Joseph Smith's Plural Wives after the Martyrdom

Brian C. Hales

Go thou loved one God is with thee
He will be thy stay & shield
And fulfill each precious promice
Which his spirit has revealed. . . .
Guardian angels will protect thee
And the Spirit's still small voice,
Will from day to day direct thee,
Therefore let thy heart rejoice.
O my Father! thou that dwelleth
In the upper courts of light;
Open thou the way before her—
Guide, O guide her feet aright.[1]

Several major studies have been published examining Joseph Smith's polygamous wives.[2] My research supports that he was sealed to thirty-five plural spouses.[3] This article examines briefly their later reactions to their plural involvement with the Prophet and addresses the following questions: What percentage kept the faith he taught? How many later left the Church and the Latter-day Saints? During the passing years, did any look back and consider his Nauvoo behavior improper or inappropriate?

Brian C. Hales (brianhales@msn.com) is an anesthesiologist at Davis Hospital in Layton, Utah, and president of the Utah Medical Association (2012–2013). He is the co-author of *The Priesthood of Modern Polygamy, an LDS Perspective* (1992); and author of *Modern Polygamy* (2008), and *Mormon Fundamentalism: The Generations after the Manifesto* (2006), which received the "Best Book Award" from the John Whitmer Historical Association in 2007. His three volume *Joseph Smith's Polygamy: History and Theology* will be published in early 2013. He is also the webmaster of JosephSmithsPolygamy.com and mormonfundamentalism.com.

Three of the plural wives of Joseph Smith, l-r: Zina Huntington, Bathsheba Smith, Emily Partridge, and Eliza R. Snow. Photograph taken later in Salt Lake City, date unknown. All but Bathsheba Smith were wives of Joseph Smith. Photograph courtesy of the Church History Library, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City, Utah.

A Private Sorority among Joseph Smith's Widowed Wives

Following the martyrdom a number of women sealed to Joseph Smith maintained a special sorority and alliance throughout the remainder of their lives. The sisterhood extended to Mary Elizabeth Rollins Lightner is particularly illustrative. For example, in 1865, Eliza wrote to Mary affectionately: "You are gathered out from the nations that shed the blood of him most dear to us both."[4] In 1880, Presendia Huntington Kimball wrote: "Won't it be a happy time for us if we can gain the place where Joseph & our loved ones mingle?"[5] On June 27, 1886, the anniversary of Joseph Smith's martyrdom, Zina D. Huntington Young wrote a letter to Mary expressing how her sister wives honored the Prophet on that fateful day:

> We remember this day, of all days to us[.] I went into Sister Elizas [Snow]. we talked over our past a little, then Sister E. spoke in tounges to comfort and cheer us, and how the vale was thinning as we advanced I cannot tel but you will feel the spirit of it.
>
> At 3 PM Sister Emily P Young sent over for Susan, and Sister Presendia was there, to be administered [to.] . . . we left her resting. I wonder what Joseph will want next to go on with the work in the other Land just so we are prepared all right. I hope she will soon be restored.[6]

In 1887, Helen Mar Kimball Whitney felt a pressing need to encourage Church leaders to lend financial support to Mary. "I consider her worthy of your attention," Helen wrote. "She, as the *Prophet's wife*, should be relieved and provided for the remainder of her days."[7]

Mary Elizabeth Rollins Lightner, date unknown.

Twenty-five of Joseph Smith's plural wives followed the Saints west, settling in Utah. Many of them married other Church leaders, apparently consistent with the Prophet's instructions to the Twelve before his death.[8] After the martyrdom, Brigham Young was sealed to eight of the widows: Louisa Beaman, Emily Partridge, Zina Huntington, Eliza R. Snow, Maria Lawrence, Olive Frost, Mary Elizabeth Rollins, and Rhoda Richards. Heber C. Kimball was sealed to seven: Sylvia Sessions, Nancy Winchester, Sarah Lawrence, Martha McBride, Lucy Walker, Sara Ann Whitney, and Presendia Huntington. In addition, Nancy Marinda Johnson was already married to Orson Hyde, and Eliza Partridge wed Amasa Lyman. Examining the individual feelings of the twenty-five women who stayed with the Church concerning their faith in Mormonism and Joseph Smith is beyond the scope of this article. However, the fact that they remained affiliated with the Latter-day Saints is indicative of continued faith though not conclusive. Todd Compton's excellent mini-biographies of the women indicate that they all remained faithful.[9]

Ten of Joseph Smith's thirty-five wives died outside of Utah. Three of these—Hannah Ells, Olive Frost, and Maria Lawrence—passed away before the migration west. However, there is evidence that they were all devout in the faith. Andrew Jenson reported: "Ells, Hannah, . . . described as a good and noble woman—strong lady of culture and refinement[,] tall and lady-like in appearance—died in 1844 at Nauvoo[.] Sister E. R. Snow was with her when she died. Died in the house of Hiram Kimball at Nauvoo." Regarding Olive Frost, Jensen wrote: "Sister Olive [Frost] died at Nauvoo, Ill. Oct 6th 1845, after an illness of two weeks & of chills fever and pneumonia."[10] Finally, concerning Maria Lawrence's death, Mary B. Smith, daughter of the Prophet's brother Samuel, wrote in 1911:

> There was a mystery about Mariah Lawrence. The Lawrences lived just across the street from us. . . . Maria Lawrence died of consumption or one might more truthfuly put it of a broken heart. My Aunt Lucy visited her and and felt great sympathy for her. She said to Aunt at one time "That if there was any truth in Mormonism she would be saved for said she [']My yoke has not been easy nor my burden light.[']." As to what was the cause of Maria's deep sorrow I do not exactly know. I have reason to believe that she was one of Almond Babits [Almon Babbit's] wives [after Joseph's death]—And her heartbreak was as likely to be occasioned by him as anyone else.[11]

Seven Plural Wives Died Estranged from the Church

Seven of Joseph Smith's plural wives died geographically removed from the center of the Church, apparently due to personal preference.

Fanny Alger

Fanny Alger was married to Joseph Smith in Kirtland, Ohio, probably 1835. The secret union was discovered just weeks after the April 1836 dedication of the Kirtland Temple.[12] Thrust out by Emma, she left the area and quickly married Solomon Custer, a non-member. Her situation is unique in that she was not privy to the expanding knowledge of celestial and plural marriage revealed in Nauvoo. Evidence exists that she joined the Universalist church in 1874 and remained a member until her death in 1889. Her obituary stated:

> She [Fanny Alger] joined the Universalist church on the evening of the 10th of October, 1874, and until her last, held to that belief. She passed away peacefully and resignedly, with an abiding faith in the justice and love of an All Powerful and Supreme Being, and with joy in the full belief that she would meet with dear ones gone before.
>
> Having fulfilled the duties of life, with a conscientious regard for the welfare and happiness of those who were compelled to lean on her in her middle and early life, she passed away, fully trusting that the welcome applaudit summons, "well done, thou good and faithful servant, enter thou into the joy of the Lord," would greet her on the other side. Funeral services were held at the Universalist church in Dublin [Indiana], on Sabbath morning, Dec. 1, 1889, Rev. P. S. Cook and C. T. Swain, officiating. [13]

Despite her complete estrangement from Joseph Smith and the main body of the Saints after 1836, Church member Benjamin F. Johnson asserted: "Altho she never left the State [of Indiana where she settled with Solomon Custer] she did not turn from the Church nor from her friendship for the Prophet while She lived."[14] The basis for his rather positive recollection and its reliability is unclear.

Agnes Coolbrith

Agnes Coolbrith, widow of both Don Carlos Smith and the Prophet, married William Pickett, a Church member, after Joseph Smith's death. However, Pickett eventually left the Church and moved with his family to California. Despite her geographic estrangement from the Church, she remained in contact with various Church members throughout her life.[15] On July 22, 1857, Ina Coolbrith, Agnes's daughter, wrote her cousin, LDS Apostle Joseph F. Smith, and expressed her willingness to gather to Jackson County or Nauvoo, but not to Salt Lake City. Her words reflect a belief in the Restoration, but she openly argued: "Is polygamy not spoken of as a crime there [in the Book of Mormon]?"[16] Her mother, Agnes, added a postscript of her own to the letter, but said nothing about Joseph and polygamy.

In 1876, just months before her death, Agnes was visited by Joseph III, Alexander, and David, the sons of Joseph and Emma Smith, who were in California promoting their anti-polygamy RLDS religion. In 1884, Lucy Walker visited Ina, who recalled what her mother had told her nephews:

> I had a very pleasant visit at Oakland, [California] with Ina [Coolbrith, daughter of Agnes Coolbrith], who received me with much tenderness and affection. . . . From her, I learned many things I was glad to know, one fact was, that her mother bore testimony to the "Boys" [Joseph III, Alexander, and David Smith] in regard to the faith and teachings of their Father and told them that what they had seen, and heard in Salt Lake was Truth, that those women were their Father's wives, and it was useless to promulgate falsehood to the world, and advised them to desist. They pretended not to believe, but she could plainly see they were stung with the truth of her testimony.
>
> David seemed struck dumb, astounded at the living testimony of so many—What could their object be! Alexander said he would *not take any bodys word*—not even Aunt Agnes. Jos. [Joseph Smith, III] would not talk on the subject. After they left [they] sent Ina what purported to be the History of their Father with their Mother's dying testimony—and desired her to place them in the Library—She wrote them She could not with the knowledge She had—that they were false.[17]

Reportedly, Agnes's last words were "O! what a dupe I have been; what a dupe I have been!"[18] Her daughter interpreted this as referring to her association with Mormonism, while Agnes's nephew, Apostle Joseph F. Smith, believed it to be a reference to her marriage to William Pickett and her separation from the Church.[19]

Elizabeth Davis

Elizabeth Davis followed the Latter-day Saints as far as Winter Quarters, but then left the main body of the Saints and returned to Illinois. During the 1850s, she visited Salt Lake City. Anti-Mormon Sarah Pratt

asserted: "There was an old woman called [Elizabeth Davis] Durfee. She knew a good deal about the prophet's amorous adventures and, to keep her quiet, he admitted her to the secret blessings of celestial bliss. I don't think that she was ever sealed to him, though it may have been the case after Joseph's death, when the temple was finished. At all events, she boasted here in Salt Lake of having been one of Joseph's wives."[20] Elizabeth lived out the remainder of her life with her son in Kansas. Ironically, in the late 1860s they were baptized into the RLDS church, despite the church's official position that Joseph Smith did not practice plural marriage. Richard Lloyd Anderson and Scott H. Faulring believe the evidence for Davis' inclusion on Joseph Smith's list of wives is not compelling.[21] However, her name was added to Andrew Jenson's list personally by Eliza R. Snow.[22] Compton summarizes: "She [Elizabeth] died as a member of the RLDS faith, whose president Joseph Smith III, vehemently denied that his father had ever practiced polygamy. Perhaps Elizabeth came to believe that polygamy was wrong by the time she became a 'Reorganite,' or perhaps she simply felt drawn to her old friend Emma Smith and Emma's children. She remains one of the most interesting of Joseph's wives, a puzzle only partially solved."[23]

Sarah Kingsley

Married to John Cleveland, a non-Mormon who refused to migrate west, Sarah Kingsley left her legal husband when the Latter-day Saint left for the Rocky Mountains. However, Church leaders Brigham Young and Heber C. Kimball counseled her to return to John in Illinois.[24] Sarah's family biographer wrote: "Brigham Young and council . . . counseled her to stay with her husband as he was a good man, having shown himself kind ever helping those in need, although for some reason his mind was darkened as to the gospel. She obeyed council and stayed with her husband, and was faithful and true to her relation and died a faithful member of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints."[25]

Despite Sarah's biographer's positive view, it appears that just before her death in 1856, she joined a revivalist religion. Her son-in-law, John Lyman Smith, visited her in 1855 and recorded: "Mother had joined a Church a couple of weeks before my arrival I bore my testimony to her she seemed to have forgotten what her feelings were once. Father Cleveland treated me with more respect than ever before & seemed greatly pleased to see me, asked me to pray & ask the blessing regularly while I was there, saying John you know we never pray but I wish you to pray with us."[26]

John Lyman Smith's journal entry may have been too pessimistic. Compton observed: "Without a support group of Mormons, it would have

been difficult to live as a Latter-day Saint in 'gentile' Illinois, and Sarah always needed a religious social community in her life. Nevertheless, some aspects of her Mormon component were probably so deep that her outward membership in a local Protestant congregation may not have changed it significantly."[27]

Lucinda Pendleton

Of Joseph Smith's thirty-five plural wives, evidence supporting inclusion of Lucinda Pendleton Morgan Harris is the weakest. She and her husband, George Washington Harris, followed the Saints to Winter Quarters, but she apparently abandoned him there. A few authors have written that she ultimately apostatized and joined a Catholic convent in the 1860s, but evidence for this is problematic.[28] Masonic historian William Leon Cummings wrote in 1934:

> At some time prior to 1853, Mrs. Harris separated from her husband, for in 1856 Harris petitioned for a divorce, on the grounds that his wife had willfully deserted him and without reasonable cause absented herself for more than the space of three years.[29]
>
> Morris [a Masonic historian] claims that Mrs. Harris (formerly Mrs. Morgan) joined the Roman Catholic Sisters of Charity, and was a nurse in a hospital in Memphis Tennessee, during the war of 1861–1865. [Other authors] have copied this statement. I have been unable to verify it from other sources, and the statement itself seems rather questionable. Neither the War Department records nor the records of the church contain any information concerning her. Furthermore, it has been ascertained that there were such requirements for membership in the Roman Catholic Sisterhoods, as age, financial resources, etc., with which it would seem that she would have been unable to comply.
>
> Recently discovered evidence proves that she died at the home of her daughter, Mrs. Lucinda Wesley Smith, in Memphis, Tennessee, in 1856, thus rendering untenable the theory that she was in any way connected with the hospital service during the War between the States.[30]

Lucinda's willingness to physically remove herself from the main body of Church members to live with her daughter in the early 1850s supports a lack of devotion to her previous beliefs. However, her actual feelings toward the Church and Joseph Smith prior to her death are unknown.

Flora Ann Woodworth

Flora Woodworth married a Carlos Gove, a non-Mormon, on August 23, 1843, probably in response to a confrontation with Emma Smith the day before.[31] Notwithstanding, Flora received her endowment in the Nauvoo Temple on January 17, 1846, and a proxy temple sealing to Joseph Smith on

February 4.[32] Despite her husband's dislike for the Church, Flora convinced him to accompany the westward migration. Helen Mar Kimball Whitney provided this narrative which suggests that Flora remained a believer in Mormonism:

> On the evening of September 1st [1846] Brother Woodworth and family arrived [at Winter Quarters]; all sick. They encamped outside of the square a little distance from our tent. We had a temporary bedstead prepared and took their daughter, Flora Gove, into our tent, where I nursed her until she recovered her strength. Her husband was also sick with fever; she had lain helpless for many days, and her heavy raven locks were so matted together that it took me hours to comb them out. We have lived neighbors in Nauvoo and were old schoolmates. She was older than myself and was sealed to the Prophet Joseph as his wife. This happened before I was aware of the principle. A young man boarding at her father's after the death of Joseph not a member of the Church had sought her hand, in time won her heart, and in a reckless moment she was induced to accept his offer and they eloped to Carthage, accompanied by a young lady friend, and were there married by a Justice of the Peace. Flora was never happy with him as he hated the Mormons, and she felt condemned for the rash step she had taken. She made this confession to me while I was nursing her, and said she desired to cling to Joseph hereafter.
>
> They settled at the "Point," and she paid me a visit the following winter. She still expressed herself as strong in the faith of the Gospel, also her great desire to cleave to the Prophet. I never saw her again as she died at that place, leaving two or three children.[33]

Historian Andrew Jenson recorded in 1887: "She [Flora Ann Woodword] regretted her last marriage, her husband being an unbeliever, and intended to cling to the Prophet."[34]

Sarah Lawrence

Sarah Lawrence is the only one of Joseph Smith's thirty-five plural wives who in later life openly denied her plural marriages to him and afterwards to Heber C. Kimball. Helen Mar Kimball Whitney chronicled her history in the pages of the *Woman's Exponent*:

> It is a sad thing to record the apostasy of any who were once so highly favored as to receive the great spiritual manifestations which were enjoyed by . . . Sarah Lawrence. [She] had been the wife of the Prophet Joseph, his first-wife, Emma, having given her and her sister to him as his wives for time and all eternity. Sarah made choice of my father to stand as proxy for Joseph in this life. But she allows a jealous nature to have full sway. She and I became warm friends after she entered my father's family, and even after she became disaffected and thought to better her condition by marrying another we were still friends and she met nothing but kindness from father and his family. . . .
>
> But the man she married had proven truant to one wife and her little ones, leaving them to struggle for existence in this valley through the hardest times

> experienced here. And not until they had found friends to succor and help to keep the wolf from their door, did he make his appearance and then he had very little of the Gospel though he, at first, professed to be a "Mormon." He had come from the goldmines of California where he had made what was then considered quite a fortune. It was not long before he proved the truth of my father's predictions as he denied the faith and returned to California, taking Sarah with him. But it seems she failed to find happiness even in monogamy. As it turned out a dissipated character, and it was only a few years before she was divorced from him. She had lost every spark of the Gospel, which had once been her guiding star and was finally left to herself. She became so wicked that when paying her last visit to Salt Lake she denied emphatically ever being connected to Joseph or to my father, and was very insulting to those who dared to dispute her word. She abused her brother Henry's second wife most shamefully, when meeting her in his store, laying to her the most humiliating and abusive accusations, which proved her to be a most vicious and heartless woman. Her brother, Henry Lawrence, was so annoyed by her unprincipled course, that he was among the most thankful when she left here and returned to California, where she soon died."[35]

Although this narrative may have exaggerated Sarah's status and feelings later in her life, it seems clear that she lost her belief in Joseph Smith as a Prophet and her devotion to the Church he founded. Despite her estrangement, she apparently left no record criticizing him or accusing him of any misconduct.

No Accusations from Joseph Smith's Plural Wive*s*

Of the thirty-five plural wives married to Joseph Smith, three passed away in Nauvoo before the Saints left for the Rocky Mountains, remaining true to their convictions. Twenty-five made the trek to the Salt Lake Valley and apparently maintained throughout their lives a belief in Joseph Smith's prophetic role and mission. Of the remaining seven who died outside of Utah, nothing is known concerning Lucinda Pendleton's religious convictions at the time of her demise (1856). Agnes Coolbrith did not identify herself with the Latter-day Saints, but remained friendly toward the Church and the Latter-day Saints who visited her. Flora Woodworth held to her beliefs, and Sarah Lawrence entirely lost her faith. In addition, three joined other churches. Fanny Alger united with the Universalists, Elizabeth Davis joined the RLDS late in life, and Sarah Kingsley was baptized into a Protestant denomination just months before her death.

While available evidence is incomplete, only five of the thirty-five women sealed to Joseph Smith (approximately fifteen percent) are known to have jettisoned their LDS beliefs, and only one later denied having been a plural wife to the Prophet. Although the disaffection rates of other Nauvoo Latter-day Saint women, or the disaffiliation rates of females

from other religious organizations of that time period are unavailable, the percentage of women who were married to Joseph Smith and left Mormonism is relatively small (see Appendix).

What is interesting among all these observations is that none of Joseph Smith's plural wives ever accused him of abuse or deception, including the seven who did not gather to Utah with the main body of the Church. Decades after their feelings had matured and their youthful perspectives were expanded by additional experiences in subsequent marriages, it appears that none of them claimed they were victimized or beguiled by the Prophet. None came forth to write an exposé indicating he was a seducing imposter or claim that polygamy was a sham or a cover-up for illicit sexual relations. Even mild criticisms seem to be absent in the historical accounts and reminiscences of the Prophet's plural wives. It seems that if any of Smith's polygamous wives eventually decided that he had debauched them, their later scorn might have motivated them to expose him through in press. Certainly, numerous publishers would have been eager to print their allegations.[36]

This brief overview of the trajectory of Joseph Smith's plural wives after the martyrdom indicates that most remained believers in the principle of plural marriage, hoping to someday be reunited with him in the eternal worlds. While many current authors depict Joseph Smith as a libertine, driven by libido, none of his polygamous spouses left a record corroborating such views. Even those who parted with the Saints and had nothing to lose by criticizing him remained essentially silent. These observations support the notion that Joseph Smith successfully convinced his plural wives of his sincerity and genuine concern for them, while promoting a theology that most continued to believe after his death. Their lives constitute an unspoken testimonial to their perception of his and their conviction that the principle of polygamy came by revelation and was sanctioned by deity.

Notes

1. Eliza R. Snow, "To Mrs. Sylvia Lyons, by Miss E. R. Snow," *Woman's Exponent* 14, no. 11 (November 1, 1885): 86. See also Jill Mulvay Derr and Karen Lynn Davidson, eds., *Eliza R. Snow: The Complete Poetry* (Provo and Salt Lake City: BYU Press and University of Utah Press, 2009), 357–58. The poem was likely penned in the late 1840s. Authorship of the poem has also been attributed to Zina Huntington. See Zina Card Brown Family Collection, Church History Library, Salt Lake City, Utah.

2. See George D. Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy: ". . . but we called it celestial marriage"* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 2008); Todd Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness: The Plural Wives of Joseph Smith* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1997); Fawn M. Brodie, *No Man Knows My History: The Life of Joseph Smith, the Mormon Prophet*, 2nd rev. ed. (New

York, 1971).

3. I accept Todd Compton's list of thirty-three wives (see Compton, *In Sacred Lonliness*, 4–7), and add two more. The first is Esther Dutcher. See Daniel H. Wells to Joseph F. Smith, June 25, 1888, Church History Library. I am indebted to H. Michael Marquardt and Joseph Johnstun for bringing this source to my attention. The second is Mary Heron. See Joseph E. Johnson, "Comments in Council Meeting in Salt Lake City, September 2, 1850," Brigham Young Collection, MS d 1234, Church History Library.

4. Eliza R. Snow to Mary E. Rollins Lightner, April 3, 1865, Mary E. R. Lightner Collection, General Correspondence, L. Tom Perry Special Collections, Harold B. Lee Library, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah (hereafter Perry Special Collections).

5. Presendia Huntington Kimball to Mary Elizabeth Rollins Lightner, March 9, 1880, Lightner Collection, Perry Special Collections.

6. Zina D. Huntington Young to Mary Elizabeth Rollins Lightner, June 27, 1886, Lightner Collection, Perry Special Collections.

7. Helen Mar Whitney to Church Leaders, October 9, 1887, Lightner, Collection, Perry Special Collections.

8. See Susa Young Gates, undated statement, Susa Young Gates Paper, Utah State Historical Society, Salt Lake City, Utah.

9. See Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, 69, 109, 143, 201, 226, 251, 300, 304, 339, 360, 377, 386, 394, 430, 454, 471, 529, 542, 557, 575, 584, 592, 603, 608, and 620.

10. Andrew Jenson, Andrew Jenson Papers, MS 17956, bx 49, fld 16, document #11, Church History Library.

11. Mary B. (Smith) Norman to Ina (Smith) Coolbrith, February, 3, 1911, Community of Christ Library-Archives, Independence, Missouri.

12. See Don Bradley, "Mormon Polygamy before Nauvoo? The Relationship of Joseph Smith and Fanny Alger," in *The Persistence of Polygamy: Joseph Smith and the Origins of Mormon Polygamy*, Newell G. Bringhurst and Craig L. Foster, eds. (Independence, MO: John Whitmer Books, 2010), 14–58.

13. http://www.algerclan.org/getperson.php?personID=I135&tree=alger, accessed on September 6, 2008.

14. Dean R. Zimmerman, *I Knew the Prophets: An Analysis of the Letter of Benjamin F. Johnson to George F. Gibbs* (Bountiful, UT: Horizon, 1976), 39. The Lima branch of the Church, organized October 23, 1842, lists Fanny Custer as a member, but whether she was actually present there is not known. See Emer Harris, Book of Patriarchal Blessings, no. 210, cited in an undated letter from Richard Van Wagoner to Linda King Newell, Linda King Newell Collection, Marriott Library, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, Utah.

15. Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, 156–70.

16. Ina Coolbrith to Joseph F. Smith, July 22, 1857, typescript, Scott Kenney Papers, Marriott Library, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, Utah. Additional letters between Ina Coolbrith and her cousin Mary B. Smith Norman, daughter of Samuel H. Smith, show that Ina had not abandoned her interest in Mormonism.

17. Lucy Walker Kimball to Joseph F. Smith, February 24, 1884, Franklin R. Smith Collection, Church History Library, emphasis in original.

18. Joseph F. Smith to Ina Coolbrith, April 20, 1918, Church History Library.

19. See discussion in Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, 169.

20. W. Wyl, pseud. [Wilhelm Ritter von Wymetal], *Mormon Portraits, or the Truth About Mormon Leaders From 1830 to 1886* (Salt Lake City: Tribune Printing and Publishing Co., 1886), 54.

21. See Richard Lloyd Anderson and Scott H. Faulring, "Review of *In Sacred Loneliness: The Plural Wives of Joseph Smith*, in FARMS Review of Books 10, no 2

(1998), 75–77.

22. Jenson, Andrew Jenson Papers, MS 17956, bx 49, fld 16, document #1.

23. Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, 269.

24. See John Lyman Smith, Diary, July 4, 1855, MS 2072, photocopy, fld 3, Church History Library; and John Lyman Smith, Journal, 21, MS 1122, Church History Library.

25. Anonymous biography of Sarah Kingsley, possibly by Augusta Cleveland Smith, as cited in Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, 283.

26. Smith, Diary, July 4, 1855.

27. Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, 287.

28. Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, 54; Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, 93.

29. George W. Harris also left the Church. Andrew Jenson penned: "In 1854 Geo. W. Harris was living at Kanesville (Council Bluffs), Iowa. He claimed that 'he had done enough for the Church and was going to work for George W. Harris now.' In 1857, Thomas B. Marsh having decided to be rebaptized, called on George W. Harris to make his peace. The wife was dead but Harris received Bro. Marsh with kindness, but expressed himself as unwilling to follow Bro. Marsh's example. . . . In 1857, on account of the suspension of mail service to Utah because of the advance of Johnston's army a pony express between Kanesville and Salt Lake City was provided by public subscription. George W. Harris, when approached, gave his old excuse of working for George W. Harris, but two or three weeks later died, leaving his money behind him." Jenson, Andrew Jenson Papers, MS 17956, bx 73, fld 28.

30. William Leon Cummings, *Bibliography of Anti-Masonry*, reprinted from Part I, Vol. IV (Nocalore, NC: Lodge of Research, 1834), 28.

31. For a discussion on Flora Woodworth's marriage to Joseph Smith, see Brian C. Hales, "Joseph Smith's Personal Polygamy," *Journal of Mormon History* 38, no. 2 (Spring 2012): 185–91. The marriage date of Flora Woodworth to Carlos Gove is listed in the *Marriage Index of Hancock County, Ill., 1829–1849* (Augusta, IL: Tri-County Genealogical Society, 1983), 19.

32. Lisle Brown, *Nauvoo Sealings, Adoptions, and Anointings: a Comprehensive Register of Persons Receiving LDS Temple Ordinances, 1841–1846* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 2006), 286.

33. Helen Mar Whitney, "Travels Beyond the Mississippi," *Woman's Exponent* 13, no. 11 (November 1, 1884): 87. Whitney incorrectly states that Flora's marriage to Carlos Gove occurred after Joseph Smith's death.

34. Jenson, Andrew Jenson Papers, MS 17956; bx 49, fld 16, document #13.

35. Helen Mar Kimball, "Scenes and Incidents at Winter Quarters," *Woman's Exponent*, 14, no. 18 (February 15, 1886): 138.

36. In addition, none of the other seventy-nine polygamists who had entered into plural marriage during Joseph Smith's lifetime wrote exposés or literature accusing him of licentiousness or similar improprieties.

Appendix Joseph Smith's Wives after the Martyrdom				
Name	Death Year	Location	Other Husbands	Church Involvement
Fanny Alger	1889	Indiana	Solomon Custer	Joined Universalist church
Louisa Beaman	1850	Utah	Brigham Young	Faithful LDS
Zina Diantha Huntington	1901	Utah	Brigham Young	Faithfu LDSl
Presendia Huntington	1892	Utah	Heber C. Kimball	Faithful LDS
Agnes Moulton Coolbrith	1876	California	George A. Smith William Pickett	Disassociates from the LDS Church but remains friendly
Sylvia Sessions	1882	Utah	Heber C. Kimball Windsor Lyon	Faithful LDS
Mary Elizabeth Rollins	1913	Utah	Brigham Young Adam Lightner	Faithfu LDSl
Patty Bartlett	1892	Utah	David Sessions	Faithful LDS
Marinda Nancy Johnson	1886	Utah	Orson Hyde	Faithful LDS
Elizabeth Davis	1876	Kansas	Jabez Durfee	Joined RLDS church late in life
Sarah Kingsley	1856	Illinois	John Cleveland	Joined a Protestant congregation late in life
Lucinda Pendleton	1856	Tennessee	George Harris	Unknown
Delcena Johnson	1854	Utah	Reuben Barton	Faithful LDS
Eliza R. Snow	1887	Utah	Brigham Young	Faithful LDS
Sarah Ann Whitney	1873	Utah	Heber C. Kimball	Faithful LDS
Martha McBride	1901	Utah	Heber C. Kimball	Faithful LDS
Rose Vose	1884	Utah	Edward Sayers	Faithful LDS
Flora Ann Woodworth	1850	Iowa	Carlos Gove	Faithful LDS
Emily Dow Partridge	1899	Utah	Brigham Young	Faithful LDS
Eliza Maria Partridge	1886	Utah	Amasa Lyman	Faithful LDS
Almera Johnson	1896	Utah		Faithful LDS
Lucy Walker	1910	Utah	Heber C. Kimball	Faithful LDS
Sarah Lawrence	1872	California	Heber C. Kimball	Denied plural marriage to Joseph Smith
Maria Lawrence	1847	Illinois	Brigham Young	Faithful LDS
Helen Mar Kimball	1896	Utah	Horace Whitney	Faithful LDS
Hannah Ells	1845	Illinois		Faithful LDS
Elivira Cowles	1871	Utah	Jonathan Holmes	Faithful LDS
Rhoda Richards	1879	Utah	Brigham Young	Faithful LDS
Desdemona Fullmer	1886	Utah	Ezra T. Benson	Faithful LDS
Olive G. Frost	1845	Illinois	Brigham Young	Faithful LDS
Malissa Lott	1898	Utah	John M. Bernhisel Ira Willes	Faithful LDS

Nancy M. Winchester	1876	Utah	Heber C. Kimball Amos Arnold	Faithful LDS
Fanny Young	1859	Utah	Roswell Murray	Faithful LDS
Esther Dutcher	1856	Utah	Albert Smith	Faithful LDS
Mary Heron	1852	Utah	John Snider	Faithful LDS

Gray denotes those who died while living outside of Utah.