith III and the Succession Question," Restoration Studies, I, Sesquicentennial Edition, ed. Maurice L. Draper and Clare D. Vlahos (Independence: Temple School, the Auditorium, 1980), pp. 131-41.

In contrast, the position of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (LDS), commonly called "Mormon" or the "Utah Church" has been that of apostolic succession. This tenet calls for the elevation to the First Presidency, the highest ecclesiastical office in the Church, of a member of the second ranking quorum, the Twelve Apostles, traditionally the President of that quorum. For a detailed discussion of the LDS viewpoint, see B.H. Roberts Succession in the Presidency of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (Salt Lake City: George Q. Cannon and Sons, 1900), and Joseph Fielding Smith's similarly entitled work "Succession in the Presidency of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints" (Salt Lake City: 1964).


Ehat argues that those succeeding Joseph Smith had to have the highest ordinances, endowments, and second anointings of the Temple, i.e. "their calling and election made sure." Quoting Samuel Richards still further, Ehat continues
"He [Joseph] also took them through all the ordinances which is necessary for the Salvation of Man, that they having experienced them all, by passing through them, might be prepared to lead the People in the path which they had trod when he had finished his work ordained and anointed the Twelve to lead this people."

5 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 25 August 1844, as quoted in Ehat, "Temple Ordinances," p.208. A copy of the actual "charge" has not yet been located.

6 Ehat, "Temple Ordinances," p.137. Ehat argues that Joseph Smith III and his younger brother, David Hyrum, were the only children born of Joseph and Emma Smith after they had received temple sealings and endowments. Hence they were "born under the covenant" and were heirs to eternal blessings. Esplin contends that David, born after his father's death, was even more favored. See Esplin, "Joseph, Brigham and the Twelve," p.318. Clearly Joseph wanted to see his sons eventually carry on in the work he had begun if they remained faithful and true.

7 Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 17 October 1846.

8 See Chapter Eight.


10 Brigham Young to Orson Spencer, 23 January 1848, Brigham Young Papers.

11 Journal History, 19 December 1846.

12 Diary of Hosea Stout, 30 December 1846, 1:221.

13 Miscellaneous Trustees Minutes, 15 November 1847.

14 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 24 July 1846.

15 Miscellaneous Trustees Minutes, 17 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

16 See Sorensen, "Civil and Criminal Jurisdiction" for an overview of Brigham's place in court action. Time and again Brigham single-handedly ruled on criminal, doctrinal, ethical, and moral matters. See Minutes of Meeting of the Twelve and Council of Seventy, 30 November 1847.

17 Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 20 December 1846.

18 Minutes of the Log Tabernacle Conference, 27 December 1847.
Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 6 April 1848.

Miscellaneous Minutes, Log Tabernacle Conference, 6 April 1848.


Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve Apostles at Orson Hyde's home, 5 December 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

Ibid.

Miscellaneous Trustees Minutes, 15 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers. Pratt may have had in mind the severe chastisements that Brigham levelled against Parley P. Pratt (Orson's brother) and John Taylor when Brigham's eastbound returning party met with the Pratt-Taylor westbound emigration train on the Sweetwater River in early September 1847. Pratt himself had been thoroughly scolded on various occasions.

Miscellaneous Trustees Minutes, 17 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve, 5 December 1847. See Doctrine and Covenants 107:24 for Pratt's contention that if the Twelve were equal to a First Presidency, why choose one.

Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and various Presidents of Seventy, 30 November 1847.

Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 12 October 1847.

Doctrine and Covenants, Section 135.

Said Joseph Young, Brigham's brother and President of the Council of Seventy, "Brigham Young has suggested a new thought to me that the Church has the authority and can make a Presidency." Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and Presidents of Seventy, 30 November 1847.

Miscellaneous Minutes, Log Tabernacle conference, 6 April 1848. There are several other references to this apparent purposeful postponement.


Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve at Willard Richards home, 15 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers. It may be that Brigham viewed the overland journey west as an
ideal time to discuss the issue privately with each of the Twelve. This may partly explain his serious displeasure with John Taylor and Parley P. Pratt who refused to go in Brigham's advance company. He later expressed dissatisfaction with other activities of Pratt and Taylor, especially their bringing back unauthorized polygamous wives. He also opposed their alterations to the authorized style and make-up of emigration parties. See Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 4-7 September 1847; and Miscellaneous Trustees Minutes, 17 November 1847.

34 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 12 October 1847.


36 See Chapter Ten.


38 Minutes of a General Council meeting, 22 January 1848, Winter Quarters, Brigham Young Papers.

39 Lawyer Almon W. Babbitt, one of the Nauvoo Trustees, described Emma's activities in a letter received just after the reorganization.

"She has made a deed of the whole White purchase to four lawyers . . . the intent is to brake [sic] up the title to the Church, holding the action that a religious corporation cannot hold more than ten acres of land . . . this conveyance operates as a compleet [sic] estopel of our selling lands in the city . . . .

Emma has joined the Methodist Church . . . they [the Methodists] are laying plans to get in possession of the temple and other properties through Emma . . . the effect of Emma's operation will operate strongly against the Trustees closing out the business."

A.W. Babbitt to Brigham Young, 31 January 1848, Brigham Young Papers.

40 Miscellaneous Trustees Minutes, 17 November 1847.


42 Brigham Young and the Twelve to Lucy Mack Smith, 4 April 1847, Brigham Young Papers.

43 Nathaniel Felt to Orson Hyde, 1 June 1847, Brigham Young Papers.
One of Hyrum's sons, Joseph F. Smith, was so appointed and indeed did become president of the Church from 1901 to 1918. In turn, his son, Joseph Fielding Smith, Joseph Smith's great nephew, was an apostle for over sixty years and served as president from 1970 to 1972.

George A. Smith to Joseph Smith III, 13 March 1847, RLDS Library and Archives.


Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve, 5 December 1847.

Ibid.

Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and some of the Presidents of Seventy, 30 November 1847. During the Winter Quarters period there were approximately thirty-six quorums of seventy in addition to the First Quorum of Seventy. A full quorum consisted of seventy men.

Ibid.

Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve, 5 December 1847.

Pottawattamie High Council Minutes, 6 January 1849.


An on-going debate during these years was whether a "high priest" held greater authority than a "seventy." If so, members of a High Council such as at Winter Quarters and across the river should have more say in the shaping of Church policy than seventies. Joseph Young, President of the First Council of Seventies, even believed that if the Twelve were ever annihilated "some of the High Council would be for leading the Church." Such a philosophy may have motivated Alpheus Cutler, one-time senior president of the Winter Quarters High Council, to later quit the Church and organize his own in western Iowa. See Pottawattamie High Council Minutes, 18 November 1848; and "History of the Cutlerite Faction of the Latter-day Saints," Journal of History 13 (October 1920):454-57.

It is significant that neither Winter Quarters nor Kanestville were ever "stakes" of the Church. Such an organization (comparable to a diocese or parish), represented permanency whereas Brigham wanted their stay at the Bluffs to be only temporary. The two high councils at the Missouri, therefore, were "travelling" and not "standing" seats of government and not permanent. "We are only travelling and have stayed all night" said Brigham to the Winter Quarters High Council about their stay at the Missouri, "and the Council is only to regulate things for the morning - anything done here is not a precedent."

Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 19 December 1847.
Miscellaneous Trustees Minutes, 17 November 1847.

Ibid. Brigham did not hesitate to criticize in public or in private when he saw the need. Years later, after word had been received in Salt Lake that many in the Martin handcart companies had perished of exposure and starvation, Brigham came down so hard on Franklin D. Richards and Daniel Spencer during an open conference of the Church "that it was years before Richards was ever again of much consequence in the councils of the Church." Stegner, The Gathering of Zion, p.258.

Miscellaneous Trustees Minutes, 17 November 1847.

Doctrine and Covenants 27:12 and 128:21. Brigham argued that Peter, James, and John were a First Presidency. "Joseph said so many a time." Peter was the president. Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and members of the Council of Seventy, 30 November 1847.

Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve and members of the Council of Seventy, 30 November 1847.

Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve, 5 December 1847.

Miscellaneous Trustees Minutes, 17 November 1847.

Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve, 5 December 1847.

Journal History, 16 February 1847.

Diary of Hosea Stout, 28 February 1847, 1:238.

Journals of John D. Lee, 17 February 1847, p.91.

Doctrine and Covenants 136:37-41.

Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 17 January 1846.

Journal History, 5 December 1847.

Minutes of a meeting of the Twelve, 5 December 1847. The three missing apostles were Parley P. Pratt and John Taylor, then in the Salt Lake valley, and the wayward Lyman Wight in Texas.


See Journal of William I. Appleby, 4 December 1847; and Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 4 December 1847.

Journal of Nelson Whipple, "Winter of 1847-48."
Lawrence D. Clark concluded that the Log Tabernacle was built near or on the location of Harmony, Benton, and Frank Streets in present Council Bluffs. Papers of Lawrence D. Clark. Gail Holmes, another local historian, has placed it between Baughn and Logan, north of Harmony St. The Log Tabernacle is not to be confused with the Pigeon Creek Tabernacle (53'x32') built in 1849 and located six miles north. See George A. Smith to Brigham Young, 7 May 1849, Brigham Young Papers.

After the succession conference the Log Tabernacle was used extensively for church conferences, balls, and dances, and as a meetinghouse for the Blockhouse Branch. For several months the Pottawattamie High Council convened in it. But the damaging spring run-offs of 1848/49 inflicted irreparable damage on the structure seriously weakening its foundation and supports. Some efforts were made to raise the floor and repair the building but with little success. It apparently was dismantled in the fall of 1849 and many of the logs re-used in the building of the Pigeon Creek Tabernacle. See minutes of the Pottawattamie High Council, 26 August 1849.

The Tabernacle was built on the Iowa side rather than at Winter Quarters because of the recent decision to abandon Winter Quarters the coming Spring.

Conference minutes, 24 December 1847, Brigham Young Tabernacle.


Ibid., 27 December 1847.

Ibid., 27 December 1847.

CHAPTER TWELVE

"LET YOUR HEARTS BE TOWARDS THE SETTING SUN"

KANESVILLE, IOWA, 1848-52

Kanesville, Iowa, so named 8 April 1848 by Orson Hyde in honor of Colonel Thomas L. Kane, and forerunner of present-day Council Bluffs, Iowa, was never meant to be a permanent colony. It was not Church headquarters, but rather a springboard for emigration and a temporary gathering center for the Great Basin trek. Since the Church was determined to pull up stakes from the Bluffs region rather than set down roots, whatever success individual Mormons had in permanently establishing themselves in western Iowa proved counter-productive and embarrassing. Abandonment, not establishment, was the watchword.

Figuring in the final decision to vacate Winter Quarters was the expectation that it would "accelerate the departure of the saints generally." In reality, however, the Kanesville which grew out of Miller's Hollow on Indian and Mosquito Creeks, continued longer than anticipated involving itself in Iowa politics, coping with large numbers of British Mormon immigrants, accommodating onrushing waves of California-bound gold seekers, and witnessing continued threats to the unity of the Church.

Kanesville was designed to be a fitting out place, a lay-over town where those too poor, tired, discouraged, or unprepared could delay their journey, plant and sow crops,
procure teams and outfits, and make all necessary preparations. And as these left for the mountains, new arrivals from the East or from overseas would take their place and repeat the preparation cycle. The whole scheme was printed and disseminated to all the branches of the Church in December 1847 in the form of a "General Epistle to the Saints."

Gather yourselves together speedily, near to this place, on the east side of the Missouri River, and, if possible, be ready to start from hence by the first of May next . . . Let the Saints who have been driven and scattered from Nauvoo . . . gather immediately to the east bank of the river . . . and let all the Saints in the U.S. and Canada gather to the same place . . . and when here, let all who can, go directly over the mountains; those who cannot, let them go immediately to work at making improvements, raising grain and stock . . .

To the Saints in England, Scotland, Ireland, Wales, and adjacent islands and countries, we say, emigrate as speedily as possible to this vicinity.

As with both Garden Grove and Mt. Pisgah, Kanesville would serve as an expanded way station, a place of rendezvous and jumping-off point. As President Brigham Young prepared for his second and final journey across the plains, he blessed the site of Winter Quarters praying that "no gentile city might ever be permitted to settle on it," and the Pottawattamie lands as a resting place for the Saints.

The Lost and Straying Sheep

During the winter lull before the actual breakup of Winter Quarters in May 1848, Brigham and the Quorum of the
Twelve tried to strengthen their position by sending a small army of missionaries back east and overseas. Their task was multiple: 1) supervise immigration to Kanensville and then to the Valley of as many as possible from wherever possible; 2) counter bothersome Strangite crusades and the deflecting efforts of other contenders; 3) collect desperately needed funds from both Mormon and non-Mormon sympathetic sources; and 4) proselyte wherever feasible. Most of the one or two hundred men sent east from Winter Quarters beginning in November 1847 were instructed to return by spring to prepare their families for either the overland journey to Salt Lake or the removal to Iowa.\(^5\)

This small platoon of emissaries fanned out in all directions, some by carriage down the Missouri River valley, others on foot or wagon eastward across Iowa in small groups with each man eventually separating for his assigned place of destination. On 28 December 1847 Apostles Ezra Taft Benson, Erastus Snow, and Amasa M. Lyman in company with William E. Appleby, Thomas Flanagan, Preston Thomas, and an Elder Davis travelled in disguise through Missouri revisiting such anti-Mormon strongholds as Liberty and Independence.\(^6\)

Once in St. Louis they held several meetings, outlined future plans and procedures, and in the process raised between $600 and $700. During January arrangements were completed to print 3,500 copies of the General Epistle for distribution to American and British branches of the Church. Afterwards, the party divided with Benson and Snow bound for
the eastern seaboard, Preston Thomas for Texas, and Appleby for New Jersey. Wherever these and other missionaries travelled, they circulated the Epistle, called for funds, confronted adversaries, and preached their religion.

They enjoyed some measure of success. Erastus Snow returned with at least $3,000, a third of which came from Josiah Quincy, mayor of Boston. Benson returned in late April with another $2,000, and Lyman with $1,200. In one public meeting in New York City on 3 March 1848, sponsored by Thomas L. Kane, an unsuccessful effort was made to raise $5,000. Others enjoyed much less success, reporting no more than $25 in contributions. In all, almost $10,600 was raised that winter season.

Preston Thomas's two later missions (one in 1848 and the other in 1849) symbolized the determination to counter apostate actions. Sent specifically to Lyman Wight who was beginning a proselyting war of his own, Preston Thomas and William Martindale arrived in Wight's colony in southern Texas on 31 December 1848, preaching and baptizing along the way. After spending two nights and a day with the estranged apostle, Preston reported that Wight was "alienated in feeling entirely from his Quorum and the Church, pronouncing them all apostates" and that night evinced a particular bitterness toward Orson Hyde and Brigham Young. Rebuffing every invitation at reconciliation, Wight scorned his two visitors who then went on their proselyting ways through Texas before returning to Kanesville the following spring.
 Meanwhile, George W. Bratton called upon another former apostle, William Smith, brother to Joseph Smith, in Ottawa, Illinois. Smith had been endeavoring in vain to create his own following. He also possessed certain valuable documents and artifacts which Church leaders wanted.  

Jonathan C. Wright's mission to eastern Iowa and Nauvoo "to preach the Gospel and set things in order" brought him into contact with several branches abusing the law of polygamy. He excommunicated many for adultery along the way having practised polygamy without authority. While in Nauvoo Wright called on Emma Smith and once again invited her and her sons to come west. "She received me very coolly," he wrote. "She says she don't pity them that suffer there; they might have known better and they knew she never told them a lie in her life. She says the first thing that Brigham teaches his followers is to lie."  

Incorrigible and unflinching, Emma and her sons would not, could not be budged.  

Other missionaries, like James Henry Clines and Charles Dolton, spent much of their four months in upstate Illinois and Wisconsin instructing all who would "to gather up to Council Bluffs where they could finish obtaining an outfit for the Salt Lake Valley." They even visited James J. Strang's headquarters in Voree, Wisconsin to learn firsthand what Strang was doing, and to argue Brigham's cause.  

To what extent these money-raising, proselyting, gathering missions succeeded is debateable. Though short-lived and sporadic, they did break the long silence
from the Church in the wilderness and fanned the fires of whatever allegiance some may still have held for the faith. The money gleaned was desperately needed; the lines of conflict more rigidly pronounced.

The British are Coming

While the eastern American branches of the Church responded with only lukewarm support as a result of confusion and divisions among the local congregations, many British converts, notwithstanding Reuben Redlock's 'joint-stockism', were awaiting only the means and the word to come. Realizing that much of the strength of the Church lay overseas, Brigham had sent out a gathering directive to the British Saints even before the "General Epistle." "Say to the saints, Come," Brigham ordered Orson Spencer, then president of the Church in Britain, "for all things are ready and let them flock in clouds to New Orleans, where they will meet some one of the Elders, duly authorized to council them in reshipping to this vicinity."15 The plan was to transport the British immigrants from New Orleans up the Mississippi to St. Louis and from there via the Missouri River to Kanesville. Nathaniel Felt was assigned clearing agent for the Church in St. Louis and Lucius N. Scovil in New Orleans. Special care was to be taken to prevent new arrivals from falling into the hands of the Strangites.

Costs were to be minimized. Those with means were expected to give of their surplus for the less fortunate. Those who did not, Brigham warned, "are not worthy to be
called saints, and the sooner they drop the name the greater will be the credit to the Church." A direct voyage to New Orleans would nullify the need for expensive overland transportation. By combining Church orders for St. Louis freight goods with shiploads of English converts on the same steamboats, costs could be minimized. A year later, in 1849, Church leaders established a revolving fund out of donations of cash and property by those settlers already in the Valley for those anxious but too poor to come on. By chartering entire ships, handling all transportation costs and ticket sales, this Church-run travel agency, called the Perpetual Emigration Fund, proved a boon to emigration, particularly in the 1850’s.

After a three year delay, British Mormon emigration renewed in February of 1848 when 120 set sail for America from Liverpool, another eighty in March, and twenty more in April. 146 arrived on board the river steamboat "Mustang" on 21 May 1848, marking the first direct arrival by ship of British Saints to the Bluffs. That season five ships sailed from Liverpool to New Orleans with 650 souls bound for Kanesville and the West. From 1849 until 1852 another 6,130 Britons arrived at the Bluffs usually disembarking at or near Council Point, 4 miles south of Kanesville.

Early Kanesville and Surrounding Settlements

The evacuation of Winter Quarters, combined with the British arrivals, created a network of small satellite settlements stretching into present Mills County in the
# FIGURE 12.1

**LIST OF MORMON BRANCHES/COMMUNITIES**

**IN WESTERN IOWA AS OF 31 DECEMBER 1848**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Branch/Community</th>
<th>Branch President (Where known)</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Allred's</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. B.S.M's Creek</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Big Bend</td>
<td>Jonathan Browning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Big Grove</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Big Pigeon</td>
<td>Uriah Curtis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Big Spring</td>
<td>Sam Brown</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Blockhouse</td>
<td>Moses Clawson</td>
<td>In Kanesville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Burtrand</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Carterville</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Cooley's</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Council Point</td>
<td>George Coulson</td>
<td>5 mi. south of Kanesville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. D.D. Hunt's</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Farmersville</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Ferrysville</td>
<td>David Williams</td>
<td>North of Kanesville-east of Winter Quarters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Galland's Grove</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Harris Grove</td>
<td></td>
<td>20 mi. north of Kanesville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. High Prairie</td>
<td>Ezra Bickford</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Highland's Grove</td>
<td>Martin Bushman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Honey Creek</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Hydes Park</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Indian Mill</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Indian Creek</td>
<td>Lewis Zebuskie</td>
<td>At old Indian town 9 miles from Winter Quarters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Kanesville</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Keg Creek</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. Lake Branch</td>
<td>Benjamin F. Bird</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. Long Creek</td>
<td>Samuel Gates (Bishop)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28. Macedonia</td>
<td>A.H. Perkins</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. McOlney's</td>
<td></td>
<td>Also spelled McAulney's</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. Mill</td>
<td>S.G. Clark</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31. Mosquito Creek</td>
<td></td>
<td>8 mi. north of Kanesville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32. North Pigeon</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
33. Old Agency  William B. Simmons  7 mi. north  
of Kanesville
34. Pigeon Grove  James D. Allen
35. Pleasant Grove  Martin Bushman
36. Pleasant Valley
37. Plum Hollow
38. Poney Creek
39. River
40. Shirts
41. Silver Creek
42. Springville  Henry Williams
43. Unionville
44. U. Keg Creek
45. Welch Branch
46. West Fork Boyer  North of  
    Kanesville
47. Whiskey Point

Farther south were branches in St. Joseph, Savannah,  
and Western Missouri.

*Sources: a) Minutes of the Pottawattamie High  
    Council, 15 July 1848
b) Silas Richards to the First  
    Presidency, 10 October 1848, Brigham  
    Young Papers
c) Journal of Erastus Snow
d) Journal of Warren Foote
e) Journal of Nelson W. Whipple
f) The Frontier Guardian
g) Journal History
north and Fremont County to the south. As Aitchison has pointed out, "strictly they were not villages, or even hamlets [but] merely the collection within easy distance [of Kanesville] of a handful of farm houses in a grove on a creek, with a school or church, and perhaps a mill or trader's stock." 22

Although small settlements had been spreading from the Bluffs east to the Nishnabotona River since the summer of 1846, the 1848 proliferation of hamlets in the area far exceeded anything seen before. Wrote Nelson Whipple, "many gatherd [sic] up from Nauvoo and other places this summer [sic] and made heavy settlements in all directions on the good land that aboundes [sic] in the country." 23 Several of these clusters operated their own horse or water-powered grist mills. By mid-summer 1848, twenty-four branches representing small settlements were in operation. 24 Three months later another seven were added to the list, and by year's end over forty existed. 25 (See Table 12.1) A branch president managed local affairs in his area and reported directly to the Potawattamie High Council. 26 Circuit riders, high councilmen, seventies, even apostles visited the outlying communities on a regularly assigned basis (weather permitting) to preserve unity, encourage emigration, and to assist the poor and destitute. 27

Meanwhile Kanesville arose on the old Miller's Hollow site on Indian Creek and rapidly became the hub of all Mormon communities in the Bluffs region. During the Jubilee celebrations in January 1848, the town lay-out was proposed,
road construction planned, and timber claims granted. The Quorum of the Twelve decided that Kanesville must serve three purposes: be the commercial and religious center and temporary headquarters of the Latter-day Saints in the region; be the receiving point for incoming emigrants and outfitting post for west-bound travellers; and provide settlers with an opportunity to improve the land for later sales to non-Mormon newcomers at a profit (as at Garden Grove and Mt. Pisgah).

From the Log Tabernacle built on Harmony Street just down the hill and west of the old Blockhouse fort, the town grew rapidly in several directions. Further east, on what then was Hyde Street (now 1st Street), Orson Hyde built his own home. By 1849, a passing traveller described the place (often misspelled "Canesville" or "Cainsville" in contemporary sources) as "a scrubby town of 80 to 100 log cabins" situated "three miles from the river in a deep hollow." By 1850, another visitor counted 350 houses "principally of logs." By this time the business centre of town had developed on Indian Creek near the Log Tabernacle at the corner now occupied by the First Methodist Church of Council Bluffs. On or near Hyde Street, a large, two story schoolhouse was erected which later served as the county's first courthouse. The population of Kanesville proper, though ever in flux, reached 5,000 by early 1852.
As at Nauvoo and later at Winter Quarters, the Mormons organized themselves into a militia. In July 1848 Charles M. Johnson was appointed "colonel of the whole of the military among the saints in Pottawattamie County." Until the formal establishment of a county and the election of recognized civic authorities, the Pottawattamie High Council under the direction of Apostle Orson Hyde ruled on matters both Church and state. The Council met biweekly, first in the Log Tabernacle, later at Hyde's home, and eventually in the large Kanesville schoolhouse.

The four years of Hyde's supervision over affairs in Kanesville (he was sustained in conference as "President of the Church east of the Rocky Mountains") were some of the most rapidly changing and perilous times in Latter-day Saint history. With Brigham and most of the authorities now transplanted to the Valley, it was once again left to Hyde, as had been done earlier in Nauvoo, to complete unfinished business, settle conflicts and defections, and facilitate migrations westward. It was enough for Hyde, in his sometimes self-congratulatory manner to proclaim, "I have sometimes thought that no other man in this Kingdom ever took such responsibility and performed so much labor for nothing and then work with his own hands to earn bread before he eat it."36

"Sliding Between Wind and Water"

Space and time forbid a thorough historical review of Kanesville life, but three themes demand some attention:
politics; economics; and apostasies. The official directive was not to get involved in Iowa politics and not to take sides, but "to slide between wind and water," protect their interests, and flee the state. President Young and Heber C. Kimball boasted little confidence and trust in either political party. However, the large numbers of Mormons then settling in Pottawattamie lands were a tempting target for both Whig and Democratic candidates, especially in an election year. In sharp contrast to their waning days in Nauvoo, Mormons in Kanesville were courted by Whigs and Democrats, especially the former who rightly sensed a Mormon sentiment against the Democrats, the party of Thomas Ford, Lilburn W. Boggs, Senator Thomas H. Benton, and Martin Van Buren. In a state where party allegiance was very evenly divided, the large Mormon vote could make a substantial difference.

Both the Whigs (who controlled the state's senate) and the Democrats (who had a majority in the state's lower chamber) knew the Mormons had political demands. They were especially anxious to establish a county organization as well as a post office in Kanesville since the nearest post office was over seventy miles away to the South. During the Jubilee celebrations of January 1848, 1,805 males signed a petition for a Kanesville post office, and a similar number for a county organization. A county organization would not only insure locally elected state representatives, sheriffs, justices of the peace, and other officers but also facilitate land pre-emptions and the right to dispose of
lands and improvements by sale at the appropriate time.
Much better to have their own county and local leadership,
they reasoned, than be a mere outpost precinct of Monroe
County under the rule of non-sympathetic "Gentiles".
Eventually, after much jostling on all sides, the Kanesville
post office was established in March 1848 with Evan M.
Greene as postmaster. Pottawattamie County was organized
24 September 1848 with William Pickett organizing sheriff.
It was some time, however, before county officers were
elected.42

The vying between Whig and Democrat reached a climax
during primary run-offs in August during which contenders
for high state offices repeatedly visited Kanesville to
court local favor. The resulting overwhelming margin of 491
Whig to 32 Democrat votes was disturbing to the losing side
and may have been the cause of various vote-counting
irregularities which conveniently omitted the Mormon vote
thereby assuring a Democratic victory in Monroe county.43

The first representative from Pottawattamie county to
sit in the General Assembly of Iowa's state legislature was
Henry W. Müller, elected in 1850, founder of Miller's
Hollow, and early member of the Pottawattamie High Council.
He was followed in 1852 by Archibald Bryant.44

Political differences in Kanesville were epitomized in
the divergent viewpoints of Apostle Orson Hyde and former
Nauvoo trustee, Almon W. Babbitt. The gulf between the two
men widened with volleys of published charges and counter
charges between the two. Babbitt claimed Hyde willingly
went to Washington for $850 from Whig party coffers to set up a printing press. While Hyde denied all charges of corruption or bribery, he made no effort to conceal his political biases. All through its four year history (7 February 1849-12 May 1853) the first town newspaper, The Frontier Guardian, with Hyde as editor, displayed a marked pro-Whig stance.

For his part, Hyde charged Babbitt with undue manipulation and unauthorized intervention in Washington as an uncommissioned spokesman for the Mormon cause—a charge not without substantiation for even Thomas L. Kane advised President Young to summon Babbitt away from Washington for unbecoming, selfish conduct. Apostles George Albert Smith and Ezra Taft Benson believed that Babbitt was negotiating to deliver to the Democrats a Mormon vote in return for "a fat appointment at Uncle Sam's expense in the Great Basin, Oregon or California." Eventually, after Hyde's departure from Kanesville, Babbitt remained behind and started his own newspaper in 1850, The Bugle, which was thoroughly Democratic in viewpoint.

Kanesville Economics

Politics aside, farming was the principle preoccupation with a wide variety of crops and relatively bounteous harvests reported. Warren Foote fenced and cultivated six acres of corn, three acres of turnips, and a wide variety of garden crops prospering "beyond [his] expectations." Joseph Holbrook grew corn, potatoes, beans, watermelons, and
turnips on his farm on Indian Creek. Farmers in Galland Grove planted and harvested several hundred acres of wheat. Produce not consumed or stored was hauled to the growing Kanesville market for local consumption or for sale to the increasing numbers of westbound travellers.

To meet the pressing needs of incoming British converts, most of whom were economically destitute, families departing for the Valley were urged to either give their farms away or dispose of them at very low prices. How many followed such advice is unknown, but it does indicate some measure of the seriousness of the migration problem and the poverty of the new arrivals. As Hyde admitted, "It is certainly rather a gloomy time for poor English saints that are landing here without a penny to bless themselves with." To help meet the problem of poverty, circuit riders called for donations of produce, clothing, utensils, and other goods. In January 1849, the Log Tabernacle was transformed into a "wholesale provision store" for the poor. A large community farm funded by Church tithing moneys, was also established to provide employment for the emigrant poor. During Kanesville's six-year history, the single, most serious problem was economic, i.e. providing rapidly overturning populations of poor emigrants with food, shelter, and meaningful employment without a strong industrial or manufacturing base. It was a case of too much growth with too little preparation and caused Orson Hyde to criticize his colleagues and superiors for too little
foresight and planning. Better to leave more of the
emigrants at St. Louis, he argued, where they could make a
decent living, than to strand them at Kanesville.54

But the problems of Mormon migration were soon
compounded by a totally unexpected development—the
discovery of gold at Sutter's Fort in California in January
1848. Almost overnight, it seemed, Kanesville was caught up
in the din and commotion caused by the tidal waves of
goldrushers. The very air was filled with gold fever. In
the spring of 1849 there was even talk in Kanesville of
their own nearby gold discoveries. Recalled Nelson Whipple,
"Some person . . . found some thing in the bluffs west of
Kainsville [sic] that had the appearance of gold this raised
a grate [sic] excitement of corse [sic]. Brother Hyde went
over to the place with some others and saw it and dedicated
it to the Lord. This was all right and in good shape but
the stuff turned out to be entirely worthless and no body
could tell what it was."55

There was no fool's gold, however, in the pockets of
the California-bound argonauts that besieged the city in
1849 and totally overwhelmed it in 1850. Suddenly,
Kanesville's economy boomed and the Mormon resident
population benefitted financially in unprecedented terms.
"We are crowded with 'Gold Diggers' as we call them," one
farmer reported. "We are busy every day and night grinding
and the mill is crowded full . . . . We are making money
midling fast now, but it can't keep this way long."56
The 1849 influx was but a foretaste of what came in 1850. Walker D. Wyman in his definitive study on outfitting towns on the Missouri claims that with the construction of new ferries at Kanesville in 1849, the town attracted up to 5,000 wagonloads of gold seekers the following year with many waiting weeks to cross.\(^{57}\) In the colorful words of one observer,

The plains about Kanesville were covered with little villages of tents, generally arranged in circles with the Stars and Stripes proudly floating in the center; wagons with white covers, some at rest by the tents, others in long moving lines; vast herds of horses and oxen, mingled with shouting herdsmen, animated with teeming life the natural beauty of the same.\(^{58}\)

By this time the Mormon trail west was well known and many were using William Clayton's newly published overland guide as their desert compass.

The America which the Mormons were trying to flee was rapidly catching up to them, but rather than a bane proved a boon to their plans and economy. Many sold homes and farms on isolated creeks and groves to buy locations nearer the river landings or along main wagon roads to maximize sales and profits. And little wonder. Prices in some instances rose ten times over. Corn increased from twenty cents to three dollars a bushel.\(^{59}\) Flour at one point sold for $4/cwt; hay at $25/ton. A good set of oxen could fetch up to $80/yoke and horses sold for as high as $100 each.\(^{60}\) It was, as one reported, "a fine time for making money."\(^{61}\)
Hyde even bought herds of cattle further down river to sell at a profit back in Kanesville.

This unexpected infusion of money into the Kanesville economy enabled many hitherto too poor to migrate the chence to make the trip. Several schemes were devised to maximize profits including the conversion of the Tabernacle into a temporary warehouse "to store goods in for the Californians and the money which will be paid for the storeage [sic] is to be used for the benefit of the Branch." Although the sudden steep increase in the cost of living proved a mixed blessing, especially to some of the new British arrivals, the gold rush of 1849-51 proved far more beneficial than otherwise to the emigration cause and in the process made of Kanesville a major outfitting river town.

The gold rush also enlivened the comparatively quiet and religious nature of Kanesville. The clash of values between peoples with entirely different motives and objectives awaits further study. Though crime and liquor consumption obviously increased, no serious conflict developed. Rather, they eyed one another with idle curiosity and at a respectable distance.

"Many Have Made Shipwreck Concerning the Faith"

In light of the unending tribulations and disappointments, the temptations to settle in Pottawattamie County, and the growing visibility of certain unorthodox religious practices, the Church suffered sizeable membership losses between July 1846 and the summer of 1852. Many
decided once and for all that they had had enough of Zion's glory and her peculiarities, that they had been through one too many harangues, sacrifices, and disappointments, and that their happiness lay elsewhere. Dissatisfaction and defection became a very real part of community life both at Winter Quarters and Kanasville. What constituted their grievances can be fairly well documented although what caused the final rupture in each individual case is difficult to ascertain.

Discouragement and lack of food ranked high as contributing factors. So many had lost loved ones, often several members of one family, that the hope and enthusiasm, even the faith that once motivated them had dissipated. Horace K. Whitney referred to one of the captains of hundreds who informed Heber C. Kimball one winter morning that he was quitting, and going back east "because he [was] discouraged." John D. Lee records that because of poverty and lack of food, (one small meal per day) many were leaving. Of these many took up residence in the fine farming lands of western Iowa where free land was readily available. Why risk a hazardous trek in the wilderness another thousand miles away from family and civilization when the riches of the earth were at their feet? Warren Foote, writing in September of 1846 said, "several have apostatized from the Church and gone down into Missouri disheartened and depressed." Early in January 1847, Lorenzo Snow reported from Mt. Pisgah that "at least three families left to return to the Gentiles in the east."
With the arrival of better weather in the late spring of 1847, and as the first pioneer company headed west, a large-scale defection occurred at Winter Quarters. Hosea Stout told Isaac Higbee, the ferry operator, on the morning of 27 April, "not to take anyone over who had not paid his tax for there were now great numbers going off through disaffection [sic]." The month following, John D. Lee reported the ferry being "thronged continually with waggons [sic] to cross, that the scattering has become so general that Brother J. Taylor and P.P. Pratt put a veto on any teams crossing without a certificate." Early in 1848 Noah Packard, writing from Grant County, Iowa, informed Brigham of "a number of people" in that region that once were Latter-day Saints "but as the saying is, they most of them lie low and keep dark, some for the sake of popularity join other denominations." A farm in Iowa would not only free them from the trials of an exhausting overland journey, but would also lessen financial sacrifices. Making ends meet might come easier out of the fold. In late December 1846 Brigham preached against the "stubbornness" of those refusing to pay tithing and taxes. Stout believed it was the police tax that had driven so many to Missouri. At Mt. Pisgah the most serious problem in 1848 was a general refusal to pay tithing. Brigham realized that constantly asking for money from the more affluent often led to a loss of commitment. And the voluntary giving of their means to help others "who have afterwards treated them scandalously..."
not only stumbles and shakes their faith in those persons, but they lose confidence in all their brethren and lose the good spirit."^75

Orson Hyde, writing from Kanesville, intimated in a letter to Brigham that economics was certainly a very divisive issue.

Others are fearful that they will be tithed too much. Some say that you require teams from them to take away people no better than themselves. Others say that women are sent over here to be supported that belong to other men. . . . Bro. Stoddard says that a number are about ready to declare their independence, pay no more tithing and take no counsel but their own.

An embittered James Stephens Brown, who forsaw the Church at the Missouri, tried to persuade his son to quit Mormonism.

I was like you. I followed up the tide met with poverty, death and many other things while I was in Winter Quarters while I found if I kept other men's council instead of my own, I could not support my family and all the blessings was by giving some considerable to others that I did not think worthy of it, and on the other hand cireses [sic] were pronounced if you did not give so that you should not get along nor prosper, but I think God I have been blessed and prospered abundantly.\^77

Others fell away because they were persona non grata, excommunicated or disfellowshipped castoffs who, for reasons already shown, were no longer welcome among the Saints. How
many fit this category is not easy to determine, but the entire memberships of both the Garden Grove and Trading Point Branches were disfellowshipped for a short period of time.\textsuperscript{78} Hyde thought that the branch at Trading Point "was not in very good standing" and that while the scriptures said "we should work out our salvation with fear and trembling . . ., they were gambling out theirs."\textsuperscript{79}

Others left because of differences over doctrine. Some followed George Miller and James Emmett after they broke with Brigham. Later, Alpheus Cutler, former president of the Winter Quarters High Council, became convinced that the Lord had a special mission for him among the Lamanites (Indians) in Missouri. Gradually he and many at Keg Creek fell away from the Church and espoused "Lamanism", a contorted doctrine of redeeming Jackson County, Missouri, by inciting the local Indian populations to arms. It was a wild and radical scheme that owed its beginning to a blessing Cutler claimed he had received from Joseph Smith. Said Hyde, "Indian Cutleryism, in 500 forms, would rage like wild fire through this country if the strong arm of power were not upon it all the time. I do assure you, President Young, that it requires the utmost care, diligence and watching over this people to keep their eye towards the Salt Lake Valley."\textsuperscript{80}

Other missionaries arrived from as far away as Ohio usually representing small dissident factions attempting to draw away converts to their cause. Wrote William Snow from Council Point in the fall of 1848,
You will see the object of our circuit riders when you learn that we have pamphlets coming in among us from all quarters containing there [sic] instructions revelations and invitations to all the saints scattered abroad and every body to come to Texas, Vorea [sic], Kirtland, Jackson [Co, Missouri] & I don't know where all but I think notwithstanding their great and marvellous powers ordinations revelations and supremacies which they hold over the authorities of the church here and in the valley, the saints give but little heed [sic] to them.

Snow's assessment was more cheery than that reported by other local Church authorities. They informed Brigham that Lyman Wight's advocates were siphoning off several members who had gone south to work in Missouri. "Lymanism," as it was called declared that Wight's mission to Texas was as much ordained as Brigham's was to the mountains and that being an apostle, Wight could not be excommunicated by his peers. Significantly, it was the conference of the Church at Kanawville and not in Salt Lake that first refused to sustain Wight as an apostle. "You may consider that our action rather hasty," wrote Apostles Smith and Benson, "but we discovered that a number of the persons affected with the Texas Epidemic were busy visiting remote branches and instilling into the minds of the people the ideas that the authorities dare not interfere with Lyman in his course."

Meanwhile Strangism, for all the scorn Church leaders were heaping on it, was still claiming converts. Although Brigham said repeatedly during the entire Winter Quarters/Kanesville episodes that "Strangism is about wound
up" and not "worthy of notice," he was engaging in rhetoric, more wishful thinking than fact. Like a bothersome rearguard action that would not go away, Strangite missionaries tried with various degrees of success to fill the vacuum left by the Church as it retreated west. In November 1846 apostle Ezra Taft Benson, then back on the east coast, reported that Strang and his counsellor, G.J. Adams, were in Pittsburgh, and that "The apostates and whoremongers are ralleying [sic] arround [sic] Strang's standard." Various Strangite apostles were proselyting among the Mormons at Cincinnati and St. Louis throughout the fall and winter of 1846. In February 1847, Almon W. Sabbitt reported on his efforts "to put down the Strangites [who] had assumed the jurisdiction of the conference in western New York and were misguiding many." Said Hyde at the April Conference of 1848, "Let them alone . . . They are occupying seats that don't belong to them; they ain't worth their room." As late as October 1849 members were being cut off from the Church in Kanesville because of their conversion to Strangism.

Eventually, in late 1851, another smaller faction developed. Called Jehovah's Presbytery of Zion or "Conjespresites" or "Baneemysm," it was started by the inconsistent and vacillating Charles B. Thompson (a former Mormon turned Strangite then self-proclaimed leader of his own). Baneemysm was a strange mixture of Miller's common ownership of property and Cutler's claim to the pending redemption of Zion and the conversion of the Indian.
The practice of polygamy alienated others. How valid a reason it was for mass disaffection is impossible to determine. While its influence is easily exaggerated, certainly many were offended by it. One writer of the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints claims it was the cause of wide-scale alienations, but this is difficult to substantiate.89

When John Neff, the purchaser of the mill and one of the wealthiest men in Winter Quarters first became aware of polygamy during the winter of 1846-47, he almost left the Church. Only after much personal intervention and explanation by prominent church leaders was Neff persuaded to stay on.90 If Neff encountered difficulties and was reclaimed only after much attention, presumably others shared the same discovery and made a clear separation.91

For a variety of reasons, then, whether economic, social, doctrinal, or personal, many quit the Church at the Missouri. The exact dimensions are difficult to ascertain, but certainly substantial numbers were involved - at least 2,000 during the six year period from 1846 to 1852 (not including the approximate 3,000 defectors in Nauvoo from 1844-46).92

Isaac Haight provided what likely was the standard Mormon explanation of their loss in followers at the Missouri:

There are many things that are for the trial of our faith and to cleanse the church. It seems as if the Lord designed to try us before we arrived at the place where he
designed for the land of our inheritance. Many cannot endure trials and have made shipwreck concerning the faith and have scattered, some one way some another and have told all manner of stories to stir up the people against the Church of God.

But while some were leaving, others were returning to the fold. Of these, the most dramatic was the rebaptism of Oliver Cowdery, former scribe to Joseph Smith while translating the Book of Mormon, second elder in the Church, and counsellor in the First Presidency. "I am out of the church," Cowdery explained to an attentive Pottawattamie High Council meeting in the Log Tabernacle in the fall of 1848. "I know the door into the church and I wish to become a member thro' the door." After much questioning, the Council unanimously voted its approval and Cowdery was baptized by Orson Hyde in Indian Creek outside the Tabernacle 5 November 1848, ending eleven years out of the Church. Luke S. Johnson, a former apostle, was also rebaptized a member of the Church at the Missouri.

The Final Exodus

Despite the distractions of dissidents and the attractions of rich free farmlands in western Iowa, most Latter-day Saints did leave for the Valley. Between the spring of 1848 and 1852 when Orson Hyde finally pulled up stakes, approximately 12,000 people left Kanesville for the Salt Lake Valley. Approximately half of these were British converts. (See Figure 12.2)
FIGURE 12.2

1848-1852 EMIGRATIONS WEST FROM KANESVILLE*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1843</td>
<td>2400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1849</td>
<td>1850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1850</td>
<td>2100 (est.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1851</td>
<td>1500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1852</td>
<td>4050</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Totals 11,900
(Based on an average of 3 people/wagon)

*Sources: 1 Brigham Young to G. A. Smith, 13 July 1848, Brigham Young Papers.
2 Wallace Stegner, Gathering of Zion, pp.199,205 & 209.
Hyde's departure marked the end of the Mormon stay in Kanesville. In December 1853, the city was officially renamed Council Bluffs by a rapidly growing majority of non-Mormon citizens intent on capturing a popular name. However, for years afterwards Council Bluffs, Iowa, was often referred to as "Orson Hyde's former town." 95

Across the river, the tiny community of Omaha founded just south of Winter Quarters in 1853 by William D. Brown who made a fortune as a ferry operator, became the terminus of the (Union) Pacific Railroad thanks to the efforts of C.M. Dodge and Abraham Lincoln. In time, Omaha surpassed Council Bluffs as an economic, trade, and transportation centre. In the late 1850's and 1860's, Florence, Nebraska, a small town built on the original Winter Quarters townsite, was a fitting out place for later bands of Mormon pioneers.

Winter Quarters does not exist today. The original cabins, hovels, sod-houses, and building of that once bustling community on the west banks of the Missouri were long since destroyed in a prairie fire that scorched the area in the mid 1850's. The gradual growth of Florence, Nebraska, in this century has all but obscured the original site. A modern water treatment plant now occupies the land where much of the city once stood. Only an old mill and cemetery remain as silent landmarks to what once was.

Kanesville, across the way, is likewise unidentifiable. Long ago it became the nucleus of Council Bluffs, Iowa, and that city has spread out in many directions from the
original core. The Log Tabernacle is no longer standing nor are many of the early buildings.

But the lack of a physical presence or reminders matters little to the history presented in this dissertation, for the written manuscript record is overwhelming and compelling. The history of the Latter-day Saints at the Missouri River is a vital chapter in the American development of the west and in the Mormon exodus. It left an abiding impression, one hitherto not adequately studied. Perhaps that omission is now also a thing of the past.
FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER TWELVE

1 Journal History, 8 April 1848.

2 Ibid., 25 November 1847.

3 Ibid., 21 December 1847.

4 Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 13 May 1848.

5 Meeting of the Twelve, Joseph Young, Newel K. Whitney, W.W. Phelps, and Phineas Young, 13 November 1847, Brigham Young Papers. Wilford Woodruff observed that during the next two weeks, eighty seventies and thirty high priests were chosen and commissioned for the work. Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 23 November 1847. Several of the Twelve were also included.

6 "We passed through the country of former persecutions where some of our brethren were confined in the posts where others were chained. But we did not make ourselves known, not considering it prudent, but traveled as gentlemen from the East as Col. Benson of Massachusetts, Esq. Mason of N.H., Dr. Snow of Boston, and Judge Appleby of N.J."

Journal History, 17 January 1848.

7 Ibid., 13 March 1848. Quincy had once visited Nauvoo and formed a favorable impression of Joseph Smith.

8 Journal of Erastus Snow, 19 April 1848.

9 Journal History, 14 March 1848.

10 Journal of Erastus Snow, 29 April 1848. Several of the missionaries were much less involved in fund raising activities.

11 Preston Thomas and William Martindale to Orson Hyde, 14 March 1849, Brigham Young Papers.

12 Journal History, 26 February 1848. Said Brigham of William Smith: "[H]e has set up a shop for himself, has one member to his Church, and he is his first counselor." Ibid., 25 November 1847.

13 Ibid., 11 February 1848.

14 Journal of James Henry Glines, 12 January 1848.

Ibid.

Ibid., 7 February 1848.


See Journal History, 9 March 1848; and Nathaniel Felt to Brigham Young, 28 March 1848, Brigham Young Papers.

Journal History, 21 May 1848.

Emigration compilation and records in the Reading Room of the LDS Church Archives. Mormon voyagers were no more immune to the hazards of river transportation than their fellow travelers. By far the most dramatic and serious loss of life was the fatal explosion of the steamboat "Saluda" in April 1852 in which scores were killed.


Journal of Nelson Wheeler Whipple, Spring and Summer, 1848.

Minutes of the Pottawattamie High Council, 15 July 1848.

Silas Richards to the First Presidency, 10 October 1848, Brigham Young Papers.

The High Council adjudicated both civic and religious matters in the absence of established civic government. Minutes of the Pottawattamie High Council, 8 January 1848.

Journal History, 8 April 1848. Said William Snow, "We have now in this county about 40 branches of the church organized in this county and some fifty elders selected to preach they generally go two together giving each Branch a preach [;] once in about two weeks." William Snow to Brigham Young, 2 October 1848, Brigham Young Papers. A few branches had both a bishop and a branch president. See Table 12.1.

Minutes of the Pottawattamie High Council, 8 January 1848.


Ibid.

Ibid.

See Bloomer, "Mormons in Iowa", p. 597; and Lawson, "The Mormons", p.79.

Sterling Morton, *History of Nebraska*, p.131. Bloomer's more exaggerated figure of 7,828 in 1850 likely included satellite communities.

Minutes of the Pottawattamie High Council, 10 June 1848.

Orson Hyde to Brigham Young, 25 April 1850, Brigham Young Papers.

Journal History, 24 March 1848.

Said Reverend Sidney Roberts, Whig delegate dispatched to Kanesville in March of 1848,

"From whence comes [your] affliction? Although individuals of every party and creed may have participated in bringing about this result, may it not with great safety be affirmed, that the Loco Focos as a party have been mainly instrumental in confirming the ruin of those who have too willingly and credulously supported that party? . . . Were they not the leaders of the same Loco Focos party who had driven you from your homes in Missouri? Did not the same Governor whom you had been instrumental in electing stand by and permit Joseph and Hyrum Smith to be murdered before your eyes . . . You now have it in your power to vindicate yourselves."

Ibid., 1 March 1848.


See Journal of Thomas Bullock, 9 February 1848; and Journal History, 16 January 1848.

It appears that Thomas L. Kane, who received a copy of the petitions, was highly influential in persuading the Postmaster General to grant the Post Office with Evan M. Greene as postmaster. Brigham Young to Thomas L. Kane, 9
February 1848, Papers of Brigham Young. Apparently the county organization made in September 1848 was spearheaded by the Democrats, including Babbitt and William Pickett. But it became an organization without representation, especially when it became clear the Mormons would vote the Whig ticket. Consequently, only two precincts, one at Kanesville and the other at Mt. Pisgah, were organized and both of them were placed under the judicial review of Monroe county commissioners. The argument made for postponing the county organization was that Indian claims had not been extinct six months. George Albert Smith and Joseph Young to the First Presidency and the Twelve, 2 October 1848, Brigham Young papers.

42 See Bloomer, "The Mormons in Iowa", p.596 and Brigham Young Papers, 8 October 1848.

43 Apostle George Albert Smith wrote that James Sloan [was] appointed to return the polling books to the county clerk at Albia, county seat of Monroe County. "The clerk," he said, "at first refused to receive them, but afterwards did so, and reported they were stolen and made no returning of them to the Secretary of State. The result was that Miller, the Jack Mormon [i.e., a sympathetic non-Mormon] candidate for Congress was beaten." George Albert Smith and Joseph Young to the First Presidency and the Twelve, 2 October 1848, Brigham Young Papers.


45 George A. Smith and Ezra Taft Benson to Brigham Young, 11 October and 15 October 1848, Brigham Young Papers. The truth of the matter was that the money was a loan to Hyde from Whig sympathizers.

46 It would be difficult to argue that the Mormon Whig vote was based on anything other than a pervasive hatred of perceived Democratic abuses of the Mormon people. It does not appear that slavery was a divisive issue although several parties of Mormons from the deep South had arrived with slaves and taken up residences south of Kanesville. Though Hyde preached more than once against the evils of inter-racial marriage, "he wished it understood that we as a people take no part either with the abolisher [sic] or slave holder." Minutes of the Pottawattamie High Council, 3 October 1847. One reason, however, that opposition from settlers in Mills County developed against the Mormon efforts to organize Pottawattamie County was the apparent level of Mormon toleration of the black people. See John Todd., Early Settlement and Growth of Western Iowa, p.91.

47 George A. Smith and Ezra Taft Benson to Brigham Young, 28 June 1848, Brigham Young Papers.
For several years afterwards Babbitt stayed back in Washington as the Mormon observer at Congress during unsuccessful efforts to gain congressional approval for admission into the union of the state of Deseret (Utah). He was killed en route overland to Salt Lake in 1855, a victim of an apparent Indian ambush.

Journal of Warren E. Foote, 3 June 1847.


See Orson Hyde, Ezra Taft Benson, and George A. Smith to Brigham Young, 5 April 1849, Brigham Young papers; also Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 19 May 1849.

Orson Hyde to Brigham Young, 25 April 1850, Brigham Young Papers.

Minutes of the Pottawattamie High Council, 25 May 1850.

Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 18 May 1850.

Journal of Nelson Whipple, "Spring of 1849."


Orson Hyde to Brigham Young, 27 April 1851, Brigham Young Papers.

Orson Hyde to Brigham Young, 25 April 1850, Brigham Young Papers.

Journal of Warren Foote, 1 April 1850.

Private journal not yet to be identified, 25 April 1852, LDS Church Archives.

Wilford Woodruff once complained of only one yoke of oxen per seventeen families because of yielding to pressures to sell out at such high prices. One sale of oxen at $50-70 could buy three homesteads at the Bluffs. Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 15 May 1850.

By 1852 Kanesville contained sixteen mercantile establishments, two drug stores, five hotels, four groceries, two jewelers, one harness maker, eight wagon shops, two tinsmiths, two livery stables, two cabinet shops, five boot and shoe makers, two daguerrotype rooms,
five physicians, nine lawyers, one gunsmith, one cooper, three barbershops, four bakers, one mill, and seven blacksmith shops. Walker D. Wyman, "Council Bluffs and the Westward Movement," Iowa Journal of History (April 1949), p.103.

66 Journals of John D. Lee, 7 May 1847, p.162.
67 Journal of Warren Foote, 29 September 1846; also his entry, 10 July 1847.
69 Diary of Hosea Stout, 27 April 1847, 1:252-53.
70 Journals of John D. Lee, 7 May 1847, p.162. Many were abandoning Summer Quarters over land disputes and other concerns that plagued that particular endeavor.
71 Noah Packard to Brigham Young, 6 February 1848, Brigham Young Papers.
73 Ibid., 2 January 1847, 1:222-23.
74 Journal History, 4 April 1848.
75 Ibid., 5 April 1848.
76 Orson Hyde to Brigham Young, 22 April 1848, Brigham Young Papers.
77 Daniel Brown to James Brown, 16 April 1854, Papers of James Stephens Brown, Utah State Historical Society, Salt Lake City, Utah.
78 Pottawattamie High Council, 13 October 1849.
79 The cause of such action was the persistent crimes of trafficking in liquor sales among the Indians and the continued clandestine counterfeiting operations that some conducted in Kanesville.
80 Orson Hyde to Brigham Young, 27 April 1850, Brigham Young Papers.
81 William Snow to Brigham Young, 2 October 1848, Brigham Young Papers.
82 Report of George Albert Smith, Ezra Taft Benson, and Joseph Young to the First Presidency and the Twelve, 2 October 1848, Brigham Young Papers.
George A. Smith to Brigham Young, 7 October 1848, Brigham Young Papers.

Journals of John D. Lee, 29 November 1846, p. 28.

J.A. Stratton to Brigham Young, 27 December 1846, Brigham Young Papers.

Journal History, 3 February 1847.

Ibid., 6 April 1848.

Minutes of the Pottawattamie High Council, 13 October 1849.


Diary of Hosea Stout, 1 April 1847, 1:243. See editor's footnote.

Ironically, the most serious doctrinal dissension did not immediately result from polygamy or the law of adoption, but from a difference of opinion over the doctrine of the resurrection. Although documentation is sporadic, it appears that many had been persuaded to believe in a form of reincarnation, a resurrection "by birth or through the womb", that "some had been teaching." See Journal of Wilford Woodruff, 21 November 1847. The provenance and promulgators of such a viewpoint are not known, but it did attract the attention and sermonizing of many Church authorities. This might explain Brigham's address during the succession conference in December 1847 in which he discussed the matter in depth. Only Adam held the keys of the resurrection. See Chapter Eleven.

Arriving at a number for those who left the Church at the Missouri is difficult. The chart below is a rough approximation based upon three estimates: calculations of the numbers of Latter-day Saints on the Missouri and Mississippi rivers in December 1846; the numbers of British emigrants who began arriving at the Bluffs from 1848 to 1852 and who crossed the plains; and the estimated Mormon population in Utah as of 1852. Data for the British emigration was derived from in-house emigration books and calculations in the search room of the LDS Church Archives.
The 14,500 population figure for Utah in 1852 was taken from a forthcoming official publication compiled by Earl Olson and others summarizing Church membership through the years. The approximate death rate is in line with the regular Nauvoo death rates and the reduced death rate at the Missouri in 1848.

Estimated Mormon population on the Missouri and Mississippi Rivers December 1846 (See Chapter Four) 11,800

Total British LDS emigrants, 1848-52 6,992

Arrivals from California (Est.) 200

TOTAL Potential Number who could have crossed to Utah up until December 1852 18,992

ESTIMATED 1852 UTAH POPULATION 14,500

Number who did not go west 4,492

Less Average Mortality Loss at 40 deaths/thousand/year over 5 years - based 11,800 pop. 2,360

Estimated Total who did not go west 2,132

Estimated per cent of those at the Bluffs who did not go west (Not counting Nauvoo disaffections) 11.2%

93 Journal of Isaac Haight, 1 January 1847.
94 Minutes of the Pottawattamie High Council, 4-5 November 1848.
BIBLIOGRAPHY
BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. ESSAY

The historiography on the topic of this dissertation makes for relatively short and skimpy reading. Incredibly, no single volume yet exists detailing the history of Winter Quarters. And most of the several Brigham Young biographies skip over this era. As indicated in the Introduction, I have relied most heavily on the primary sources to fill the vacuum - diaries, letters, minutes, and biographies.

Nonetheless, several printed sources were consulted and found very helpful. By far the most useful are published manuscripts of the following contemporary journals: William Clayton's Journal - A Daily Record of the Journey of the Original Company of "Mormon" Pioneers from Nauvoo, Illinois to the Valley of the Great Salt Lake (Salt Lake City: The Deseret News, 1921); Charles Kelly, ed., Journals of John D. Lee 1846-47 and 1859 (Salt Lake City: Western Printing Co., 1938); Elden J. Watson, comp., Manuscript History of Brigham Young 1846-1847 (Salt Lake City, 1971); and most helpful of all, Juanita Brooks, ed., On the Mormon Frontier - The Diary of Hosea Stout 1844-1861, 2 vols. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1964).

Only two theses address themselves directly to the history of the Mormons in the Council Bluffs region. Ernest Widstoe Shumway's "History of Winter Quarters, Nebraska 1846-1848" (M.A. thesis, Brigham Young University, 1953) is
a good beginning, but only that. Shumway relied almost exclusively on secondary references and either was not allowed access or consciously chose not to use the manuscript sources in the Historical Department of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints in Salt Lake City. Consequently, his work is incomplete omitting so many of the relevant issues and concerns. Another thesis suffering from the same difficulty is Lynn Robert Webb's "The Contributions of the Temporary Settlements Garden Grove, Mount Pisgah, and Kanesville, Iowa to Mormon Emigration, 1846-1852" (M.A. Thesis, Brigham Young University, 1954). Clyde B. Aitchison's article "The Mormon Settlements in the Missouri Valley," The Quarterly of the Oregon Historical Society (1907): 276-289 was only marginally informative.

Few general survey histories devote so much as a chapter to Winter Quarters and of these most rely uncritically on the observations of Thomas L. Kane in his published lecture "The Mormons" (A Disclosure Delivered Before the Historical Society of Pennsylvania, March 16, 1850). Mormon historian Brigham H. Roberts' still useful though dated six volume study A Comprehensive History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (Salt Lake City: Deseret News Press, 1930) provides a sympathetic overview. Bernard De Voto's 1846 - Year of Decision (Boston: Little, Brown and Company, 1943) is still a superbly written interweaving of main currents in American history for that eventful year and provides excellent insights into the
Mormon exodus as a part of the much larger American scene, including the Mexican War. A noninterpretive study commemorating the centennial of the trek using primary sources is Preston Nibley's *Exodus to Greatness: The Story of the Mormon Migration* (Salt Lake City: Deseret News Press, 1947). No less readable though more sarcastic in tone than De Voto's is the recent work by Wallace Stegner, *The Gathering of Zion* (Salt Lake City: Westwater Press, 1981). Written in a journalistic, flowing style and from a non-Mormon vantage point, Stegner's book devotes one chapter to Winter Quarters and provides color and human interest, but fails to shed any new factual light on the subject.

Dale L. Morgan's *The Great Salt Lake* (Indianapolis: The Bobbs Merrill Company, 1847) devotes even less time to Winter Quarters, but is factual and informative.

1976), and *The City of God* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Company, 1976) by Leonard J. Arrington, Dean L. May, and Feramorz Y. Fox.

The single best background study for understanding trail migrations in America in the mid-nineteenth century is John D. Unruh Jr.'s *The Plains Across* (Urbana, Illinois: University of Illinois Press, 1979). Perhaps the most significant, scholarly work on Oregon, California, and Mormon trail movements west, Unruh provides indispensable statistical overviews and trends in a flowing narrative rich with flavor and human interest. Another valuable insight into the Oregon and Mormon trails is Merrill J. Mattes' *The Great Platte River Road: The Covered Wagon Main Line Via Fort Kearny to Fort Laramie* (Lincoln: Nebraska State Historical Society, 1969). An unpublished work helpful in understanding Missouri River towns is "The Missouri River Towns in the Westward Movement" (Ph.D. dissertation, State University of Iowa, 1935) by Walter D. Wyman.

By far the most reliable starting point in studying Mormon plans for the trek west and their eventual destination is Lewis Clark Christian's "A Study of the Mormon Westward Migration Between February 1846 and July 1847 with Emphasis on and Evaluation of the Factors that Led to the Mormon Choice of Salt Lake Valley as the Site of Their Initial Colony," (Ph.D. dissertation, Brigham Young University, 1976). A good distillation of his work was recently published as "Mormon Foreknowledge of the West," *Brigham Young University Studies* (Fall 1981): 403-415.
The story of the Mormon crossing of Iowa has been left largely untold although two authors have given much attention to the question of 'where' they went. Stanley Kimball has written extensively on the subject including Discovering Mormon Trails, New York to California 1831-1868 (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book Co. 1979), perhaps the best single map study of Mormon trails and his most recent "The Mormon Trail Network in Iowa 1838 - 1863: A New Look," Brigham Young University Studies (Fall 1981): 417-430.

Before Kimball, Jacob Van der Zee's "The Mormon Trails in Iowa (January 1914): 3-16. The Iowa Journal of History and Politics was probably the authority and must still be consulted especially for the trail in western Iowa. Another outdated but still valuable contribution to the Iowa crossing is Roy Franklin Lawson's, "The Mormons: Their Trek Across Iowa and Their Settlement in Kanesville" (M.A. Thesis, Creighton University, 1937). Edgar Rubey Harlan's A Narrative History of the People of Iowa (Chicago: The American Historical Society, Inc., 1931) also provides some assistance although Harlan relied heavily on Van der Zee.

Several publications were helpful in providing a necessary understanding of the upper Missouri River country prior to the Mormon arrival, particularly with respect to the Indians and the fur trade. "Annual Reports of the U.S. Office of Indian Affairs" and other related Senate and House Documents of the United States Congress provided indispensable information. Of no less value were Hiram Martin Chittenden's The American Fur Trade of the Far West,

On the role and history of the now famous Mormon Battalion the most enduring standard study is Daniel Tyler's "A Concise History of the Mormon Battalion in the Mexican War 1846–47" (1881; reprint, Chicago: Rio Grande Press, 1964). Frank A. Golder's The March of the Mormon Battalion from Council Bluffs to California (New York: The Century Co., 1928) was also helpful. Recently John F. Yurtinus has completed the definitive scholarly study on the subject in his "A Ram in the Thicket: The Mormon Battalion in the Mexican War" (Ph.D. dissertation, Brigham Young University, 1975) now being published. Until all the papers of President James K. Polk are edited and published by Vanderbilt University, the only reliable manuscript source on Polk and his administration for the Battalion era remains

Next to nothing has been written on the social and cultural life of the Mormons at Winter Quarters and what little has been said is still unpublished. Maureen Ursenbach Beecher has written extensively on Mormon women and has willingly shared with me many of her findings supportive of her recent Mormon History Association paper on the topic given in May 1983 and published as "Women at Winter Quarters," *Sunstone* (July and August 1983): 11-19. Beecher's work is sorely needed and updates and corrects so much in Edward Tullidge's *The Women of Mormondom* (New York: 1877). Kenneth W. Godfrey's similarly unpublished paper "Winter Quarters: Glimmering Glimpses Into Mormon Religious and Social Life" also proved helpful. The only work remotely helpful on sickness and death among the Mormons, a grossly neglected topic, is Matthew Anthony Thomas' "Disease in a Mormon Community, Nauvoo, Illinois: 1839-1846" (B.A. thesis, Harvard University, 1977).

Virtually nothing has yet appeared on Church theology and practice for the period under study. Several very recent works, however, while focusing on Nauvoo, provide indispensable background information on specific beliefs and practices. For understanding the doctrine of plural marriage, Daniel W. Bachman has written a sympathetic yet scholarly treatise "A Study of the Mormon Practice of Plural Marriage Before the Death of Joseph Smith" (M.A. Thesis,
Purdue University 1975). Andrew Ehat's "Joseph Smith's Introduction of Temple Ordinances and the 1844 Mormon Succession Question" (M.A. thesis, Brigham Young University, 1982) is a provocative re-examination of temple work and its importance in Nauvoo. Finally, for the poorly understood law of adoption, the best single study is Gordon Irving's "The Law of Adoption: One Phase of the Development of the Mormon Concept of Salvation, 1830-1900," Brigham Young University Studies, (Spring 1974): 291-314. All three of the above point to a refreshing change in Mormon historiography, a courageous willingness to tackle debatable topics heretofore considered off limits.

Several works are now coming forth on Church government during the post Joseph Smith era. Ronald K. Esplin, especially, has made truly valuable, albeit sympathetic studies of the role of the Twelve Apostles in the following three works: "Joseph, Brigham and the Twelve: A Succession of Continuity" Brigham Young University, (Summer 1981): 301-341; "Brigham Young and the Power of the Apostleship: Defending the Kingdom Through Prayer, 1844-45" (Sidney B. Sperry Symposium Sesquicentennial Look at Church History, January 16, 1980); and his and Leonard J. Arrington's "The Role of the Council of the Twelve During Brigham Young's Presidency of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints," Task Papers in LDS History #31 (Salt Lake City: Historical Department of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1979). For two clashing opinions on the ill-defined Council of Fifty, contrast Klaus Hansen's Quest

The best source available for a study of Kanesville history is the town newspaper, The Frontier Guardian, that began publication in 1849 and continued until 1852. Orson Hyde served as editor and took pains to cover Church practices and theology plus Whig party politics in fascinating detail.

Those sources listed below are only of works cited in this work. Many other studies were consulted.
SELECTIVE BIBLIOGRAPHY
A. PRINTED LITERATURE CITED

1. BOOKS


The Book of Mormon. Translated by Joseph Smith, Jr. Salt Lake City: The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1959.


Cannon, Donald Q., and Cook, Lyndon W., eds. Far West Record — Minutes of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1830-1844. Salt Lake City, Deseret Book Company, 1983.


Christensen, Clare B. *Before and After Mt. Pisgah*. Salt Lake City: Clare B. Christensen, 1979.


History of Holt and Atchison Counties, Missouri. n.a., n.p. 1882.


Newhall, J. B. *A Glimpse of Iowa in 1846; or the Emigrant's Guide and State Directory with a Description of the New Purchase.* Burlington, Iowa: W.D. Skillman, Publisher, 1846.


Reid, J. M. *Sketches and Anecdotes of the Old Settlers, and New Comers, The Mormon Bandits and Danite Band.* Keokuk, Iowa: R. B. Ogden, Publisher, 1876.


---

Succession in the Presidency of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. Salt Lake City: George Q. Cannon and Sons, 1900.


Todd, John, Rev. *Early Settlement and Growth of Western Iowa or Reminiscences.* Des Moines: The Historical Department of Iowa, 1906.


2. PUBLISHED ARTICLES AND TASK PAPERS CITED

Arrington, Leonard J. "'In Honorable Remembrance': Thomas L. Kane's Services to the Mormons." Brigham Young University Studies 21 (Fall 1981): 389-402.


Holbrook, Leona. "Dancing As An Aspect of Early Mormon (Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints) and Utah Culture," in "Papers Delivered at the Third Canadian Symposium on History of Sport and Physical Education, 19 August 1974."


"Winter Quarters Revisited - Untold Stories of the Seven-Year Story of Mormons in the Missouri Valley 1846-53." Omaha, n.d.

"Incidents in the Life of Mary Helen Grant." Journal of History 10 (April 1917): 77.


Pearson, Carol Lynn. "'Nine Children Were Born': A Historical Problem from the Sugar Creek Episode." Brigham Young University Studies 21 (Fall 1981): 441-44.


Whitney, Helen Mar Kimball. "Our Travels Beyond the Mississippi." Woman's Exponent 12 (1883-84) and 13 (1884-85).

Whitney. "Scenes and Incidents at Winter Quarters." Woman's Exponent 13 (1884-85), 14 (1885-86), and 15 (1886-87).


3. GOVERNMENT PUBLICATIONS


4. NEWSPAPERS

The Frontier Guardian (Kanesville), 7 March 1849.

The Gospel Herald, 29 June 1848.

Hancock Eagle, 8 May 1846.

The Latter-day Saints Millennial Star, Vol. 8., Chapter 5.

The Mormon Neighbor (Nauvoo), 1 May 1843.

Northern Islander (Beaver Island, Michigan), 20 September 1855.

The St. Louis Weekly Union, 30 March 1847.

The Voree Herald, March 1846; April 1846;

B. PRIMARY SOURCES CITED

1. ARCHIVES, LIBRARIES, AND OTHER DEPOSITORIES CONSULTED

The Historical Department of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. Salt Lake City. Hereafter referred to as the LDS Church Archives.

Library and Archives, Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints. The Auditorium, Independence. Hereafter referred to as RLDS Library and Archives.

The Marriott Library. Salt Lake City. University of Utah.

The Nauvoo Restoration Corporation. Salt Lake City.
2. JOURNALS AND DIARIES

Appleby, William S. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Bullock, Thomas. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Dana, Charles R. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Dunham, Jonathan. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Flanagan, James H. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Glines, James Henry. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Hovey, Joseph G. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Huntington, Williams. Journal. BYU Library.
Jacob, Norton. Journal. LDS Church Archives
Kimball, Heber C. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Lee, John D. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Pratt, Orson. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Pulsipher, John. Diary. LDS Church Archives.
Richards, Mary H.P. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Rogers, Samuel H. Journal. BYU Library.
Sessions, Patty. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Shetts, Elijah. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Snow, Eliza R. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Snow, Erastus. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Snow, Lorenzo. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Watson, Gilbert. Journal. RLDS Library and Archives.
Whipple, Nelson W. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Whitney, Horace K. Journal. LDS Church Archives.
Woodruff, Wilford. Journal. LDS Church Archives.

3. UNPUBLISHED HISTORIES, REMINISCENCES, AND AUTOBIOGRAPHIES

Call, Anson. Autobiography. LDS Church Archives.
Holbrook, Joseph. Autobiography. LDS Church Archives.


McArthur, Daniel D. Autobiography. LDS Church Archives.


Smith, Bathsheba W. "Record Book of Bathsheba W. Smith." BYU Library.

Taggart, Fanny Parks. Autobiography. LDS Church Archives.


Young, Brigham. "Manuscript History of Brigham Young." LDS Church Archives.

4. CORRESPONDENCE FILES


Haskell Family Letters, 1845-54. RLDS Library and Archives.

Kane, Thomas L. to Kane, Elijah. Letter of 29 May 1846. Kane Papers. BYU Library.

Kane, Thomas L. to Medill, William. Letter of 21 April 1847. Thomas L. Kane Papers, Yale University. Microfilm copy in LDS Church Archives.

Kimball, Christeen G. to her mother. Letter of 7 May 1847. Correspondence of Christeen G. Kimball. LDS Church Archives.

Miller, George to Wight, Lyman. Letter of 19 January 1854. RLDS Library and Archives.

513


Paden, Isaac to Adams, James M. Letter of 27 February 1853. RLDS Library and Archives.


Smith, George A. to Smith, Joseph, III. Letter of 13 March 1847. RLDS Library and Archives.


Young, Brigham. Incoming and outgoing correspondence in the Brigham Young Papers, 1845-1850. LDS Church Archives. (The majority of letters cited in this work are derived from the Brigham Young Papers. For space considerations, they are not listed here.)

5. ECCLESIASTICAL AND INSTITUTIONAL ARCHIVES,

SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES

"Conference Minutes of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints 1859 and 1860." Record Book. RLDS Library and Archives.

Mill Branch (Iowa) Record Book, 1848. LDS Church Archives.

Minutes of the Blockhouse (Iowa) Branch, 1846-49. LDS Church Archives.

Minutes of the conferences in the (Kanesville) Log Tabernacle, 24 and 27 December 1847; 6 April 1848. Brigham Young Papers.

Minutes of a General Council Meeting. 22 January 1848. Brigham Young Papers.

Minutes of a Meeting of the Twelve, Seventies, High Council, and Bishops. 10 November 1847. Brigham Young Papers.

Minutes of a Meeting of the Twelve and Seventy. 30 November 1847. Brigham Young Papers.

Minutes of a Meeting of the Twelve. 13 November; 15 November, 5 December 1847. Brigham Young Papers.
Minutes of Miscellaneous Trustees Minutes. 15, 17 and 21 November 1847. Brigham Young Papers. LDS Church Archives.

Mt. Pisgah Historical Record. LDS Church Archives.

Pottawattamie High Council Minutes, 1846-1852. LDS Church Archives.


Winter Quarters High Council Minutes, 1846-1848. LDS Church Archives.


6. FINANCIAL RECORDS

Belnap, Gilbert. Account Book. LDS Church Archives.

Kirtland, Ohio. Gilbert and Whitney Day Book, November 1836 - April 1837. RLDS Library and Archives.

Winter Quarters. Store Account Book. LDS Church Archives.

7. SPECIAL VERTICAL FILES AND HISTORICAL COMPILATIONS

Clark, Lawrence. Scrapbook. Lawrence Clark Collection. LDS Church Archives.

Journal History of the Church. A chronological collection of newspapers and other items related to the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints as compiled by Andrew Jenson. LDS Church Archives.

Manuscript History of Cutler's Park. LDS Church Archives.

Manuscript History of Winter Quarters. LDS Church Archives.

ABSTRACT

MORMONS AT THE MISSOURI:
A HISTORY OF THE LATTER-DAY SAINTS
AT WINTER QUARTERS AND AT KANESVILLE,
1846-52 – A STUDY IN
AMERICAN OVERLAND TRAIL MIGRATION

by
RICHARD EDMOND BENNETT

MAY 1984

Adviser: Philip P. Mason
Major: History
Degree: Doctor of Philosophy

The superficial details of the Mormon trek west from Nauvoo, Illinois, to the Great Basin valleys in present-day Utah are well known in American history. Less well studied and understood are the complex and multiple reasons that delayed their journey forcing them to establish a temporary headquarters in the Council Bluffs region at the Missouri River in the fall of 1846. This work begins by carefully examining those delaying factors, relying heavily upon primarily unpublished manuscript sources not readily available previously.

From this starting point, what follows is a study of Mormon life in their newly built city of the plains, "Winter Quarters". Besides a detailing of such largely physical aspects of life (in what briefly then was the largest city in the upper American plains) as city lay-out, architectural design, health and sickness, Indian relations, and economics, much is provided about social, political, religious, and ecclesiastical developments. Special emphasis is placed on the skills and attitudes both men and women developed to survive in a hostile environment, on their increasingly peculiar religious beliefs and practices which included plural marriage and spiritual adoption, and on tracing the ecclesiastical developments of apostolic supremacy and succession in determining ultimate Church authority.
Under the increasing dominance of Brigham Young, many of the doctrines, practices, leadership councils, and priorities that dominated the history of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints for decades to come were firmly established at Winter Quarters and many important decisions were also made at the Missouri that determined their final destination in the Rocky Mountains. A final chapter examines the dissolution of Winter Quarters and the establishment of Mormon settlements across the river in Iowa Territory until 1852 and evaluates the impact and extent of defections.
PERSONAL:

Name: RICHARD EDMOND BENNETT
Birthdate: 20 February 1946
Birthplace: Sudbury, Ontario, Canada
Current Address: 1275 Markham Road, Winnipeg, Manitoba, Canada, R3T 4R1
Marital Status: Married to the former Patricia Dyer; 5 children

EDUCATION:

High School: Sudbury High School, 1961-65
University: B.A., English Literature (1972) – Brigham Young University
M.A., United States History (1976) – Brigham Young University

CAREER DEVELOPMENT:

1978 to Present: Head, Dept. of Archives & Special Collections, Elizabeth Dafoe Library, The University of Manitoba, Winnipeg, Manitoba, Canada
1977-78: Curator of Mormon Manuscripts, Harold B. Lee Library, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah,
1976: Assistant Archivist, Chrysler Corporation, Highland Park, Michigan
1972-75: Senior Researcher/Writer, Brigham Young University Centennial History Project, Brigham Young University

HONORS:

Undergraduate: Tuition scholarships, Brigham Young University
Graduate: 1976 - "University Graduate Fellowship"
1982 - "Professional Graduate Scholarship"
1983 - "Historical Memorial Society Award"
Career: 1980 - Rank Promotion to "Associate Librarian"
1981 - University of Manitoba Outreach Award of Merit

PUBLICATIONS, PAPERS, AND ADDRESSES:

Books: 

Articles:
- "It Gathers Strength as it Goes" - A brief history of the University of Manitoba Alumni Society," Alumni Journal, Summer, 1982; 2-16
- "University of Manitoba Archives", Manitoba History, (f2, 1981)

Thesis: "The History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints in Upper Canada, 1830-1850" (Brigham Young University, 1975)

PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATIONS:

Organization of American Historians
American Association for State and Local History
Society of American Archivists
Association of Canadian Archivists
Mormon History Association
Popular Culture Association