Emma Smith, Eliza R. Snow, and the Reported Incident on the Stairs

Brian C. Hales

Several authors have written that during the Nauvoo period Emma Smith may have had a violent altercation with Eliza R. Snow, one of Joseph's plural wives.[1] Different narratives of varying credibility are sometimes amalgamated and inflated to create a flowing storyline of questionable accuracy. For example, Samuel W. Taylor penned this dramatic account in *Nightfall at Nauvoo*:

> Eliza got out of bed, feeling queasy. It was early, the house quiet. Perhaps she'd be sick this morning again. Better go out back to the privy, in case. She stepped from her room just as Joseph's door opened. He paused a moment looking at her with affection—big, handsome, vital, her husband for time and eternity!—then they came together. She whispered, had he decided what to do? He nodded. They could meet at Sarah Cleveland's this afternoon to talk it over. Two-thirty. . . .
>
> A wild cry, then Emma was upon them with a broom-stick. Joseph staggered back. Emma flailed at Eliza with the heavy stick, calling her names, screaming. Eliza, trying to shield her head with her arms, dashed for the stairs, stumbled, fell headlong, and went head over heels down the steep steps as everything went black.
>
> She awakened in bed. Emma was there, and Joseph, together with Dr. Bernhisel.
>
> "Eliza," Emma said, "I'm sorry. . . ."
>
> "I understand," Eliza said. Her voice came as a weak whisper. Dr. Bernhisel nodded to Joseph and Emma, saying quietly that the patient needed rest. Joseph put an arm

Brian C. Hales (brianhales@msn.com) works as an anesthesiologist at Davis Hospital and Medical Center in Layton, Utah, and is the president of the Davis County Medical Society in 2009. As the author of *Modern Polygamy and Mormon Fundamentalism: The Generations After the Manifesto* (Greg Kofford Books, 2006), he received the "Best Book of 2007 Award" from the John Whitmer Historical Association. He is the webmaster of www.mormonfundamentalism.com and is currently working on a two-volume treatise of Joseph Smith's polygamy.

Emma Smith, ca. 1870.

Eliza R. Snow, ca. 1850.

around Emma's shoulders and went out with her. Then the doctor turned to Eliza. He took her wrist to feel her pulse.

"It is best that you should know immediately, Sister Eliza," he said quietly. "You have lost your baby."

He paused, then added, "And I am afraid that you never again will become a mother."[2]

Admittedly, though Taylor's account is not presented as documented history, it may perpetuate unverified rumors concerning purported historical incidents. This paper examines the historical accounts or statements associated with the Emma H. Smith-Eliza R. Snow "stairs incident" in an attempt to assess accurately whether in fact the alleged incident did or did not occur.

Statements Regarding the Alleged Stairs Incident

At least six different statements or accounts can be identified that mention either a conflict between Eliza and Emma, or a pregnancy of Eliza's, ostensibly by Joseph Smith. The most detailed narrative comes from Leroi Snow quoting W. Aird McDonald quoting Ben Rich quoting Charles C. Rich:

Charles C. Rich called at the Mansion house, Nauvoo, to go with the Prophet on some appointment they had together. As he waited in the main lobby or parlor, he saw the Prophet and Emma come out of a room upstairs and walk together toward the stairway which apparently came down center. Almost at the same time, a door opposite opened and dainty, little, dark-haired Eliza R. Snow (she was "heavy with child") came out and walked toward the center stairway. When Joseph saw her, he

> turned and kissed Eliza, and then came on down stairs toward Brother Rich. Just as he reached the bottom step, there was a commotion on the stairway, and both Joseph and Brother Rich turned quickly to see Eliza come tumbling down the stairs. Emma had pushed her, in a fit of rage and jealousy; she stood at the top of the stairs, glowering, her countenance a picture of hell. Joseph quickly picked up the little lad, and with her in his arms, he turned and looked up at Emma, who then burst into tears and ran to her room. Joseph carried the hurt and bruised Eliza up the stairs and to her room. "Her hip was injured and that is why she always afterward favored that leg," said Charles C. Rich. "She lost the unborn babe."[3]

The second statement comes from Mary Ann Barzee Boice, who quotes Aidah Clements: "She [Aida] says that once when she was at her work that Emma went up stairs and pulled Eliza R. Snow down stairs by the hair of her head as she was staying there."[4]

The third recollection is from Eliza Jane Churchhill Webb: "Joseph never had any living children by his polygamous women, although it is always supposed that Eliza R. Snow had a child, as she went into retirement for a year before Joseph's death."[5]

The fourth popular story was published in 1886 by Wilhelm Wyl, who quoted Chauncy Webb: "Emma soon found out the little compromise arranged between Joseph and Eliza. Feeling outraged as a wife and betrayed as a friend, Emma is currently reported as having had recourse to a vulgar broomstick as an instrument of revenge; and the harsh treatment received at Emma's hand is said to have destroyed Eliza's hopes of becoming the mother of a prophet's son."[6]

The fifth account from John R. Young was written to Willard Stolworthy on February 7, 1928:

> In ____ I was living in St George Utah, at the that time Joseph and Alexander sons of the Prophet Joseph Smith visited Salt Lake City—Solon Foster[7] liveing at St George, when a young man lived with the Prophet, was his coach man, & dearly loved him, when he learned of Josephs & Alexanders comeing, Foster went to S. L. City to see them, upon his return to St George, I was at the Sacrament meeting—President Erastus Snow, seeing Foster in the audience called him to the Stand, and asked him to tell the People about his meeting the Prophets Sons. . . .
>
> Foster said, "When I met Joseph, after congratulations I said, Joseph when you meet your Father, dont you think that He will give you a good Spanking?"
>
> "Why should Father spank me?"
>
> "Because you are doing all in your Power to undo what He gave his life to Establish."
>
> "I suppose you refer to Polygamy?" "Yes."
>
> "I don't know that my Father gave his life to establish Polygamy."
>
> "Joseph when your Mother turned Eliza R Snow out doors in her night clothes, and you stood there, crying, I took you up stairs to bed with me, and you said I wish Mother would not be so cruel to Aunt Eliza.
>
> You knew that Eliza R Snow was your Fathers wife. . . ."

> The statement above, In spirit and Substance, Is a true Report of what Solon Foster said to the saints assembled in that sacrament meeting.[8]

The sixth version, which quotes LeRoi C. Snow, was written by Fawn Brodie in 1945: "There is a persistent traditional that Eliza conceived a child by Joseph in Nauvoo, and that Emma one day discovered her husband embracing Eliza in the hall outside their bedrooms and in a rage flung her downstairs and drove her out into the street. The fall is said to have resulted in a miscarriage. (This tradition was stated to me as fact by Eliza's nephew, LeRoi C. Snow, in the Church Historian's Office, Salt Lake City.)"[9]

Problems with the Narratives

These narratives describe one or more conflicts between Eliza and Emma. Three allege she was pushed or flung down a flight of stairs. In one she was pulled by her hair, and in another she was beaten with a broom, but no mention is made of the stairs. One of the accounts specifies that the events occurred in the Nauvoo Mansion House. Solon Foster's recollection of taking Joseph

The Homestead, Nauvoo, Illinois, 2001. Joseph and Emma Smith and their family lived in the home from May 1839–August 1843. The portion of the home on the left was not extant when the Prophet's family lived in the home, but was added by Joseph Smith III in 1858. Photograph by Alexander L. Baugh

Smith III upstairs to be with him would have been difficult in the Homestead, which had but one small upstairs room. Three accounts are inconclusive regarding location.

Eliza's reproductive state is described different ways. Four writers imply pregnancy, while three accounts indicate that a miscarriage occurred. One account notes that a child was actually delivered, and another specifies resultant sterility. Two of the recollections identify the provocation as taking place from Joseph giving Eliza a kiss or an open embrace. The major problem associated with these statements involves the provenances of the respective documents. The sources cited are all at least second hand, although the longest and most detailed is fourth-hand and was the result of over one hundred years of storytelling.

Chronological Inconsistencies

A major problem regarding the six narratives is the chronological inconsistencies (see Table 1). The timeline indicates that if the stairs conflict occurred while Eliza lived with the Smiths, it must have occurred in the Homestead because she stopped boarding with them several months before they moved into the Mansion House.[10] It appears that Emma may have confronted Eliza on July 20, 1843. On that date, Eliza recorded:

> Sister [blank in original but probably Emma] called to see me. Her appearance very plainly manifested the perturbation of her mind. How strangely is the human countenance changed when the powers of darkness reign over the empire of the heart! Scarcely, if ever, in my life had I ~~ever~~ come in contact with such forbidding and angry looks; yet I felt as calm as the summer eve, and received her as smilingly as the playful infant; and my heart as sweetly reposed upon the bosom of conscious innocence, as infancy reposes in the arms of paternal tenderness & love. It is better to suffer than do wrong, and it is sometimes better to submit to injustice rather than contend; it is certainly better to wait the retribution of Jehovah than to contend where effort will be unavailable.[11]

Eliza's account may reflect a rosy view of her personal behavior during the interaction and perhaps over-dramatizes the visitor's conduct. Regardless, a number of authors assume that Emma was the unidentified woman.[12] Perhaps other acquaintances could merit such an entry in Eliza's diary without being named, but Emma was certainly capable of creating the described scene if polygamy was involved. The confrontation occurred just eight days after her husband had dictated the revelation on plural marriage (July 12, 1843), and her rejection of the revelation when it was presented and explained to her by Hyrum Smith.[13]

Importantly, Eliza immediately changed residence, moving from Nauvoo the very next day. Her diary entry records: "July 21st, In company with br. Allen left Nauvoo for the residence of sister Leavitt in the Morley Settlement."[14] Possibly the timing of the move was coincidental, but there is evidence that Emma sometimes sought to separate Joseph geographically from his plural wives, forcing them from the city if possible.[15] If the unidentified visitor was Emma, she might have encouraged or demanded that Eliza remove herself from Nauvoo.

Table 1
Eliza R. Snow Illinois Timeline

Year	*Day*	*Event :*
1839	May 10	The Smiths move into the Homestead cabin on the bank of the Mississippi.
1842	Pre-June 29	Eliza lives with Sarah Cleveland.
	June 29	Eliza is sealed to Joseph Smith.
	August 14	At Emma's invitation, Eliza moves into the Homestead with the Smith family.
	December 12	Eliza begins teachings school in Nauvoo.
1843	February 11	Lucy Mack Smith moves into the Homestead and Eliza leaves to join the Jonathan Holmes family.
	March 17	Eliza closes her school by holding a formal meeting attended by students and others, including Joseph and Emma.
	July 20	A possible confrontation takes place between Emma and Eliza.
	July 21	Eliza moves to the Morley settlement twenty-five miles south of Nauvoo to be with her sister Leonora.
	August 21	Emma finds letters from Eliza in Joseph's pockets and becomes "vexed and angry."
	August 31	The Smith family moves into the more spacious Mansion House.
	October 10	Eliza attends general conference in Nauvoo.
	December 31	Eliza attends a New Year's Eve gathering. Lorenzo speaks.
1844	February 20	Eliza visits Lima.
	April 14	Eliza moves to Nauvoo with the Stephen Markham family, where she stays for the next three years.

Apparently, the distances did not stop correspondence between the Prophet and Eliza. One month later William Clayton recorded: "E[mma] asked if I handed 2 letters to Joseph which she showed me. I had not done it. I satisfied her I had not. They appeared to be from E[liza] R[oxcy] Snow and President Joseph found them in his pocket. E[mma] seemed vexed and angry."[16]

The apparent discord between Emma and Eliza in July and August of 1843 makes it less likely that Eliza would have ever been permitted to reside, even for a short stay, in the Mansion House after the Smiths moved in on August 31. It is even less probable that Eliza would temporarily reside there in a pregnant state where Joseph Smith would openly kiss or embrace her in front of Emma, as described.

In addition, there is no evidence that Eliza "went into retirement" because of a pregnant condition during the year before the martyrdom or at any other previous time. For example, on April 14, 1844, she described moving back to Nauvoo, which apparently did not include any interaction with the Smith family: "On the fifth I came to the City to attend the Conference Spent the time

The Mansion House, Nauvoo, Illinois, 2005. Joseph and Emma Smith and their family moved into this home on August 31, 1843. The home included an east wing which was removed in 1890. Photograph by Alexander L. Baugh.

very pleasantly in the affectionate family of Bishop Whitney in company with my sister. Having received counsel to remain in the City, after spending a few days at elder Sherwood's & br. Joshua Smith's; I took up my residence at the house of Col. S. Markham being invited to do so; and I feel truly thankful that I am again permitted to enjoy society which is dear to me as life."[17]

The Staircase Structure

Another problem with the stairs accounts involves the configuration of the stairways at both the Homestead and the Mansion House; several incongruities between the descriptions and the physical structure of the staircases in both homes can be observed or identified. In regard to the Homestead, the physical design and structure of the staircase makes the altercation as described in the narratives unlikely if not impossible (see Figures 1 and 2).

The same problem could also be said of the Mansion House (see Figures 3 and 4). The most obvious structural inconsistency is the absence of a lower "parlor or lobby," unless the three-foot landing near the front of the main entrance could be so designated. That said, it is not impossible that one of

Figs. 1 and 2. Photographs showing the view of the stairs from the bottom of the Homestead staircase (left) and the top of the staircase (right). The photographs show that there could not have been a visualization of activities transpiring at the top of the twelve stairs. Photographs courtesy Community of Christ, Independence, Missouri, used by permission.

Figs. 3 and 4. The configuration of the staircase in the Mansion House does not appear to correlate to the stairs mentioned in the various accounts. Photographs courtesy Community of Christ Library-Archives, Independence, Missouri, used by permission.

the two rooms at the bottom of the Mansion House stairs might comply with the descriptions. Community of Christ historian Lachlan MacKay observed: "The downstairs room south of the stairs would have been the equivalent of the lobby and the room north of the stairs was the parlor. The account puts the observer in one of the two rooms at the bottom of the stairs rather than standing at the bottom of the stairs. However, a person in one of the downstairs rooms could not see someone coming out of the upstairs rooms."[18]

Another problem with the Mansion House staircase is that only one doorway is visible by a person standing at the bottom of the stairs. One door opens straight back into a small room that probably served as a store-room until January 1844, when it became the sleeping chamber for the Smith children, who were in the range of six to thirteen years old. No other doors are viewable from the lower landing. Third, the stairway would probably not be described as being "center" or "down center" with respect to the entryway, but it is located in the center of the Mansion House itself. In January 1844, Joseph Smith leased the Mansion House to Ebenezer Robinson, retaining three rooms for him and his family. Evidence exists that at that time, another stairway connected the kitchen area to their bedroom upstairs, but its placement does not correlate to the descriptions in the accounts. Perhaps one or two other staircases were constructed as part of the Mansion's hotel room extension, but they too do not seem to match the implied configuration.[19] In short, the statements about the physical layout of the stairs do not conform to the structure of the staircases in the Homestead or the Mansion House.

Eliza R. Snow's Alleged Sexual Relationship with Joseph Smith

Another question regarding the six accounts of the stairs incident involves the alleged sexual relationship between Joseph Smith and Eliza.[20] Available evidence supporting a connubial relationship is ambiguous. In the decades of the 1860–70s, the RLDS Church vigorously denied that Joseph Smith ever practiced polygamy.[21] In response, Utah Church leaders took specific steps to counter the assertions, and several of Joseph Smith's plural wives produced evidence corroborating the Prophet's plurality. In a 1905 interview with Joseph Smith III, Angus Cannon quoted Heber C. Kimball:

> He [Joseph Smith III] said, "I am informed that Eliza Snow was a virgin at the time of her death." I in turn said, "Brother Heber C. Kimball, I am informed, asked her the question if she was not a virgin although married to Joseph Smith and afterwards to Brigham Young, when she replied in a private gathering, 'I thought you knew Joseph Smith better than that.'"[22]

In contrast, Eliza R. Snow was asked in an 1877 letter by RLDS missionary Daniel Munns if she had been a "spiritual wife," of Joseph Smith.[23] In reply, Eliza penned: "You ask (referring to Pres. Smith), 'Did he authorize or practice spiritual wifery? Were you a spiritual wife?' I certainly shall not acknowledge myself of having been a carnal one.' . . . I am personally and intimately acquainted with several ladies now living in Utah who accepted the pure and sacred doctrine of plural marriage, and were the bona fide wives of Pres. Joseph Smith."[24] While it seems unlikely that Eliza would have ever considered herself a "carnal" wife in any setting, overall, this statement seems to indicate that either she was not sexually involved with the Prophet or she was carefully trying to avoid admitting to it, even though she freely implied its occurrence with some of Joseph's other plural wives. In addition, RLDS Church President, Joseph Smith III commented in 1876: "If my father had many polygamous wives, why was it that none of these women bore him children? Eliza R. Snow, whom it is said gave birth to a child of his, denies it."[25] Available manuscripts fail to mention any pregnancy or miscarriage.

Miscarriage and/or Sterility

A final problem involves reports that a fall down a flight of stairs could cause a miscarriage that resulted in Eliza's sterility for the rest of her life. Obstetrician-gynecologist Steven L. Johnson wrote:

> It is true that trauma during pregnancy can result in pregnancy loss. However, during the first trimester, the baby is usually well protected from blunt trauma. During the second and third trimesters, the baby/uterus is literally more exposed to the direct force of a traumatic blow. Consequently, trauma during these stages is more likely to cause fetal demise.
>
> The possible long term consequence of the fall that could cause permanent infertility could have been a secondary infection. The maternal mortality rate was very high in the 1800s from secondary infections. An infection could occur from a retained piece of placenta (a piece of the placenta that did not deliver with the baby subsequently becomes a host to bacterial infection), or bacterial contamination of the uterus from unsterile instrumentation or hand manipulation in an attempt to "help" complete the miscarriage. This type of post-miscarriage infection (*endometritis*) would have caused great pain, fever, and other symptoms.[26] In 1840, this severe complication would have been manifested by a prolonged serious illness and often in the death of the mother. There is no historical mention of such an event or symptoms in Eliza Snow's life at this time.[27]

Numerous unknown factors, absent from the accounts, frustrate conclusively the diagnosis of Eliza R. Snow's medical condition as described. However, reported details seem inconsistent with many of the assertions made by the various writers.

In summary, multiple problems with the accounts and their claims can be identified. The narratives all appear to have undergone at least one retelling, if not several, over the span of many years. The proposed chronology is also problematic because Emma likely knew of Eliza's sealing to Joseph before the Smith family's move into the Mansion House and consequently would not have been inclined to permit Eliza to live there afterwards. Less plausible is the description of Joseph kissing or embracing Eliza in Emma's plain view. Other inconsistencies are noted respecting the portrayal of the structure of the staircase, as well as issues of pregnancy, miscarriage, and possible post-traumatic sterility.

An unrelated story may have given rise to these accounts, a story that had nothing to do with Eliza R. Snow. Wilhelm Wyl quoted an unidentified "Mrs. J" saying: "Eliza Partridge [not Snow], one of the many girls sealed to the prophet, used to sew in Emma's room. Once, while Joseph was absent, Emma got to fighting with Eliza and threw her down the stairs. 'That finished my sewing there,' Eliza used to say."[28] Perhaps this conflict with Emma and a different Eliza was conflated to apply to Eliza R. Snow.Concerning the tantalizing stories of conflict between the two women, many problems and questions exist. A review of available manuscript documents leads to the conclusion that folklore predominates where historical evidence is unavailable.

Notes

1. For example, see Fawn M. Brodie, *No Man Knows My History: The Life of Joseph Smith, the Mormon Prophet*, 2nd rev. ed. (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1971), 470–71; and Linda King Newell and Valeen Tippetts Avery, *Mormon Enigma: Emma Hale Smith* (Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1984), 134–37.

2. Samuel W. Taylor, *Nightfall at Nauvoo* (New York: Macmillan, 1971), 180.

3. Leroi C. Snow, "Notes," in possession of Cynthia Snow Banner as cited in Maureen Ursenbach Beecher; Linda King Newell; and Valeen Tippetts Avery, "Emma and Eliza and the Stairs," *BYU Studies* 22, no. 1 (Winter 1982): 90. I have been unable to verify this quotation. In regards to the Snow-McDonald-Rich-Rich narrative, Charles C. Rich signed an affidavit in 1869: "On the [blank] day of May A.D. 1844 as he was about starting on a mission to the State of Michigan, Hyrum Smith, patriarch, taught him the principle of polygamy or celestial marriage, and told him that when he should return from the said mission it would be his privilege to take other wives." Joseph F. Smith Affidavit Books, 1:54, Church History Library, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City, Utah. In other words, Charles C. Rich did not become a polygamy insider until that date. This is important, since it suggests that Rich would either not have known of Nauvoo plural marriage at the time he witnessed supposed altercation between Emma and Eliza, or he would have had to be introduced to plural marriage the day the stairs incident occurred. Otherwise, he would have had no context for understanding the reported conflict between the two women or Joseph's tender concern for Eliza. In other words, if Rich did not learn about polygamy until May 1844, then the incident probably would not have happened

previous to that time. However, dating the altercation to a month before the martyrdom is problematic. Eliza was not boarding in the Mansion House at that time so far as we have any record, and Emma was not supporting plural marriage sufficiently to allow Eliza to live there at that time.

4. John Boice and Mary Ann (Barzee), Boice, Record [Patriarchal Blessing Book], Church History Library.

5. Eliza J. Webb [Eliza Jane Churchill Webb], Lockport, New York, to Mary Bond, April 24, 1876, Biographical Folder Collection, Community of Christ Library-Archives, Independence, Missouri.

6. W. Wyl [pseudonym for Wilhelm Ritter von Wymetal], *Mormon Portraits* (Salt Lake City: Tribune Printing and Publishing Co., 1886), 58. After reading *Mormon Portraits*, William Law, who lived in Nauvoo in the 1840s, wrote: "Your informants . . . may, now and then, have drawn a little on their imagination, may have reached false conclusions in some instances judged from circumstances and not from facts; doing injustice, perhaps, to the innocent." William Law to Dr. W. Wyl, January 7, 1887; cited in "The Mormons in Nauvoo: Three Letters from William Law on Mormonism," *The Daily Tribune* (Salt Lake City, Utah), July 3, 1887.

7. Joseph Smith III reportedly discredited Solon Foster as a witness of Joseph Smith's plural marriage. See Mary Audentia Smith Anderson, ed., *Joseph Smith III and the Restoration* (Independence, MO: Herald House, 1952), 360–63.

8. John R.Young to Willard Stolworthy, February 7, 1928, Scrapbook, 1928–1930, 32–34, Church History Library. See also John R. Young to Vesta Pierce Crawford, no date, in Young Scrapbook, as cited in Raymond T. Bailey, "Emma Hale: Wife of the Prophet Joseph Smith" (MA thesis, Brigham Young University, 1952), 186–87.

9. Brodie, *No Man Knows My History*, 470–71.

10. Linda King Newell, and Valeen Tippetts Avery suggest that an entry for November 2, 1842, in Joseph Smith's journal refers to his moving into the Mansion House from the four-room Homestead. Newell and Avery, *Mormon Enigma*, 132. The entry reads: "Spent this A.M in removing the books, desk &c from the store over to the house." Dean C. Jessee, ed. *The Papers of Joseph Smith: Volume 2, Journal, 1832–1842* (Salt Lake City, UT: Deseret Book, 1992), 491. However, in a later diary entry dated February 11, 1843, Joseph recorded: "Changing the furniture in the house to receive Mother Smith in the family." Scott H. Faulring, ed., *An American Prophet's Record: The Diaries and Journals of Joseph* Smith (Salt Lake City, UT: Signature Books, 1989), 303. This second reference to "the house" is clearly to the Homestead. The entry for August 31, 1843, reads: "About these days was moving into the new house on the Diagonal corner." Faulring, *An American Prophet's Record*, 412. It appears that the final move to the Mansion House occurred on August 31, supporting the fact that the Prophet's house was the Homestead until that date.

11. Maureen Ursenbach Beecher, "Eliza R. Snow's Nauvoo Journal," *BYU Studies* 15, no. 4 (Summer 1975): 408.

12. See, for example, Beecher, et al., "Emma and Eliza and the Stairs," 94, n. 19. Elsewhere Newell and Avery state that the woman "probably" was Emma. Newell and Avery, *Mormon Enigma*, 155. Richard Van Wagoner wrote that the "angry woman [was] evidently Emma" Richard Van Wagoner, *Mormon Polygamy: A History* (Salt Lake City, UT: Signature Books, 1989), 59.

13. Joseph F. Smith reported that after dictating the revelation on plural marriage, Joseph Smith said, "that is enough for the present, but I have a great deal more, which would be given hereafter." Joseph F. Smith, Remarks given at a quarterly conference held March 3–4, 1883, manuscript, 271, Utah State Historical Society, Salt Lake City, Utah. If any additional information or instruction regarding the revelation was given, it was not

recorded.

14. Maureen Ursenbach Beecher, ed., *The Personal Writings of Eliza Roxcy Snow* (Logan, UT: Utah State University Press, 2000), 80.

15. See Emily Dow Partridge Young, Incidents in the Early Life of Emily Dow Partridge, Special Collections, J. Willard Marriott Library, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, Utah. See also Emily D. P. Young, Autobiographical Sketch, January 7, 1877, manuscript in the possession of Emily Young Knopp, copy of typescript in possession of the author.

16. George D. Smith, ed., *An Intimate Chronicle: The Journals of William Clayton* (Salt Lake City, UT: Signature Books, 1995), 118, entry for August 21, 1843.

17. Beecher, ed., *The Personal Writings of Eliza Roxcy Snow*, 99.

18. Lachlan MacKay to the author, May 29, 2009.

19. Onsite discussion with Lachlan MacKay, Kevin Bryant, John Hamer, and the author, May 20, 2009.

20. After quoting Wyl, *Mormon Portraits*, 186–87, authors Richard and Pamela Price theorize that Eliza did become pregnant in Nauvoo, but that the father was John C. Bennett. Richard and Pamela Price, *Joseph Smith Fought Polygamy* (Independence, MO: Price Publishing, 2000), 77, 84–87. The evidence is not compelling.

21. See the extended discussion in Willard J. Smith, *Joseph Smith; Who Was He? Did He Teach or Practice Polygamy?* (Grand Rapids, MI: Glad Tiding Publishers, 1899).

22. Angus Munn Cannon, Statement of an interview with Joseph Smith, III, 1905, 23, Church History Library.

23. *The History of the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints*, 8 vols. (Independence, Mo: Herald Publishing House, 1967), 4:149.

24. Eliza R. Snow to Daniel Munns, May 30, 1877, Community of Christ Library-Archives; emphasis in original. I express appreciation to Ronald E. Romig for helping me with the acquisition of this document. See also Newell and Avery, *Mormon Enigma*, 136.

25. "Joseph Smith, Jr.," *Salt Lake Tribune*, November 24, 1876, 4.

26. F. Gary Cunningham, "Infection and disorders of the puerperium," in Paul C. MacDonald, et al., *Williams Obstetrics*, 20th ed. (Stamford, CT: Appleton & Lange, 1997), 548–55.

27. Excerpt from an unpublished manuscript by Steven L. Johnson which analyzes the obstetrical details of the various accounts of the reported Emma H. Smith-Eliza R. Snow stair incident, copy in possession of the author.

28. Wyl, *Mormon Portraits*, 57.